ESP Across Cultures

VOL. 14, 2017

CONTENTS

Lucia Abbamonte
*English media idioms of US confrontations across cultures: the Charleston Massacre - white supremacy vs African American dignity* 9

Barbara Cappuzzo
*Medical metaphors in economics news articles in English and Italian* 27

Mariagrazia De Meo
*From exhibitions to the screen: the challenges of subtitling art from English into Italian* 49

Paolo Donadio
*Post-trip narratives. A cross-cultural analysis of UK and Italian tourists’ online accounts* 65

Antonio Fruttaldo and Marco Venuti
*A cross-cultural discursive approach to news values in the press in the US, the UK and Italy: the case of the Supreme Court ruling on same-sex marriage* 81

Alba Graziano
*Marketing food through translation: an analysis of a hundred menus from Lazio* 99

Pietro Luigi Iaia
*Linguistic and extralinguistic strategies of hybridization, simplification and reformulation in English and Italian multimodal popularized discourse* 115

Adriano Laudisio
*The adaptation of legal Culture-Specific References in cross-cultural rewriting: the case of legal drama* 131

Anna Franca Plastina
*Online health promotion: the cross-cultural construction of biopedagogical discourses of childhood obesity* 159

Virginia Pulcini and Matteo Milani
*Neo-classical combining forms in English loanwords: evidence from Italian* 175

Margaret Rasulo
*Packaging anti-terrorist attitudes through the powerful language of colouring books* 197

Giorgia Riboni
*Languages for Specific Purposes on YouTube: a cross-cultural and cross-linguistic analysis of English and Italian makeup tutorials* 231

Notes on contributors 251

Instructions for contributors 255
ESP Across Cultures

Chief Editor
Christopher Williams, University of Foggia, Italy (christopher.williams@unifg.it)

Assistant Editor
Denise Milizia, University of Bari, Italy (denise.milizia@uniba.it)

Editorial Board
Mona Baker, University of Manchester, UK
Marina Bondi, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Italy
Delia Chiaro, School for Interpreters and Translators, Forlì, Italy
Ilse Depraetere, University of Lille III, France
Rodica Dimitriu, University of Iasi, Romania
Marina Dossena, University of Bergamo, Italy
Tatiana Dubrovskaya, Penza State University, Russia
Laura Gavioli, University of Modena, Italy
Maurizio Gotti, University of Bergamo, Italy
Shaeda Isani, University of Grenoble Stendhal 3, France
David Katan, University of Salento, Italy
Juana Marin Arrese, University Complutense of Madrid, Spain
Monique Mémet, École Normale Supérieure de Cachan, France
George Murdoch, York St. John University, UK
Shanta Nair Venugopal, University of Kebangsaan, Malaysia
Päivi Pahta, University of Tampere, Finland
Françoise Salager-Meyer, University of Los Andes, Mérida, Venezuela
Christina Schäffner, Aston University, Birmingham, UK
Elena Seoane, University of Vigo, Spain
Christopher Taylor, University of Trieste, Italy
Elena Tognini Bonelli, University of Siena, Italy
Michel Van der Yeught, University of Aix Marseille, France
Nur Yigitoglu, Middle East Technical University Northern Cyprus Campus, Turkey

Website: http://www.unifg.it/ricerca/attivita-di-ricerca-di-ateneo/esp-across-cultures

ESP Across Cultures is a double blind peer reviewed international journal that publishes theoretical, descriptive and applied studies on varieties of English pertaining to a wide range of specialized fields of knowledge, such as agriculture, art and humanities, commerce, economics, education and vocational training, environmental studies, finance, information technology, law, media studies, medicine, politics, religion, science, the social sciences, sports, technology and engineering, tourism, and transport. The journal addresses a readership composed of academics, professionals, and students interested in English for special purposes particularly from a cross-cultural perspective. The aim of the journal is to bring together scholars, practitioners, and young researchers working in different specialized language domains and in different disciplines with a view to developing an interdisciplinary and cross-cultural approach to the study of ESP.

ESP Across Cultures is covered in Linguistics & Language Behaviour Abstracts, MLA International Bibliography, Translation Studies Abstracts and Bibliography of Translation Studies. It is indexed in ANVUR Riviste Scientifiche (ANVUR/scientifiche).
Foreword

Volume 14 of *ESP Across Cultures* contains a total of 12 papers, the highest number of papers in a single volume since the journal began in 2004.

All of the contributors in this volume are scholars working in Italy, and many of the papers explore aspects of specialized discourse where both English and Italian are compared. There are, however, exceptions, as can be seen in the paper by Lucia Abbamonte which opens this volume, where the ‘cross-cultural’ element consists in the racial divide which still exists in the United States. The author focuses on the 2015 Charleston Church massacre where a white extremist entered a church and shot dead nine black people, an episode which gave rise to a “new transformative language of racial confrontation, with its own lexicogrammar” where the black community reacted to the massacre by using words of forgiveness and healing rather than words of vengeance and hatred, an aspect that the media were quick to highlight and which the author analyses from a sociolinguistic perspective.

In her paper, Barbara Cappuzzo compares medical metaphors in economics news articles in English and Italian which were investigated in two corpora drawn, respectively, from the *Financial Times* and *Il Sole 24 Ore*. The results show that the Italian corpus tends to use medical terms metaphorically more frequently with respect to the English corpus, ultimately highlighting the fact that “health/medical-related matters are a crucial source of inspiration in the conceptualization of English and Italian economics news discourse.”

Mariagrazia De Meo analyses the challenges of subtitling art from English into Italian in the field of English for Art Purposes by focusing on the translation strategies used in the Italian subtitles in the art documentary *Goya: visions of flesh and blood* (2016). Through the leitmotif of the art exhibition, “the narration is presented through a variety of voices, from those of art curators and critics to the voice of the artist himself,” and in the commentary, the connotative charge of lexical items and figurative language convey the communicative aim of emotionally engaging the viewer through a language that is accessible and aesthetically pleasing.

Paolo Donadio provides a cross-cultural analysis of British and Italian tourists’ online accounts using a corpus downloaded from Tripadvisor, comparing the feedback of Italian tourists visiting the British Museum with that of British tourists visiting the Museo Archeologico Nazionale in Naples. The author shows that the category of tourist feedback, shaped in the web genre of the review, is conceived and achieved differently by British tourists with respect to Italian tourists, especially in terms of implementing different cultural frames and constructing mental spaces.

Antonio Fruttaldo and Marco Venuti offer a cross-cultural discursive approach to news values in the press in the US, the UK and Italy by examining the Supreme Court ruling on same-sex marriage, and focusing on whether analysing news values can help identify differences and similarities in constructing newsworthiness. The authors show how Italian newspapers tend to represent the event in terms of the news values of Eliteness, Impact, and Timeliness; the UK press stresses those of Negativity, Impact, and Timeliness/Superlativeness; whereas the US press privileges those of Impact, Eliteness, and Negativity.

Alba Graziano looks at how food is marketed through translation in her study of menus from the Lazio region. Belonging to the genre of info-marketing communication, the restaurant menu has not been widely studied in terms of its semiotic and multimedial features. The author examines the morpho-syntactic and lexical structure of the texts highlighting their informative and persuasive functions. She also
analyses to what extent the English versions use the same strategies, concluding that, despite the traditional emphasis on culture-bound features of food language, the pragmatics of such texts is established by the combination of syntactic order and sensory-metaphorical lexis.

Pietro Luigi Iaia investigates the linguistic and extralinguistic strategies of hybridization, simplification and reformulation in English and Italian multimodal popularized discourse in a corpus of English and Italian scripts from the TV shows *1000 Ways to Die*, *Curious and Unusual Deaths*, and *Rare Anatomy*, which mix journalistic, documentary and humorous discourses with reality-TV and docudrama genres. The analysis focuses on the interaction between the extralinguistic features and verbal characteristics of audiovisual scripts with the aim of describing multimodal popularization.

Adriano Laudisio examines the adaptation of legal Culture-Specific References (CSRs) in cross-cultural rewriting in legal drama, the fictional genre concerning the professions of lawyers, judges and police as well as law enforcement. As a form of FASP (Fiction à Substrat Professionnel, i.e. ‘Fiction with Professional Background’) it plays a role in language learning and in popularizing legal-specific contents and terminology for non-experts. The study analyses two corpora, made up of the original scripts in English and the Italian fan-made translations of three legal dramas. The results show a tendency to substitute CSRs with references drawn from the Target Culture.

Anna Franca Plastina focuses on online health promotion and the cross-cultural construction of biopedagogical discourses of childhood obesity by exploring how such discourses are mediated across US and Italian health cultures. The author investigates how cultural schemas contribute to organizing information and situating the meaning of childhood obesity cross-culturally, revealing distinctive discourse patterns. A comparative analysis of US and Italian web-based texts is carried out by using cultural schema theory. The paper highlights the diverse approaches to constructing biopedagogical meaning across health cultures, and on differences in conceptualizations of health.

Virginia Pulcini and Matteo Milani analyse neo-classical combining forms (CFs) in English loanwords using evidence from Italian in the word-formation of compound terms in the technical and scientific domains. In their examination of Anglicisms containing CFs, the authors observe that the number of borrowings from English is relatively small, despite the strong influence of English in specialized vocabulary. This is due to the fact that most CFs derive from Latin and Greek and, Italian being a Latin-based language, they are felt to be familiar and integrated into the language. Thus, in the area of composition with neo-classical CFs, Italian tends to favour the combination with domestic elements rather than with English ones.

Margaret Rasulo explores the theme of terrorism through the language of colouring books, looking at how this genre in the US is used to shape reality from a specific cultural stance. She argues that the conventions of colouring books have been recreated to offer an anti-terrorist response to the incitement of terrorist groups whose online magazines are used to recruit and radicalize young Muslims worldwide. By comparing the colouring books and the terrorist magazines, and by underlining their divergent aims, the author shows “the stimulus/response pattern underlying their communicative action” whose aim is to create their own version of the truth.

The final paper in this volume is by Giorgia Riboni who undertakes a cross-cultural and cross-linguistic study of English and Italian makeup tutorials, focusing on the generic, rhetorical and linguistic practices of English- and Italian-speaking
‘makeup gurus’ and highlighting how the language and discursive strategies are used in different cultural contexts, within the same virtual platform and using the same generic resources. The author examines the verbal element of makeup video tutorials and compares the rhetorical, discursive and lexical preferences in the language in which this genre originated (English) and within a new lingua-cultural environment (Italian). She concludes that there is “an ongoing tension between the global and the local dimension of YouTube makeup culture.”

As can be seen from this brief synopsis of the papers constituting this volume, the rich variety of topics and methodological approaches to the study of English in specialized discourse from a cross-cultural perspective bear witness to the fact that this field of study is thriving and capable of providing new insights which, it is hoped, will prove to be of value to scholars of applied linguistics.

Christopher Williams
(Chief Editor)
Abstract

The frequent shooting in the US of unarmed black men by white police officers is rooted in the longstanding issue of racial disparities – systemic racism being a persistent major phenomenon in the history of the nation, as the protests organized by the ‘Black Lives Matter’ movement and other movements have successfully foregrounded, also thanks to the attention of the media.

A specific multimodal lexicon, with accompanying gestures, appears to be unfolding to give voice to nationwide protests, rioting (‘Hands up, don’t shoot!’ ‘I can’t breathe’, etc.) and debates which, through the contemporary media, are also audible abroad.

This continuing racial confrontation, grounded in the unsettled issue of racial profiling, displays an intrinsically cross-cultural confrontation between black consciousness vs. the allegedly unconscious ‘white privilege’, or, on the illegal side, ‘white supremacy’, which are starkly opposing visions/cultures within the same nation, both voiced through the same language.

In this volatile contrast, a key event was the 2015 Charleston Church Massacre, which is the focus of this study. On the evening of June 17, 2015, Dylann S. Roof, a white man, killed nine black people at Mother Emanuel Church in that city. Instead of words of hostility and vengeance, the language of forgiveness and healing was immediately spoken in the following media-enhanced conversation.

A new transformative language of racial confrontation, with its own lexicogrammar (Hasan 1987; Berber Sardinha 2012), seems to be developing mainly through the media (van Dijk 1991, 2008; Fairclough 1995, Fairclough, Mulderrig and Wodak 2011). The present study aims to identify this context-specific, re-semiotized English lexicon and comment on some of its traits from a cross-cultural discourse-historical perspective (Wodak and Reisigl 2015).
1. Introduction

The frequent killings of unarmed black men by white police officers are one of the most dismal effects of the historically problematic relationship between black and white populations in the US. Among the major events in this ongoing violent racial confrontation we find the 2015 Charleston Massacre, as well as the death of the five police officers shot in Dallas (July 2016) by Micah X. Johnson, a 25-year-old black, allegedly in retaliation for those senseless killings. These dire events, the unsolved issue of racial profiling and the ensuing reactions, including nationwide debates, retaliation and rioting, have only recently been foregrounded in the (social) media, and are still resonating beyond national boundaries. These deaths show how in the US race still plays a key role both in hate crime and in law enforcement. The capacity of the contemporary media both for fuelling protests, creating groups and circles, and for promoting sympathetic, thought-provoking conversations cannot easily be overvalued. Real-time communication and hyper-textual links to additional sources make possible an immediate diffusion of news about events that are still ongoing, and the resources of cross-media communication make it possible to engage and bring together all parties involved. Under the media lens, the ever-growing list of unarmed Afro-Americans killed by police is re-semiotized as the outcome of widespread racist attitudes.

Recently, the first death to gain the full attention of the media was the shooting of unarmed Trayvon Martin by the Neighbourhood Watch volunteer George Zimmerman in 2012 in Florida. The ‘police wannabe’ Zimmerman was accused of racially profiling the Afro-American teen, who was wearing a hoodie sweatshirt. The police quickly released Zimmerman, since his behaviour was legally acceptable under Florida’s “stand your ground” law (a controversial self-defense law). The national media soon seized on the shooting, which was initially covered by the Florida media alone, and race was reported as central to the tragedy. After weeks of demonstrations across the nation, a special state prosecutor charged Zimmerman. His 2013 trial became one of the most racially-charged and politically motivated prosecutions in recent US history. Amidst the growing media frenzy and active participation of the public, a new lexicon was emerging. ‘I am Trayvon Martin’ quickly became a popular rallying cry, and, when Zimmerman was acquitted (on July 13, 2013), the now famous ‘Black Lives Matter’ slogan was coined by Alicia Garza, a workers’ rights activist, who posted a missive on Facebook: “Black people. I love you. I love us. Our lives matter.” Then the hashtag was added, and the activists made banners inscribed with #j4tmla (justice for trayvon martin l.a.) and, underneath, #blacklivesmatter.

Gradually, the BLM slogan helped to shape a structured political movement that has captured media attention by effectively denouncing discrimination and cases of police brutality, as in the recent outbreak of high-profile incidents. The killings of Michael Brown in Ferguson (Missouri) and Eric Garner in New York in 2014 sparked nationwide protests and violent conflicts as well as debates about the use of exces-

---


2 See, among others: http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/nation/2014/08/14/michael-brown-fergu-
sive force and racial profiling by officers (in both cases the grand juries declined to charge the officers involved). Increasingly, in our web-wired, audio-visual-verbal arena the phrases ‘Hands up, don’t shoot’, echoing protests in Ferguson, and Garner’s cry ‘I can’t breathe’ became loud rallying cries for the related protests, together with their accompanying iconic gestures. These typical phrases have also been magnified on posters, spray-painted on walls and monuments, and variously reified in gadgets. A kind of multimodal context-dependent lexicogrammar is being developed for relating (or shouting) the protests against the police brutality on black bodies, which also cast light on similar cases from past years, only some of which have led to charges against the police officers involved.

A further complication is the lack of reliable national data on how many people are killed by police officers each year. Again, the role of the media has been essential for obtaining more reliable data and showing how unarmed black Americans, compared to their white counterparts, are twice as likely to be killed by police, though the interpretation of such data is not void of controversy. To give one example, on its website The Guardian has promoted an initiative that is a relevant example of the ability of the media to engage their audiences for the public good with all the paraphernalia of contemporary communication – Help us document every police killing in America.

While these much-debated violent deaths of African Americans were causing protests and riots across the nation, and the BLM movement had found its voice and language, growing into a national movement, at the Emanuel Church in Charleston a cold-blooded attack by a self-confessed white supremacist took place (June 17, 2015). Dylann S. Roof, a white man, killed nine black people at the Emanuel African Methodist Episcopal (AME) Church in that city. The two-century-old church has played a significant role in the history of South Carolina, in the slavery era, during the Civil Rights movement of the 1960s, and currently for the BLM movement. This was a callous attack by a ‘white supremacist’ aiming to provoke a race conflict in the heart of the old Confederacy. Instead of words of war, the language of forgiveness was immediately foregrounded in Charleston, though the families involved were divided over the issues of forgiveness, which deprived them of their narrative about being rightfully hurt and angry. The media coverage of this attack and the following conversation are the major foci of this study. The families of the victims had several possibilities to voice their grief and convey their perception of the events in real time. Thus, increasingly, this shooting – solely grounded on racial hatred – acquired a symbolic significance, amplified through the media lens, which found its highest expression in the immediate removal of the Confederate battle flag that Dylann S. Roof had posed with in several pictures. The removal of the flag, a symbol generally disliked by the African Americans, had been previously debated, but no agreement had been reached until the massacre made this balancing act undelayable.


It is to be noted that while black consciousness and self-awareness are no novelty, a new form of mainstream white self-perception is emerging from these recent events, as is evident in the words of the journalist John Huey:

Since any discussion about the massacre is essentially about race in America, and, more particularly, race in the South, I should present my credentials upfront. I speak from what is known today as white privilege. I am also a native Southerner, descended from slave owners who fought and lost (thank God) the Civil War (*Time Magazine*, November 23, 2015. My italics).

In short, ‘white privilege’, which is not to be assimilated to the problematic, crime-prone ‘white supremacy’ ideology, denotes a set of passive advantages, or lack of difficulties, that white persons might not be aware of having. The advantageous effects of ‘white privilege’ can be seen in professional, educational, and personal contexts. This notion has been recently brought into mainstream US culture through a social media campaign, especially promoted by BLM, by contrastively highlighting it against the background of the persistent poverty of many African Americans, and the disparities in education, health and housing.

2. Aims

This study aims to outline this new (or re-semiotized) multimodal English lexicogrammar, as it emerges from the media-enhanced unfolding of debates and protests (*I am Trayvon Martin; Hands up, don’t shoot; Black Lives Matter; the narrative of forgiveness...*), to explain some of its features and to contextualize the situation. The main focus is on the coverage of the Charleston church massacre from a comparative perspective: excerpts from a local and an international journal will be comparatively analysed. From an applied linguistics perspective, an interesting aspect is how the English language is treading a brittle line between black consciousness and what is now commonly defined as ‘white privilege’. Two contrasting cultural frames with their emerging narratives are voiced via English – a powerful *trait d’union* within one nation, which is now increasingly referred to as the ‘Disunited States of America’.

---

6 Black consciousness, which intrinsically entails embodied responses to the material contexts and prescribed identities, as well as the Black Consciousness Movement, have a long history and have been the object of many studies.

7 Interestingly, there is a new field of study, Critical Whiteness Studies “whose aim is to reveal the invisible structures that produce and reproduce white supremacy and privilege. CWS presumes a certain conception of racism that is connected to white supremacy. In advancing the importance of vigilance among white people, CWS examines the meaning of white privilege and white privilege pedagogy, as well as how white privilege is connected to complicity in racism” (Barbara Applebaum, 2016, Critical Whiteness Studies, *Oxford Research Encyclopaedia - Education*: [http://education.oxfordre.com/view](http://education.oxfordre.com/view)). Dealing with these multifaceted issues, and their gradation, is well beyond the scope of this article. Yet, the data of this study from the media coverage of the Charleston massacre show an overarching attitude of general solidarity and empathy with the black victims, though the strongest expressions of contempt for the Confederate battle flag come from the Afro-American writers.
3. Integrated methodology

We are moving within the domain of qualitative linguistic analysis, applied to media realizations of this highly contextualized English lexicogrammar that requires, in Hasan’s (1987) terms, a special delicacy of focus. These multifaceted issues require an interdisciplinary methodology such as the discourse historical approach, which can integrate a plurality of tools, as is appropriate when dealing with sensitive, multilayered issues (Abbamonte 2012).

The discourse historical approach (DHA) combines historical, socio-political and linguistic perspectives, and focuses on identity construction and any form of discrimination from an intrinsically cross-cultural perspective. The DHA posits within the broad domain of critical discourse analysis (Reisigl and Wodak 2015a; Wodak 2013; Fairclough 2011), whose operational tools mainly originate from Halliday’s approach to language as a social semiotic system (systemic functional linguistics – SFL). Both CDA and DHA aim to ‘de-naturalize’ the ideologies expressed through language, and disclose how power structures are shaped in and through discourse. In brief, these approaches show what is omitted and what is included in discourse, and attempt to explain why, or what, is made explicit or left implicit, what is foregrounded and what is backgounded, what is thematized and what is unthematized, and, additionally, what process types and categories are drawn upon to represent people, events, and so on (Fairclough 1995; van Leeuwen 1996; Fairclough, Mulderrig and Wodak 2011).

Special attention in DHA studies has been devoted to the expression and representation of racism (Reisigland Wodak 2015b; van Dijk 1991, 2000, 2008), through an integrative, problem-oriented approach, where
categories and tools are not fixed once and for all. ‘Grand theories’ often serve as a foundation. In specific analyses, however, ‘middle-range theories’ frequently supply a better theoretical basis. [...] The concept of context is an inherent part of the DHA and [...] takes into account four levels:
1. the immediate, language, or text-internal co-text;
2. the intertextual and interdiscursive relationship between utterances, texts, genres and discourses;
3. the extralinguistic social variables and institutional frames of a specific context of situation;
4. the broader socio-political and historical context, which discursive practices are embedded in and related to (from Reisigl and Wodak 2009: 95-98).

Wodak (2011, 2015) and Wodak and Reisigl (2015b) also provided a useful classification of how socio-political issues could be dealt with, according to a set of topoi, as follows:

---

8 E.g. the political and ideological views of newspapers can be expressed in the choice of different vocabularies: ‘resistance fighters’ vs. ‘rebels’, or ‘terrorists’, and different grammatical structures (e.g. active vs. passive constructions).

9 Diachronically, the DHA should be seen as an extension of van Dijk’s(1991) socio-cognitive model, which linked the generation of prejudice to units larger than the sentence and showed the media’s role in reproducing racism and unequal power relations in society. In van Dijk’s (2000: 362) words, “racism is a complex system of social and political inequality that is also reproduced by discourse”. 

---
Broadly, the flexible DHA allows the discourse analyst to show how given issues are shaped and/or prioritized in given contexts, not only through verbal language, but also through other forms of meaning-making such as visuals and sound (Reisigl and Wodak 2009), i.e. at multimodal level, and with attention to mediatid communication as well. Hence, many aspects of ongoing racial confrontation in the US can be better understood in its light.

Furthermore, the multi-layered DHA perceives discourse as a form of social practice, i.e. as a complex of interrelated context-dependent semiotic acts that are situated within specific fields of social practice (Wodak and Reisigl 2015a). Influenced by SFL with its attention to the context of situation, the DHA can also encompass functional linguistic analyses aimed at outlining context-dependent lexicogrammars. An effective definition of lexicogrammar can be found in the following excerpt from Berber Sardinha (2012: 1-2):

Together with semantics, lexicogrammar forms part of the content plane of language. The development of the notion of lexicogrammar in SFL is linked to the pursuit of the so-called ‘grammarians dream’, which entails treating lexis as final selections in grammatical systems: “the grammarians dream . . . is to turn the whole of linguistic form into grammar, hoping to show that lexis can be defined as most delicate grammar” (Halliday 1961/2002: 54). Lexis is seen as “grammar extended to the point of maximum delicacy” (Halliday and Matthiessen 2004: 46) or that point “where further uniqueness cannot be postulated” (Hasan 1987/1996: 76).

In this light, thinking about language relationally, and considering lexis as a kind of delicate grammar (see also Martin 2017: 22-23), the indicative mood of ‘matter’ in Black Lives Matter, in relation to its historical and socio-cultural context, strongly conveys the objective need to reconsider the relevance of ‘Black Lives’. In the rallying cry ‘I am Trayvon Martin/We are Trayvon Martin’ the stative ‘I am/we are’, which realize an identification process, convey analogous meanings (see Section 6).

3.1. Corpus
Our small, specialized corpus was drawn from the online versions of both Time Magazine (Time) \(^{11}\), which has the world’s largest circulation among the news magazines,


\(^{11}\) See http://time.com/time-magazine-charleston-shooting- / etc.
and the more locally oriented Charleston Gazette (ChG), a weekly news magazine founded as far back as 1873. More specifically, ten articles were sorted by relevance from each (Time: 21,771 total words, time span June 18, 2015 - June 17, 2016; ChG: 7,767 total words, June 18, 2015 - January 10, 2017), then re-arranged chronologically for clarity’s sake. From a DHA perspective, the key notions and phrases foregrounded in the two media will be comparatively considered, in order to reach a more complete understanding of the interplay of the various cultural frames and their linguistic realizations in operation. For brevity’s sake, only excerpts from six articles from each subcorpus are shown.

4. The DHA framing of the data from the Charleston Gazette

Let us briefly remember the facts. On the night of June 17, 2015, in Charleston, South Carolina (SC), a gunman opened fire at the oldest AME Church in the South, and the symbol of the earliest expressions of African American dignity and vision. Nine people died and five survived, as the result of this brutal attack by Roof, a ‘white supremacist’. His aim to raise race conflicts in the heart of the old Confederacy was not achieved, since the language of redemption, reconciliation and forgiveness was immediately spoken in Charleston by members of the families of the victims, and the whole community mourned and displayed solidarity. In the background, however, there was the issue of the controversial Confederate legacy, revolving around the Confederate flag and symbols, as we can read in the table below, where the key notions debated in the ChG articles and the phrases typically used to foreground such issues are reported.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTICLES</th>
<th>The removal of the Flag, iconicity</th>
<th>White supremacists, no remorse, debated heritage</th>
<th>Unifying effect + healing vs. race wars</th>
<th>Black grace + Black forgiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOPOS OF URGENCY + HISTORY</strong></td>
<td><strong>TOPOS OF BURDENING+ HISTORY+ THREAT</strong></td>
<td><strong>TOPOS OF REALITY + CHALLENGE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. SUSPECT UNEMOTIONAL IN COURT AS VICTIMS’ FAMILIES EXPRESS GRIEF, CALL ON HIM TO REPENT</strong></td>
<td>NAACCP President condemned state officials for continuing to fly the Confederate flag, an ongoing issue that has worsened race relations in the South [...] It has become a symbol for some white supremacist groups.</td>
<td>he appears to be a “disaffected white supremacist,” based on his Facebook page, said Richard Cohen</td>
<td>The racial issue has remained a gnawing presence during the debate after the shooting. [...] NAACCP President Cornell William Brooks condemned the shooting as “an act of racial terrorism” and a hate crime that goes</td>
<td>“Every fiber in my body hurts, and I will never be the same,” said Felicia Sanders, the mother of victim Tywanza Sanders. “May God have mercy on you”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 18, 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td>a roommate of Roof’s, said that Roof “was big</td>
<td>“Charleston is like one family. We all</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


13 Online versions of dailies and magazines commonly utilize systems to refine research results, such as ‘Search Results’ + ‘Sort by: Relevance’. 
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Solidarity in Charleston before church victims' funerals</th>
<th>The slayings have renewed calls for the flag to be removed from the S.C. Statehouse grounds, in part because photographs of Roof [..] showed him holding Confederate flags</th>
<th>the hate embodied in the slayings at Emanuel AME</th>
<th>displays of unity as Charleston heals from a church massacre</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 22, 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 miles from Emanuel, someone vandalized a Confederate monument, spray-painting &quot;Black Lives Matter&quot; on the statue [..] along with the message &quot;This is the problem # RACIST&quot;</td>
<td>Area residents repeated messages of solidarity, love and even defiance of evil at the remembrances, hopeful their expressions would drown out the hate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. On lowering the flag</td>
<td>the psychic national need post-Charleston to do something took a remarkable direction: banishment of the Confederate flag [..]</td>
<td>Logically, the connection is tenuous [..]T here's a deeper reason for this rush to banish Confederate symbols [..]</td>
<td>The flag was not material to the crime itself [..] does anyone imagine that if the South Carolina flag had been relegated to a museum, the massacre would not have occurred?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 29, 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td>Within 48 hours of the murder of their loved ones, they spoke of redemption and reconciliation and even forgiveness of the killer himself</td>
<td>the breath taking display of nobility and spiritual generosity by the victims' relatives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. S.C. governor signs bill to remove Confederate</td>
<td>Nikki Haley signed a bill [..to] bring down the Confederate flag outside the</td>
<td>The flag first flew over the Statehouse dome in 1961 to mark</td>
<td>the tragedy was a massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FLAG FROM</strong></td>
<td><strong>Statehouse [...] “We will bring it down with dignity and we will make sure it is stored in its rightful place” Nikki Haley said</strong></td>
<td><strong>the 100th anniversary of the Civil War and was kept there as a symbol of official opposition to the civil rights movement [...] a historic but divisive symbol</strong></td>
<td><strong>Roof re-ignited a debate over the flag’s history as a symbol of white superiority and racial oppression</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPITOL GROUNDS</strong></td>
<td><strong>July 9, 2015</strong></td>
<td><strong>July 22, 2015</strong></td>
<td><strong>June 29, 2015</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. REBEL FLAG DOWN IN SOUTH CAROLINA, BUT OTHERS REMAIN</strong></td>
<td><strong>Chad Haden said [...] one of his ancestors fought for the Confederacy, and he does not want to see [...] the battle flag in South Carolina to come down. “It’s like they’re trying to take one bad thing from us, slavery, and they ignore the progress that was made before the war. They try to make us the villain. I’ve got a question: Is it just a hatred of Southerners?”</strong></td>
<td><strong>[Haley said] it was crucial to remove a symbol considered an emblem of slavery by many, “no one should ever drive by the Statehouse and feel pain”</strong></td>
<td><strong>Derrick Johnson, president of the Mississippi NAACP, has called on Bryant to bring about change. “It’s time to write the next chapter of our history”</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>November 1, 2015</strong></td>
<td><strong>A few white boys have attached a Confederate flag to their cars. One says [...] in defiance of authority, others usually quote heritage. We didn’t hear them define what exactly the heritage is. Have they asked fellow black students what they think?</strong></td>
<td><strong>The most dominant Confederate heritage is people who were enslaved and helped build American agriculture.</strong></td>
<td><strong>In 1863, the creator of the Confederate flag, W. T. Thompson, wrote, “we are fighting to maintain the Heaven-ordained supremacy of the white man over the inferior colored race... it would... be hailed by the civilized world as THE WHITE MAN’S FLAG.”</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1. ChG articles – foregrounded issues and words – the shaping of iconic notions*
4.1. Discussion

The issues of the flag as the foremost among the Confederate icons and symbols has been very strongly felt at the local level, and could not be easily dismissed. From our corpus we gather that, although the historic value of the flag is mentioned, it mainly appears as a ‘divisive symbol’ to be ‘removed’ or ‘taken down’. Predictably, the flag would eventually have come down. Yet, the massacre, and above all the moving reaction of the black community to it, demanded its immediate removal (Topos of Urgency + History) as a sign of reciprocity and reconciliation. This act of anti-racist diplomacy was performed thanks to the passionate speeches of Nikki R. Haley (the conservative governor of South Carolina and a former supporter of the Confederate flag), who immediately perceived this need and persuaded the conservative State legislature to remove the flag. Her attitude attracted international attention, and President Donald Trump named her as his choice to become ambassador to the United Nations (November 23, 2016).

However, across the ChG corpus, a lingering sensitivity to the notion of the Southerners’ historical legacy is tangible, even in the short excerpts of Table 2, ranging from varying degrees of respect and appreciation from the white community perspective (excerpts 3, 4, 5), to its thorough repudiation (1,6) from the black perspective, also enhanced by the BLM vision. In more detail, on the one hand, the flag is to be taken down “with dignity” (4), since it was not material to the crime itself and had been “hijacked” or “abducted” by racists (4) – Topos of Reality + Challenge. On the other hand, from the black perspective, the flag is a “foible”, and its “heritage IS racism” (6) – Topos of Reality + Justice. Hence, though both communities agreed on its removal, their different cultural frames display varying attitudes to that symbolic act. Such frames, however, find a substantial, if not fully perceived, common ground in sharing the language and common phrases: “mercy”, “display of nobility/forgiveness/solidarity/redemption”, “take down/removal of a symbol of hate”, “divisive symbol”, etc., which are generally utilized, differences in opinion notwithstanding. These shared expressions are increasingly common across the media coverage of these and similar events (e.g. the flag is to be removed “with dignity”, and Mother Emanuel is the symbol of the earliest expressions of “African-American dignity”), including the general representation of President Obama’s persona. To some extent, such phrases steer the lexicogrammar of the local and national discourse towards a representation of the US as a progressively more historical- and civil-rights-aware nation.

Paradoxically enough, Roof himself utilized popular protest phrases, e.g. when he wished for “something big like Trayvon Martin” (1), supposedly hoping for the opposite result, i.e. a race war instead of national solidarity (Topos of Burdening + History + Threat). We can see how, in this media-enhanced chain of events, names like Trayvon Martin have come to be part of the special lexicon of contemporary racial protest, which eventually will be taught in schools.

5. The DHA framing of the data from Time Magazine

Overall, the Time articles are less focused on the iconicity of the Confederate flag, and more on the meaning of forgiveness, against the background of the history of race relations in the US. As we will see, wider and more multifaceted perspectives are outlined.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTICLES</th>
<th>Controversial mediatic forgiveness</th>
<th>Stories matter, different mind frames</th>
<th>Icons – Emanuel AME Church v. the confederate Flag – and transformative actions</th>
<th>Re-emerging troublesome memories, evolving racial attitudes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Everything We Know About the Charleston Shooting June 18, 2015</td>
<td>The Attorney General has announced plans for the FBI to open a hate crime investigation [...] to make sure that justice is served. [...] The outpouring of unity and strength and fellowship and love across Charleston today, from all races, from all faiths [...] indicates [...] how the degree to which those old vestiges of hatred can be overcome.</td>
<td>We as a country will have to reckon with the fact that this type of mass violence does not happen in other advanced countries [...] we need to] be able to shift how we think about the issue of gun violence collectively.</td>
<td>Mother Emanuel is, in fact, more than a church, [...] some of our brightest leaders spoke and led marches from this church’s steps. This is a sacred place in the history of Charleston and [...] America.</td>
<td>Police are treating the shooting as a hate crime. The Dep. of Justice has launched a federal civil rights investigation into the incident.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Read President Obama’s Speech on the Charleston Church Shooting June 18, 2015</td>
<td>The Attorney General has announced plans for the FBI to open a hate crime investigation [...] to make sure that justice is served. [...] The outpouring of unity and strength and fellowship and love across Charleston today, from all races, from all faiths [...] indicates [...] how the degree to which those old vestiges of hatred can be overcome.</td>
<td>We as a country will have to reckon with the fact that this type of mass violence does not happen in other advanced countries [...] we need to] be able to shift how we think about the issue of gun violence collectively.</td>
<td>Mother Emanuel is, in fact, more than a church, [...] some of our brightest leaders spoke and led marches from this church’s steps. This is a sacred place in the history of Charleston and [...] America.</td>
<td>Police are treating the shooting as a hate crime. The Dep. of Justice has launched a federal civil rights investigation into the incident.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Here’s Why the Confederate Flag Is Still</td>
<td>Howard, a Democrat, [...] thinks the</td>
<td>Because of the strong support for the</td>
<td>So why is the Dixie Flag still flying?</td>
<td>The flag [...] has had a fraught history in the South since the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
<th>Quote</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 19, 2015</td>
<td>Massacre in Charleston has brought the legislature “closer to moving it than ever before.”</td>
<td>Confederate flag among many South Carolina voters, some political scientists said that advocating for flag removal is [...] political suicide.</td>
<td>Part of the answer is political.</td>
<td>Civil War, but supporters say it represents a symbol of Southern heritage, a history they associate with honor and valor, not racism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 21, 2015</td>
<td>The Rev. Norvel Goff [...] said the aftermath of the massacre has “been tough” but that the community will &quot;pursue justice [...] and hold our elected officials accountable to do the right thing.&quot;</td>
<td>The historic black church in Charleston, S.C., [...] held its first post-massacre worship service Sunday, bringing a sense of unity to the shattered city.</td>
<td>The murders at Emanuel must be fitted into the long struggle of America's race relations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 23, 2015</td>
<td>The most important message to come out of this tragedy is, sadly, the lesson that we will likely forget soonest: forgiveness.</td>
<td>So what was with the burst of momentary morality that had certain talk show hosts refusing to show the killer's face? [...] not to show Roof's face seemed not only disingenuous, but racial. Partisan politicians and the chattering class started manufacturing excuses about this tragedy.</td>
<td>Today saw South Carolina Governor Nikki Haley call for the immediate removal of the Confederate flag.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Instead of war, <em>Charleston erupted in grace,</em> The rev. Anthony Thompson [a victim's widow]</td>
<td>To quote King about the “beloved community” and not get serious about gun violence in America is [...] mangling of his message.</td>
<td>Never in my media career have I seen media outlets refuse to show the face of any adult black murderer. [...T]hey loop it. All day, all night.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>When is a terrorist not a terrorist? Apparently when he's a 21-year-old white male in America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 23, 2015

led by the survivors of the Emanuel [victims]. It happened suddenly, but not every survivor was on board. For some it was too soon, too simple. Even so, within 36 hours of the killings, and with pain racking their voices, family members stood in a small county courtroom to speak the language of forgiveness.

President Obama’s eulogy [...] shifted into song: “Amazing grace, how sweet the sound…”

“I forgive you.” Those three words reverberated through the courtroom and across the cable wires, down the fiber-optic lines, carried by invisible storms of ones and zeros that fill the air from cell
tells this calmly, but with intensity [...] what he chooses to remember [...] is Myra radiant just beyond his helpless reach.

But a story so freighted with shock and pain doesn’t end like a Hollywood movie, with the President singing and a divisive symbol coming down [...] Anger abides, even if the frank acknowledgment of it is now off script

Many of those themes [...] fear black freedom] were on the mind of the killer as he posted his manifesto on June 17

[...Roof] said he would let her live to tell the story of his deeds

M. Graham suspects that forgiving was far from the minds of most families. “During [...] that bond hearing two public symbol of South Carolina’s Civil War past, the Confederate battle flag, was removed from the state capitol grounds with relatively little of the controversy that had surrounded it for decades.

[In 1822] Emanuel Church was burned to the ground [...], reopened after the Civil War, [...but] church members continued to be segregated, intimidated and oppressed.

“I [Roof] chose Charleston because it is [the] most historic city in my state.”

and tangled history of race relations, racial violence and oppression that stem from America’s original sin.

The past is Charleston’s constant companion [...] slave quarters are repurposed as part of an upscale restaurant [...] there is much in the city’s past that needs forgiveness.

This real and symbolic oppression, maintained for generations, suggests that whites in Charleston and elsewhere continued to fear black freedom and did not expect forgiveness.

The forgivers of Charleston trace their beliefs [...] and cultural heritage to a communion of enslaved and degraded] forebears stripped of all liberty—except its essence [choose their own reaction]. This culture [...] promises, someday, [...] the liberation of the captive and the
5.1. Discussion

By far the most exhaustive coverage of the massacre in our corpus is to be found in (6), *How Do You Forgive A Killer?*, which accounts for the issues at stake from an integrative perspective. In brief, the article highlights how to tell stories, face sorrowful memories, unveil attitudes and re-frame the notion of forgiveness in a way that can help promote change. However, the way survivors and families told their stories of faith and forgiveness may also be read as a significant example of the self-perception of blacks as acting ‘under white eyes’, or as their “resignation to certain brutal realities” (6) – **TOPOS OF CHALLENGE + THREAT**. Indeed, families were divided over the issues of forgiveness, which was also regarded as an excuse to avoid difficult action (furthermore, the accused killer did not publicly display remorse). Here follows an excerpt from the interview of Reverend Waltrina Middleton, a relative of one of the victims, who tried to clarify the possible reasons why so many African Americans adhered to the narrative of forgiveness:

> The trouble with focusing on forgiveness in this story is that it might make white society more complacent while denying black victims a measure of their humanity. [...] Although the statements [of faith and forgiveness] at the bond hearing were genuine [...] the way the statements were immediately seized on as the true meaning of what happened took away our narrative to be rightfully hurt. I can’t turn off my pain. [...] You have people who already look at black people as being uncivilized [...] Thus, when the world suddenly looks at a community like Mother Emanuel there’s this great pressure to perform. Behave yourself! Don’t do this, don’t do that—because white people are watching. Look at how the media portrayed the anger of the people of Ferguson. [...] Or right here in Cleveland, a 12-year-old child, Tamir Rice, is shot to death by police. We’re not allowed to be angry? [...] Now you have the spotlight on Charleston and people are watching to see how these black folks are going to respond. Create this image of civility. We don’t want white people
uncomfortable. For that matter, where’s the talk of forgiveness when mass killers strike white communities? We have to tell the truth: the racism is real [my italics] 15.

It cannot be overlooked that the issue of the Confederate flag also occurs in the *Time* corpus, with Governor Nikki Haley calling for its immediate removal (TOPOS OF REALITY + HISTORY), and is mentioned “as symbolic of Southern heritage, a history they associate with honor and valor, not racism” (3) – TOPOS OF HISTORY + CHALLENGE. Yet, in the conclusions of David Von Drehle (editor-at-large for *Time*, and author of article 1, “HOW DO YOU FORGIVE A KILLER?”) we read that forgiveness at Charleston

was not born of a need to reassure white people, even if it may have had that effect. Nor was it simply the product of oppression, though the past can’t be separated from the present. It was an expression of genuine hearts. The nine lost lives belonged to church folk, Wednesday people, true believers. And their family members – for all their anger and shock and loss – all in their own ways seek to honor that and give them a victory despite the killer’s hatred.

What we are dealing with in the *Time* corpus is an interplay of complex black-perspective beliefs (5), also entailing volcanic reactions of pain and distress, and the struggle with the self-conscious feeling of being observed by the white Other – TOPOS OF HISTORY + CHALLENGE. Also, the chagrin at the choice of some media not to show Roof’s face seemed “not only disingenuous, but racial” (5) – TOPOS OF HISTORY + THREAT. The question ‘When is a terrorist not a terrorist?’ unveils controversial questions of identity construction, which are an overarching issue in racial discrimination (TOPOS OF HISTORY + CHALLENGE).

Yet, in many narratives powerful emotions are neutralized – “he tells this calmly, but with intensity […] what he chooses to remember” (6) – according to some as a way of avoiding both a display of ‘uncivilized’ behaviour (anger is “off script”) and the dreadful implications of racist violence. Overall, however, the Charleston religious community and the city showed a very different societal reaction from Ferguson, where violent protests took place. The mainstream narrative immediately foregrounded the lexicogrammar of forgiveness, as highlighted in the table above (“Charleston erupted in grace”, “I forgive you” etc.) and, dissident opinions notwithstanding, the “dignity” and “grace” of such forgiveness became salient.

6. Concluding remarks

In an interesting article (April 17, 2016) from the ChG, ‘Black Lives Matter’ a teachable moment, or too touchy for school? 16, we are informed of the angry reactions to an assignment by a seventh-grade teacher on a national movement to support racial equality – that is, BLM. If we focus on naming strategies, we notice that, interestingly, the teacher asked students, among other things, about the difference between the

treatment of Dylann Roof and Michael Brown. Briefly, for Roof, who is white, the media did not use the word ‘terrorism’, whereas the *New York Times* referred to Brown, who was black and unarmed, as ‘no angel’ in a story.

The role of lexicogrammar choices can be considered as central to the shaping of the transformative narratives that are expected to promote new awareness and change. The increasingly controversial ‘white privilege’ is also to be included in the set of this fast-evolving, context-connoted lexicogrammar of contemporary racial protest/discussion, which is here (provisionally) listed:

- *We are* / *I am Trayvon Martin*\(^1\)
- *Justice for Trayvon Martin*
- *Hoodie march*
- *Hands up, don’t shoot!*
- *Justice for Michael Brown*
- *I can’t breathe*
- *National debate/discussion about race*
- *Black lives Matter. Our black lives matter*
- *Blue Lives Matter*
- *All Lives Matter*\(^2\)
- *Dignity/grace*
- *Mercy/forgiveness*
- *White privilege*
- *Confederate flag/symbols*
- *No angel*
- *When is a terrorist not a terrorist?*

The grammatical dimension of these phrases ranges from the force of the imperative mood (*Hands up, don’t shoot!*) and the factuality of the indicative (*I can’t breathe*) to the naked essence of the verbless phrase (*Justice for Trayvon Martin/Michael Brown*). Fine-tuned, highly contextualized lexis is here enhanced by essential, vivid grammar patterns, which are highly compatible with the spontaneity of rallying cries.

Such iconic phrases are quickly becoming a kind of g/localized hypostasis, which resonate across the media, realizing transformative narratives, comments, etc. Unfortunately, space constraints did not allow reporting the context and journalistic instantiations of each of the above-mentioned phrases. From an applied linguistic perspective, future research could monitor the evolution and the spread of such patterns across wider corpora. However, qualitative linguistic analysis will be needed so as not to lose the necessary delicacy of focus. Special attention should be given to how American English is providing a common lexical terrain for the contrasting cultural frames realized along the intrinsically cross-cultural black consciousness vs. ‘white privilege’ and ‘white

\(^1\) We can speak of a proper Trayvon Martin movement, which also created a proactive Foundation “committed to ending senseless gun violence, strengthening families through holistic support, education for women and minorities and mentoring. Our strategy is to move from intervention to reform”: http://trayvonmartinfoundation.org/.

\(^2\) Both police officers, who tried to affirm that also ‘blue lives matter’, and people adopting also other perspectives (‘All lives matter’) tried to make their voices heard, but the specificities of the African American condition is still getting the full attention of the media.
supremacy’ spectrum. Such differing frames, with their emerging narratives, are all voiced via English – a possible bridge within one ‘disunited’ nation.

References


MEDICAL METAPHORS IN ECONOMICS NEWS ARTICLES IN ENGLISH AND ITALIAN

Barbara Cappuzzo
(University of Palermo, Italy)

Abstract
As Lakoff and Johnson (1980: 3) state in Metaphors We Live by, “our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature.” From a linguistic point of view, metaphors not only exist in everyday language but in specialized discourse too, where they are frequently the result of interdisciplinary borrowings. The language of economics, replete with medical metaphors, is one of the most representative examples of this phenomenon.
This paper offers a quantitative and qualitative analysis of medical metaphors in English and Italian economics news discourse, as no research seems to have been conducted so far on the topic from a cross-linguistic perspective for the two languages in question.
Medical metaphors were investigated in two corpora of economic articles published between 2014 and 2016 and drawn, respectively, from the Financial Times (https://www.ft.com/) for the English language, and Il Sole 24 Ore for the Italian language (http://www.ilsole24ore.com/).
The contrastive analysis aims at highlighting the level of pervasiveness of medical metaphors over non-metaphorically used medical terms/expressions in both corpora, and at identifying categories of metaphorical reasoning in the two languages.
The results show that both corpora were replete with metaphorically used medical terms, with the Italian corpus showing a higher tendency to use medical terms metaphorically as compared to the English corpus. Moreover, the investigation revealed ten categories of metaphorical meaning in both the English and the Italian data and equivalent realizations within the same metaphorical category. Only a limited number of cases of different realizations within the same metaphorical category were identified from the comparison between the two languages.
The results ultimately highlight that health/medical-related matters are a crucial source of inspiration in the conceptualization of English and Italian economics news discourse.

1. Introduction

1.1. The traditional view and the Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT)
Metaphor has attracted human interest ever since ancient times. Views on metaphor fall into two main schools, the traditional metaphor school and the modern metaphor school, following, respectively, the line of rhetoric and the line of cognition. Studies
on metaphor in the line of rhetoric can be traced back to Aristotle who, in his *Poetics* (1457b), offers a definition of metaphor:

> Metaphor consists in giving the thing a name that belongs to something else; the transfer-
> ence being either from genus to species, or from species to genus, or from species to species,
> or on grounds of analogy.

Here Aristotle presages the central tenet of the traditional view of metaphor, namely that metaphor is the transfer of one word to another, a deviation from the literal meaning to a figurative one, therefore a rhetorical device used to enhance vigour and embellishment in expressions. In other words, metaphor is a stylistic ornament and, as such, only a select few can create and manipulate it.

Lakoff and Johnson’s seminal work *Metaphors We Live By*, published in 1980, brought a revolution in studies of metaphor and marked the beginning of the Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT) – which would enormously affect future metaphor research.

In Lakoff and Johnson’s (1980: 3) view, metaphor is not just a matter of language but first and foremost a fundamental mechanism of the mind that shapes the understanding of our experience:

> The concepts that govern our thought are not just matters of the intellect. They also govern our everyday functioning, down to the most mundane details. Our concepts structure what we perceive, how we get around in the world, and how we relate to other people. If we are right in suggesting that our conceptual system is largely metaphorical, then the way we think, what we experience, and what we do every day is very much a matter of metaphor.

What is innovative in their theory is that metaphor is conceived as being an integral part of our sensory system, like sight, touch and all the other senses which allow us to perceive the world. In *The Contemporary Theory of Metaphor*, Lakoff (1993: 205) claims that “metaphor can be understood as a mapping (in the mathematical sense) from a source domain to a target domain.” The scholar explains that there are ontological correspondences according to which entities from a given domain correspond systematically to entities in another domain. These correspondences – that characterize the human mind – are called conceptual metaphors.

Within this view, the linguistic utterance – also referred to as “linguistic expression” (Lakoff and Johnson 1980: 6; Lakoff 1993: 202), “metaphorical expression” (Lakoff and Johnson 1980: 7) or “metaphorical linguistic expression” (*ibid.*) – is nothing but the manifest realization of our cognitive processing of reality. In other words, “linguistic metaphors are the reflection in language of the conceptual metaphors that structure our thought and help define our understanding of reality” (Nacey 2013: 19).

A strong tenet of CMT is that metaphors do not stem from existing similarities between two different conceptual domains but rather they create similarities. By doing so, “metaphors may create realities” (Lakoff and Johnson 1980: 145). Hereunder (*ibid.*; 146) is one of the central moments where the scholars give an insight into the cognitive role of metaphor as a means of understanding and constructing reality:

> The social reality defined by a culture affects its conception of physical reality. What is real for an individual as a member of a culture is a product both of his social reality and of the
way in which that shapes his experience of the physical world. Since much of our reality is understood in metaphorical terms, and since our conception of the physical world is partly metaphorical, metaphor plays a very significant role in determining what is real for us.

Another crucial belief in Lakoff and Johnson’s (ibid.: 3) view concerns the fundamental role that language plays in helping understand how our conceptual system works. They state:

Since communication is based on the same conceptual system that we use in thinking and acting, language is an important source of evidence for what that system is like.

Therefore, like two sides of the same coin, investigating language means investigating the mind, and since language is the primary vehicle through which the mind gives evidence of how it perceives reality, the linguistic approach to metaphor is paramount.

1.2. Aims of the present study

Lakoff and Johnson’s (1980) new insights into the understanding of metaphor have resulted in a more complex and articulated investigation of metaphor in recent years, as scrutiny of metaphor entails encompassing several – often interrelated – disciplines ranging from cognitive linguistics to philosophy, from psychology to psycholinguistics, from sociology to education, and from descriptive and applied linguistics to translation and cultural studies.

To limit the boundaries of the research, the present study aims at describing, mainly from a linguistic point of view, medical metaphors used in the domain of economics, and, by adopting a cross-linguistic perspective, at comparing English and Italian, as no contrastive research seems to have been carried out to date on the specific topic in the two languages in question. The paper, which falls within the theoretical framework of the CMT discussed above, will mostly aim at exploring possible similarities and differences in patterns of metaphorical use of medical terms/expressions between the two languages. From a quantitative point of view, the contrastive analysis will focus on the investigation of the probability of medical terms/expressions included in an economic context being used metaphorically. Previous studies (Urbonaité and Šeškauskienė 2007; Clément 2003) have, in fact, highlighted the remarkable influence of medicine on economic discourse. Thus, in this study, frequency of metaphorically used terms/expressions drawn from the field of medicine is expected to be high in both languages.

Before going into the core of the work, an overview of the main studies on metaphor in specialized discourse in general and on the language of economics in particular will be given in the three following subsections. More specifically, for the purpose of this work subsection 1.5 will give an account of the research carried out on metaphors drawn from the field of medicine.

1.3. Linguistic research on metaphor in specialized discourse

In the last twenty years, linguistic research on metaphor has shifted its attention to what has been perceived as lacking in metaphor studies, namely investigation in specialized discourse (Giles 2008; Grishman and Kittredge 1986; Hermann 2013; Hermann and Sardinha 2015; Kermas 2009; Klamer and Leonard 1994; Krennmayr 2011; Littlemore 2012; Muschard 2007; Musolff 2004; Pasma 2011; RicharTdt 2005; Semino
2008; White and Herrero 2012). Semino (2008) discusses the use of metaphor across several genres, from politics to education, to literature and advertising, and analyses different text types, e.g. election leaflets and scientific articles. Giles (2008) examines the fundamental importance that metaphor has in explaining science, and by highlighting its epistemological relevance he suggests foregrounding the use of metaphor in both textbooks and in the classroom. Muschard (2007) explores categories and frequency of occurrence of metaphors in the language of linguistics as a language for specific purposes (LSP), while Kermas (2009), who focuses her attention on the role of metaphor in the demarcation between academic discourse and popular texts, agrees with Richardt’s (2005: 249) claim that “metaphorical thinking can [...] not be overcome by scientific formalization and precision [...and that] metaphor-free science is an illusion.”

1.4. Metaphor research in the language of economics

The ever-increasing enrichment of metaphorical expressions and words in economic discourse justifies the considerable amount of linguistic research carried out on the phenomenon so far (Arrese 2015; Boers 1999; Cardini 2014; Charteris-Black 2000; Clément 2003; Esager 2011; Gotti 2003; Horner 2011; Joris et al. 2014; Kermas 2006; Klamer and Leonard 1994; Langer 2015; McCloskey 1983; Picard 2015; Resche 2013; Richardt 2005; Telibasa 2015; Wang et al. 2013; Warren 2013). Nowadays, numerous metaphors have become so well established that their metaphorical value is no longer perceived. “Elasticity of demand”, “economic depression”, “imbalance in market trends”, and “competition among firms” (Gotti 2003: 57) are but a few examples. These and other expressions are by now referred to as ‘dead metaphors’ as their markedness has gradually been lost. However, it is worth mentioning that Lakoff and Johnson (1980) reject the term ‘dead’ when referring to even the most conventional metaphors, as their use is so deeply-rooted that they cannot be considered ‘dead’ in any way. The abundance of metaphors in the language of economics is pointed out by McCloskey (1983: 507) who states that “if economists are not comparing a social fact to a one-to-one mapping, thus bringing two separate domains into cognitive and emotional relation, they are not thinking.” Richardt (2005: 115) justifies the widespread use of metaphors in economics by explaining that economic matters are particularly complex and economic processes do not have physical activity or direct experiential phenomena. The complexity and breadth of economics can be found in one of the many definitions that have been offered of the subject. As a matter of fact, no unanimous opinion exists among modern experts. The most commonly accepted definition is that offered by Samuelson (1976: 3) who, taking inspiration from the English economist Lionel Robbins (1932), states:

Economics is the study of how people and society end up choosing, with or without the use of money, to employ scarce productive resources that could have alternative uses, to produce various commodities and distribute them for consumption, now or in the future, among various persons and groups in society. It analyses the costs and benefits of improving patterns of resource allocation.

Previous studies on economic metaphors have revealed that the economy is generally conceptualized in terms of the source domains MACHINE (Picard 2015; Telibasa 2015; Richardt 2005), BODY/HUMAN BEING (Telibasa 2015; Richardt 2005; Cardini 2014), WAR (Richardt 2005, Kovács 2007), NATURAL PHENOMENA including WEATH-
ER CHANGES or NATURAL DISASTERS (Charteris-Black and Ennis 2001; Kovács 2007), BUILDING (Picard 2015; Richardt 2005), LIQUID, SPORTS, JOURNEY, UP/DOWN (Richardt 2005).

1.5. Medical metaphors in the language of economics

The close relationship between medical and economic sciences dates back to the beginning of the 17th century. Gradually, medical discoveries began to transfer knowledge to the nascent science of economics, thus providing the latter with a more structured and concrete framework for new abstract concepts. The ever-increasing use of medical metaphors in the language of economics has attracted much attention in linguistic studies in recent years. Research has been carried out from different perspectives, with the focus of attention being either on a specific type of metaphor or on different types of metaphors in more fine-grained and comprehensive investigations. Boers and Demecheleer (1995) carried out a contrastive analysis of HEALTH metaphors (besides PATH and WAR metaphors) in English, Dutch, and French, and found major quantitative differences between English and Dutch, while no significant contrast was identified between English and French. Urbonaité and Šeškauskiené (2007) compared HEALTH metaphors in English and Lithuanian economic and political discourse and discovered that both languages use health metaphors to conceptualize (economic and political) problems, with English showing metaphors twice as frequently in comparison with Lithuanian. Picard (2015) points out that in newspaper language economics-related problems and difficulties are often conceptualized in terms of various conditions. Markets “may need to pause and GO ON A DIET in order to avoid INDIGESTION” (Resche 2013: 158). An economic crisis is frequently described as an illness or an ailment of the organism (Charteris-Black and Ennis 2001; Horner 2011; Wang et al. 2013), or as a transmittable virus or contagion (Peckham 2013). Miettinen (2010: 211-212) speaks about the medicalization of the economy, while Clément (2003), who carried out a study on the influence of medicine on political economy discourse, defines economists as “prisoners of metaphor” as they “justify their own practices by analogy with medicine.”

2. Corpus and methodology

The corpus used for cross-linguistic investigation of medical metaphors in English and Italian economic language consists of texts from two newspapers, respectively Il Sole 24 Ore for Italian, and the Financial Times for English. Besides the level of specialization in the field, the criteria for choice took into account such homogeneity of features as periodicity and type of readership. Both Il Sole 24 Ore and the Financial Times are highly specialized economic and financial dailies, and both newspapers are recognized as the most authoritative information tools in the field of economics in their respective countries (Wikipedia 2016). Readers are often experts in the field, namely specialists, public administration managers, and financial investors. The long tradition of both Il Sole 24 Ore, founded in 1865, and of the Financial Times, founded in 1888, in dealing with economic and financial topics was an additional factor of similarity that contributed to opting for the two dailies for the purpose of the present study.

All selected articles were published between 2014 and 2016, with topics ranging from the global economic crisis to questions largely dominated by and connected to
Brexit and the last US presidential election campaign. Sixty articles including medical/health-related terminology (also when this was included only in headlines) were randomly selected for both the Financial Times and Il Sole 24 Ore subcorpora (henceforth corpus/corpora for convenience). The Financial Times corpus accounted for 52,210 words, and Il Sole 24 Ore corpus accounted for 39,420 words. All medical/health-related words were analysed independently of the grammar categories they belonged to (nouns, adjectives, verbs, etc.). Qualitative analysis was carried out, as well as quantitative investigation supported by Wordsmith Tools 5.0 (Scott 2007) for frequency counts and word lists. Initially, a word list of all medical terms was made, including anatomical terminology. Then, all occurrences of each term were (manually) examined in context to identify their metaphorical or non-metaphorical use. As expected, not all medical terms included in the data were used metaphorically, as some articles dealt with medical/health-related topics (e.g. the incidence of vaccinations on the economy of a country). The metaphorically and non-metaphorically used terms were subdivided into three groups depending on their frequency range (see Tables 1 and 2). Finally, the metaphorical use of medical terms was described and a contrastive analysis was carried out, accompanied by illustrating excerpts from the two investigated newspapers. The study was supported by the use of specialized dictionaries for each domain and language 1.

3. Results

3.1. Quantitative analysis

The results from the investigation of occurrences of health/medical-related metaphors in the English and Italian data are shown in Tables 1 and 2 below. All nouns were counted distinctly for both their metaphorical and non-metaphorical use. Number (singular or plural) for nouns was not considered in the word list count of medical terms/expressions and consequently nouns and adjectives with different numbers (e.g. AILMENT/AILMENTS for the English corpus and SANA/SANE for the Italian one) were counted as single words in the word list of medical terms/expressions. The same criteria were adopted for derivatives (e.g. BLOOD/BLOODY/BLEEDING and DEBOLE/DEBOLEZZA/INDEBOLITO etc.) as the common basic concept/semantic root word was considered.

The investigation of medical metaphors in the Financial Times corpus yielded 142 cases of 32 different metaphorically used medical terms, accounting for 55.9% of the total number of medical occurrences. By contrast, non-metaphorically used medical words accounted for 44.1% of total medical occurrences. This means that in the corpus investigated the incidence of medical terms considering both metaphorical and non-metaphorical frequencies was 0.5%, and of metaphorically used medical terms 0.3%.

1 The Stedman’s Medical Dictionary (2013), the Merriam Webster Medical Dictionary (http://www.merriam-webster.com/medical) and the Oxford Dictionary of Business and Management (2016) were used for the English language, and Chiampo (1988) Dizionario Enciclopedico di Medicina, Dizionario di Medicina (http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/medicina_(Dizionario-di-Medicina)/), and Dizionario di Economia e Finanza (2012) (http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/economia-pubblica_(Dizionario-di-Economia-e-Finanza)/) for the Italian language. The Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary (2015) was also consulted whenever a given word/expression was metaphorically used but a check to verify its belonging to the medical domain was needed.
MEDICAL METAPHORS IN ECONOMICS NEWS ARTICLES IN ENGLISH AND ITALIAN

The *Il Sole 24 Ore* corpus yielded 79 cases of 23 different metaphorically used medical terms/expressions, accounting for 61.2% of the total number of occurrences. As a consequence, the percentage of non-metaphorically used medical terms accounted for 38.8% of the total number of occurrences. The incidence of medical terms considering both metaphorical and non-metaphorical frequencies was 0.3%, and of metaphorically used medical terms 0.2%.

The quantitative comparison between the English and the Italian data did not show significant differences in the incidence of metaphorical use of medical terms. More than half of the total number of occurrences of medical terms were used metaphorically in each corpus. More precisely, considering the frequency of medical metaphors in relation to the total number of occurrences of medical terms (metaphorically and non-metaphorically used) in each corpus, the Italian data showed a higher tendency to use terms metaphorically as compared to the English data. Interestingly enough, from the quantitative comparison of the two corpora it emerged that the most frequently used medical metaphors in both languages were those included in the lexical group *WEAK/WEAKEN/WEAKENED/WEAKNESS/ES* (44 overall occurrences, accounting for 30.9% of all metaphors) for the English data, and the corresponding Italian *DEBOLE/DEBOLEZZA/INDEBOLIMENTO/INDEBOLIRE/INDEBOLIRSI/INDEBOLITO* (22 overall occurrences, accounting for 27.8% of all metaphors) for the Italian data. Moreover, the *WEAKNESS*
group, all lexemes of which were used metaphorically, was distributed across 17 different texts (28.3% of all texts), and in the Italian data the corresponding DEBOLEZZA group was distributed across 14 texts (23.3% of all texts). The most frequent term within the WEAKNESS/DEBOLEZZA metaphor group in both corpora was the adjective WEAK/DEBOLE, respectively, 54.5% of occurrences within the group and 16.9% of all metaphors in the English data, and 59.0% of occurrences within the group and 16.4% of all metaphors in the Italian data.

The following three most frequent metaphors were, respectively, RECOVERY (19.0% of all metaphors) and DIAGNOSIS (7.7%) for the English corpus, and CURA/CURARSI (12.6%) and PATOLOGIA/E (6.3%), for the Italian corpus. Finally, the English data manifested a larger variety of metaphorically used medical terms as compared to those in the Italian counterpart, possibly due to the relatively higher number of overall English tokens.

3.2. Qualitative analysis

In this subsection an account will be given of medical terms/expressions resulting from the comparison between the English and the Italian economic corpora. Initially, the investigation will focus on the metaphors the two corpora have in common. First, these will be listed according to the types of mappings between source and target domains; then they will be investigated separately and accompanied by the most significant extracts showing how economic issues are conceptualized in both languages data. Finally, metaphors the two corpora do not have in common will be examined.

The shared mappings fall into the following types:

1. THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT/PAZIENTE
2. THE CONDITION OF THE ECONOMY AND ECONOMIC INSTITUTIONS IS HEALTH/SALUTE
3. BAD CONDITION IS WEAKNESS/DEBOLEZZA
4. PROBLEM IS PATHOLOGICAL CONDITION/CONDIZIONE PATOLOGICA
5. PROBLEM IS VIRUS
6. MANIFESTLY NEGATIVE CHARACTERISTICS ARE SYMPTOMS/SINTOMI
7. PROBLEM LASTING A LONG TIME IS CHRONIC/CRONICO
8. IDENTIFICATION OF PROBLEMS IS DIAGNOSIS/DIAGNOSI
9. INTERVENTION IS CURE/CURA
10. GETTING BACK TO NORMALITY IS RECOVERY/HEALING/GUARIGIONE

In the extracts 1-43 below all medical metaphors will be underlined, including those which are not the object of investigation in a specific part of the present subsection.

---

2 With regard to excerpts, it seems worth clarifying that since the description of economic issues in newspapers often involves the actions of public authorities, economic journalism often overlaps with political journalism (see Richardt 2005: 116). Therefore, it will be no surprise if a few quoted text strings manifest a predominantly political character and do not include strictly economic-related topics.
1. THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT/PAZIENTE

1. En: The role of the economic doctor is to keep the patient alive: preventing the financial system from collapse and sustaining demand. (*FT*, Nov 25, 2014)

2. It: La politica espansiva della Banca Centrale Europea è una cura ipotetica. Ma nessun paziente che non abbia voglia di superare il male può davvero guarire. (*Il Sole*, Sep 13, 2014)

(The expansive policy of the European Central Bank is a hypothetical cure. No patient who is unwilling to overcome the ill can actually recover)³.

As can be seen from the extracts above, the economy is openly conceptualized in terms of a PATIENT/PAZIENTE in both the English and the Italian data.

Despite not being the most significant from a strictly numerical point of view (3.8% in the English data and 1.3% in the Italian data), THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT metaphor is discussed first, as it represents the superordinate anthropocentric metaphor which all other metaphors converge on in both corpora. It is the most important metaphor type in the data in that the other metaphors originate from it. In THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT metaphor the source domain (PATIENT) is mapped onto the target domain at different levels. If the economy is perceived as a PATIENT, consequently the general conditions of the state of the economy are conceptualized as HEALTH, problems and difficulties become DISEASES and/or AILMENTS. Moreover, the identification of problems is conceptualized in terms of DIAGNOSIS (as the following metaphors will illustrate), etc. In the above-mentioned English extract (1), the expert economist is conceptualized as a DOCTOR whose task is that of preventing the economy/PATIENT from collapsing. In the same way, in the Italian extract (2) the politics of the European Central Bank is thought of as a cure (CURA) and returning to normality is ‘recovering’ (GUARIRE).

2. THE CONDITION OF THE ECONOMY IS HEALTH/SALUTE

3. En: The IMF’s warning on banks’ health came as it fretted that low interest rates in the eurozone were not sufficient to support risk-taking that was beneficial to economic growth, but might nevertheless be encouraging the build-up of financial vulnerabilities. (*FT*, Oct 8, 2014)

4. The UK has to rectify longstanding supply-side failings. The list includes: low investment […] and a corporate sector whose leaders are motivated more by the share price than by the long-term health of the business. (*FT*, Sep 29, 2016)

5. It: Se le banche vengono private della capacità di erogare credito, si mette in pericolo la stabilità economica dei mercati in cui operano, con ulteriori danni alla salute delle banche stesse. (*Il Sole*, Nov 13, 2016)

³ The translations are mine.
(If the banks are deprived of the capability to allocate credit, the economic stability of the markets where they operate is endangered, with further damage to the health of the banks themselves).


(The health of the Italian economy can be appreciated through many other keyholes. What does the prickly stenography of the data tell us?).

The CONDITION OF THE ECONOMY IS HEALTH metaphor (2.1% of metaphorical occurrences in the English data, and 5% in the Italian data) is used in the same way in the English extract (3) and in the Italian extract (5) to refer to the condition of banks. HEALTH is also used to refer to the situation of business in the two remaining occurrences of the English data (one in extract 4), and to that of the economy in the three remaining occurrences of the Italian data (one of which is illustrated in extract 6).

3. BAD CONDITION IS WEAKNESS/DEBOLEZZA

As already mentioned in subsection 3.2., the WEAKNESS group metaphor was the most represented shared metaphor in the English and Italian corpora. Its several uses in both languages will be shown below:

7. Even Germany, with many fewer structural rigidities, is sputtering because of continued weakness in domestic demand. (FT, Dec 10, 2014)

8. Le indicazioni provenienti dalla Fed hanno indotto gli investitori sui mercati Forex a scommettere contro lo yen [...]. Inoltre ha inciso la debolezza dello yen sulla sterlina dopo la sconfitta degli indipendentisti scozzesi al referendum. (Il Sole, Sep 19, 2014)

(The directions coming from the Fed have led investors on the Forex markets to bet against the yen. Moreover, the weakness of the yen over the pound after the defeat of the Scottish independentists weighed heavily).

9. Household income growth, after taking account of inflation, was weak, with disposable income falling 0.6 per cent in the quarter. (FT, Dec 23, 2016)

10. Chiusura debole per le Borse europee, con l’attività ridotta ai minimi termini in vista delle festività natalizie e della chiusura dell’anno. (Il Sole, Dec 22, 2016)

(Weak closing for the European stock markets, with activity being reduced to the lowest terms in view of the Christmas holidays and the end of the year).

11. Yields on sovereign bonds have fallen and the euro has weakened. (FT, Dec 10, 2014)


(Has Brexit weakened the West?)
13. The UK economy is highly dependent on inward foreign direct investment, which Brexit would seem virtually to weaken. (FT, Sep 29, 2016)


(The economic recovery of the Eurozone is resisting the shock due to Brexit [...] However – as Williamson said – if growth keeps on weakening in Spain and Italy, the rising wave of employment will inevitably be put under pressure).

As can be seen, in both the English and Italian data the source concept of “lack of strength or potency” (Stedman’s Medical Dictionary 2013) is transferred to several target economic topics, ranging from demand (7) to currencies (yen and euro, respectively in extracts 8 and 11), from incomes (9) to stock markets (10), from investments (13) to economic growth (14). The use of the adjective WEAK did not show significant differences in two languages. In most cases it collocated with banks, currencies, economic growth, and European stock markets.

As for the noun WEAKNESS, in the English corpus it was also used as a synonym of “disease”, as the following example illustrates:

15. The implications of a realistic view of the UK economy is that, even without the looming shock of Brexit, the economy suffers from big weaknesses relative to the European economies that many Brexiteers despise. […] Yet devaluation will not cure UK weaknesses. (FT, Sep 29, 2016)

The identification of WEAKNESS with “disease” is generated from the use of the verb SUFFER before the first occurrence of WEAKNESSES, and that of CURE before the second occurrence. As already shown by the quantitative results, the use of WEAK/DEBOLE and their corresponding derivatives is rather pervasive in both the English and Italian corpora. Its contextual meaning is basically that of “not financially strong or successful” (Oxford Advanced Learner’s Dictionary 2015), with the phenomenon basically representing a sign of conventionality of the metaphor in question in the language of economics.

4 PROBLEM IS PATHOLOGICAL CONDITION/CONDIZIONE PATOLOGICA

16. Anecdotal evidence of paralysis and decline abounds. Some younger employees at Tata are struggling to obtain mortgages or loans [...]. (FT, Oct 9, 2016)

17. La trappola della liquidità si sostanzia nella paralisi di due anelli di trasmissione: uno che va dalla banca centrale alle banche ed i mercati finanziari, l’altro che arriva all’economia reale ⁴. (Il Sole, Mar 11, 2016)

⁴ The concept of liquidity trap was developed by the 20th-century British economist J. M. Keynes to describe a “situation in which investors hold on to cash because they are worried about the likelihood of a fall in the price of financial assets. Keynes argued that in these circumstances monetary policy becomes ineffective.” (Oxford Dictionary of Business and Management 2016).
(The liquidity trap consists in the paralysis of two rings of transmission: one goes from the central bank to the banks and the financial markets, the other arrives at the real economy).

18. Even for debts that are no longer being serviced by the commonwealth, prices have climbed. [...] It’s a recognition that the board will focus on the real causes of the ailment. (FT, Sep 20, 2016)

19. Nessuna recessione è mai stata così lunga. [...] E non sappiamo ancora fino a che punto durerà la notte. La nostra patologia politica ha davvero tratti anoressizzanti. (Il Sole, Sep 13, 2014)

(No recession has ever been so long-lasting. [...] And we still don’t know how long the night will be. Our political pathology really has anorexia traits).


21. Nessun paziente che non abbia voglia di superare il male può davvero guarire. (Il Sole, Sep 13, 2014)

(No patient who is unwilling to overcome the illness can actually recover).

The metaphorical use of PARALYSIS in extracts 16 and 17 is rather striking at an emotional level. In medicine the term “paralysis” refers to the “loss of power of voluntary movement in a muscle through injury or disease of it or its nerve supply” (Stedman’s Medical Dictionary 2013). The source concept of paralysis, therefore, encompasses those of immobility, motionlessness, and impotence, which are all mapped and transferred onto target economic issues, in the specific cases the difficult condition of a group of employees of a steel-making company (Tata) in extract 16, and the finance and banking situation consequent to the liquidity trap in extract 17. Moreover, as in medicine paralysis is a pathological condition generally caused by another disease (or injury), the result is that in a context other than the medical one its cause is also perceived as a disease (or an injury). The crisis hitting the Tata company in extract 16 and the liquidity trap in extract 17 are the diseases/injuries which, respectively, caused the above-mentioned problematic economic conditions.

In extracts 18 and 19, two other economic phenomena are conceptualized as diseases, that is, respectively, inflation and recession. More precisely, the former is referred to by the general term AILMENT, the latter by PATOLOGIA first, and identified as a specific emotional and behavioural disorder later (“ANOREXIA”).

Finally, a particular type of PROBLEM IS PATHOLOGICAL CONDITION metaphor found in both the English and the Italian data concerns the English ILLS and the corresponding Italian (in the singular form) MALE. Both are used, respectively, in the sense of “illness” and “malattia” (see extracts 20 and 21), as confirmed by Stedman’s Medical Dictionary (2013) which does not include “ill” in the list of its headwords, and by the Dizionario Enciclopedico di Medicina (1988) where “male” is registered as mere synonym of “malattia.” As for the English language in particular, the Oxford Advanced Learners’ Dictionary (2015), which does not frame the term within the medical domain (as non-specialized), offers the following definition of “ill”: “a problem or harmful thing;
an illness”, and registers the examples “social and economic ills”, where the metaphorical use of the term in question is manifest.

5. PROBLEM IS VIRUS

22. What links this advanced economy political risk with its EM cousin is low trust in institutions and elites – political and business elites, [...]. It is trust, plus belief in the future, not growth alone, that immunises the body politic against the populist virus. (FT, Nov 1, 2016)

23. In questo discorso entra anche l’allarme per il rischio di focolai di violenza destabilizzante, eversiva che non possiamo sottovalutare, fuori da ogni etichettatura di destra o sinistra. Virus di questo genere circolano ancora in certi spezzi di sinistra estrema [...]. (Il Sole, Dec 11, 2014)

(There is also agitation over the risk of foci of destabilizing, subversive violence that we can’t underestimate, beyond any left or right wing labels. Such viruses still circulate in certain extremist left-wing groups).

In the extracts above, the conceptual mapping is between VIRUS (source) and populist behaviour  (target) in the English data, and between VIRUS (source) and violent conduct (target) in the Italian data. In medical terms, a virus is defined as a group of “infectious agents that are capable of growth and multiplication and that cause important infectious diseases in humans, animals, and plants” (Merriam-Webster Medical Dictionary). Therefore, the contextual meaning of virus in both English and Italian examples is “something negative” which, perceived as a virus, circulates, spreads, and is communicable. As a consequence, in the Italian example “destabilizing violence” is perceived as a disease, more precisely as a serious and contagious disease that is also likely to have socially dangerous hubs of violence, in the same way as a disease may have focuses of microorganisms which are harmful for health. The same considerations can be expressed for the English extract, where populism is a disease too, and where protective measures (“trust” and “belief in the future”) are thought of as something that IMMUNIZES the BODY politic.

As was observed for THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT metaphor, also the PROBLEM IS A VIRUS metaphor characterizes itself as a metaphor activating mental schemata which are mapped from familiar source domains onto abstract and more complex target domains.

6. MANIFESTLY NEGATIVE CHARACTERISTICS ARE SYMPTOMS/SINTOMI

24. European markets threw a tantrum last week. Investors expected more than the European Central Bank president’s open-ended pledge to keep buying €60bn of bonds each month until, or even beyond, March 2017. But I think Mario Draghi, ECB president, actually got the prescription just right. His diagnosis is not an easy one – weaning the eurozone economy off its monetary stimulus is like taking a patient off its medicine. Too quick and you leave the patient suffering withdrawal symptoms. But if the patient is already in recovery, too many drugs can be detrimental. Drug-dependent markets might have hoped for more of an injection but, with the patient looking surprisingly “normal”, increasing
quantitative easing (QE) at this stage could do more harm than good, boosting a recovery that might already be under way. (*FT*, Dec 9, 2015)


(ECB. Is the therapy the right one or not? Here are the symptoms that Draghi must keep an eye on. Is the cure that Draghi is administering to Euroland effective enough? Is his policy not expansive enough or too expansive?).

The extracts reported above were chosen to show another metaphorically used medical term in both investigated corpora, i.e. *SYMPTOMS/SINTOMI*. *SYMPTOMS* (extract 24) was included within an article where medical metaphors abounded. For this reason, it was decided to quote the whole string of text containing all metaphors used in the article and show it as a valid example of how rich the medical domain is as a source of cognitive and therefore linguistic inspiration for reasoning in an economic context. As can be observed by reading extract 24, THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT metaphor is the basic metaphor pervading the discourse. All other metaphors are the result of the consequential mappings that THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT metaphor has activated. These are: RECOMMENDATION IS PRESCRIPTION, IDENTIFICATION OF PROBLEM IS DIAGNOSIS, SOLUTION/REMEDY TO PROBLEM IS MEDICINE/DRUG, NEED FOR SPECIFIC POLICIES IS DRUG-DEPENDENCY, INTERVENTION MEASURE IS INJECTION, RETURN TO NORMALITY IS RECOVERY.

As far as the use of *SYMPTOMS/SINTOMI* is concerned, in the English extract it is adopted to conceptualize the manifest negative characteristics consequent to the interruption of financial measures, the withdrawal of which is perceived as the unpleasant effects of not taking drugs after having become addicted to them. As for the Italian extract, *SINTOMI* is used to conceptualize the negative manifestations of the European Central Bank that (President) Draghi must take into account in order to find the right corresponding solution (*CURA*).

Most likely, the choice for *SYMPTOMS/SINTOMI* was due to the need for the use of a familiar and unequivocally medical-related term, whereas the possibly more appropriate “signs”/“segni” would have seemed too technical and/or not immediately perceived in its metaphorical value, thus appearing less effective.

**7. PROBLEM LASTING A LONG TIME IS CHRONIC/CRONICO**

**26.** The lack of symmetry in the Eurozone is a major reason for chronic and unsustainable imbalances. (*FT*, Dec 30, 2016)

**27.** Il rischio è che alcuni meccanismi deflattivi si miscelino a fenomeni psicologici e producano prima un intorpidimento cronico e poi una necrosi del nostro sistema industriale. (*IL SOLE*, Sep 13, 2014)

(The risk is that some deflationary mechanisms can be blended with psychological phenomena and produce initially chronic numbness and later necrosis of our industrial system).
In both extracts, a long-lasting phenomenon is thought of as a chronic disease or dysfunction. The image of the economy perceived as a patient is more marked in the Italian extract, where *CHRONIC* is associated with *INTORPIDIMENTO* (numbness) and followed by another metaphorically used medical term, i.e. *NECROSI*, which is employed to conceptualize the ‘death’ of the industrial system.

8. IDENTIFICATION OF PROBLEM IS DIAGNOSIS/DIAGNOSI

28. The Eurozone needs a fiscal capacity independent of that of the national governments [...] The fiscal compact is not fit for purpose, first and foremost because it panders to a fantasy that the euro crisis was a fiscal crisis. Wrong diagnosis leads to wrong prognosis. *(FT, Jan 4, 2015)*

29. La riunione di giugno della Banca centrale europea, che non ha reintrodotto l’attesa deroga sui titoli greci, ha solo leggermente alterato la diagnosi sulla situazione economica di Eurolandia. *(Il Sole, Jun 2, 2016)*

(The June meeting of the European Central Bank, which did not reintroduce the expected dispensation to the Greek bonds, has only slightly altered the diagnosis on the economic situation of Euroland).

As previously mentioned, the contextual meaning of *DIAGNOSIS* in the economic data is that of ‘identification of a problem’, and this may refer to any problem which is going to take place or has already taken place. *DIAGNOSIS*, the basic meaning of which is “the determination of the nature of a disease, injury, or congenital defect” *(Stedman’s Medical Dictionary 2013)* is one of the medical metaphors which best highlight the image of the economist perceived as a physician and whose role is that of determining the type of problem/disease, and finding the appropriate solution/cure (as will be shown below).

9. INTERVENTION IS CURE/CURA

30. Today’s incentives are hopelessly biased towards boosting the short-term share price. [...] Mrs Clinton is right to point out that America is short-changed because of it. But her cure is no match for her diagnosis. She would introduce a tapered capital gains tax [...]. *(FT, Jul 26, 2015)*

31. La cura contro la crisi non può essere che quella delle riforme e della semplificazione del Paese a tutti i livelli. *(Il Sole, Sep 15, 2014)*

(The cure against the crisis must necessarily be that of reforms and of the simplification of the country at all levels).

As can be seen, in both extracts the solution to problems is conceptualized in terms of medical treatment. What is notable is that the metaphorical use of a medical term affects the way the remaining part of the text is perceived by the reader. “Short-term share price boosting” in the English extract, and “crisis” in the Italian extract are implicitly identified as diseases (which require intervention/CURE/CURA).
10. GETTING BACK TO NORMALITY IS RECOVERY/HEALING/GUARIGIONE

32. On average, economists expected Eurozone growth of 1.47 per cent and inflation of 1.26 per cent next year. Twenty-six of 28 respondents said the recovery would outlast 2017. (*FT*, Dec 30, 2016)

33. We’ve healed the wounds from the crisis: the banks are back to normal. (*FT*, Aug 7, 2015)

34. Nonostante la confusione, la Bce ha mantenuto diritto il timone. L’ossigeno ci sarà ma la guarigione è ancora lontana. (*Il Sole*, Jul 17, 2015)

(In spite of the confusion, the ECB has kept the helm straight. There will be oxygen but recovery is still far away).

As can be seen, the use of RECOVERY (extract 32) and of the corresponding Italian GUARIGIONE (extract 34) is the result of the association between the (source) medical concept of “process of overcoming a disorder or shortcoming” (*Merriam Webster’s Medical Dictionary*) and a situation of economic upturn (target). The mapping between the economic and medical domains is more manifest in the Italian extract, where the term GUARIGIONE is used in the above-mentioned sense, and where the cross-reference to medicine is emphasized by the presence of another metaphorically used medical term, i.e. OXYGEN. This is not used in the general sense of “gaseous element which is essential to animal and plant life” (*Stedman’s Medical Dictionary* 2013) but in the specific medical sense of drug, more precisely of “medicinal gas” (*Stedman’s Medical Dictionary* 2013) used for therapeutic purposes. By contrast, in the English extract, RECOVERY does not allow an immediate association with the medical domain. More precisely, despite being originally based on the concept of regaining health after an illness or injury, RECOVERY is mostly used in the generic sense of “process of improving or becoming stronger again” (*Oxford Advanced Learners’ Dictionary* 2015), thus showing a lower level of metaphoricity in comparison with the Italian GUARIGIONE⁵. On the contrary, HEALED is immediately associated with the medical domain as its basic meaning is “to restore to health” (*Stedman’s Medical Dictionary* 2013).

The investigation of the English and the Italian corpora also showed non-shared linguistic realizations of medical metaphors. More precisely, in some Italian articles the concept of crisis was conceptualized in terms of specific diseases/disorders, namely NECROSI (two occurrences in two different texts), ANEMIA (one occurrence) and ANORESSIA (four occurrences in two different texts), and not only as generic ‘malattia’ or ‘patologia’ as was shown in the extracts illustrated so far. As for ANORESSIA and NECROSI, their use was already shown, respectively, in extracts 19 (where the precise lexical item was ANORESSIZZANTI), and 27.

Extract 35 below displays the occurrence of the concept of ANEMIA in the English

---

⁵ In fact, the corresponding Italian term for the English “recovery” in the sense given by the above-mentioned *Oxford Advanced Learners’s Dictionary* (2015) is not “guarigione” but “ripresa” (see extracts 14 and 39). The latter term is not specific to the medical domain.
data, and extract 36 includes another interesting example of conceptualization of a crisis in terms of the emotional/behavioural disorder ANORESSIA:


(Before 2002-2003, export increased by 2% a year in Germany, which was considered the sick man of Europe, afflicted by lack of competitiveness and anaemic growth).


(The economy is undergoing a metaphorical form of anorexia. Anorexia is a pathology of the soul and the body. In the soul it concentrates desire on obsessive thoughts that are crystallized by fear and anguish. In the body it produces a reduction in the flesh and tissues, wearing out the muscles. Something similar is happening to the Italian productive system. Deflation is both the cause and the effect of the industrial recession).

It can be observed that in both extracts problems afflicting the economy (lack of competitiveness and slow growth in extract 35, and deflation in extract 36) are all conceptualized in terms of very debilitating medical disorders (especially ANORESSIA in the Italian extract), thus offering the image of an extremely weak and fragile economy/PATIENT.

None of the three diseases encountered in the Italian corpus were found in the English data which, however, displayed other types of serious and/or devastating, if not potentially deadly, medical conditions to conceptualize economic crises and/or economic-related political attitudes. CARDIAC ARREST, HEART ATTACK, and ALLERGY may serve as examples:

37. Crises are cardiac arrests of the financial system. They have potentially devastating effects on the economy. [...] The time to worry about a patient’s lifestyle is not during a heart attack. The need is to keep them alive. (FT, Nov 25, 2014)

38. Quarterly capitalism was king during Bill Clinton’s administration. The chief mark of today’s Republican field was its allergy to new ideas. (FT, Jul 26, 2015)

Of a certain interest in the Italian data is the reference to recovery from crises in terms of a patient being anaesthetized or reanimated, as in the following sentences:

(The European stock markets have been anaesthetized by the signals of a slow recovery of the continental economy).

40. La Banca Centrale Europea sta provando a rianimare l’economia. (Il Sole, Aug 7, 2016)

(The European Central Bank is trying to reanimate the economy).

Moreover, in the English data, problems caused by crises are thought of in terms of WOUNDS (two occurrences in two different texts), and other occurrences were found of conceptualization of economic conditions referring to blood images (three occurrences in three different texts):

41. The economy is in better shape than it was a few years ago. We’ve healed the wounds from the crisis: the banks are back to normal; housing is back to normal [...]. (FT, Aug 7, 2015)

42. (Criminal charges for fraud) Ms Lagarde has argued that she approved of bringing the case into one single arbitration instead of nine pending cases because those cases were bleeding the taxpayers in legal fees. (FT, Dec 12, 2016)

Finally, even though only two occurrences were found in one article, the English corpus also showed an example of coinage of a new expression, as shown in the sentence below:

43. Demand deficiency syndrome has afflicted Japan since the early 1990s and the other economies since 2008 at the latest. (FT, Nov 25, 2014)

Here, not only is lack/scarcity of demand (for goods and services) conceptualized in terms of a syndrome but first and foremost the pattern of its superficial form shows the same morphosyntactic structure as that of specific codified medical expression such as “immune deficiency syndrome.” DEMAND DEFICIENCY SYNDROME is a significant example of word/expression formation process, with the metaphor representing an interdisciplinary calque from the medical domain.

4. Conclusions

The results of this study confirmed the initial hypothesis that English and Italian economics news discourse is replete with metaphorically used medical terms. More precisely, the incidence of medical metaphors in comparison with non-metaphorically used medical terms showed more than half of occurrences of medical terms being used metaphorically in both languages. Noteworthy was both the frequency of use of specific terms (e.g. WEAK/DEBOLE, RECOVERY for the English data, CURA for the Italian data) and the variety of the linguistic realizations displayed. The cross-linguistic investigation showed significant similarities between the two languages as regards frequency of metaphors, with the Italian data manifesting a slightly higher tendency to metaphorical reasoning as compared to the results in the English data. First and foremost, the outcomes obtained were clear evidence of the extent to which the medical domain in
general and the bodily experience in particular are a source of inspiration for knowledge construction and conceptual organization in economic discourse. The systematic conceptual schema activated by the basic THE ECONOMY IS A PATIENT mapping was well defined in both corpora. The expert economist is a DOCTOR who, after having correctly identified difficulties/having made the right DIAGNOSIS, must find the appropriate solution/CURE to problems/AILMENTS/ILLS - PATOLOGIE/MALI of the economic system/PATIENT and support return to normality/favour RECOVERY/HEALING/GUARIGIONE. The manifestation of the same schemas drawing on health-related images in both the English and the Italian data must come as no surprise. As highlighted by Boers (1999: 48), bodily experience is universally shared. Therefore, problematic economic issues are easily associated with health-related matters in general and particularly with human body diseases, independently of the specific culture.

As for occurrences of metaphors that the two corpora did not show to have in common, if on the one hand these were not quantitatively significant and might only have been an expression of individual authors’ preferences, on the other hand they represented further interesting examples of similarity-creation between the economic and the medical domains. The English data showed instances of conceptualization of economic crisis in terms of cardiovascular system-related conditions, i.e. CARDIAC ARREST and HEART ATTACK, whereas the Italian data showed a preference for other types of pathological conditions/diseases, namely NECROSI and ANORESSIA.

It seems appropriate to highlight that from a quantitative and also a qualitative point of view this research was intended to be only a starting point for the study of the metaphorical use of medical terms in an economic context from a comparative perspective. Due to the small size of the corpora investigated, any tentative generalization would have led to indecisive conclusions. Further studies with larger corpora are needed to confirm (or disconfirm) the results of this study, search for other possible different realizations within the same category of metaphorical meaning in the two languages, and as a consequence discuss potentially culture-specific features.

Finally, independently of the results obtained, it is hoped that this work will contribute to highlighting the importance of the linguistic approach to the study of metaphor and the close relationship existing between language and mental processes. Language is the most immediate and tangible means giving insights into the way our conceptual system is constructed – in everyday thought as well as in specialized discourse.

References


*Dizionario di Medicina*. At http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/medicina_(Dizionario-di-Medicina)/.


FROM EXHIBITIONS TO THE SCREEN: THE CHALLENGES OF SUBTITLING ART FROM ENGLISH INTO ITALIAN

Mariagrazia De Meo

(University of Salerno, Italy)

Abstract

The aim of the paper is to explore the characteristics of English for Art Purposes, also referred to as International Art English (Rule and Levine 2012), and to focus on the translation strategies used in the Italian subtitles of this type of content-related discourse in the art documentary Goya: Visions of Flesh and Blood (2016).

Through the leitmotif of the art exhibition, here the narration is presented through a variety of voices, from those of art curators and critics to the voice of the artist himself, producing a successful attempt to make art available in an informative but also entertaining manner, thanks to the use of a refined yet accessible and enjoyable language. Despite its technical constraints, does subtitling manage to retain such features? And in what ways does it transfer the aesthetic quality and interpersonal tone of the source text? The translation strategies used to manipulate and adapt the multi-layered nuances of this rich language will be identified through a qualitative approach, with specific reference to lexical and syntactical choices, the use of figurative language and register alteration. It will be argued that the communicative purpose expressed through the register, in the interpretations produced by art critics, is altered in translation which shows greater concern for the descriptive and compositional components.

1. Introduction

The opening quote echoes the debated statement that ‘art speaks for itself’ and therefore no additional explanation is required to understand and appreciate it. While searching for proof of this cliché, the opposite argument finds empirical backing in the widespread natural human practice of regularly talking about art.

The aim of this paper is to identify the most common linguistic and rhetorical features, together with the semiotic functions of the language of art, in the genre of the art commentary and consider the translation strategies used in the subtitles from English into Italian for the art documentary Goya: Visions of Flesh and Blood (2016).
The specific domain of English for Art Purposes refers to the study of a functional language used by the art discourse community of artists, art critics and academics to describe and interpret visual arts in specific social and cultural contexts. A significant contribution to the field comes from the area of language teaching, mainly to second or foreign language Art students, through academic programmes, websites, blogs and textbooks. However, the topic has been little investigated so far and mainly with reference to written genres (Hudson and Noonan-Morrissey 2015; Harris 2003; Sayre 2013; Svenungsson 2007; Barrett 2000; O’Toole 2011; Atkins 2013; Rule and Levine 2012; Crețiu 2013a, 2013b, 2016).

Due to the complex nature of the visual arts, whose primary communicative purpose is not merely informative but aimed at inspiring and moving the viewer, language seems an inadequate tool yet also a necessary evil whose form and purpose may vary. Harris (2003) used the term Artspeak to refer to an open-ended type of discourse mainly intended as a means of propaganda, to obtain social validation through the use of socially, politically and educationally loaded words. These mystifying constructions and ‘esoteric contortions’, often resulting in the alienation of the reader/viewer from the artworks, are highlighted and criticized in the corpus-based analysis conducted by Rule and Levine (2012), who coin the negatively connotated term International Art English (IAE). In opposition to the negative drawbacks of both Artspeak and IAE, there is general agreement among experts and academics that language concerning art “is thoughtful and thought-out, for the purpose of increasing understanding and appreciation of art and its role in society” (Barrett 2000: 25, quoted in Crețiu 2013b: 2), and, therefore, concerned primarily with establishing a positive contact with the viewer.

2. A framework of analysis

In English for Specific Purposes (ESP) research, the construction of a methodological framework of analysis has frequently drawn on Systemic Functional Linguistics (Halliday 1978), and Genre Analysis (Swales 1990; Bhatia 1993), as is also the case in the analysis of the source text and target text in Translation Studies (Hatim and Mason 1997; Trosborg 2002; Munday 2012).

In Functional Linguistics, the notion of register refers to language used in a situational context, determining the construction of meaning through three co-occurring factors, i.e. field, tenor and mode, where field refers to the subject-matter and purpose, tenor to the interpersonal relation between interlocutors expressed through the use of formal or informal language, and mode to the written or spoken medium. These elements activate three main linguistic functions. First, the Experiential or Ideational function relates to the fact that every semiotic text, regardless of the medium, is based on the encoder’s experience of the world he/she is describing; second, the Interpersonal function refers to the type of interpersonal relation established between the producer and the receiver of the message; third, the Textual function means that the message will have the structural features of a properly formed text as regards coherence and cohesion, in relation to a distinctive genre.

1 The acronym EAP will be used only in reference to English for Academic Purposes.
In Swales’ (1990: 58) definition, genre is “a class of communicative events, the members of which share some set of communicative purposes” that functions and is shaped within the discourse communities who use it. Consequently, meaning is always socially constructed and language varies according to the situation in which it is used. In the domain of English for Art Purposes, common written genres are the art review, the research paper, the artist’s statement and so on, and art commentary as an example of a spoken genre. Within different genres, specific discourse structures or text types may occur, such as describing a formal element, interpreting and evaluating, narrating, comparing and so on, depending on the specific communicative purpose (Paltridge 2012; Biber 1988).

For the purpose of the present research, the semiotic model introduced by O’Toole (2011) bears important methodological implications. The Australian scholar of communication studies also draws on Halliday’s Systemic Functions, arguing that “semiotics – the study of sign systems – can assist us in the search for a language through which our perceptions of a work of art can be shared” (ibid.: 10). According to such a model, the visual arts should be described and interpreted in terms of three functions: a Representational, a Modal, and a Compositional meaning. The Representational function is expressed by elements that convey the experiential dimension, hence it concerns the description of the content of the painting, through a progressive order going from a single figure or detail to the picture as a whole. The Modal function pertains to the interpretation of both representational and compositional elements of the painting, through the use of rhetorical strategies and intertextuality, in order to connect the viewer to the painting. The Compositional function relates to the description of elements of composition such as the arrangement of forms, proportions, and so on (O’Toole 2011: 16-31). The scholar points out that, in spite of its apparent complexity, this semiotic model for the classification of functional elements provides a reliable framework for the interpretation of art that would otherwise risk undertaking undefined and unclear paths. Moreover, since “the boundaries between functions are permeable” (O’Toole 1990: 193), the language of art does not necessarily need to reproduce faithfully the order of macro functions described in the semiotic model. The main recommendation is, in fact, that art commentary gives priority to interpretative elements of the Modal function, as its main purpose is to engage the viewer’s attention and emotions.

Most discourses about art, whether art history or popular criticism, tend to deal first with what is represented (the Representational Function), while academic and practical art teaching understandably starts with observations about the Compositional Function. Meanwhile, the ordinary visitor to an art gallery may lack both the factual knowledge and the technical vocabulary to say anything meaningful about either of these, and is discouraged from articulating how she or he relates to the work’s visual impact (ibid.: 193).

In other words, the representational and compositional elements should intertwine with the expression of the art critic’s personal engagement, highlighting those elements that were probably the ones the artist intended to exploit to make the picture connect to the observer.
3. Features of English for Art Purposes

English for Art Purposes can be considered as a subgenre of English for Academic Purposes (EAP), whose main shared function is to persuade and promote understanding through the use of narratives and intertextual references (Preece 1994). In his study of register in academic discourse, Biber (2006) argued that, while in written texts the achievement of persuasion is built through reference to highly informative material, in spoken texts this relies more directly on the interpersonal involvement achieved in a more spontaneous manner.

In the genres of English for Art Purposes, the urge to “establish relationships between words, images and objects in the real world” (Crețiu 2013b: 4) is obtained through the formal analysis of an artwork and a constant shift between descriptions and interpretations. Indeed, credibility and persuasiveness of subjective interpretative statements often rely on descriptions of real people and historical events or reference to documents and letters. In addition to this, the language of the art commentary, only apparently spontaneous, is a type of constructed orality that is written to be spoken. Therefore, although being dense and thought-through, it also relies on linguistic and pragmatic features to achieve interpersonal involvement, through the articulation of subjective emotions, and the expression of uncertainty, aimed at engaging the viewer in the process of speculation on artworks.

For the purpose of the present study, we are going to identify semantic, syntactic and rhetorical structures that convey the Interpersonal function in language within the specific context of talking about art. O’Toole (2011: 12-13) suggests focusing on those elements normally used in spoken language to engage the viewer, i.e. (1) direct address through the use of the personal pronouns you and we; (2) use of direct questions and answers; (3) use of modal verbs and of lexical items signalling lack of certainty and the speaker’s interpretative mode suggesting the viewer’s response to the painting; (4) prosodic features such as intonation and the rising and falling tone of voice. Crețiu (2013b: 13-15), a Romanian scholar and teacher of English for Art Purposes, suggests considering terminological specificities at lexical level, proceeding towards the morphological, syntactical and semantic level. More specifically, the linguistic signals of interpretation that can be found at the lexical level include the use of adverbs, subordinating conjunctions of manner, and specific nouns and verbs.

4. Subtitling

Subtitling represents the most widely researched audio-visual translation mode with dubbing and voice-over, pushing the boundaries of a mere language transfer from one linguistic code to another (Taylor 2002). Subtitles translate spoken dialogue, which is still audible on screen, into written text that is synchronously added at the bottom of the screen and, in Jakobson’s (1959) terms, can be either intralinguistic (i.e. using the same language) or interlinguistic (i.e. from one linguistic code to another), and always intersemiotic (i.e. from spoken to written language). The manifestation of this diamesic shift (Perego 2003) generates a target text that has inevitably lost most of the prosodic features of spoken language, i.e. tone of voice, dialects, regional accents, sociolinguistic markers, etc., favouring elements more typical of a written register (Assis Rosa 2001).
On the other hand, it necessarily functions in a polysemiotic relation to the visual and acoustic channels. Chaume (2004) defines this relation as ‘semiotic cohesion’ which allows for the recovery of some missing elements in the subtitles through the support of the image and sound. However, “the systematic elimination of seemingly redundant elements such as even phatic fillers, modal adjuncts or repetitions (in any case – words) can be detrimental to understanding” (Taylor 2000: 159), and also interferes with the perception of the relation between interlocutors.

The adaptation of subtitles to the screen entails the compliance to technical time and space parameters. Therefore, the generally accepted norms specify that the time of permanence of the title on the screen should not exceed 6-7 seconds and the length of each line should stay within the limit of 33-40 characters, divided into a maximum of two lines at a time (Gottlieb 1992; Ivarsson and Carroll 1998; Lomheim 1999). Due to these formal restrictions, subtitles seem to inevitably require reduction, either total or partial, which, in turn, may generate problems with the “information density of the message” (Taylor 2002: 144), particularly once the source dialogue has been cleared of spoken features of conversation such as repetitions, hesitations, false starts, etc. Empirical research on the translation processes has produced numerous proposals for a categorization of translation strategies, considered as “the first level of abstraction from the concrete level data, which contains translation solutions” (Pedersen 2011: 71).

In academic research, terminological discrepancies and different systems of categorizations prove the difficulty of setting clear boundaries to these translation solutions. It should be of no surprise that the seminal research in this field originates from Scandinavia, owing to a well-established tradition of subtitling audiovisual content. Gottlieb’s (1992: 294) detailed subtitling taxonomy including ten different strategies was later revised in Lomheim’s model (1999: 202-204), who reduced it to six main strategies, i.e. omission (e.g. an element that disappears during the transfer), compression (e.g. text-condensation), expansion (e.g. addition of information), generalization (e.g. use of hyperonymy), specification (e.g. use of hyponymy), and neutralization (i.e. using a less connotative term). The word translation is used to refer to a direct transfer of “equivalent meaning” (Lomheim 1999: 200) offering the closest possible alternative.

In particular, features of text reduction are the main focus of Díaz Cintas and Remael’s (2007) study of subtitling. The subtitler’s choices concerning text reduction are always dependent on the principle of relevance (Gutt 1991), which goes beyond linguistic issues, concerning not only meaning but also purpose and function of the source language (SL). Therefore, reduction includes total omission on the one hand, and condensation and reformulation on the other, all of which could be part of the same subtitle. Condensation and reformulation may happen at word level, through simplification, generalization, using near-synonyms, etc., or at sentence level, e.g. changing questions into statements, simplifying modality, etc. (Díaz Cintas and Remael 2007: 151-161). As for the relation to functional linguistics, it is evident that elements conveying the Ideational function, mainly reliant on descriptions of reality, usually undergo less reduction compared to those expressing the Interpersonal and Textual function (Kovačić 1996).

Moreover, as an overt type of translation synchronically added to the screen, subtitling is ‘vulnerable’ since excessive reduction of the SL may be too evident and produce a distancing effect in the audience, especially in the case of two languages bearing some degree of familiarity. Thus, the subtitler’s choices of condensation could also exploit the
strategy of reliability that consists in the use of a number of words that present “strong phonetic and morphological similarities in both languages” (Díaz Cintas and Remael 2007: 56).

In opposition to reduction strategies, explicitation (Perego 2003, 2009) is a macro-strategy indicating the insertion of additional information necessary to clarify obscure meaning. Forms of explicitation are addition, i.e. the introduction of a linguistic element not part of the source dialogue, specification, i.e. the substitution of a lexical item with a more specific one, and reformulation, i.e. changing the syntactical structure (Perego 2009: 59). More specifically, explicitation may be ‘reduction-based’ (Perego 2003), as a special type of addition inserted in the subtitle to compensate for previous toning down or deletion.

To sum up, the study of different taxonomies of translation strategies reveals the importance of establishing macro-categories (Pedersen 2011: 73). So far, in addition to direct translation, these macro-categories are text reduction, which includes the micro-strategies of omission and condensation; text explicitation, entailing addition and specification; and text reformulation, as a broader term that has been used in reference to both the previous categories (Bianchi 2015). Reformulation will be used, for the purpose of the present research, to refer to various types of intended grammatical changes, mainly producing condensation.

4.1. Translating documentaries

Documentaries are multimodal texts that exploit different communicative modes to convey the message. The verbal element intertwines with the visual and the prosodic features of voice, gestures, movement, music, etc., therefore the analysis of their language in translation should be considered in reference to multimodal discourse analysis of the different signs that co-participate in the creation of meaning (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996; Thibault 2000).

Usually considered as non-fictional films (Plantinga 2005), documentaries represent a very flexible and hybrid genre. Although the description of reality is what audiences generally foresee, documentaries usually present a distinct perspective within a specific socio-cultural context, which inevitably reduces objectivity. As Franco (1999: 289) argues, “[i]f we assume that documentaries are far from impartial representations, then the role of translation in the documentary discourse seems to me to be a highly relevant issue”. Indeed, research on subtitling documentary deserves more attention within the wider field of Audiovisual Translation (Franco 1999, 2000; Taylor 2002; Matamala 2009a, 2009b; Bianchi 2015; Hanoulle, Hoster and Remael 2015).

The translation of a specialized text usually presents recognizable linguistic and pragmatic conventions that mark its belonging to a particular genre (Asensio 2007). In spite of the lower level of specialization in the language of documentaries, generally addressing the layman, the translation of specialized lexicogrammatical, rhetorical features and the tenor still require attention from the audio-visual translator, usually unfamiliar with the specific domain (Matamala 2009b).

The most common audio-visual transfer modes used in documentaries include voice-over (Franco, Matamala and Orero 2010), mainly used to translate the voices of talking heads, i.e. people being interviewed; off-screen dubbing, used to translate the voice of
an off-screen narrator; and subtitling, usually chosen in case of different languages or in the translation of captions (Matamala 2009b).

As for the specific domain of English for Art Purposes, translation research is still a rather unexplored field with very few exceptions coming from individual contributions in online journals, such as Art in Translation, or professional workshops held on the topic. To my knowledge, no scientific research has been published on the topic of subtitling art documentaries.

5. The case study

The documentary series Exhibition on Screen, launched in 2012, aims at making major art exhibitions accessible to a wider audience all over the world through cinema screenings. As argued by Phil Grabsky, the documentaries director and producer, “a cinema experience of an Art Exhibition is unique,” not only because of the extraordinary close-ups into the artworks, but also for the compelling insights into the artist’s life as well as behind-the-scenes footage. These art documentaries have the purpose of being “educational, informative and entertaining” for the viewer, accompanied throughout the captivating journey by the voices and commentaries of leading art critics, curators and historians, and, not least, by compelling music.

This case study analyses Goya: Visions of Flesh and Blood (2016) based on the artist’s portrait exhibition at London’s National Gallery in 2015/2016. Curatorial insights and commentary of portraits intertwine with biographical references to Goya’s life, from the description of his birth place and adolescence in Zaragoza to the narration of key moments in his career: e.g. his journey to Italy to study the classic masters, the early period spent at the Royal Tapestry Factory, his first royal commissions for painting frescoes in cathedrals, and finally his long awaited success as the Royal portrait painter of the Bourbons. Moreover, the documentary offers private insights into Goya’s contradictory personality due to the correspondence he maintained with his lifelong friend Zapater, showing he was a royalist and a man of the Enlightenment, sharply critical of his times.

The genres present in the documentary are the artist’s biography, the artist’s statement and the art commentary. An off-screen voice of a female narrator recounts the artist’s biography through the use of a formal register, aimed at conveying objectivity and reliability in reporting facts. The narrator’s voice also functions as the main linking device, connecting the scenes of art commentaries, and the fictional frames in which an actor in Goya’s clothes is walking or painting, while an off-screen voice with a strong Spanish accent is reading the artist’s letters to Zapater. Thus, the artist’s statement is expressed in the form of read-aloud private letters, with the main purpose of informing the audience of the artist’s emotions and thoughts, adding authenticity to the narration.

During the Mediterranean Editors & Translators (MET) Conference in 2013, Poblet, Spain, two Workshops on the topic were presented: (1) J. Martinez, A. M. Bohan and L. Bennet, The Art of Translation and the Translation of Art: perspectives on translating the arts from five languages; (2) P. Llimona, Translating art from Spanish to Catalan.


Retrieved from Arts Alliance, the documentary producer’s website: http://www.artsalliance.com/introduction-exhibition-screen/.
and also functioning as a back-up to the experts’ comments. Finally, the art commentary presents a continuous shift between descriptions and interpretations of Goya’s portraits as well as comments on his life, career and complex personality, through the voices of leading curators, historians and other artists, including, for example, the Prado’s curator of prints and drawings who goes through the pages of Goya’s rare Italian notebook in Spanish, adding a multilingual layer to the documentary. The art commentary is the genre that most clearly contains features of spoken language, whereas both the biographical narration and the artist’s statement recall written language in terms of structure and level of formality. Goya complies to the recurrent structure of documentaries described by Matamala (2009: 5), where usually “a narrator presents the situation, a talking head gives her opinion and some shots of real action with real speech are included”. Here, only the latter voices are absent, as we do not encounter instances of real spontaneous speech; the only real scenes are shots of people visiting the exhibition with background music.

Subtitling is the only mode of transfer present on screen. On the one hand, maintaining the original soundtrack provides a sense of authenticity while, on the other, it comes as a surprise for two main reasons. First, as mentioned previously, documentaries usually include subtitles in combination with other translation modes such as voice-over, lip-sync and off-screen dubbing, in particular in countries like Italy that maintain a well-established dubbing tradition (Hanoulle, Hoster and Remael 2015), mainly for cinema screenings. Second, for the specific genre of art documentaries, subtitles may distract the audience from the intriguing close-ups. Nevertheless, the presence of subtitles may imply a thoroughly planned pedagogical choice, aimed at maintaining the original sound of the elegant and meaningful utterances of critics and curators and of the Spanish incursions, as part of the aesthetic dimension of the film.

I approached the production house Seventh Art to shed light on the above queries, and they provided me with a more practical explanation. The translation process was entirely delegated to the distributor who chose subtitling and outsourced it to external professionals. Moreover, the choice of subtitles was entirely dictated by time pressure, because of the goal of a single European cinema release of the film. As for future productions, they expressed the intention of opting for dubbing, particularly so as not to detract attention from the image during the screenings. In a sense, the producer/distributor’s response unveiled and endorsed the wide and persisting gap dividing commercial and marketing strategies on the one hand, and the theoretical reasoning of the pedagogical potential hiding behind the use of subtitles, on the other.

Nonetheless, to date, after the release of 19 documentaries, the distribution language transfer strategy has not changed. This sustains the belief that, besides commercial reasons, subtitling offers the significant advantages of preserving authenticity and the multilingual component of the documentary, fostering the idea of art as a form of communication naturally blurring borders and therefore belonging to a wider international community sharing similar perceptions. Furthermore, subtitling in art documentaries functions as a powerful didactic tool for language learning, blending specific content and academic language together.
6. Analysis and results

Based on O’Toole’s model, the analysis of the case study draws on the genre of the oral art commentary, focusing on the linguistic and pragmatic features used to signal the modal function of interpretation and on the rhetorical devices marking the alternation between informative description and interpretation. In particular, when describing a painting, the structure of the commentary follows a common path. First, the description begins with reference to the main character; second, there is an almost immediate shift towards interpretation, producing a sort of gossiping effect, with reference to Goya’s personal relationship to the character or to additional information external to the painting. Then, finally, the description of the characters and composition comes to the fore usually through a close-up on a detail or gaze that takes the viewer straight into the painting. Description and interpretation continuously overlap through a rather informal and direct tenor.

The excerpts that follow were selected to provide qualitative examples of frequent occurrences in the SL and of the most frequent translation strategies used in the subtitles. As for the references found in the literature, the analysis focuses on the semantic, syntactical and rhetorical features directly aimed at engaging the viewer in the construction of an interpersonal process of interpretation and reconstruction of meaning.

At the lexical level, the specific terminology, i.e. etchings (acqueforti), lithographs (litografie), sketches (bozze), etc. is translated, in the majority of instances, with direct equivalents. In addition, a foreignizing effect in the subtitles is achieved thanks to the transfer of Spanish loan words from the SL e.g. competencia formál, mantilla, etc., not because of lack of equivalence in the target language (TL), but mainly as a sign of cultural connotation (Pedersen 2011).

Moreover, the critics frequently choose words expressing interpretation, lack of certainty, personal taste and signalling informality to commit the viewer into the interpretation of the painting, whereas the omission of these bundles produces an increase of assertiveness in the subtitle. Similar considerations apply to the lexical choice of connoted and emotionally loaded adjectives and adverbs that co-occur in the formation of poignant noun and adverbial phrases.

In Table 1, excerpts (1) and (2) exemplify the recurrent omission of the bundles ‘sort of’ and ‘kind of’ in the subtitles, as is also the case in (3). However, there are rare cases of direct translation, as in (4). In (5) and (6), both frequently occurring verbs ‘mean’ and ‘think’ are omitted as in the majority of cases, with a few notable exceptions, as reported in excerpt (7) where the personal tone remains explicit in the subtitle. Other scattered attempts at direct translations are found in the cases of the interpretative verbs ‘seem’, ‘suppose’ and ‘wonder’, respectively in (8), (9), and (10). The indefinite ‘something’ finds explicitation in (5) as ‘un certo talento’, while ‘perhaps something’ is omitted in the sentence reformulation in (10). The line acquires a higher degree of formality also because of the omission of the personal pronouns, as we will see later.

5 The tables present in the left column a progressive number indicating the example, in the middle column the source language (SL), and in the right column, the subtitle, the back translation and the subtitling strategy identified. The symbol (Ø) indicates omission of a word or a sentence.
The informality of the commentary is also signalled by the use of general and colloquial verbs, i.e., to be, to go, to think, etc., whereas, the subtitle is usually more explicit increasing the level of formality, as shown in excerpts (11) and (12).

As for lexical combination, frequent occurrences of noun phrases and adverbial phrases express carefully chosen and dense collocations that convey the speaker’s intention of transmitting personal enthusiasm and engaging the viewer. These chunks tend to be retained in most cases. In (13), the choice of a near-synonym produces a toning down of meaning. The direct translation of ‘redeeming gaze’, in (14), neutralizes the direct address to the viewer because of the omission of the first person plural pronoun. The SL is particularly rich in adverbial phrases that are usually maintained in the subtitles through direct translation as in (15) and (16), in spite of their length. This may be interpreted as an intentional choice aimed, on the one hand, at avoiding simplification, reproducing semantically loaded words and, on the other hand, at showing reliability (cfr. Díaz Cintas and Remael 2007: 56), translating words in the subtitle that are morphologically and phonologically similar in the two languages (Table 3).

At a syntactical level, the use of the personal pronouns ‘you’ and ‘we’ and of modality establishes an informal and direct tone that is rendered more formally in the subtitles through the choice of impersonal structures, depriving the TL of a specific connotative
element. In (17), the specification of ‘spectator’, translating the personal pronoun ‘you’, and the omission of ‘we’ increase the impersonal tone in the subtitle; in (18), the switch from a direct to an impersonal grammar structure generates the same effect. The omission of modality produces a shift towards a more formal subtitle in excerpts (19) and (20) and the latter example also presents condensation and omission of the generic ‘those things like’.

Table 3

| (13) | with a kind of piercing intelligence. | e con una Ø profonda intelligenza/ [and with a profound intelligence (generalization)] |
| (14) | […] that somehow redeeming gaze at us of the artist | quasi un sguardo di redenzione Ø dell’artista, [almost a redeeming gaze of the artist] |
| (15) | I mean, some of the portraits in this exhibition are simply overwhelming | Ø Alcuni ritratti di questa mostra sono semplicemente sconvolgenti. (direct translation) |
| (16) | and that’s incredibly exciting | ed è qualcosa di incredibilmente emozionante. (direct translation) |

Table 4

The use of direct questions and answers is another rhetorical strategy expressing interpersonal reference and a direct address to the viewer. In excerpt (21), the explicit reference of the utterance becomes an indirect question, whereas in (22) the syntactical structure is maintained in the subtitles.

| (17) | there is a man looking at you and we all think | c’è un uomo che fissa lo spettatore e tutti pensano [there is a man who is staring at the spectator and everyone thinks (specification)] |
| (18) | you are in touch with the artist himself as you can be in no other way, | Si è in contatto con l’artista stesso. Non potrebbe essere altrimenti, [There is contact with the artist himself. It could not be otherwise (condensation)] |
| (19) | and you might think | c’è quello che crede [it makes one think (condensation)] |
| (20) | You can see he strips his portraits of all those things like attributes | Si vede che elimina dai ritratti tutti gli attributi, [It is visible that he eliminates from the portraits all the attributes (condensation)] |

Table 5

The expression of intentionality through informality is also achieved with the use of rhetorical devices conveying “additional intended meaning” (Hatim and Mason 1997: 69), as in the case of lexical repetition and figures of speech, i.e. metaphors, similes and hyperboles. Besides being a recurrent feature of spoken discourse, frequent repetition of lexical items, e.g. adjectives, verbs, adverbs, is also an important feature that has
come to the fore in the analysis, as it transmits a sense of spontaneous and progressive construction of thinking rather than a mere report of pre-packed theories. Subtitles generally avoid repetition of the same words, either through omission, as in excerpts (23) to (25), or by substitution with near-synonyms, interrupting in a way the smooth language flow of the SL, as in (26). However, the closing commentary of the documentary shows an interesting inversion of the trend, as shown in (27) and (28), where the subtitle maintains lexical repetition and redundancy, perhaps as a strategy to increase the emotional tone of the epilogue.

| (23) | She was also very courageous, quite difficult, quite cheeky, quite eccentric. |
| (24) | in her very very elegant neoclassical dress |
| (25) | because he paints nature, he paints what is in front of him |
| (26) | [...] he rethinks it, he rethinks his approach, he rethinks of how to make a sitter sit, |
| (27) | he is interested in everything. He is interested in antiquity, he is interested in education, he is interested in politics, |
| (28) | he is a big big figure |

| (23) | Era Ø molto coraggiosa, piuttosto difficile, Ø sfacciata ed Ø eccentrica [She was very courageous, quite difficult, cheeky and eccentric.] |
| (24) | in suo elegante vestito neoclassico [in her elegant neoclassical dress] |
| (25) | perché dipinge la natura, Ø ciò che si trova davanti a lui [because he paints nature, what is in front of him] |
| (26) | [...] lo riconcepisce. Ripensa il suo approccio, ripensa a come far posare il soggetto, [he reconceives it. He rethinks his approach, he rethinks... (reformulation)] |
| (27) | Gli interessa tutto. Gli interessa l’antichità, Ø l’istruzione, Gli interessa la politica (direct translation) |
| (28) | È una figura molto, molto grande. (direct translation) |

Table 6

Ultimately, art commentaries benefit from and rely on the communicative force and frequent occurrence of figurative language, mainly retained in the subtitles through direct translation or reformulation of culturally connotated expressions in the TL. In excerpts (29) and (30), the imaginative force conveyed by the metaphor and the simile is transferred to the subtitles which also retain the sense of tentative interpretation in translating the words ‘perhaps’ and ‘almost’. The hyperbole in (31) is maintained in the subtitle. The frequent use of idiomaticity in the SL is often translated with a parallel idiom in the TL as in excerpt (32), or reformulated as in (33) (see Table 7).

The selection of excerpts illustrated and the observations they triggered are part of a preliminary investigation that would benefit from further quantitative analysis. Many of the comments on the features of English for Art Purposes in the genre of the art commentary could also apply to the description of the characteristics of spoken genres in EAP. However, the main quality that comes to the fore in the former is the interpersonal and collaborative modality and the constant shift between description of formal elements and tentative interpretation expressed through an informal tenor.
7. Concluding remarks

In *Goya*, the art historian Juliette Wilson-Bareau speaks of an artist’s portraits as a record of a “spiritual and emotional conversation” with the person watching them. The language of the art critics verbalizes this emotional component in a non-judgemental interpretation and description of the artworks.

Far from the obscurity and hostility of Artspeak and IAE, English for Art Purposes, both in written and in spoken texts, strives to capture the readers’/viewers’ imagination by drawing them into a persuasive and engaging conversation, although descriptions can become, at times, technical and meticulous endeavours.

In the art commentary, the connotative charge of lexical items and figurative language transmit the communicative purpose of emotionally connecting the viewer through an accessible yet aesthetically pleasing and smooth language. Moreover, the informality and directness of tenor is essential to this purpose and it is achieved through the use of syntactical constructions and expressions of vagueness, lack of definition, and repetitions fulfilling the interpersonal function of including the viewer in the process of meaning reconstruction.

In subtitling, the transfer of this aesthetic dimension is achieved at a lexical level mainly through the choice of direct translation or reformulation, aimed at transferring the pragmatic meaning. Particularly in the case of noun and adverbial phrases, the subtitler is not over-concerned with excessive length, often choosing to use more rather than fewer words, also in consideration of the slow pace of the original lines. Therefore, the subtitles maintain a rich semantic texture. On the other hand, the informal and explicit tenor of the utterances sees a consistent shift towards formality due to the frequent omission of markers of uncertainty and repetition, and the use of personal pronouns and markers of modality, as is frequently the case when switching from spoken language to written subtitles. As for the specific genre of the art commentary, this translation shift can affect the perception of the communicative purpose of the SL and alter the audience response. The identification of unusual subtitling choices that show a specific concern towards these markers of informality, although scattered, comes as a surprising deviation from the norm. Moreover, this prepares the ground for further research on subtitling choices that attempt to escape from habitual compliance to features of written language, looking at new practices that tend to enhance orality without affecting readability. In particular, for subtitling of English for Art Purposes, further research should move to-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>[the Duchess of Alba] she is a muse of music and perhaps poetry, floating almost on clouds</th>
<th>Lei è una musa della musica, forse della poesia che sembra galleggiare tra le nuvole</th>
<th>(direct translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(30)</td>
<td>It’s almost like a laboratory.</td>
<td>È una specie di laboratorio.</td>
<td>(direct translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(31)</td>
<td>it’s a miracle of dressmaking</td>
<td>è un miracolo di fattura,</td>
<td>(direct translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(32)</td>
<td>the students made fun of him</td>
<td>gli studenti lo prendevano in giro</td>
<td>[the students took him around (translation/reformulation)]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(33)</td>
<td>He was a real sweet tooth</td>
<td>Era appassionato di dolci.</td>
<td>[he was fond of sweets (reformulation)]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 7*
wards the implementation of a comparative investigation of semantic and syntactical
features in the TL and the creation of a larger corpus for quantitative analysis.

References

Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins: 213-221.
Barrett T. 2000. Criticising Art. Understanding the Contemporary. Mountain View CA,
York: Routledge.
Bianchi F. 2015. The narrator’s voice in science documentaries: qualitative and quantitative
analysis of subtitling strategies from English into Italian. ESP Across Cultures 12: 7-23.
Press.
At https://www.academia.edu/10359422/_Artspeaking_About_Art_Discourse_Features_of_English_for_Art_Purposes.
Crețiu A.E. 2013b. English for Art Purposes. Interpreting art. Studia Universitatis Babeș-
Crețiu A.E. 2016. English as a practical tool for increasing visibility in the art world. Sinergy
12/1: 54-70.
Jerome Publishing.
(ed.). Translation and the (Re)location of Meaning. Leuven: CETRA: 287-316.
Gallardo and Y. Gambier (eds), Translation in Context. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John
(eds), Teaching Translation and Interpreting. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins:
161-170.
and Meaning. London: Edward Arnold.
Hanoulle S., V. Hoste and A. Remael 2015. The translation of documentaries: can
terminology-extraction systems reduce the translator’s workload? An experiment


Thibault P.J. 2000. The multimodal transcription of a television advertisement: theory and

Every traveller sees the Other as a ‘motivation for learning’, that is, an opportunity to meet something or someone that is irreducibly different from ‘me’. Tourists, either looking for fun and pleasure or driven by the search for authentic experiences (Dann 1999; Cappelli 2006), decide to knock on the door of someone else’s home and ask to come in. Taken for granted is the willingness to meet other people’s cultures and the
expectation to be welcome as guests, a désir de voyager which can be used to paraphrase Ricoeur’s (2004) désir de traduire. Tourists get back home after being involved in an intercultural relationship with their hosts, if we share the idea that tourism is a discourse practice (Dann 1996) as well as being a distinctive social practice (Giacomarra 2005).

Therefore, tourism becomes a form of semiotization in which “tourists are the agents of semiotics [...] all over the world they are engaged in reading cities, landscapes and cultures as sign systems” (Culler 1990: 2). Objects, nature, and cultures are turned into messages to the tourist who, working as a language interpreter, starts a process of sign comprehension that affects his/her own behaviour. Things, of course, are not so simple, because tourists do not come into contact with a generic destination, but with culture-mediated representations:

Sightseers do not, in any empirical sense, see San Francisco. They see Fisherman’s Wharf, a cable car, the Golden Gate Bridge, Union Square, Coit Tower, the Presidio, City Lights Bookstore, Chinatown, and, perhaps, Haight Ashbury. As elements in a set called “San Francisco,” each of these items is a symbolic marker. Individually, each item is a sight requiring a marker of its own (MacCannell 1999: 111-112).

Tourism is based on symbolic values that are subsumed under tourists’ cultural frames and these are much wider than the mere consumption of places. Representations, sometimes produced by tourists themselves, “are not neutral but are involved in a circuit of culture, where tourists themselves are a product of particular socio-economic and cultural systems and share knowledge and attitudes, which are in turn ideologically framed” (Vestito 2006: 31).

Therefore, a visit to a museum falls within a shared cultural macro-frame (Baker and Fillmore 2009) that is nonetheless interpreted in different ways by tourists coming from different countries. Zavala (1990, in Bicknell and Farmelo 1998: 83) introduces the question of representing the frame “visiting a museum” in narrative terms as “inevitable”:

After a visit to a museum, visitors reconstruct the experience narratively. This phenomenon is inevitable, because museum visitors always arrive with specific expectations and have specific experiences (whether museum-related or not). Visitors show specific reactions to the title of the exhibition, to the physical site, to the entrance and to the architecture of the museum building. They decide how to conduct the visit (alone or with others, making stops in order to look at specific objects) and use or ignore the parallel elements offered (guided visits, audio-visual projections). Finally, there comes a time when visitors reconstruct for themselves the museum experience.

The point, which seems to be confused by Zavala, is the distinction between the inherent narrative nature of the museum experience and the way to represent it. When it is time to “reconstruct the museum experience”, the narrative way is not the only available strategy. As we can see, a comparison between British and Italian travellers, involved in the same experiences, shows that cultural frames and scenarios follow different interpreting paths and, accordingly, trigger different representations.
1. Commenti and reviews in Tripadvisor

The web has had a strong impact on the tourist industry and the way in which tourists plan their holidays. The innovation brought forth by Web 2.0, according to Urry and Larsen (2011), is the possibility for the single tourist to play the role of content producer and content consumer at the same time, playing what is now called a prosumer role. A wide range of websites, from reservation (booking.com, expedia.com, airbnb.com etc.) to travel websites (tripadvisor.com, smartertravel.com, etc.) give the opportunity to publish reviews and pictures on behalf of other tourists who have not planned their travels yet.

In the past, the word-of-mouth that triggered travels to particular destinations was restricted to small circles or communities – friends, colleagues, family members. Tripadvisor, being today’s “electronic word of mouth” (ibid.: 59), has acquired a global influence that can determine the success of specific destinations, places, even cities. Unlike other studies on the genre of Tripadvisor reviews (see Mandarano 2014), mainly dealing with the impact of feedback on business and its implications in terms of marketing strategies, this paper proposes to combine a cultural and sociological approach (Dann 1996; Urry and Larsen 2011) with the notion of cognitive frames (Baker and Fillmore 2009) and mental spaces (Fauconnier 1985: 2011).

Often, tourists are not aware of the cultural frames and scenarios they use to think. The goal is to describe tourists’ reviews in Tripadvisor in terms of text-types and see if they stand for different cultural conceptualizations of travelling. This is possible, since Tripadvisor gives the possibility to include textual/visual information about the reviewer, such as picture(s), country, name/surname, or nickname. All the reviews in English from 2015 to 2016, in which reviewers explicitly state they are British citizens, have been downloaded and included in the corpus. The same has been done for Italian reviews: if the reviewer does not explicitly state his/her nationality (British or Italian), the review has been excluded from the corpus.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corpus_IT (Italian tourists visiting British Museum)</th>
<th>Language/source</th>
<th>Visited place</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>no. of reviews/ commenti</th>
<th>no. of words</th>
<th>Average length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>196</td>
<td>18,593</td>
<td>94 wds</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Corpus collection

Bearing this goal in mind, it was decided to compare the feedback provided by British and Italian tourists coping with the task of representing in a verbal form their museum experiences. These representations were collected from Tripadvisor in the form of online reviews, to which any tourist can have access through his/her smartphone or PC. To ensure comparability between a) the Italian tourists’ feedback visiting a museum in
the UK and b) British tourists’ feedback visiting a museum in Italy, two small equivalent corpora of about 18,000 words each (one in English and the other in Italian) were collected in the period June 2015-June 2016 from the same online source.

As the table shows, in the case of the Italian corpus, the collection of texts over four months was sufficient to obtain a large number of reviews (400). In the case of the less visited National Archaeological Museum of Naples, instead, the reviews in English were collected over a timespan of one year, from June 2015 to June 2016, in order to reach a number of words comparable to the Italian corpus.1

What is striking is that the number of Italian commenti (400) is double the number of English reviews (194); in other words, if we take two small but comparable TripAdvisor subcorpora of about 18,000 words (British “reviews” and Italian commenti), we get a number of “user actions” (or however we wish to define them) that is drastically different. As shown in Table 1, the smaller number of reviews in English implies that their average length is twice the average length of the Italian commenti (94 words against 46 words).

The similarity between these two small corpora in terms of a) data source (Tripadvisor), b) cultural frame (“visiting a museum”), c) purpose (product rating) and d) word count (about 18,000 words each) allows us to reduce the weight of other variables that may also have an impact on verbal representations.

As a result, we can rely on two small but quite consistent and comparable corpora and carry out a qualitative analysis. The fact that the TripAdvisor Italian interface provides tourists with the opportunity to post feedback in the form of commenti and not “reviews”, as in English, does not imply a genre change. Although the etymology of the two labels emphasizes the usage of visual perception in English (from Latin and then Middle French RE + voir, see again 2) and that of mental recollection in Italian (past participle of cominnisci, to contrive, devise; from com- + base of meminisse, to remember, related to ‘mind’3), both are presented as rating tasks linking a verbal description to a score from 1 to 5 (1 is the lowest mark, 5 the highest).

The similarity in communicative purpose creates a certain genre overlap between English ‘reviews’ and Italian commenti, as shown by Bhatia (1997) in the academic domain:

From the above description of these closely related genres I have called academic introductions, it is clear that all of them, whatever names they are given, have at least one main communicative purpose in common, and that is to introduce the book. This rather surprising amount of overlap in the function and identification of academic introductions is not simply a typical characteristic of modern dictionaries, it is evident in modern practice too.

1 These two museums were selected as they are comparable in terms of types of exhibits and collections displayed (mainly archaeological) and target/number of visitors. The British Museum has an average of 6 million visitors every year (www.statista.com/statistics/422343/british-museum-visitor-numbers-uk), while the National Archaeological Museum of Naples, often visited by tourists after a trip to Pompei excavations, has about 3.5 million visitors every year (www.beniculturali.it/mibac/multimedia/MiBAC/documents/feed/pdf/Tabella-imported-64702.pdf). Rome was excluded because the Colosseum and the Forum are not museums, and the Vatican Museum displays a different type of artwork.

2 Oxford English Dictionary.

3 Dizionario Etimologico online di Ottorino Pianegiani, www.etimo.it.
One may find instances of introductions, prefaces, and forewords largely indistinguishable from each other (Bhatia 1997: 185; my emphasis).

They are called Avis (opinions, suggestions) in French and Resumen (summaries) in Spanish, for example, but the first action that the user is asked to carry out after clicking on the screen button “Write a review” is to rate (from 1 to 5 points) the chosen destination. After rating, the user may opt to write a text and add pictures, but she/he is not allowed to write a review without including the 1-to-5 rating.

The nominal variation – commenti vs. reviews – that distinguishes the Italian interface from the English one, does not undermine the relevance of the gaze that characterizes Western culture:

Focusing on the gaze brings out how the organising sense in tourism is visual. And this mirrors the general privileging of the eye within the history of western societies. Sight was long viewed as the noblest of the senses, the most discriminating and reliable of the sensuous mediators between humans and their physical environment. This emphasis on sight is present within western epistemology, within religious and other symbolisms and within notions of how society should be visible, made transparent, to government (Urry and Larsen 2011: 4).

As a specific object of this study, we claim the existence of a plurality of gazes underlying cultural diversity and revealing a substantial difference in terms of relationship between the self and the Other, that is to say between the see and the seen engaged in the cultural frame of “visiting a museum” and the corresponding Tripadvisor secondary frame “reviewing a museum”.

Figure 1. The Tripadvisor screen in English displayed after clicking on “Write a review”. It is striking that, in English, TA travellers are invited to “write a review”, which is then displayed as such under the heading “Reviews”. In Italian, TA travellers are invited to write a recensione (“Scrivi una recensione”), that is later labelled as a commento.
In terms of mental spaces (Fauconnier 2011), the base space (SPACE A) “visiting a museum” features a subject \((a=\text{seer/tourist})\) and an object \((b=\text{seen/museum exhibits})\) linked by the operator VISIT.

\[
\text{SPACE A (VISIT, } a, b)\\
\]

The base space (SPACE A) triggers a new space B (SPACE B) which features an actual tourist \((a', \text{British or Italian})\) that describes his/her experience in a real museum \((b', \text{British Museum or Museo Archologico Nazionale in Naples})\) by using a verbal form. In this second space, the operator that connects the subject and the object is REVIEW, by which we have the function: REVIEW, \(a', b'\). We will see that this new space B is not a universal one, but it differs according to the travellers’ cultural background. As a result, the new space B, by displaying different configurations, will show to what extent British tourists’ and Italian tourists’ reviews illustrate different gazes and different conceptualizations of travel.

2. Narrative scenarios vs. appraisal scenario

Although this paper focuses mainly on the qualitative nature of the analysis, which is feasible thanks to the small size of the corpora, there is a quantitative feature that seems quite striking and concerns the average length of the reviews. In the case of British tourists visiting the Italian Museum, the average length is 92 words, while the average length of reviews in Italian is much shorter, about 46 words. This does not mean, in absolute terms, that a museum is more interesting or less interesting than the other, but that the representation of the frame “visiting a museum” by British tourist provides details that, on the contrary, are not explicit in the Italian reviews.

The average length of the feedback in English, then, is the first clue to describe representation strategies that are definitely narrative and seem to be highly dynamic and relational:

(1) “Self Guided Audio Tour of Naples Archaeological Museum”

We visited in early May 2015 and with our excellent value Campania ARTE cards we got reduced price audio guides and half price admission (We had already used our cards for “free” entry to Pompeii and Herculaneum). We visited the museum in the afternoon, after a morning visit to Herculaneum, and we toured the Pompeii exhibits with Murals, Pillars, Mosaics and Statues etc. and the “secret” room. Whilst the museum was quite nicely laid out and everything was interesting the whole tour of the museum took only
about two hours and I would therefore only plan for half a day here. I would NOT opt for
the audio guide again as it was disappointing and not very informative, there were only a
few of the numerous exhibits that had an audio description, and generally only applied
to one exhibit in any one area. I would recommend this museum for a half day trip to be
coupled with a half day trip to Herculaneum or Vesuvius (June 16th 2015).

The dynamism of this review is mainly due its narrative plan, starting from the
phases that precede the visit to the museum (we got reduced price audio guides and half
price admission … We had already used our cards … after a morning visit to Herculan-
um) until its conclusion. As the story unfolds, it includes an account of the visit and the
relevant time references, as if the task were that of writing a private journal (We visited
in early May 2015 … We visited the museum in the afternoon … we toured the Pompeii
exhibits… the museum was quite nicely laid out and everything was interesting…), that
finds its conclusion with the end of the experience (the whole tour of the museum took
only about two hours). The experience itself, turned into a narrative, seems to point to a
dialogue between the seer and the object of the sight. The reason for the review is based
on the narrative and subjective account of one’s own visiting experience.

Past tenses, especially the simple past, are the main tenses in these reviews; the
past tense and the narrative circle create the background for the piece of advice ad-
dressed to prospective tourists, in which we can notice the shift from past to present
tense (in bold in the examples). This narrative attitude is frequent in most reviews
written by British tourists, even if the rating is low and potential tourists are warned
against the drawbacks of such an experience.

(2) “OK for an hour!”
Visited recently as part of a tour. The journey through the city to get there took ages and
once we arrived the tour commenced. We did have a guide who tried her hardest to
make the tour as interesting as she could. She struggled with me. There’s only so much
you can say about a statue or mosaic!
The museum is in desperate need of some maintenance to say the least. Worth a visit if
your not visiting the sites at Herculaneum or Pompeii but certainly not a full day visit.
Our guide did warn us about the area around the museum and suggested we didn’t
decide to explore Naples as the area is not tourist friendly! (July 29th 2015).

Even in this case, a low rating mirrors a narrative representation of the experience
that starts with a general micro-introduction (Visited recently as part of a tour...), con-
tinues with the narration of the preliminary phases before the actual visit (the journey
took ages... once we arrived the tour commenced...), during the visit (We did have a
guide who tried her hardest to make the tour as interesting as she could) and the follow
up (Our guide did warn us about the area around the museum and suggested we didn’t
decide...). The switch from past to present marks the transition from storytelling to
recommendations (Worth a visit if your [sic!] not visiting the sites ...). As we can see,
the narrative is so subjectively interpreted that it neglects to mention the quality of
the exhibits, which are supposed to be the real purpose of any “visiting a museum”
experience.

As far as the reviews in Italian are concerned, the frame remains the same but the
viewpoint is radically different. The whole experience is summarized in a few words
and these are not filtered by a narrating ego. The past tense gives way to an all-encom-
passing present in which the visit and the review seem to take place at the same time. The transition from past to present, which marks the switch from storytelling to recommendations in English, is here flattened by using an unspecified present:

(3) “tappa obbligata”
Una meta da non farsi mancare in un viaggio a Londra! bello e imponente l’esterno che ricorda un tempio greco, molto interessanti le collezioni, attraverso le quali si riesce a fare un salto nel tempo e un giro del mondo semplicemente passando da una sala all’altra (June 2nd 2015) 4.

(4) “Meraviglioso”
Al suo interno vi é conservata la stele di Rosetta ed un pezzo del frontone del partenone, oltre ad innumerevoli reperti greci, romani, egizi, etruschi... Ingresso gratuito (July 3rd 2015) 5.

(5) “sempre unico”
Puoi tornare venti volte e rimani ogni volta stupito ed ammaliato. bellissima la sala che non avevo mai visto - con il nucleo costitutivo della collezione (July 16th 2015) 6.

The English narrative is replaced with an appraisal attitude: the tourist does not reconstruct his/her experience narratively, but as a passive witness. The exhibits (l’esterno… le collezioni … la stele di Rosetta … il frontone del Partenone … reperti … il nucleo costitutivo) are foregrounded and rated by using modifiers (bello e imponente… molto interessanti … bellissima). The tourist never talks about his/her being there as a sequence of events and actions (there is only one flashback in 5) …che non avevo mai visto…), since the tourists’ gaze is construed in a timeless universal present tense (che ricorda… si riesce … è conservata… puoi tornare…). Alternatively, the construction DET + NOUN + BE + MODIFIER is turned into a MODIFIER + DET + NOUN that sees the deletion of the linking BE and the focus on the modifier, placed in initial position: bello e imponente l’esterno (3)… molto interessanti le collezioni (3)… bellissima la sala (5).

It is a reconstruction placed in a generic and static present, being based on a sequence of modifiers (adjectives) rather than processes (verbs). The rhetoric of appraisal focuses the readers’ attention on the left of the sentence, where modifiers are positioned. The tourists’ final rating is based on the type of adjectives used in the review, not the tourists’ perception of the whole experience. The British tourist attempts to transform the whole experience into a story to tell; the Italian tourist, on the other hand, selects and isolates the objects of his/her gaze and provides an evaluation. Italian reviews, being also shorter than British ones, are more easily connected to Tripadvisor scores

4 “a necessary stop” / A place not to be missed on a trip to London! Beautiful and impressive building front that recalls a Greek temple; very interesting collections, which let you jump through time and travel around the world simply by going from one room to another.

5 “Wonderful” / Inside, the Rosetta stone and a part of the Parthenon pediment are preserved, as well as countless Greek, Roman, Egyptian, Etruscan exhibits ... Free entry.

6 “unique, every time” / You can come back twenty times and, each time, be surprised and charmed. The room – which I had never seen – containing the main exhibits of the collection is amazing.
from 1 to 5 (1 terrible; 2 poor; 3 average; 4 very good; 5 excellent), whereas the narrative reconstruction of British travellers is less clearly connected to a score. Even in the few cases of a poor rating, the attitude of Italian tourists and the way they reconstruct their experience do not change:

(6) “Caotico”
Metto quattro pallini solo per rispetto agli oggetti che contiene (uno su tutti: la tomba di Nebamun), ma è caotico, confuso e male organizzato. Fai dei chilometri avanti indietro per passare da una zona all'altra, perché le piantine, ma il museo stesso, sono molto confuse. Ci si deve andare, è tappa obbligata, ma fai una faticaccia, e ve lo dice una che insegna storia dell'arte! (August 8th 2015) 7.

(7) “Tanto spazio..sprecato!”
Per fortuna che l'ingresso era gratis perché forse i britannici non hanno idea di cosa siano rovine etrusche e romane! Questo museo non ha nulla di particolare a parte gli ampi spazi occupati da vetrine con dentro reperti che per noi italiani sono all'ordine del giorno! Unica cosa interessante la zona egizia e la stele di Rosetta (August 18th 2015) 8.

The range of modifiers such as caotico, confuse, male organizzato, sprecato are foregrounded and play a major role in the review. Even the reference to an actual, individual experience that may justify a low rating (fai dei chilometri...fai una faticaccia...i britannici non hanno idea ... questo museo non ha nulla di particolare) is not exploited to construct a narrative approach. The only reference to a past — the imperfetto in Per fortuna che l'ingresso era gratis — just marks the beginning of the visit. What seems a narrative incipit, however, is immediately followed by a modifier (gratis) and an unproven statement that has a universal reach. Even in this case, the subject of the sentence is an object (il biglietto) and not the tourist in person.

3. Personalization

Another feature, linked to the roles played by tourists involved in the frame “visiting a museum” and the different text-types exploited to represent the experience, is the weight of subjectivity. The English narratives personalize the visit and make tourists’ identities more visible, by singling out a specific experience. In Italian, on the contrary, the absence of any narrating attitude, structured around a time sequence, makes it quite difficult to distinguish one review from the other. The writer’s identity can only be retrieved by using the partial information displayed on the left of the screen:

7 “Chaotic” / I give a mark of four points just because of the objects it contains (above all: the Nebamun tomb), but it is chaotic, confused, and badly organized. You can walk around for kilometers just to move from one area to another, since the maps, but the museum itself, are really confusing. You cannot miss it, it is an essential stop, but it is so tiring - and I teach the history of art, believe me!

8 “So much space...wasted!” / Luckily, the entry was free of charge because British people, probably, don’t know what Etruscan and Roman remains are! This museum has nothing special apart from large spaces filled with showcases containing exhibits that, for Italians, are not so extraordinary! The only interesting things are the Egyptian area and the Rosetta stone.
Personal and individual reconstructions in English switch from *I/my* to *we* because what really seems to matter in these reviews is to deliver the individual perception of a cultural experience:

(8) “*History at its finest....*”
A great place to start before your visit to Pompeii or Herculaneum.. it gives an insight into daily life and the mosaics, paintings and sculptures are truly amazing but could be presented in a different way. **I think it would be nice** to have large story boards for tourists to read and stop and take time to bring the whole experience to life instead of just moving from room to room with a headset. **I much prefer to read** at my own pace and this was a disappointment (July 16th 2015).

(9) Very thought provoking!”
Pompeii display is excellent and puts most of what you may have seen at the sight into perspective. Some lovely exhibits **which blew my mind. My advice would be to do the site trip** first as we did. The big down side is no air conditioning; I was wearing a Tee shirt and was soaked with sweat even though we timed for an early arrival. Take something to fan yourself! Allow around 2-3 hours for your visit. €13 entry fee was a bit steep I thought but should not prevent you visiting (August 13th 2015).

The British tourist personalizes the museum experience by introducing an epistemic stance that is usually addressed to the reader (*I think it would be nice ... I much prefer to read ... My advice would be to do the site trip*) and exploits modal verbs (*would* is particularly frequent). Emotional involvement and descriptions of such involvement are quite frequent and personalized, as in 9) **Some lovely exhibits which blew my mind....** Likewise, first-person-related elements, such as *I/me/my* often introduce suggestions or recommendations to other tourists:
(10)
[...] I would suggest going to this museum after going to Ercolano [...] (August 27th 2015; my emphasis)
[...] I did think it was worth the cost [...] (June 17th 2015; my emphasis)
[...] Then I suggest you visit the Museo Archeologico Nazionale [...] (June 25th 2015; my emphasis)
[...] I challenge the head Curator to go to Rome/Paris/London [...] (June 24th 2015; my emphasis)
[...] I would recommend going but maybe buy a book explaining everything if these are available [...] (July 23rd 2015)

Instead, the usage of first person plural elements, such as adjectives (our) or pronouns (we/us) seems to be aimed at personalizing the narration by involving other members of the tourist group (in the following examples we have a family and a couple) in an experience that goes beyond the rating of the exhibits:

(11) “excellent collection of mosaics”
We visited the Museum before Herculaneum and Pompeii and found it extremely interesting. We are a family with two children under 14. Our favourite area was the mosaics (we skipped the secret room). There is not much written explanation about exhibits but the audio-guides were helpful and we could look around at our leisure (August 29th 2015).

(12) “Go here for the delights of Pompeii”
We went here solely to see the mosaics of Pompeii and were not disappointed! We paid our admission fee but you could quite easily have slipped in FOC by going to the bookshop at the back of the pay booth and then slipping into the museum from there! Security is not very tight! We found a quiet garden inside the grounds of the museum to eat our lunch in and get away from the hoards [sic] of screaming school kids laughing at the erotica that is to found amongst the Pompeii exhibits! We said that it’s a pity they don’t have replicas of the mosaics at Pompeii so that you can see them in situ - although maybe you would then have no need to visit the museum! (April 26th 2016).

In Italian, on the contrary, the appraisal approach is based on the opposite principle, the depersonalization of the review. In Italian reviews, the most frequent verbal structures exploit impersonal forms, passivizing or using the impersonal *si*, sentences not featuring any verbs and with a modifier placed on the left in focus position (as seen before):

(13) “un viaggio nella storia”
Durante il mio breve soggiorno a Londra, non poteva mancare la visita a questo museo. La visita merita davvero qualche ora del nostro tempo, ma si è ripagati dall’enorme patrimonio che ne è conservato all’interno! Visitatelo!! (June 9th 2015)

(14) “La parte degli Egizi”

9 “a journey into history” / During my short stay in London, I could not go without visiting this museum. The visit really deserves some hours of our time, but you are paid back by looking at the great amount of exhibits that are kept there! Go and visit it!!
La parte degli egizi è notevole sia al piano terra sia al primo piano. **Molto valida anche la parte riguardante gli etruschi. E’ enorme** e forse consigliabile di farlo in più tappe altrimenti dopo un po’ **sembra tutto uguale**. Tanto **non è a pagamento** e nonostante tanta gente all’interno **si riesce a girare** bene perché molto grande (August 24th 2015) 10.

As we can see, the syntactic subject of the sentences is never the tourist as a **persona**, but a non-animated object or concept (**la visita ... l’enorme patrimonio... la parte degli egizi ... la parte riguardante gli etruschi**). In some cases, this subject is not specified (**è enorme... sembra tutto uguale... non è pagamento...**) and corresponds to the museum itself. In particular, we can see the frequent use of the deontic construction “**da + (non) + infinitive**”, which is exploited to make up appealing headings or in the body of the review. Its function is basically to address future tourists and provide them with a compelling suggestion, quite often introduced in the headings:

(15) **“Da visitare almeno una volta nella vita”**  
(June 16th 2015) 11

(16) **“Da non perdere”**  
(July 22nd 2015) 12

(17) **“Da visitare assolutamente!”**  
(August 16th 2015) 13

(18) **“da visitare anche perché ingresso ad offerta”**  
(August 21st 2015) 14

(19) **“Un classico da non perdere”**  
(August 23rd 2015) 15

In the main text of the review, the expression “**da + (non) + infinitive**” is usually associated to a positive rating, whose deontic strength is reinforced through adverbial boosters such as **assolutamente** or **sicuramente**:

(20) **“La Storia”**  
In questo museo è possibile fare un giro tra la Storia dei popoli che hanno abitato la Terra. Molto bello, affascinante. Sicuramente consigliato a tutti, dai bambini agli adulti. Ero in viaggio con mio figlio di 15 anni ed è il museo che ha apprezzato di più a Londra. **Da vedere sicuramente** (June 14th 2015) 16.

---

10 “The Egyptian area” / The Egyptian area is remarkable, both on the ground floor and the first floor. The Etruscan area is outstanding too. It is so big, and maybe it is advisable to visit it at different times, otherwise everything seems the same after a while. After all, entry is free of charge and you can walk around easily because it is very big.

11 “To be visited at least once in a lifetime”.

12 “Not to be missed”.

13 “To be visited, absolutely”.

14 “To be visited, since entry is based on voluntary contributions”.

15 “A classic not to be missed”.

16 “History” / In this museum you can walk around the History of the populations who lived on the Earth. Very beautiful, charming. Definitely recommended to everybody, from children to adults. I was
(21) “Museo da non perdere”  
Che dire... uno dei musei più grandi e ricchi del mondo in una location splendida. da non perdere assolutamente (July 1st 2015) 17.

Conclusion

If we retrieve space B, stemming from the base space A (VISIT a, b), we can see that it changes according to the type of reviews produced by British tourists visiting a museum in Italy or Italian tourists visiting a museum in London. The different but connected mental spaces actually help us make a clear distinction between the nature of the experience itself and its representation, which can sometimes be confused. In our case, the secondary derivations from space B can be configured in the following way:

According to the analysis here, the dominant narrative and subjective mode in English brings about a functional change and a replacement of the primary operator REVIEW with the operator NARRATE. The resulting space C’ that summarizes the British tourists’ approach to reconstructing the museum experience, and probably travelling experience as a whole, is:

NARRATE, a”, b”.

This conclusion suggests that the narrative mode seems to be widespread and prevalent in reviews written by British tourists. Verbal processes and personal views create travelling with my 15-year-old son and it is the museum he liked most in London. Definitely not to be missed.

17 “A museum not to be missed” / What can I say ... one of the biggest and richest museums in the world set in a wonderful location. Not to be missed, absolutely.
a dynamic account which is not, however, easily connected to TripAdvisor scores and the general purposes of a reviewing task.

On the other hand, the attitude of Italian tourists privileges a stance that almost completely ignores the seeing subject, but keeps the reviewing function alive. The result is a space C” where the “seer” is deleted:

**REVIEW, Ø, b”.

In this case, the missing seeing subject (missing in the verbal representations, not in practice) triggers timeless descriptions that are quite difficult to distinguish, but are clearly connected to the communicative purposes of the TripAdvisor scoring system.

What mental spaces reveal, in terms of intercultural comparison, is a different conceptualization of the travelling experience and its verbal representation. Italian *commenti* show that the cultural frame of reference is one in which the narrating subject fades into the background and often disappears. The perceived role of the Italian tourist involved in the representation of his/her own travel experiences seems to be the role of an “objective reporter”, who is willing to share his/her appraisal of the “Other”. On the contrary, British tourists seem more than willing to share “a vision” of their travelling experiences, which is implicit in storytelling.

In terms of genre analysis, we can see that the sharing of an identical communicative purpose – writing a review – does not trigger the same result as soon as a verbal account in different languages is involved. Different cultures provide different interpretations of the same pragmatic input and show how the theoretical notion of genre is often shaped by culture-bound cognitive frames. Further research could probably point to text-type differences by restricting the investigation to reviews written in English by non-native speakers; or, if one decides to focus on English-speaking countries, native speakers of English coming from different countries of the “inner circle” (Kachru 1992) may possibly display significant variations.

**References**


Antonio Fruttaldo and Marco Venuti
(University of Naples ‘L’Orientale’, Italy and University of Catania, Italy)

Abstract
On June 26, 2015, the US Supreme Court ruled on the Obergefell v. Hodges case that led to the recognition of same-sex marriage in all fifty States, declaring it a constitutional right under the Fourteenth Amendment. The event received huge media coverage and soon became a major topic of animated discussions on digital media platforms.
In this context, our investigation will focus on the cross-cultural representation of the main actors and events concerning the US Supreme Court ruling in leading US, UK and Italian online newspapers. In line with Bednarek and Caple’s (2012a, 2012b) approach to the analysis of media discourse, our analysis focuses on the discursive construction of newsworthiness (Bell 1991; Bednarek and Caple 2012a, 2012b, 2014, 2017; Caple and Bednarek 2016; Bednarek 2016a, 2016b) in the textual elements of the selected news stories. Our findings have confirmed Hall, Critcher, Jefferson, Clarke and Roberts’ (1978) claim on the cultural nature of news values, the analysis of which can be seen as a suitable instrument to draw a cultural ‘map’ of the social world. Indeed, our investigation has identified how different cultures tend to highlight different sets of news values in reporting a news story that has cross-culturally impacted on the different value systems of the countries represented in our corpus.

1. The Obergefell v. Hodges case: the context that led to the same-sex ruling

The long journey towards the recognition of same-sex marriage in the United States starts from the early 1970s, when on May 18, 1970, two University of Minnesota students, Richard John Baker and James Michael McConnell, applied to Hennepin County District Court (Minneapolis, MN) for a marriage licence. Clerk Gerald Nelson, however, denied the application, since the applicants were both men. Baker and McConnell,

1 The authors would like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their suggestions, comments, and guidance on early drafts of this contribution.

2 The following reconstruction of the events that have led to the Supreme Court ruling is based on the timeline offered by the website ProCon.org (retrieved from http://gaymarriage.procon.org/view.timeline.php?timelineID=000030; last accessed: February 4, 2017), where news stories from different sources historically reconstruct the legal steps in the recognition of same-sex marriage.
by claiming that Minnesota law on marriage made no reference to gender, sued clerk Nelson, but the trial court agreed with the latter. The couple’s case was dismissed again when Baker and McConnell went to the US Supreme Court.

However, the matter concerning legal recognition of civil marriage rights and benefits for same-sex couples became increasingly prominent in US politics following the Hawaii Supreme Court decision (1993) in *Baehr v. Lewin*, which challenged traditional marriage and raised the possibility that the State’s prohibition of same-sex marriages might be unconstitutional. At the national government level, this challenge was met by strong restrictions to marriage to male-female couples, most notably through the enactment of the Defense of Marriage Act (DOMA; Clinton administration, first term, 1993-1997).

Given these restrictions, the Supreme Court’s decision in *Goodridge v. Department of Public Health*, on May 17, 2004, thanks to which Massachusetts became the first US state to legalize same-sex marriage, represents a cornerstone in the fight towards the recognition of civil rights for same-sex couples. However, this provoked again a reaction from supporters of traditional marriage and, more specifically, from former US President George W. Bush, who announced a series of legal actions to reserve marriage rights and benefits to opposite-sex couples. Notwithstanding this announcement, we can notice a steady expansion of the recognition of same-sex couples’ rights up until late 2014, when same-sex marriages had become legal in states that contained more than 70% of the US population. Even though legalization came through the action of state courts or, more frequently, as the result of the decisions of federal courts, they further highlighted the increasing urgency of the matter from a national government point of view.

In June 2013, the US Supreme Court’s decision in *United States v. Windsor* struck down the restriction of the US federal interpretation of ‘marriage’ and ‘spouse’ to apply only to opposite-sex unions. Therefore, this represented one of the very first chinks in the US armour in helping the progress of lawsuits in federal courts that challenged state bans on same-sex marriage.

Hence, given the previous legislations in favour of same-sex couples, on June 26, 2015, the US Supreme Court in the case *Obergefell v. Hodges* was able to strike down all state bans on same-sex marriage, legalizing it in all fifty states and requiring states to honour out-of-state same-sex marriage licences. However, the landmark 5-4 decision split the court between the usual ideological lines and, in a rare occurrence, the four justices who disagreed with the majority authored dissents (Gerstein 2015). In particular, Justice Antonin Scalia argued that the decision represents a threat to American democracy, maintaining that (Supreme Court of the United States 2015):

> The opinion in these cases is the furthest extension in fact – and the furthest extension one can even imagine – of the Court’s claimed power to create “liberties” that the Constitution and its Amendments neglect to mention. This practice of constitutional revision by an unelected committee of nine, always accompanied (as it is today) by extravagant praise of liberty, robs the People of the most important liberty they asserted in the Declaration of Independence and won in the Revolution of 1776: the freedom to govern themselves.

Given the heated debates surrounding it and the massive media coverage it received, we have decided to focus our attention on the US Supreme Court ruling on the
Obergefell v. Hodges case in the way the press reported this event. Additionally, given the worldwide resonance of the decision, and given the social nature of news values (see Section 2.2), investigating how they are enhanced in the US, UK and Italian press can help us see the different social construction of the event in the three cultures under investigation, thus highlighting the different cross-cultural ideologies embedded discursively in the news reporting.

2. Data collection and methodology

Our investigation, then, will focus on the representation of the main actors and events concerning the US Supreme Court ruling in leading US, UK and Italian newspapers. More specifically, the analysis will concentrate on the discursive construction of news values in the textual elements of the selected news stories. The aim of this contribution is to identify differences in terms of negativity, prominence, consonance, and personalization (among others: see Section 3 for a detailed description of the news values introduced in the framework of analysis by Bednarek and Caple 2012a) in the three countries and heritage news sources under investigation.

In particular, our contribution is based on the analysis of the first article (June 26, 2015) published online by The New York Times (US_NYT), The Washington Post (US_WAP), and the Los Angeles Times (US_LAT) in the US; The Guardian (UK_Guardian), The Daily Telegraph (UK_DalTelegraph), and The Times (UK_Times) in the UK; and la Repubblica (IT_Rep), Corriere della Sera (IT_CorSer), Il Messaggero (IT_Mess), il Giornale (IT_Gior), il Fatto Quotidiano (IT_FaQuot), and Libero (IT_Lib) in Italy. The selection was made both on the basis of the online circulation of each newspaper in the respective countries and their widespread use of digital media, something that we will discuss later in this piece of research (see the Concluding remarks and desiderata section of this contribution).

3 Heritage news sources refer to traditional and well-established print and broadcast news media organizations (such as The Guardian, The Daily Telegraph, The New York Times, BBC and CNN) that were developed before the advent of the Web 2.0 (Piazza, Haarman and Caborn 2015; Bednarek 2016; Bednarek and Caple 2017). In other words, these media outlets can be seen as off-line native organizations that later saw in the Internet a way to survive given their low product sales and advertising income from off-line contents. ‘Digital native’ sources (Bednarek 2016; Bednarek and Caple 2017), on the other hand, refer to online-only news media organizations (such as the Huffington Post and Buzzfeed).

4 The newspapers included in the corpus are also representative of different political and ideological stances. However, while the British press has been more accurately categorized as responding to specific political agendas (e.g. The Guardian has been traditionally seen as left-leaning, while The Daily Telegraph and The Times are classified as right-leaning; see Jucker 1992: Ch. 3; McNair 1994: 62; O’Driscoll 2003: 153; Baker, Gabrielatos and McEnery 2013: 8-9), the Italian and, more specifically, the American press is more problematic to clearly categorize as manifesting its allegiance to specific political parties (also because each country has its own conceptualisation of what can be regarded as ‘labour’ or ‘conservative’ agendas). Therefore, for the purposes of this contribution, political stances will not be categorically taken into consideration in order to explain given phenomena since, as Baker et al. (2013: 8) argue, “[t]he political terms ‘left’ and ‘right’ are relative, multifaceted and therefore problematic [...] [since] within a newspaper there may be some columnists who have been chosen precisely because they represent an antagonistic view [...] [and] there are different ways of being ‘left’ or ‘right’.”

5 The data regarding the online circulation were retrieved, for the UK, from the Audit Bureau of Circulations (ABC: available online at https://www.abc.org.uk/); for the US, from the Alliance for Audited Media (AAM: available online at https://auditedmedia.com/); and for Italy, from Alexa Internet (available online at https://www.alexa.com/).
The articles selected for the investigation all belong to the same genre (i.e. news stories) in order to rule out the hypothesis that cross-cultural differences were due to the nature of the genre.

Additionally, the selection of the countries was based on the different legal steps each of them has taken towards marriage equality. Indeed, while the Marriage Act (2013) legalized same-sex marriage in England and Wales, in Italy a heated debate was occurring regarding the approval of same-sex civil unions at the time of the US Supreme Court ruling.

The analysis of the news stories has been performed by adopting a qualitative approach to the data collected. Thus, each news story has been manually annotated to highlight the news values enhanced in specific lexical items. Due to the differences in languages and cultures, the news values were annotated manually on the basis of a common categorization (see Section 2.2 for further information on the discursive approach to news values used in this contribution). This has allowed us to draw a common baseline in order to make a comparison between the different newspapers in the corpus under investigation.

2.1. News values in the press

News values have been traditionally described in terms of the factors that make a news story newsworthy, that is, as “the factors that take an event into the news” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 39). Thus, they have been considered as linked to news selection since, as Bell (1991: 155) argues, they are “values by which one ‘fact’ is judged more newsworthy than another”.

In the Journalism and Communication Studies literature, news values have been defined by Bednarek and Caple (2014: 2) as “properties of events or stories or as criteria/principles that are applied by news workers in order to select events or stories as news or to choose the structure and order of reporting”. Since they are generally referred to as ‘values’, van Dijk (1988: 119) underlines their location in social cognition, as “[t]hey are values about the newsworthiness of events or discourse, shared by professionals [...], and indirectly by the public of the news media”.

First introduced by Galtung and Ruge (1965: 65) in their foundational work on how events become news, news values are discussed through a metaphor, thus comparing the world to “an enormous set of broadcasting stations, each one emitting its signal or its program at its proper wavelength”. Therefore, in order to ‘pick up’ the right frequencies and maximize them in a given media outlet, the media industry follows certain values (ibid.: 70). However, Galtung and Ruge’s (ibid.) seminal work displays a number of shortcomings. In particular, as Harcup and O’Neill (2001: 265) argue, Galtung and Ruge’s (ibid.) approach to news values seems to imply that “there is a given reality ‘out there’ which the news gatherers will either admit or exclude” while, as previously argued, since they are first and foremost values, they offer a specific construction of a given reality. In the words of Vasterman (1995: n.p.):

---

6 Each researcher annotated the articles independently. Results were compared and discordances and incongruities were jointly discussed in order to aim at consistency of annotation.
[...] news is not out there, journalists do not report news, they produce news. They construct it, they construct facts, they construct statements and they construct a context in which these facts make sense. They reconstruct ‘a’ reality.

In this sense and, in a way, by overcoming the limitations of Galtung and Ruge’s (1965) study on news values, Bell (1991) further explores them as a way to turn an event into news. This simple but powerful insight into the factitious nature of news values as a construction of newsworthiness allows the author to categorize them in three main macro-categories, that is, as values in the news text, values in the news process, and values in news actors and events.

Values in the news text (i.e. clarity, brevity, and colour: Bell 1991: 160) are those factors that are related to the quality and style of the news story that may affect its newsworthiness. In other words, “if a story’s writing exhibits these characteristics, editorial decision-makers will favour it above a story which does not exhibit them” (ibid.).

Values in the news process (i.e. continuity, competition, co-option, composition, predictability, and prefabrication: ibid.: 158-160) are those factors that are related more closely to news gathering. That is, they can be seen as those factors that enable given events to be featured as news.

Finally, values in news actors and events (i.e. negativity, recency, proximity, consonance, unambiguity, unexpectedness, novelty, superlativeness, relevance, personalization, eliteness, attribution, facticity: ibid.: 156-158) are those factors that can enhance the newsworthiness of an event.

However, Bednarek and Caple (2012a: 40) define as news values only Bell’s (1991) macro-category of values in news actors and events, since the other two macro-categories usually represent “general characteristics demanded of a news story in order to be included”. Thus, as we can see in Table 1, Bell’s (ibid.) macro-categories under which news values have been organized are re-labelled in the framework of analysis developed by Bednarek and Caple (2012a):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Values in the news text</td>
<td>News writing objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values in the news process</td>
<td>News cycle/market factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values in news actors and events</td>
<td>News values</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1.* Bell’s (1991) macro-categories of news values and Bednarek and Caple’s (2012a) corresponding categories

Therefore, in line with Bednarek and Caple’s (2012a, 2012b, 2014, 2017) Discursive News Values Analysis (DNVA), our approach to news values in the news stories under investigation will be restricted only to the ones identified by Bell (1991) as values in news actors and events.

**2.2. The discursive construction of news values**

As previously said, Bednarek and Caple’s (2012a) view is particularly linked to their discursive approach to news values, which investigates (Bednarek and Caple 2012b: 104) “how newsworthiness is construed and established through discourse”.

According to Fairclough, Mulderrig and Wodak (2011: 357), discourse as a social practice implies “a dialectical relationship between a particular discursive event and all the diverse elements of the situation(s), institutions(s), and social structure(s) which frame it”. However, Fairclough et al. (ibid.) maintain that this dialectical relationship goes both ways: discourse shapes and is shaped by the situation(s), institutions(s), and social structure(s). In this way, news values can be seen as discursively enhanced since they may be representative of specific social concerns that are ‘voiced’ in media discourse. Thus, a discursive perspective sees news values as a “quality of texts” (Caple and Bednarek 2016: 13, emphasis in the original), and their analysis can allow us to “systematically investigate how these values are constructed in the different types of textual material involved in the news process” (Bednarek and Caple 2012b: 104). This approach to news values allows the authors to highlight given textual traces, referred to as “pointers” to newsworthiness (Bednarek and Caple 2014: 11), that provide insights as to how news values are realized in news discourse, as we can see from Table 2 (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 55-56; 2012b: 106).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NEWS VALUES</th>
<th>EXAMPLES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NEGATIVITY</td>
<td>terrible news, a tragedy, distraught, worried, breaking our hearts, killed, deaths, bodies, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIMELINESS</td>
<td>breaking news, today, yesterday, [use of tenses that express that an event has only just happened, is still ongoing or will happen in the (near) future], etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROXIMITY</td>
<td>[geographical names or cultural references]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROMINENCE / ELITENESS</td>
<td>pop star, celebrity bad boy, President, MP, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONSONANCE</td>
<td>legendary, notorious, a flood of immigrants, yet another personal scandal, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPACT</td>
<td>a potentially momentous day, a terror that took their breath away, thousands of people, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOVELTENESS</td>
<td>a very different sort of disaster, a new discovery, unusual, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPERLATIVENESS</td>
<td>they were petrified, a giant storm, a tragedy of epic proportions, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERSONALIZATION</td>
<td>[an ‘ordinary’ person telling their story]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 2.* Summary offered by Bednarek and Caple (2012a: 55-56; 2012b: 106) of the linguistic cues that can be used in order to construe news values

The list of pointers to newsworthiness should not be restricted to the examples given in Table 2: furthermore, certain textual devices can “simultaneously construe more than one news value and hence contribute significantly to rendering the story newsworthy” (Bednarek and Caple 2012b: 106).

Additionally, Bednarek and Caple (2014: 6) argue that “an analysis of how news values are discursively constructed in texts should be both ‘manual’ and ‘multimodal’”, since “only through close analysis of texts can we find out what values are emphasised (foregrounded), rare or absent (backgrounded)” (ibid.).

Thanks to the analysis of how news values are discursively constructed, we can thus gain “first insights into a conventionalised repertoire of rhetoric of newsworthiness”
Therefore, if “every journalist and every editor will have a different interpretation of what is newsworthy” (Rau 2010: 15), the analysis of news values in media discourse can help researchers identify “what kind of discursive devices are repeatedly used [...] to construct different news values” (Bednarek and Caple 2014: 16) and, consequently, they can take us to the backstage of the news production process.

From this observation, we must also underline that these are values and, as such, “t[hey are not neutral, but reflect ideologies and priorities held in society” (Bell 1991: 156). Indeed, Cotter (2010: 8) refers to them as “ideological factors”, since they can be used to reinforce “an ‘ideology’ about what counts as news” (ibid.: 67) and “other ideologies (rather than just an ideology of what is newsworthy)” (Bednarek and Caple 2014: 3, emphasis in the original). Thus, news values can be seen as those factors that are enhanced in news stories to reinforce ideologies and ‘make sense’ of given events, in line with the value system of a specific cultural environment. In this view, news values construct a cultural ‘map’ (Hall et al. 1978) of what counts as news. In the words of Hall et al. (ibid.: 54-55):

An event only ‘makes sense’ if it can be located within a range of known social and cultural identifications. [...] The social identification, classification and contextualisation of news events in terms of these background frames of reference is the fundamental process by which the media make the world they report on intelligible to readers and viewers. This process of ‘making an event intelligible’ is a social process – constituted by a number of specific journalistic practices, which embody (often only implicitly) crucial assumptions about what society is and how it works.

The analysis of news values can thus be seen as uncovering the cultural assumptions that the media industry embodies in reporting specific events in a given society. Retrieving their discursive construction may be metaphorically associated with the operation of linking different points on a cultural map to connect them and reconstruct the social contours of the representation of specific actors and events.

In line with the previous observations and the methodological framework adopted here⁷, in the following section we will apply this model of analysis to the news stories in the corpus under investigation.

3. Discursive cross-cultural identification of the news values in the US, UK and Italian press

Given the methodology previously introduced and used in order to analyse the news values highlighted in the news stories under investigation, in the following section, we are going to comment on the specific realizations of the news values as enhanced in reporting the US Supreme Court ruling on same-sex marriage in the different context of the US, UK and Italian press.

Figure 1 below shows the overall distribution of the news values retrieved in the

---

⁷ The methodological framework adopted here is based on the one introduced in Bednarek and Caple (2012a) and further explored and used in Bednarek and Caple (2012b, 2014).
data under investigation. We will, however, comment on them individually in the next sections.

As can be seen in Figure 1, while some news values are equally distributed in the news stories and countries under investigation, others seem to be particularly enhanced in specific social contexts. However, the equal distribution of some of them does not mean that they foreground and pinpoint the same issues and world views in the US, UK and Italy. Therefore, in the following paragraphs, we will comment on them and offer a wider overview of the different or similar way specific news values are enhanced in the corpus under investigation.

3.1. Negativity
In line with previous studies (Glasgow University Media Group 1976; Bell 1991), Bednarek and Caple (2012a: 42)argue that “[n]ews stories very frequently concern bad happenings such as conflicts, accidents, damages, injuries, disasters or wars”. More broadly, negativity thrives on conflictual aspects of news stories. Table 3 below shows the distribution of the news value in the news stories under investigation:

![Figure 1. Distribution of news values in NewsMar](image_url)

Table 3. Negativity in NewsMar

As we can see from Table 3, negativity is particularly enhanced cross-culturally in all the news stories under investigation. However, each newspaper uses it to highlight given aspects of the news story. Indeed, the Italian press (see example 1 below) generally uses negativity so as to present the event as a resolution of an injustice (with the exception of the Messaggero, which focuses on the opposite sides in the debate before the Supreme Court, and Libero, which employs it to argue that other events are more
relevant and newsworthy (ISIS attacks) and to focus on the opinions expressed by the dissident judges:

(1) Il giudice Anthony Kennedy, scrivendo a nome della Corte, ha detto che le persone omosessuali che intendono sposarsi «non devono essere condannate a vivere in solitudine, esclusa [sic] da una delle più antiche istituzioni della civiltà».
(IT_CorSer)

In the UK press, while The Times enhances negativity so as to make a comparison between the event and past human right victories (e.g. the abolition of racial segregation) and The Guardian focuses on the dissenting judges opposing the sentence and its legal limitations, The Telegraph is more explicit in using negativity in order to negatively evaluate the event as a revolution imposed undemocratically on people, a crusade against those opposing gay marriage (see example 2 below), and LGBTIQ+ people as emotionally immature:

(2) Conservatives lost the battle over gay marriage, and liberals won — with a little help from activist judges. Hopefully they will be generous in victory and not persecute religious people.
(UK_Telegraph)

Finally, as for the US press, negativity is particularly linked in all the news stories analysed to the dissenting opinions of the Supreme Court judges: their opposing views are constructed discursively in a constant battle between the two sides.

3.2. Timeliness

Timeliness entails that “[m]ore recent events are often more newsworthy” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 42), more relevant to readers/viewers. Therefore, it can also be constructed in discourse to project the temporal deictic centre to that of the viewers/readers’." Table 4 below shows how the news value of timeliness characterizes the reporting in the three countries differently.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>IT</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FQ</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gi</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Me</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gu</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Te</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAT</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WaP</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Timeliness in NewsMar

As we can see from Table 4, timeliness is equally enhanced in all the news stories under investigation, specifically to highlight the historical moment represented by the event. However, a particular mention should be made in the case of la Repubblica,

8 Translation: “Justice Anthony Kennedy, writing for the Court, said that gay people who intend to get married ‘should not be condemned to live in solitude, excluded from one of the oldest institutions of civilization.’”

9 The semantic-pragmatic notion of ‘deictic projection’ (Lyons 1977) can be defined as a “shift in points of view” (Chovanec 2014: 36). In other words, deictic projection entails that “[s]peakers, or writers, do have the option of transferring the deictic centre to the hearer’s, or reader’s, spatio-temporal situation in which the text will be encountered” (Brown and Yule 1983: 53).
where special emphasis is placed on Obama’s previous political victories, and the event is thus used to present Obama as a man of action:

(3) Il presidente statunitense – che ha già incassato successi sul trattato di libero scambio e sulla sanità negli ultimi tre giorni – ha tenuto un discorso per congratularsi con gli attivisti “e con gli americani tutti [...]” 10.
(IT_REP)

The American press, on the other hand, uses timeliness to construct discursively the future consequences and impact of the event through ‘tense’ (see example 4 below):

(4) Though the court’s 5-4 opinion is tightly focused on the question of same-sex unions, its broad wording and soaring rhetoric will reverberate beyond the two-decade-long battle for marriage equality and almost surely lead to the striking down of any remaining laws that directly discriminate against people based on sexual orientation.
(US_LAT)

3.3. Proximity

The news value of proximity is particularly linked to the fact that “[w]hat is newsworthy usually concerns the country, region or city in which the news is published” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 42). The relevance of geographical closeness may explain the imbalance of the distribution of proximity in the three subcorpora, as the news value is present in the US articles and hardly used in the remaining ones.

As we can see from Table 5, proximity is not particularly enhanced in the Italian and UK subcorpora. The only peculiarity in the Italian press is represented by Libero, where proximity is used so as to make reference to more newsworthy events near Italy that should have been covered (i.e. ISIS attacks in Tunisia and Lyon):

(5) Tendenza che porta a riflettere su quanto l’opinione pubblica sia sensibile a certi temi piuttosto che ad altri, e a come su internet sia più “figo” parlare delle nozze gay piuttosto che di stragi terroristiche che avvengono a due passi da casa nostra 11.
(IT_Lib)

In the case of the American press, proximity is discursively realized in the use of pronouns (more specifically, the use of the pronoun ‘we’).

10 Translation: “The US President, who has already succeeded on the Free Trade Agreements and on the healthcare system in the last three days, has held a speech to congratulate activists and all Americans [...]”.

11 Translation: “This trend forces us to reflect on public opinion’s sensitivity towards certain issues rather than others, and how on the Internet talking about gay marriage is ‘cooler’ than discussing terrorist massacres that have taken place just around the corner from our houses.”
3.4. Superlativeness

Superlativeness seems to be linked to the fact that “news stories usually focus on maximizing or intensifying particular aspects of an event” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 44). In this way, given aspects of an event are maximized or intensified to enhance their newsworthiness. Therefore, superlativeness may provide a useful indication of the angle chosen for the report.

Table 6 shows how the closer the event is to the culture where it has taken place, the more superlative pointers are used in presenting different aspects of the event. Indeed, while in the Italian and UK press superlativeness is mainly realized in expressions linked solely to the historical significance of the event, in the US press superlativeness is used to describe the tone of the debate among justices (see example 5 below), the crowds enthusiastically celebrating in different parts of the US and the number of people involved in the celebrations.

In the corpus under investigation, pointers to superlativeness also embody nuances of the news value of impact (more specifically, when referring to the national implications of the Supreme Court decision). Thus, superlativeness and impact seem to be realized discursively as one in our data (see example 6 below):

(6) In four separate and blistering dissents, conservative justices heaped scorn on the majority opinion. “This court is not a legislature [and] our Constitution does not enact any theory of marriage,” said Chief Justice John G. Roberts Jr., who took the rare step of reading his dissent in court.

(US_LAT)

(7) Same-sex marriages are now legal across the entirety of the United States after a historic supreme court ruling that declared attempts by conservative states to ban them unconstitutional.

(UK_Guardian)

3.5. Eliteness

The news value of eliteness entails that “[s]tories about ‘elite’ individuals or celebrities are more newsworthy than stories about ordinary people” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 43). Eliteness, however, can also play an important role in the selection of given sources over others in terms of “attribution” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 43; see also Bednarek 2016a). Indeed, socially validated authorities have better chances to see their ‘voices’ being represented in the media.

Table 7 below shows the distribution of eliteness in the three subcorpora. A closer analysis of elite people in the news articles will reveal differences in the discursive construction of newsworthiness in the three countries.
Table 7 shows some level of variability in the discursive distribution and enhancement of eliteness in the three subcorpora. This variability is also testified in the different cultural realizations of eliteness in the Italian, UK and US press. Indeed, in the Italian press eliteness is linked to the Supreme Court but, more specifically, to the role played by Obama (see example 8), also used to enhance superlative aspects of the event by quoting his statement. In the UK press, eliteness is realized in the accessed voices of local authorities and officers (see example 9), and in the two sides of the battle: the conservatives (seen as the losers) and liberals (seen as the winners). If in the UK press different voices are represented as sources of eliteness, in the US press this news value is realized in the Supreme Court judges, who are repeatedly assigned a key role in reporting the event (see example 5 above).


(IT_Rep)

(9) Texas attorney general Ken Paxton issued a long statement suggesting he would attempt to fight the legalisation of gay marriage by asserting the “religious liberties” of clerks and officials.

(UK_Guardian)

3.6. Impact

The news value of impact is particularly linked to the fact that “[t]he effects or consequences of an event are aspects of a story that are newsworthy, especially if they involve serious repercussions or have a more global impact” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 43). Since there may be different groups of viewers/readers, with different interests and expectations, “[m]inority relevance is much less emphasized” (van Dijk 1988: 122) while effects on relevant social classes are much more newsworthy. This is also linked to the local and global impact of given events: the more global the relevance, the more newsworthy the event.

As shown in Figure 1, impact is the most frequently enhanced news value in the whole corpus, and also the one which is more frequently used in the US subcorpus, as we can see from Table 8:

Table 8. Impact in NewsMar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IT</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>FQ</td>
<td>Gi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12 Translation: “Love is love’ – Obama said – ‘It was an extraordinary achievement; ordinary people can do extraordinary things. America should be proud of itself. Today we made our Union a little bit ‘more perfect’.”
Impact thus seems to represent a cross-cultural news value in the reporting of the Supreme Court ruling which is, however, construed differently in the newspapers under investigation. Indeed, while all of them highlight the historical moment represented by the sentence, *il Fatto Quotidiano* is maybe the only newspaper underlining the key role played by social media (and the hashtag #LoveWins) in the impact of the news story. *Libero* (see example 10), on the other hand, uses impact to criticize the popularity of the event, since it argues that more significant news stories should have been reported. The UK press specifically focuses on the joyous celebrations after the Supreme Court ruling (e.g. scenes of happiness, rainbow lights shining on the White House, etc.), with the only exception of the *Telegraph* (see example 11), which looks at the consequences of the event through a personal angle of the dangerous change taking place in American society, while also underlining the controversy between the two sides of a ‘war’ metaphor between dissident judges. Finally, as for the US press (see example 12), impact is both construed by highlighting the nationwide effect of the sentence, making a parallel with previous rulings that only applied to single states, and with reference to the reactions of elite individuals:

(10) Un moralismo che rischia di diventare ridicolo, ma d’altronde si sa: è più fashion condividere sulla propria bacheca post con bandiere multicolori che urlano la nostra (presunta) apertura mentale, piuttosto che le immagini di turisti uccisi dalla follia dell’Isis.  
(IT_Lib)

(11) Putting aside the rights and wrongs of the Court’s decision, this represents an extraordinary extension of judicial reach.  
(UK_Telegraph)

(12) The decision, which was the culmination of decades of litigation and activism, set off jubilation and tearful embraces across the country [...].  
(US_NYTtimes)

3.7. *Personalization*

Personalization refers to the fact that the personal or human side of an event is more newsworthy than an abstract concept. Thus, “[n]ews stories that are personalized attract audiences more than the portrayal of generalized concepts or processes” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 44).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>IT</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CS</td>
<td>FQ</td>
<td>Gi</td>
<td>Li</td>
<td>Me</td>
<td>Re</td>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td>Gu</td>
<td>Te</td>
<td>Ti</td>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td>LAT</td>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>WaP</td>
<td>Tot.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 9.* Personalization in NewsMar

As Table 9 shows, the news value of personalization is rarely used in all three subcorpora, and it mainly refers to the reactions of ordinary people celebrating the ruling.

---

13 Translation: “A moralism that may become ridiculous, but then again, you know, it is more popular sharing on our timelines posts with multi-coloured flags that scream our (alleged) open-mindedness, rather than the images of tourists being killed by the ISIS’ madness.”
and, especially in the Italian press, the personal/emotional response by former US President Barak Obama (see example 8) \(^\text{14}\).

### 3.8. Consonance

The news value of consonance concerns “[t]he extent to which aspects of a story fit in with stereotypes that people may hold about the events and people portrayed in it” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 41), thus confirming van Dijk’s assumption (1988) that news values are located and respond to a social cognition, which builds on expectations and ways of perceiving specific events.

Given the importance and ‘novelty’ of the US ruling, the news value of consonance is rarely used in all newspapers, as we can see from Table 10, and is mainly a reference to ‘traditional’ marriage:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IT</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>FQ</td>
<td>Gi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 10. Consonance in NewsMar*

### 3.9. Novelty

The news value of novelty entails that “[n]ews stories are frequently about happenings that surprise us, that are unusual or rare” (Bednarek and Caple 2012a: 43). In other words, the more unexpected, the more newsworthy the event is.

As we can see from Table 11, novelty seems to be particularly enhanced both in the IT_NewsMar and US_NewsMar:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IT</th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>FQ</td>
<td>Gi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 11. Novelty in NewsMar*

The even distribution of novelty in the subcorpora is, however, due to the fact that in all the news stories marriage is defined through the use of expressions (e.g. same-sex marriage, gay marriage, etc.) construing a ‘new’ marriage in contrast with the traditional view of heterosexual marriage. However, an exception can be identified in *la Repubblica*, where novelty is realized in the way the Obama administration’s support for the sentence is reflected in the rainbow lights shining on the White House:

(12) **Matrimoni gay** legali in tutti Usa: Casa Bianca **arcobaleno** su Twitter \(^\text{15}\).

(IT_Rep)

\(^{14}\) A previous study (Venuti *et al.* 2012) on a cross-cultural comparison of TV new programmes found a limited use of ordinary people by Italian TV outlets in comparison to UK ones.

\(^{15}\) Translation: “Gay Marriage legal in all US States: Rainbow White House on Twitter”.
4. Concluding remarks and desiderata

Our investigation is part of a wider independent research project (Fruttaldo and Venuti forthcoming; Venuti and Fruttaldo 2017) based on the cross-cultural analysis of news values in the press. More specifically, the aim of our research project is to demonstrate how given news values (Bell 1991; Bednarek and Caple 2012a, 2012b, 2014, 2017) are disseminated and ‘picked up’ by readers in their experience of reinterpreting given news stories online.

Indeed, if, as Bell (1991: 156) argues, news values “[…] are not neutral, but reflect ideologies and priorities held in society”, analysing whether and how readers reinforce and reinterpret these ideologies may help researchers see what values are foregrounded or backgrounded in the media outlet and how readers react to specific events.

In this contribution, however, our specific focus has been that of analysing whether, from a cross-cultural point of view, the analysis of news values can help researchers identify differences (and similarities) in the construction of newsworthiness in the social contexts where given news stories are issued. Our case study is based on the lack of cross-cultural analyses of news values in the press. Indeed, as Bednarek and Caple (2014: 17) argue, their theoretical framework is useful to “[…] uncover whether news outlets from different countries construct the newsworthiness of one event using the same news values”.

We have therefore seen how the Italian newspapers tend to represent the event in terms of the news values of Eliteness (in particular, by presenting the event as a success for the Obama administration), Impact, and Timeliness, while the UK press strongly underlines the news values of Negativity (in particular, in The Telegraph), Impact, and Timeliness/Superlativeness; finally, the US press strongly enhances the news values of Impact (specifically, focusing on future consequences), Eliteness (in this case, the judges involved in the US Supreme Court ruling were particularly foregrounded), and Negativity (explicitly linked to the opposing sides in the judges’ ruling). The discursive analysis of news values thus represents a useful tool in ethnographic research in order to draw a cultural map of specific media outlets, uncovering those processes of entextualization (Bauman and Briggs 1990; Briggs and Bauman 1992; Silverstein and Urban 1996) governed by journalists in the creation of ‘a’ reality.

References


MARKETING FOOD THROUGH TRANSLATION: AN ANALYSIS OF A HUNDRED MENUS FROM LAZIO

Alba Graziano
(Università degli Studi della Tuscia, Viterbo, Italy)

Abstract
A restaurant menu is both a business card of sorts and a showcase for any food service establishment. As such, it belongs to a complex genre of info-marketing communication and is as yet a form of food-related text that has received surprisingly little critical attention with regard to its semiotic and multimedia features. The verbal level of the menu – dish names in particular – has also so far been neglected by linguistic and pragmatic studies. In a previous study by Graziano and Mocini (2015) founded on Halliday’s (1994) functional grammar as well as Floch’s (1990) socio-semiotic framework, the peculiar morpho-syntactic and lexical structure of this form of brief text was analysed paying special attention to its twofold informative and persuasive function. The present study, conducted on the dish names of one hundred menus taken from the websites of as many restaurants operating in Lazio (Italy), confirms the presence of the previously identified promotional strategies on a wider scale, both from the quantitative and the qualitative point of view. A second point analysed is whether and to what extent the English versions of the same menus employ the same strategies. The translation analysis is conducted using a comparative linguistic approach applied to Language for Special Purposes, orientation strategies and translation procedures commonly identified in Translation Theories, and, in part, Error Analysis. It is to be concluded that, despite the emphasis traditionally placed on the culture-bound characteristics of food language, what establishes the pragmatics of this kind of text, therefore posing greater difficulties in translation, is the combination of syntactic order and sensory-metaphorical lexis.

1. Introduction

It is certainly no coincidence that the first example used by Roman Jakobson (1959) to start his seminal discussion on linguistic-cultural studies of translation was taken from the domain of food. The well-known case of the word cheese, borrowed from the logician Bertrand Russell, triggered Jakobson’s thought on radical linguistic arbitrariness and, developed in the same essay through a comparative analysis with the Russian sýr, it originated the “equivalence in difference” concept as “the cardinal problem of language” and “the pivotal concern of linguistics” as well as a regulating factor in the practice of interlingual translation and a dynamic measure of the translatability of texts.
Taking their cue from Jakobson and moving on up to Cronin’s *Eco-Translation* (2017), which posits the food/translation rapport as the primary component of what today is perhaps the most brilliant and ethically noble interpretation of the translator’s work, and passing via Expo 2015, which saw an increase in studies on the cultural, linguistic, literary and media value of food and nutrition¹, Food Studies and Translation Studies have proven to be doubly connected. The two fields present analogies in their respective objects of study and offer possibilities in layered interpretations with interdisciplinary input from anthropology, sociology, aesthetics, cultural and communication studies and even the medical and biological sciences (Chiaro and Rossato 2015).

As food and cuisines – like ethnic groups, civilizations and languages – migrate and blend together or, by reaction, seek to maintain/reproduce an ‘originating’ identity, and as communication channels become increasingly multimedial, absorbing and transforming more traditional ones, the textuality derived from the contemporary obsession with food is enriched both quantitatively and qualitatively. Its old and new genres are increasingly subjected to practices of ‘transference’ ranging from simple intralingual rewording (i.e. the product label) and interlingual translation (i.e. the recipe in L2) to localization of television shows (*MasterChef* & co.) and internationalization of blogs, ending with extremely interesting back-version phenomena – for example, the various multimedia products of the Jamie Oliver supply chain, which for an Italian audience retranslates Italian gastronomy previously translated for the Anglophone context (Rossato 2015). In all cases, processes of ‘re-interpretation’ and ‘rewriting’ come into play, involving the referent, the real product, and the linguistic-semiotic level of its description in a loop. On the other hand, it is common knowledge that no recipe really succeeds as it should – or better, is never like the one at home. Whether it is a question of ingredients or words, it is substantially non-transferable – yet almost infinitely adaptable.

Within the vast textuality related to food, this paper continues research on menus, and more particularly on dish names, inaugurated around Expo 2015. The intrinsically multimodal and multimedial nature and the important marketing role, which make the menu a distinctive element of the overall ‘style’ of a restaurant, deserve more in-depth analysis from the point of view of semiotic studies of communication than has been done so far (Lakoff 2006; Chau 2014)². And also dish names, which are different texts from simple food names – more complex and at the same time briefer than recipes and with a different purpose – have been neglected by pragma-linguistics³. Graziano and Mocini (2015) have described the peculiar composition strategies utilized in a bilingual

---

¹ See, among others, the special issues of three scientific journals under the editing of Proietti (2012, 2013); Chiaro and Rossato (2015); and Petrocchi (2015) (the latter including a bibliography of about 950 titles on Literary Food Studies).

² Management-oriented handbooks setting guidelines for the composition of successful menus are more common (for a review of such literature, see Ozdemir and Caliskan 2013). Other kinds of food-related textuality, such as cookery books or television shows, have had more luck in the semiotic field as well: see for example the numerous articles in the magazine of the Italian Association for Semiotic Studies *E/C*, edited by Gianfranco Marrone. The contribution of psychology is also interesting, ranging from Seaberg (1971) to the Gallup survey on the time spent in reading a menu, which is reckoned to be about 109 seconds.

³ There are some exceptions in Italian: Caffarelli (2002); Stefinlongo (2006); Bonazzi (2009). In English, besides the information that can be found in the above-mentioned manuals (see for example McVety, Ware and Lévesque Ware 2009) and journalistic articles (e.g. Dickerman 2003), Jurafski (2014) has studied dish names, recipes and menus above all from the historical-linguistic point of view.
Italian-English corpus of menus from sixty of the best restaurants in the six major Italian art cities, using Floch’s socio-semiotic tools, Halliday’s functional linguistics and recent post-Iser studies on empirical reading. Taking up the premises of the previous study, the present investigation seeks further confirmation and demonstration of the inter-relation between food and language in the study of a wider, more varied corpus of dish names, albeit regionally circumscribed, analysing if, how and to what extent it is possible to render the communicative intention of the original text in its translation into international English (ELF). The focus of this further research on menus thus shifts from composition to translation strategies and the analytical methodology includes the experience of comparative linguistics applied in particular to English for Special Purposes (ESP), of Translation Studies and, partially, of Error Analysis. It will be shown that this textual object of a non-literary but pragmatically complex nature, being both informative and persuasive, allows the application of strategies which from Schleiermacher to Venuti rewrite the eternal fluctuation between source- and target-orientation, and in fact exemplifies many of the methods identified by translation theoreticians. The research concludes that a study of the characteristics and potential offered by such textuality is an integral part of the studies on tourism and info-marketing communication, offering the restaurant industry greater scope for its utilization for promotional purposes.

2. Marketing strategies

Before proceeding to analyse translation strategies and procedures used in the corpus of menus in the Lazio region, it will be useful to identify a taxonomy based on their Italian versions, cross-checking the criterion of quantitative exploitation of the nominal group composing the dish name with the qualitative criterion of marketing strategies, borrowed from Floch’s (1990) socio-semiotics – that is, his idéologies mythique, référentielle, substantielle and oblique. Three types can be identified for the first criterion: 1) brief fairly conventional menus; 2) menus which precisely indicate ingredients, methods of preparation and condiments, at times through co-ordination, at times through modification achieved with one or more prepositional phrases; 3) menus which include highly complex syntax, often accompanied by refined vocabulary using both technical gastronomical expressions and culinary metaphors. The following are examples of the first type:

---

4 The bilingual Italian-English corpus of a hundred menus in the Lazio Region was collected in 2014 by Debora Galassi and subjected to a first rudimentary analysis for her M.A. thesis, of which I was supervisor (Università della Tuscia, Viterbo). The selection of menus was circumscribed to the ones appearing on the restaurant websites for obvious reasons of digital compilation and was mainly focused on Italian and regional gastronomy, to the exclusion of ethnic or even fusion cuisines. At the same time the intention was to try and cover the widest possible typology of restaurants in terms of price and category, thus providing a control corpus to the former one, based on the top restaurants of major tourist destinations. The corpus has been re-examined and partly updated in the last three years, although the ‘style’ of such menus, along with the quality of the translations, has essentially remained unchanged. Given the large number of dishes provided in Italian, it was decided not to translate them into English to ensure greater fluency in reading the text, thereby reducing the risk of ‘verbal indigestion’!

5 For a comprehensive comparison of terminology of orientation strategies, see Munday 2016: 311.

6 These types can include gradations and overlapping and are to be interpreted as general trends,
Grigliata mista, Rombo, Soguiola, Orata, Pescato del giorno (Antica Taverna, RM); Antipasto della casa, Carpaccio, Tartare, Ostriche, Tartufi (Assunta Madre, RM); Insalata, Patate, Rughetta, Verdura cotta, Pomodori (Il Castagneto, Fiuggi, FR); Abbacchio, Manzo, Baccalà al forno, Piccione (Open Colonna, RM); Tiramsù, Créme caramel, Crostata alla frutta/cioccolato, Pastiera napoletana (Taverna Quintilia, Tivoli, RM).

Such menus, minimal even in the dishes’ verbal presentation, are typical of long-popular restaurants in Rome or of those located in touristic locations boasting a tradition. The compositional strategy aims to emphasize the elements of gastronomic tradition and conservation and targets a type of clientele – including foreigners – seeking typically Italian or even local flavours. In more extreme cases of conciseness there is almost no information (the cooking method of a meat or fish is evidently entrusted to the cook’s improvisation or the client’s taste); while more often these menus like to alternate conciseness with rhetorical devices such as antonomasia and eponymy, at times used together:

I tortelli di ortica “Biscetti”; I Tortelli all’Etrusca. (Biscetti, Bagnaia, VT)
Tagliere Cavatappi, Pennette Cavatappi. (Cavatappi, Tarquinia, VT)

Both are referable to Floch’s (1990) *idéologie mythique*, which, by exploiting the mental associations of symbols and legends or heroic or mythological figures, speaks to the collective consciousness and cloaks the product with a dream-like aura. Eponymy in particular recurs at least once in almost all the menus and for all types of dishes:

Fettuccine Romolo e Remo. (Romolo e Remo, RM)
Supplì di Aldo, Polpettine di “Nonna Lella”, Tommarelli alla Cuccagna. (Sora Lella, RM)
Filetto di manzo alla Sophie. (La Taverna dei Fori Imperiali, RM)
Cime all’Amerigo Vespucci, Radiatori all’Andrea Doria. (La Cantinella Gaetana, Gaeta, LT)
Zuppa etrusca con ortaggi, legumi, orzo perlato, cavolo nero aromatizzato alle erbe. (Giò, RM)

Even though, as in the last example, the dish components are often specified, generally the more traditionalist menus tend to take the actual content of a dish for granted, concealing it in the ‘dead metaphor’ of a preparation method assumed to be universally known. The ever-present *alla bolognese, all’amatriciana, alla carbonara, alla giudia, alla romana, alla milanese, alla cacciatora*, etc. also fulfil the promotional function which makes traditional Italian cooking a shared myth.

Floch’s (*ibid.*) *idéologie référentielle*, which in advertising aims to inform the client about the product’s features as objectively as possible, can be said to inspire the vast majority of Lazio menus (probably Italian). The nominal group syntax is here exploited which only at the extreme ends may be said to constitute a ‘style’, whereas in the same menu, apart from some exceptions, there may be discrepancies and varieties of strategic choices for Italian as well as English.
to the point where an explanation, including ingredients and their geographical origin or brand, method of preparation, condiments and various herbs, may become exaggeratedly detailed:

1. COORDINATION: Pesce spada olive capperi e pomodorino (Hostaria dell’Orso, RM); Pezzogna, foglia di cavolo melograno e aglio nero (Metamorfosi, RM); Uovo croccante, asparagi, crema al pecorino (Molto, RM); Couscous di farro e verdure, burrata e uova di salmone (Primo al Pigneto, RM); Asparagi bianchi e uova di quaglia, lattughina e stracchino romano (Imàgo, RM); Zuppetta leggera di funghi prataioli tartufo nero di Norcia e piccione di Bresse (La Terrazza dell’Eden, RM); Mezze maniche Verrigni, mazzancolle limonate, bottarga di muggine e aneto (Antico Arco, RM).

2. PREDICATIVE AND/OR PREPOSITIONAL MODIFICATION: Risotto mantecato ai Funghi e Tartufo (Carrera, Fondi, LT); Prosciutto di Parma stagionato 24 mesi e mozzarella di bufala (Casa Coppelle, RM); Mazzancolle scottate con latte di cocco, pasta di curry piccante e verdure di stagione saltate al wok (Il Valentino, RM); Lonza di Maiale Friulano con Puntarelle, Salsa d’Acciughe e Burrata di Andria (Cristal, LT); Mousse al cioccolato Barry Callebaut Cuba al 75% con cuore al Bourbon (Doney, RM); Filetti di acciughe del Mar Cantabrico selezione Nardin con burro Echiré della Normandia e pan brioche (Bacano, RM); Riso Biodinamico delle Cascine Orsini integrale alla Zucca Gialla e Curcuma (Raphael, RM).

The typically Anglo-American tendency to reveal what is hidden behind fanciful or strongly cultural-specific names for dishes, along with the recent health-conscious fashion for organic food, food miles and controlled origin of products lead to extremely redundant menus, in which very simple dishes are presented with expressions like the following:

1 TONNO ROSSO STAGIONATO SOTT’OLIO: tonno rosso siciliano sott’olio cotto al vapore, stagionatura 2010 con carciofi romaneschi alla griglia e cipolline borrettane al balsamico.
CACIO E PEPE: tonnarello all’uovo con pecorino romano DOP, cacio di Moliterno, pecorino di fossa di Sogliano del Rubicone e pepe malesiano.
HAMBURGER DI CARNE: di razza Fassona alla piastra con bacon dorato, cheddar Farmhouse, maionese espressa, salsa di Bloody Mary e mostarda di Digione. (Roscioli, RM)

2 UOVA DI GALLINA LIVORNESE AL TEGAMINO CON ASPARAGI E LARDO: uova livornesi Peppovo Sora, asparagi Giobbi Ariccia, lardo Stefanoni Viterbo.
SPAGHETTI ALLA CHITARRA CON PESTO DI ZUCCHINE, NOCCIOLE E MENTA: pasta di nostra produzione con uova di San Bartolomeo Vetralla e blend di farine Capati Civita Castellana, zucchine e menta Giobbi Ariccia, nocciole Dea Nocciola Viterbo. (Urbana 47, RM)

The expansion of nominal groups to include detailed referential information demanded by the modern tourist also induces the use of epithets, diminutives and qualifiers corresponding to the function which, with Floch (1990), we call "substantielle" – that is,
the appeal to the consumer's senses. In the above-mentioned examples, adjectives such as croccante (crunchy) and leggera (light) referring to the cooking method, introduce a value-judgement, while lattughina (baby lettuce) and cuore (heart) clearly elicit sensorial associations. Below are further examples from second and third type menus of this promotional strategy, based essentially on suggestions of colour, texture and aroma, often placed in contrast (Bourne 1982; Mohamed, Jowitt and Brennan 1982; Lawless 2000):

Crudo di spigola, salmone e gambero rosso su wafer croccante con spuma al “Margarita”; Crema tiepida di piselli con astice e cipolla rossa in aggetto; Filetti di San Pietro con timballino di riso nero e pistilli di zafferano pregiato. (Aroma, RM)
Spaghetti ruvidi, cacio e pepe con zucchine croccanti (piatto della tradizione romana). (Clemente alla Maddalena, RM)
Tonnarelli fatti in casa con cacio romano, pepe nero grezzo, grana croccante e ricotta di Bufala; Tenero Gulasch di cinghiale con salsa al vino rosso con note piccanti; Elogio al cioccolato caldo con cuore morbido, servito su crema fredda alla vaniglia. (Divin Peccato, RM)
Merluzzo carbonaro glassato al sakè, verdurine in campo viola; Babà in sospensione e rhum speziato, aroma di mandorla e zenzero. (Imàgo, RM)
Ceviche di capesante e cannolicchi melone bianco e pomodoro verde. (Metamorfosi, RM)
Variazione di crudo: Tartare di tonno su salsa alla pesca gialla e rosmarino, tartare di ricciola su rugiada di limone, gamberi bianchi Siciliani su pera grigliata. (Minerva Roof Garden, RM)

Finally, occurrences such as elogio (eulogy) and rugiada (dew) fall within Floch’s (1990) idéologie oblique, in which linguistic elements from different cultural domains or from different sectors of the gastronomical domain are juxtaposed. Such a strategy engages the menu reader in a cognitive/interpretative effort as much as the substantial does on the physical plane of the senses.

“Raffaello” di fois gras, “Tiramisù” di patate e baccalà, “Rocher” di coda alla vaccinara. (All’Oro, RM)
Alternanza di pomodoro, bufala e basilico su julienne d’insalatina di campo. (Cabiria, RM)
Puzzle di Anatra con Cuore di Fegato brulata agli odori del bosco e Cambiamenti di Stagione: Manzo al Curry di Bacche di Bosco e Quadro di Verdure; Insalata immersa e Nuvole dell’orto. (Enoteca La Torre, RM)
Pepite di fegato grasso d’anatra...; Sfoglia di manzo su amaranto... (La Pergola, RM)
Rombo confit con cappuccino di calamaro e cardoncelli. (Glass, RM)
Strudel ai carciofi, ricotta, pecorino e menta. (Grappolo d’oro, RM)
Frivolezza all’arancia con spuma di cioccolato bianco; Variazione al cioccolato; Impressionismo di crema e zabaglione al caffè. (Vivendo, RM)

The greatest concentration of this promotional strategy is found in the third menu type, in combination with the referential and substantial functions, supported by long nominal groups made up of several prepositional phrases, where the head of the sequence is at times not a food, but an ‘estrangement’ element. Predictably, such linguistic sophistication reflects innovation and gastronomic creativity. Some dishes from the same restaurant (Brunello Lounge & Restaurant, RM) show that it is possible to utilize all four of Floch’s (ibid.) ideologies with admirable variety in one menu:

Mythical: Zuppetta etrusca con ortaggi e legumi primaverili e crostone di pane casareccio;
Referential: Riso Carnaroli Bio selezione Acquerello alla crema di Grana Padano con ragù di maialletto arrostito al mirto selvatico;
Substantial: Bavarese al cioccolato Amedei bianco, gianduia e fondente con frollino al cocco e crema soffic alle fragole;
Oblique: Seppie in guazzetto su passata di fagioli zolfini con tagliatelle di verdure al vapore; Guazzetto di frutta gratinata alla crema di Malvasia; Carpaccio d'ananas marinato alle spezie.

The complexity and potential of the single nominal group that makes up such “little texts” (Halliday 1994: 392) is evident. Particular ‘narrative’ attention to the collocation of the ingredient names within a dish definition – even more important for a language with a rigid syntax like English – along with an inclination for a sensorial lexis capable of stimulating synaesthetic emotion, can bring added value to the actual quality of the food and contribute to the national and international success of a restaurant. Thus, constant investment in professionally trained translators becomes vital.

3. Translation strategies and procedures

Research similar to this study, on the translation of dish names as verbal text of menus from L1 to ELF, does not seem to be as plentiful as one might expect. All studies traced agree on the dual (informative and performative) communicative function of the menu for the customer, and consequently on applying a functionalist and typological approach to the analysis both of the genre and the translations. Nevertheless, in most cases the focus is on correctly rendering the information to the detriment of an investigation of the rendering of emotional and promotional effects: it is taken for granted that the menu translator’s “global decision” in terms of pragmatic strategies (Chesterman 1997: 107) is (or ought to be) to aim solely at the needs of a foreign clientele, ‘domesticating’ the lexis as much as possible to aid comprehension and foregoing any attempt to elicit the emotional response linked to promotional ideologies. If this is actually the global strategy of most of the translations, since in any case most of the menus are based on referential ideology, for the analyst to highlight just this aspect conceals the peculiar info-marketing nature of this textuality and the fact that even the

---

7 There has been no investigation of actual translators of menus in Lazio (and Italy), as has been done for example in the Tarragona area by Pouget 1999, following Catalan government regulations for the translation of menus into English, and in various regions of Greece, including Crete, by Grammenidis 2008.

8 Apart from accounts of personal experiences of translation (Altanero 2005; Epstein 2009; Orel 2013) and in addition to the two above-mentioned studies on Catalonia and Greece, some attention has been aroused by culturally distant cuisines like the Chinese (Mu 2010; Kang 2013; Peng 2015, to which I refer the reader for a list of at least a dozen Master’s theses and some important articles; Yang 2017); Thai (here too above all Master’s theses); and Persian (Ghafarian, Kafipour and Soori 2016). In Europe the most substantial academic studies are by the Polish linguist Padarowski (2010, 2017), whose work deals mostly with cookbooks providing an Anglphone corpus of comparison, and by two Lithuanian linguists (Ruzaitė 2006 and Kasparė 2012), whose corpora, while more limited than ours, provide similar methodological indications.

9 The most frequently applied theories – in analyses conducted by Asian scholars as well – are equivalence theories (e.g. Nida and Newmark), typological-functionalist approach (e.g. Nord and Reiss), and Skopos Theory (Vermeer); more recently foreignization and domestication strategies (e.g. Toury and Venuti).
referential ideology is a precise promotional and rhetorical strategy, especially in its most extreme forms. As Newmark (1988: 42, 48) underlines:

Most informative texts will either have a vocative thread running through them (it is essential that the translator pick this up), or the vocative function is restricted to a separate section of recommendation, opinion, or value-judgment; a text can hardly be purely informative, i.e. objective. [...] the vocative (persuasive) thread in most informative texts has to be rendered with an eye to the readership, i.e., with an equivalent effect purpose.

Thus, discussion of the problem of translation cannot be reduced to the question of the cultural specificity of some of the ingredient vocabulary and the search for the impossible equivalent. If instead the LSP component of such texts is given due consideration and their translation classified as first of all a matter of LSP/ESP translation (Scarpa 2008), it becomes clear that for the most part the culinary lexis – for example with reference to cooking methods – is technical and mono-referential when not formulaic and international. The search for direct equivalents can easily be resolved by consulting the excellent specialized dictionaries available even online (Cranchi 1983; Edigeo 2010; Dizionario di cucina Inglese/Italiano), which, at times, far from overdoing the culture-bound aspect, resort to a prestigious metalanguage such as French still is for the Western and Anglophone community in particular. Conversely, as the last part of our research shows, it is the syntactical level which presents the greatest difficulty in obtaining an “equivalent effect purpose”: it also shares LSP features, such as nominal density, but is in addition charged with marked semanticization.

With reference to the translation procedures identified by Vinay and Dalbernet (1958), literal/close translation is applied to the majority of the menus, which are referential, from the simplest to the most detailed. This type of translation, tending towards invariance, entails conceptual identity and standardized terminology (Snell-Hornby 1995: 34) and, from the point of view of syntax, the collocation of ingredients (with their possible toponyms and anthroponyms) and methods of preparation within the syntax of the English noun group:

Scarola con uvetta e pinoli = Batavian endive with raisins and pine nuts. (Baccano, RM)
Insalata di polipo e zenzero = Octopus salad with ginger. (Ditirambo, RM)
Carpaccio di filetto di bue danese con rucola e parmigiano, uova di quaglia e noci di pecan = Danish beef fillet carpaccio with rocket and parmesan cheese, quail eggs and pecan walnuts. (Il Valentino, RM)
Filetto di manzo ai ferri con salsa tartara e bernese, verdure gratinate e patate fritte = Grilled fillet of beef with tartare and béarnaise sauces, with vegetables au gratin and french fries. (Cabiria, RM)
Petto di pollo ruspante ai sentori di liquirizia con pera Spadone e insalata di spinaci novelli = Liquorice scented free-range chicken breast with Spadone pear and spring spinach salad; Profiteroles al liquore di limoni delle Peracciole = Cream puffs flavored with Peracciole lemon liqueur. (Vivavoce, RM)

10 Vinay and Dalbernet’s seven procedures – borrowing, calque, literal translation, transposition, modulation, equivalence idiomatic translation, adaptation (also in Venuti 2000: 84-93) – have been revised and augmented by Newmark (1988: 69; 81-93), ultimately reaching 22 in Delisle et al. (1999).
FOIE GRAS: Terrina di fegato grasso d’oca cotto al vapore con pere cotte al karkadè e aceto balsamico di Reggio Emilia invecchiato 12 anni = FOIE GRAS: Terrine of steamed (goose) foie gras served with karkadè flavoured pears and 12 years aged balsamic vinegar from Modena. (Roscioli, RM)

The dictionary disambiguates the false friend indivia/endive with the precise identification of the ingredient, Batavian endive, or suggests the use of French words such as tartare, béarnaise and au gratin, and also helps in selecting the most elegant post-modifying sequences (fillet of...; terrine of...). On the other hand, only the translator’s skill can explain the correct syntactical choice which collocates cooking procedures in pre-modifying position and keeps in post-modifying position the prepositional phrases introduced by con/with, at times replaced (and simplified) by coordination.

Remaining on the lexical level, when the technical terminology – transposed in the great majority of menus into their perfectly equivalent English or French forms (emulsion, variation, reduction, grilled, braised, baked, boiled, fried, marinated, seared, stewed, steamed, sautéed, etc., consommé, emincé, julienne, escabèche, chutney, ceviche, etc.) – is not found in dictionaries, the transposition/recategorization procedure, implying a shift in the part of speech without semantic variation, absolves the need to produce a translation and to assist the non-Italian customer in understanding, albeit with some loss of connotation:

Alici fritte con impanatura ai pistacchi = Fried anchovies with bread and pistachio crumbs. (Babette, RM)
Cartoccio di gamberi al sesamo = Sesame shrimps baked in tin foil. (Chez Cocò, RM)
Impepata di cozze = Mussels in black pepper sauté. (Hosteria dell’Orso, RM)
Battuto di frisona a coltello = Chopped “frisona” meat. (Risoamaro, Fondi, LT)
Guazzetto di dentice con peperoncino fresco = Stewed red snapper with fresh chilli. (Time, RM)
Tonno rosso scottato alla senape = Red tuna steak with mustard. (Quinzi & Gabrieli).

Vice versa, the challenge is by-passed with omission, frequently used not only for preparation methods, but also for many of those details which make up the referential ‘style’ of such menus, details connected to ingredient origin or brand, apparently not considered indispensable for comprehension, if not even counter-productive as a marketing strategy, given a certain awkwardness of hybrid language:

Prosciutto di Cinta Senese e melone = Ham and melon. (Cesare, RM)
Insalata di polpo alla ponzone = Octopus salad; Gamberoni Rossi di Mazzara = King Prawns. (La Veranda, S. Felice Circeo, LT)
Ravioli di melanzane aromatizzate al basilico con razza e carciofi = Ravioli pasta filled with aubergine with skate fish and artichokes; Rigatoni di Kamut con guanciale di Sauris, pomodori datterini e ricotta affumicata “da Noi” = Kamut “Rigatoni” pasta with cherry tomatoes, Sauris bacon and smoked ricotta cheese. (Aroma, RM)

Some examples: Abbacchio al forno = Lamb (Il Castagneto, Fiuggi, RM); Filetto di manzo al Brandy scaloppato su insalatina = Fillet of beef with Brandy on salad (Oasi di Kufra, Sabaudia, RM); Polpettine di maialino da latte porchettato = Suckling pig meatballs (Molto, RM); Ravioli di baccalà mantecato con acqua di pomodoro e olive nere = Ravioli with cod in tomato water and black olives (Oliver Glowig, RM).
Cappellacci farciti con stracciatella di Andria e ricotta di bufala, su fonduta di pomodoro e basilico crocante = Home made large ravioli “Cappellacci” pasta with soft stracciatella cheese and ricotta served on a light tomato sauce with crispy basil; ...su crema di lentichie di Castelluccio IGP... = ...on a layer of lentils [sic] cream... (Circus, RM)

The alternation of direct vs. oblique translation in Vinay and Dalbernet’s (1958) terms – Venuti’s (1995) foreignizing vs. domesticating strategies – is observed above all in more markedly culture-bound menus, namely the more traditional group, apparently less complicated, but in actual fact more permeated with the mythical ideology. The most frequent procedure, expansion/amplification, transforms very concise menus in Italian into menus of the second type, resolving the culture-bound problems of national and local gastronomy, in particular the names of some typical dishes, through listing their ingredients or explaining the more traditional ways of culinary preparation, such as those expressed with the “alla + toponymic adjective/common noun/anthoponym” periphrasis:

Pinzimonio alla romana = Fresh vegetables served with olive oil and vinegar. (Assunta Madre, RM)
Supplì al telefono = Rice croquettes with tomato sauce and mozzarella cheese covered with bread crumbs and deep fried; Saltimbocca alla romana = Rolled pieces of veal, garnished with ham, sage, fired in butter and served with mashed potatoes. (Circus, RM)
Bomboletti alla Maga con Calamari e Zucchine = Macaroni with Squid and Courgette; Gnocchetti alla Pescatora = Small gnocchi with tomato sauce, Squid, Shrimps and Mus-sels; Penne alla Carbonara = Penne Carbonara with Bacon Eggs and Black pepper; Bucatini all’Amatriciana = Bucatini Amatriciana with Bacon and Tomato sauce. (La Veranda, S. Felice Circeo, LT)
Trofie alla puttanesca = Short pasta with olives, capers, tomato sauce; Filetto di manzo alla Sophie = Beef fillet with ham smoked cheese and marsala wine. (La Taverna dei Fori Imperiali, RM)
Penne “Mari e Monti” = Quills with porcini mushrooms and baby clams. (Taverna Quintilia, Tivoli, RM)
Fettuccine alla Tiberina = Homemade Fettuccine in a dried porcini, ham and meatsauce; Paccheri alla maniera “der Capitano Pescatore” = Paccheri with clams, mussels, squid, shrimps and tomato sauce; Coda di Manzo alla Vaccinara = Oxtail with celery and spicy tomato sauce. (Sora Lella, RM)
Gnocchi fatti in casa de’ Gasperino (salsiccia, pomodori pachino, pecorino) = Homemade gnocchi de’ Gasperino (with sausages, cherry tomatoes, sheepcheese); Rigatoni alla norcina (salsiccia, carotine, parmigiano) = Rigatoni norcina (with sausages, carrots, parmesan); Polpo alla Luciana (polpo, pomodoro, uva passa, pinoli, olive e spezie) = Luciana octopus (octopus with tomato, raisins, pine nuts, olives, pepper). (Ristochicco, RM)

As we can see, a wide variety of solutions prevail under the umbrella of expansion/amplification, ranging from additions (homemade), functional equivalents (short pasta) and generalizations (macaroni) to explicative paraphrasing of the preparation processes. When it comes to rendering the various types of pasta – an extremely cultural-specific aspect of Italian gastronomy – there is an incredible variety of solutions, due both to the use of different micro-strategies (ranging from omission, borrowing and technical equivalents to neologisms) and the combination of several micro-strategies, often classified under opposing macro-strategies of translation. The ‘domesticating’ amplification
and generalization are used alongside (and often compensate) the ‘foreignizing’ borrowing when putting the word pasta after the original name, even in cases of already consolidated loans in English food vocabulary (e.g.: paccheri pasta but also tagliatelle pasta, calamarata pasta as well as ravioli pasta, and even spaghetti pasta; and, absurdly enough, at least one occurrence was traced of gnocchi pasta!) 12. The same is true for preparation methods: expansion for explicative purposes alternates – also within the same menu – with borrowing, thus almost annulling the purpose of a menu in a different language, or with the typical “(in) noun/adjective + style” calque, which in any case leaves the cooking method unexplained:

Spezzatino alla romana = Beef medallions with carrots, celery, onions and tomatoes; Saltimbocca alla romana = Veal topped with Parma ham and sage BUT Fettuccine Alfredo = Alfredo sauce. (Panzirone, RM)

Caprese di mare = Fresh mozzarella and tomato with fish; Pesce spada alla siciliana = Stewed swordfish with tomato sauce, olives and capers BUT Scampi alla cacciatora = Scampi cacciatora style. (Le Terrazze, Civitavecchia, RM)

Triglie di scoglio alla livornese = Fresh mullets in Livorno style. (Chez Cocó, RM)

The last dish on the list, one of the most typical in Roman cooking, most frequently expanded with the clarification Grilled (spring) lamb (from Lazio) or with the functional equivalent served hot (from the grill), opens up the possibility of using the calque creatively to transpose the sensorial function of the ‘dead metaphor’: Grilled “finger burnt” lamb ribs (Cesare, RM), Grilled lamb cutlets “burnfingers” (Grappolo d’oro, RM).

In actual fact, omission is the most frequent solution to rendering the various rhetorical techniques: at times due to the objective incompatibility of the morphologies of the two linguistic systems, at others because of a probable underestimation of their promotional importance. For example, in the English menus, almost no trace remains of the definite article used to create antonomasia 13 and of alteratives used with substantial ideology 14.

12 Falling within this combination of strategies are all the cheeses and cured meats, solved in the great majority of cases by putting the genus term in English next to the species in Italian: for example, grana cheese, provola cheese, gorgonzola cheese, tomino cheese, burrata cheese, etc. (including occurrences of parmigiano cheese and mozzarella cheese, instead of the more simple and common parmesan and mozzarella, and the tautological – to the Italian ear – cacio cheese!); Parma ham, Culatello ham, Cinta Senese ham/salami, etc. In addition, examples like porcini mushrooms, cannellini/borlotti beans, friggitelli peppers, focaccia/schiacciata/panzanella bread, misticanza salad and also rucola salad instead of rocket salad or simply rocket. To these are added many toponyms used alone in Italian (e.g.: Madeira wine, Marsala wine, Moscato winecream, Castelmagno cheese, Angus beef, etc.).

13 La spigola = Seabass (Le Jardin de Russie, RM); Bombolotti con la vera p Mata = Bombolotti (short pasta) with paja (Divin Peccato, RM); Le melanzane alla parmsgiana = Aubergine in parmesan sauce (Biscetti, Bagnaia, VT); Il pollo ruspante = Wild range chicken; Il maialino da latte = Suckling pig (Molto, RM); L’abbacchio romano e il carciofo = Roman lamb and artichokes (Doney, RM).

14 In such cases only polipetti (baby octopus) and carotine (baby carrots) are rendered, but not: agretto (as a condiment), caponatina, cicorietta, cipollotti, insalatina, lasagnetta, lombatina, polpettine,
Compared to very few attempts at literal translation, where the adjective or image is not only traceable to a shared trans-cultural heritage but is also linguistically equivalent, the translation procedure least used is adaptation, that is, the creative rendering of linguistic (and culinary) innovation, with a net loss of elements appealing to the emotions and imagination if not informative ones. While it is still possible to take one’s chances with the heart metaphor (..., chocolate mousse with a bourbon whiskey heart; ..., tiramisù with coffee and chocolate heart) or the aroma of food, almost no menu dares to render polvere di verdure, neve di baccalà, aria di prezzemolo or sabbia di olive, not to mention quadro di verdure, nuvole dell’orto or ricordo di tiramisù, without obtaining truly ‘macaronic’ results.

Rosso d’uovo poché, ricotta, cavolfiore e mille punti di tartufo nero = Poached egg, ricotta cheese, cauliflower and black truffle. (Antico Arco, RM)
Biscotto agli arachidi con morbido alla vaniglia e salsa al croccantino = Peanut biscuit with vanilla and crunchy nougat sauce; Millefoglie di rombo in crosta di pistacchi... = Turbot in a crust of pistachios... (Circus, RM)
Cofanetto di ricotta e noci in manto di patate = Potatoes filled with ricotta cheese and nut; Sformatino di cavatelli in manto di melanzane con pomodoro fresco e cuore filante = Aubergines filled with Cavatelli pasta, tomato and mozzarella cheese; Tegame di ciliegine di agnello... = Lamb chops... (L’Olimpo, RM)
Zuppetta di piselli con involtino di pesce spatola, quenelle di pappa al pomodoro e trasparenza di guanciale = Peasoup with flag fishroll served with “pappa al pomodoro” and bacon; Ravioli agli scampi e caviale di melanzane fumè con cipolline di calabri e finocchietto su cremoso di bufala = Ravioli with scampi & smoked aubergine served with squid, creamy buffalo mozzarella and dill. (Minerva Roof Garden, RM)
Cappellacci cioria e salsiccia, aria di mozzarella di bufala e acciughe = Cappellacci chicory and sausage with buffalo mozzarella and anchovies; Prosciutto di Bassiano, salvia, patate e clorofilla di prezzemolo = Ham of Bassiano, sage, potatoes and parsley. (Risoamaro, Fondi, LT)

Focusing finally on syntax, it is important to emphasize that not more than a dozen menus in Lazio – and not necessarily those of top restaurants – demonstrate constant awareness of the functional constraints of English syntax and the semantic possibilities offered at the same time by such norms. Literal/close translation does not always succeed in respecting the distribution of Classifier (in pre-modifying position) and Qualifier (in post-modifying position), in terms of Halliday’s (Halliday and Matthiessen 2004) grammar, and almost never in balancing within the Qualifier space purely informative communication with promotional rhetoric. The various nominal syntagms which enrich the brief dish name text are invariably put to the right of the Head Noun in Italian, following a more or less logical sequential order generally reflecting the ingredients’ importance, which nevertheless can be extremely free or even random; in English, on the other hand, they are distributed both to the right and left following precise rules of standard syntax. More or less significance or informativeness is automatically estab-
lished depending on whether they are placed to the right or the left of the Head Noun. The following is Halliday’s logical/experiential scheme applied to dish names, which contains some of the most frequent occurrences:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-modifier</th>
<th>Head</th>
<th>Post-modifier</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deictic</td>
<td>Post-deictic</td>
<td>Epithet / Classifier / Classifier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our</td>
<td>classic</td>
<td>fresh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The</td>
<td>typical</td>
<td>best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>original</td>
<td>fried</td>
<td>spaghetti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>homemade</td>
<td>fish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>smoked</td>
<td>ravioli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>roast/ed</td>
<td>carpaccio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adjectival participles and nouns with attributive function occurring as Classifiers generally denote the most common cooking techniques of primary ingredients or the species of which the Head Noun is the genus – as it was for pastas, cheeses and cured meats – and all precisely define the type of food served, in this responding to the common syntactic use of the English language. It is therefore correct to say: *Veal escalope*, *Deep fried calamari*, *Baked suckling pig*, *Roast potatoes*, etc.; less correct: *Scampi steamed or grilled*, ...*with vegetable mixed*, *Wild clams sautéed*, *Season vegetables boiled or Endive salad, pears and nuts*, with many other such ‘errors’ in word order. Vice versa, with regard to the position of the indication of origin, so often present in referential menus, there is an option, but not pragmatically indifferent: *Umbrian olive oil*, *Pachino/Vesuvian tomatoes*, *Sicilian broccoli*, *Roman chicory* denote a different variety of agricultural product, while *Pasta from Gragnano*, *Pecorino cheese from Fossa*, *Red onion from Tropea*, *Fassone beef from Piedmont*, *Anchovy fillets from the Cantabrian Sea* add a connotation of authenticity and uniqueness, bordering on exoticism, which aptly fulfils the *info-marketing* potential inherent to such texts.

As a consequence, moving the cooking procedure to the Qualifier slot for particular preparations, with the addition of side ingredients, possibly in their turn enriched by emotional adjectives, and special and select aromas, means knowing how to best use simple but effective thematic organization. Given the short time spent on reading a menu, the customer’s attention and curiosity should be driven towards the end of the sequence, towards those noun phrases collocated in post-modifying positions, which carry the weight of appeal and/or innovation in gastronomy, those more capable of making mouths water and stimulating a desire to try the dish:

Maialino al forno in crosta di sale = Suckling pig roasted in salt crust. (Ditirambo, RM)
Stinco di maiale marinato alla birra con castagne croccanti = Roasted pork shank marinated in beer with crunchy chestnuts (Grappolo d’oro, RM)
Sautéé di frutti di mare e quinoa su crema di zucchine al basilico ed olio allo zafferano = Sauteed seafood and quinoa served on a cream of zucchini with basil and olive oil perfumed with saffron (Circus, RM)
Gnocchi di patate all’amatriciana = Homemade gnocchi in a classic Roman sauce with cured pig’s cheek, tomatoes and Roman pecorino cheese. (Sora Lella, RM)
Fegato d’oca con chutney di mela annurca e Sauternes aromatizzato allo zafferano = Goose foie gras with Annurca apple chutney and Sauternes wine jelly infused with saffron. (La Terrazza dell’Eden, RM)
Trancio di spigola su pasdata di melanzane alla parmigiana con asparagi e carote in riduzione al caciucco = Sea-bass fillet on a pureed parmigiana-style eggplant with asparagus and baby carrots in seafood broth reduction. (Vivendo, RM)

Tiramisù ai lamponi e pepe rosa glassato al frutto della passione = Raspberry and pink pepper tiramisù served in a passion fruit glaze. (Minerva Roof Garden, RM)

4. Conclusions

More or less explicitly, the tradition of Italian food service and catering has always been inspired by the constitutive nutrition and economic principles orienting a movement like Slow Food and summed up in the three keywords of its philosophy: good, clean and fair 15. The movement, which started in Piedmont about thirty years ago, has been opposing the diffusion of ‘fast food’ habits, trying to preserve local productions, promoting healthy food, gastronomic pleasure and a slow pace of life. A leading organization of thousands of projects in biodiversity and food and taste education all over the world, it now has the power to influence the very concept of a global event like Milan Expo 2015. However, when we observe the info-marketing purport of many Italian restaurant menus, even if we leave aside actual errors and mistakes – at times glaring and offensive, at times more subtle and interesting from the didactic viewpoint, to which our research project will in future dedicate further consideration – it becomes clear that, in order to fully succeed in its conquest of modern culture and economy, the Slow Food movement would benefit from joining forces with one as strong in resisting the “mass, industrialized production of translated language” through CAT or Google Translate (Cronin 2017: 4). While Slow Food is already a consolidated international reality, the concept of Slow Language/Translation (Cronin 2015; 2017) definitely seems to be still struggling to succeed – at least in the restaurant business of the Lazio Region.

References


15 See https://www.slowfood.com for more details.


Linguistic and Extralinguistic Strategies of Hybridization, Simplification and Reformulation in English and Italian Multimodal Popularized Discourse

Pietro Luigi Iaia
(University of Salento, Italy)

Abstract
This paper explores the linguistic and audiovisual features of medical-discourse reformulation in a selected corpus of English and Italian scripts from the TV shows 1000 Ways to Die (1000 modi per morire), Curious and Unusual Deaths (Strani modi per morire), and Rare Anatomy (Rare Anatomy: Casi estremi), which actualize new forms of popularization by mixing journalistic, documentary and humorous discourses with reality-TV and docudrama genres. The analysis is grounded on a cognitive-functional approach, according to which the authors’ mental representation of the implied receivers influences the process of text construction, thus aiming at making specialized knowledge more accessible by means of different strategies of speech hybridization that are tailored to the imagined audience. In particular, regarding source-text production, the authors of the first and second TV shows seem to have in mind male viewers, since they resort to a specific integration between taboo jokes, derogatory humour and lexical reformulation accessible to non-experts. At the same time, the third TV series adopts mainly the conventional strategies of linguistic simplification to explain specialized knowledge, along with the emotional presentation of real stories about rare diseases. The analysis focuses on the interaction between the extralinguistic features and verbal characteristics of audiovisual scripts so as to help describe multimodal popularization, which can now be found in a number of different text types, from magazines to sitcoms. Finally, this study also inquires into the extent to which the lexical, structural and functional dimensions of the selected corpus of target versions stem from the interaction between the equivalent reformulation of medical discourse and the respect for the technical limits of voice-over.

1. Introduction, research objectives and rationale

The term ‘popularization’ labels the lexical and structural reformulation and “re-contextualization” (Calsamiglia and van Dijk 2004) of specialized knowledge for the general audience (Gotti 2005). Academic investigation of popularization has focused overwhelmingly (Myers 2003: 272) on written texts, but in order to reflect “the expansion and differentiation of the sciences” (Whitley 1985: 10), as well as to advance the current state of research (Gotti 2013; Cavalieri 2015), scholars are also exploring the multimodal nature of the process, examining the extent to which the verbal and extra-
linguistic semiotic resources interact to make the original information more accessible to the magazine readers, or to the viewers of audiovisual programmes.

This paper analyses a selected corpus of examples from three TV series, *1000 Ways to Die* (henceforth 1WTD), *Curious and Unusual Deaths* (henceforth CAUD), and *Rare Anatomy* (henceforth RA), which mix conventional linguistic reformulation with a multimodal hybridization of journalistic (Broersma 2010), documentary (Gifreu 2011), and humorous (Guido 2012) discourses, and reality-TV and docudrama genres. A cognitive-functional model is adopted, according to which the selection of the linguistic and extralinguistic features of these popularized texts is not arbitrary, but subject to the characteristics of implied receivers, whose interest is supposedly captured by a particular variety of topics, pictures and videos which simultaneously try to convey scientific literacy (Berti 2013: 175) and pique their (sometimes even morbid) curiosity towards the fatal accidents and rare diseases explored in the selected series. Section 2 defines general and multimodal popularization from the theoretical viewpoint, whereas the comparison between the English and Italian versions of the selected corpus of extracts (Sections 4.1 and 4.2) pinpoints the lexical, syntactic and visual strategies which aim to make the definitions of a number of specialized notions more accessible to the receivers. At the same time, this study also inquires into the effects of the spatial and temporal limitations of voice-over on the equivalence levels of the target-language retextualizations.

2. Multimodal popularization: definition and main features

According to the “canonical view” of popularization (Grundmann and Cavaillé 2000), the notion is usually associated with the type of “exposition” (Cloître and Shinn 1985) concerning the production of “popular” texts that are destined “for the largest audience possible” (Grego 2013: 152) and aimed at conveying “specialist knowledge for education or information” purposes (Gotti 2013: 9; see also Whitley 1985: 3). The investigation of the lexical and syntactic features of written texts (Gotti 2005) has revealed that authors resort to devices such as periphrasis, juxtaposition, metaphors and generalizations to facilitate the non-experts’ acquisition of the disciplinary knowledge. Although books or articles in both magazines or newspapers represent the main forms of popularization (see Gotti 2005, 2013), novel realizations can be identified, where linguistic recontextualization represents one of the communicative resources that senders choose to achieve the intended informative function, and is integrated by the exploitation of the multimodal construction to actualize innovative or even peculiar forms of “hypermodal” (Lemke 2002) or “hybrid” discourse (Santamaria, Bassols and Torrent 2011; Moschini 2014). Due to such hybridization, which is seen as one of the distinguishing features of contemporary media (Fairclough 2003; Catenaccio 2008), the rigid separation between genres and styles gives way to different forms of “spectacularization” (Moirand 2005) and “marketization” (Zhang and O’Halloran 2014) of specialized knowledge, which modify the conventional documentary genre (Holmes and Jermyn 2001: 2) through the interaction between medical and humorous discourses, or the combination of real-life images and re-enactments of medical stories, “to allow potential readers to understand the scientific content” (Silletti 2015: 67).

Yet, despite labelling popularization as a “pluricode discourse” (Cavalieri 2015: 87) where texts, images and colours interact to transmit the semantic and communicative
levels of the authors’ messages, academic research prevalently ignores the actualization of the interaction between verbal, acoustic and visual elements (Myers 1997), with some exceptions (Miller 1998; Santamaria et al. 2011; Berti 2013; Iaia 2013; Zhang and O’Halloran 2014; Cavalieri 2015; Silletti 2015). For this reason, this paper analyses a selected corpus of English and Italian scripts from 1WTD, CAUD, and RA to further highlight a number of strategies by which ‘multimodal popularization’ is performed. The latter notion entails that both the linguistic and audiovisual dimensions of the episode scripts are meant to enhance the general audience’s scientific literacy in the medical field. Additionally, since a cognitive-functional model (Widdowson 1996; Langacker 2008) is applied here to the study of the production of these text types, the linguistic and extralinguistic features of the examined programmes are interpreted in the light of the authors’ mental representation of the potential receivers (Silletti 2015) in terms of their gender, age, alleged interests, or background knowledge. In other words, the selection and combination of the semiotic modes as meaning-making resources (Halliday 1978) are not arbitrary, but support the senders’ illocutionary force (Austin 1962) – namely, to attract the receivers’ attention and explain scientific knowledge (Miller 1998) – and the perlocutionary effect of enhancing the latter’s knowledge, but not their secondary culture (Widdowson 1979). In fact, the analysed series mix verbal simplification and the inclusion of animated, fictional or actual images to provide a multimodal composition (Kress and van Leeuwen 2006) that usually gives rise to two main types of segments – the entertaining and the explanatory – whose features are tailored to the implied audience.

Since 1WTD premiered on the prevalently “male oriented” (Buckman 2015) Spike TV, with a “target audience of men 18-49” (Mahmud 2008), and CAUD was broadcast on Discovery Channel, “dominant on the men side of the 25-54 demo” (Kissell 2015), their viewers are imagined as young adult males. Indeed, the episodes usually tell stories of clumsy and ill-fated people, where the common informative purpose of the explanatory segments is integrated by derogatory (Zillmann 1983) comments or, in the entertaining ones, by nonsensical and exaggerated characterizations. Furthermore, their scripts also display more vivid representations of the causes and effects of diseases or accidents (which are usually the conclusion of trivial events or sexual practices), whereas the potential recipients are also expected to activate an “arousal/safety” psychological strategy (Rothbart 1973), when their experience of a sensation of arousal provoked by being able to laugh about someone else’s death, or to mock others in their misfortune, is softened by the relief response prompted by the exaggerated characterizations. On the other hand, RA is produced and aired by The National Geographic Channel, which aims to captivate and entertain “a global community”, as one can read on its website (http://www.nationalgeographic.com/about/), as well as “to reach a broader and consistently upscale audience” (Littleton 2016). This may justify why RA authors prefer stories of young people suffering from rare diseases and resort to unscripted, real-life images accompanied by comments and interviews with members of their families, without producing derogatory representations of the protagonists, underlining instead their strength (see examples (11) and (12) below). It seems that this structure – along with the more emotional tone of the narration and representations of the entertaining segments – is meant to prompt an empathic reaction from the viewers.
Three examples of the audiovisual hybridization are represented in the following multimodal transcription:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VISUAL DIMENSION</th>
<th>VERBAL DIMENSION</th>
<th>DISCOURSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sheldon Morgan recently moved back into his mother’s house</td>
<td>Interaction between journalistic discourse and reality-TV genre</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemothorax, which is blood filling a chest cavity, and prevents lungs from filling with air</td>
<td>Interaction between popularization discourse, documentary and horror film genres</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>And like a typical teenager, he’s fallen in love.</td>
<td>Interaction between journalistic discourse and unscripted, reality-TV genre</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Multimodal transcription of three extracts from CAUD (first row), 1WTD (second row), and RA (third row)

As regards the Italian versions, we think that the interaction of discourses and genres may lead one to question the appropriateness of voice-over, the translation mode of the analysed case studies. Although its selection may be supported in economic and functional terms by being cheaper than dubbing and by its higher degree of credibility (Franco, Matamala and Orero 2010), thanks to the fact that the source-text soundtrack can be heard in the background (Espasa 2004), its technical constraints (Agost and Chaume 1999) may force translators to reduce fragments by omitting what they do not consider relevant to convey the authors’ intentions. Yet, any condensation can undermine the pragmatic equivalence of the target-language popularization, unless linguistic reduction is associated with a critical examination and usage of the extralinguistic frame. Since the verbal explanations are usually accompanied by visual illustrations, translations may be planned in order to pursue a multimodal compensation between what is uttered in the target language because of the time limits and what receivers could infer from what is depicted, thus giving viewers the supposedly appropriate amount of data to access the authors’ discourse (a practical example can be found in extract (5) below).

3. Method and corpus

The analysis of a selected corpus of scenes from 1WTD, CAUD, and RA aims at exploring the interaction between images and linguistic reformulation to make the causes
of rare diseases, the origins and mechanisms of certain medical conditions, or the function of human organs more accessible to the recipients. The entire corpus of examples is made up of 40 definitions, and the following Sections will focus on the most representative types, which are divided into two main groups. The first one (examined in Section 4.1) encompasses the use of juxtaposition, periphrasis and simplification, whereas the second group (Section 4.2) explores the definitions conveyed through metaphors. Finally, the investigation of the Italian versions – which represents only an initial step of an ongoing research about the multimodal analysis of the target versions of these TV shows – will also inquire into the equivalence levels between the original and adapted texts, and into the effects of voice-over on the structural and functional levels of the target scripts.

4. Analysis

4.1. Juxtaposition, periphrasis, and simplification

In the selected audiovisual texts, the structural device of juxtaposition is used to explain how diseases affect human bodies, the function of their organs, or the consequences of medical conditions. The following extract (1), from RA, for example, aims at illustrating the function of capillaries:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) His blood then enters much smaller pipes called capillaries, which deliver the supplies to his cells.</td>
<td>Le arterie di Son affiancono in vasi più piccoli detti capillari, che portano il nutrimento alle cellule.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Two popularization strategies interact to define the structure and function of the capillaries of Son, a Vietnamese child suffering from a rare vascular malformation. At first, capillaries are metaphorically compared to pipes; then the narrator says that their function consists in delivering “the supplies to the cell”, through an inductive process that places the term after its definition. Besides showing the common strategies of popularization, extract (1) also illustrates its multimodal connotation: a specific image – visible in Figure 1 below – is in fact selected to accompany the narrator’s description:

Figure 1. The structure of capillaries in Son’s malformation
Figure 1 activates a relationship of “complementarity” (Compte 2009) with the narrator’s utterances, and in particular the colour of the veins on the right changes from red to blue to highlight and reproduce Son’s malformation. The “smaller pipes” can actually be observed, therefore viewers can witness the alternative network of vessels caused by the disease. The target version, instead, exemplifies the compromises due to the time limits of voice-over: the translation is more condensed, some repetitions are avoided, and other parts are deleted. In particular, since blood has already been mentioned in one of the previous utterances, the translators do not repeat the noun in the reformulation of extract (1), but produce a less explicit explanation of the specialized notion. The target version indeed mixes two sentences from the source text: whereas the English segment starts with the statement of the “normal” arteries in most of Son’s body and then describes the non-conventional path of his blood, which enters the “small pipes” because of the malformation, the Italian script contains only one sentence with one subject – “arteries”. This seems to validate the fact that the translation choices usually stem from the translators’ interpretation of source versions in terms of relevance, insofar as they opt for the more rigorous adaptation of what is considered essential to preserve the main objective of the sender’s discourse. In fact, they choose to preserve the main popularization strategy, rather than reproducing the utterances that are mainly included for entertainment and emotional reasons, to mark the child’s unfortunate condition.

A similar translation strategy is also adopted in extract (2) below, for the popularization of lymph:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(2) This fluid, called lymph, contains infection-fighting white blood cells.</td>
<td>Questo fluido contiene globuli bianchi che combattono le infezioni.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The examination of extract (2) shows the cognitive-functional nature of text production and translation. As regards the former process, the noun “lymph” is introduced by the verb “called”, to show its specialized use within the community of doctors. Then, the narrator also describes white blood cells in the same utterance, opting for the syntactic strategy of “premodification”, which Gotti (2005: 73) attributes to specialized texts and not to the language of popularization. This choice, which hence seems uncommon, could be seen as a consequence of the need to reformulate two medical notions within the restricted temporal frame of the explanatory segment under consideration. In this light, authors may have preferred to provide a more detailed explanation of lymph, rather than of the white blood cells, perhaps considered as a notion with which viewers are already familiar. At the same time, with regard to the Italian version, the introduction of “lymph” only later in the script, without naming the fluid at the beginning of the segment, reveals the influence of the translators’ interpretation of the source text. In other words, this entails that they have to decide what could be omitted from their renderings to cope with the limits of voice-over, as well as to reproduce the intended communicative objective. In fact, even though the target script does not include the specification “called lymph”, the medical notion is effectively spread, and the main illocutionary force of the senders’ conversation is nonetheless preserved.
The following extract depicts instead the typical interaction between the specialists’ and narrators’ utterances in multimodal popularization to retextualize the medical discourse:

In extract (3), juxtaposition is not activated, but the general audience’s knowledge is supposedly increased thanks to the doctor’s periphrasis listing the functions of the signals. It is only when the narrator takes the floor that the inclusion of the adjective “genetic” provides a more ‘specialized’ label, reflecting an inductive logical process. This form of cooperation between the doctors’ utterances and the narrators’ comments (see also extract (17) in Section 4.2 below) seems to be one of the constant features of this form of audiovisual popularization – it can in fact be found also in the following extract (4), from 1WTD, when pulmonary oedema and the causes of suffocation are explained:

Example (4) shows the same ‘narrator-specialist’ relationship highlighted in extract (3), along with the increased simplification of medical discourse in the Italian script, when the narrator’s definition of “oedema” is replaced by its generalization. This is further proof of the fact that the adapted scripts are the outcome of the interaction between the translators’ interpretation of the authors’ intentions, the need to reformulate the source utterances in pragmalinguistic equivalents, and the need to respect the limits of voice-over. Since target versions have to cope with a restricted temporal slot, translators may tend to include condensed sentences, although this could raise concerns in terms of functional equivalence, as in extract (5) below:
Dr Svoboda explains that the “air-way obstruction” may prevent one from letting “air in” and “out”, in the portion of extract (5) that is not transcribed. After the latter illustration, the notion is further reformulated with a periphrasis at the end of Svoboda’s turn above, as “lack of oxygen”. It is worth pointing out, however, that the Italian fragment contains a more specific, non-popularized correspondent, “ipossia”, which may not be immediately understood by the target audience. The condensed solution is needed because of the technical constraints of voice-over, and the viewers’ understanding might have been compromised had images not assisted the verbal dimension. In fact, the doctor’s turn is completed from the extralinguistic perspective by a series of animations representing the consequences of suffocation, presumably allowing the achievement of the informative goal through a multimodal retexualization of the medical knowledge under investigation.

Definitions by means of juxtaposition and the “x is P” structure (Gotti 2005: 209) can be found in extracts (6) and (7) below, respectively from 1WTD and CAUD:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(6) This resulted in massive hemothorax, which is blood filling a chest cavity, and prevents lungs from filling with air, thus resulting in suffocation.</td>
<td>Questo ha causato un massiccio emotorace, ovvero la cavità toracica si è riempita di sangue, i polmoni non sono più riusciti a riempirsi d’aria, e l’uomo è morto soffocato.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) This reflex is called laryngospasm. Laryngospasm is an involuntary muscular contraction of the vocal chords.</td>
<td>Questo riflesso è noto come laringospasmo. Il laringospasmo è una contrazione muscolare involontaria delle corde vocali.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In extract (6), popularization is pursued through a deductive process when “hemothorax”, the specialized notion that causes Marcel’s death, is explained along with its consequences. The latter – namely, the inability of air to pass through the lungs due to the presence of blood, and “suffocation” – are communicated by means of a sentence introduced by “thus”, whereas the linguistic dimension interacts again with an animated representation of the fracture in the main character’s chest cavity (see Figure 2 below):

Figure 2. Representation of hemothorax
In the target version of extract (6), linguistic and functional equivalence is achieved: the translation respects the original deductive process entailed by the inclusion of the definition – where the conjunction “ovvero” indicates the start of the explanation – but also the other parts of popularization are reproduced, describing the final consequence of the man’s condition. The above image then proves that the selection of the extralinguistic and linguistic features is affected by the implied receivers: if Figures 1 and 2 are compared, one may notice that the latter displays a more explicit representation of blood filling lungs, as in a horror movie, suggesting that 1WTD would appear to be mainly addressed to male viewers. The characteristics of potential recipients can actually be inferred from the themes of the episodes as well, for 1WTD and CAUD narrate the fatal consequences of actions that generally involve clumsy people or sexual accidents. For example, extract (7) above is from CAUD and explains the causes of Sheldon’s death. When about to feed his cat, he slips on some ice, hits his head and falls unconscious into the cat bowl, becoming a victim of “dry drowning”, a process that is explained by Dr Goldman. In this case, the multimodal nature of popularization is actualized by the pluricode reformulation of what happens when water is inhaled and hits one’s larynx, since the specialist’s utterance is completed by the visual representation of laryngospasm (see Figure 3 below):

Figure 3. Visual representation of laryngospasm
As for the linguistic dimension, laryngospasm is firstly simplified and described as a “reflex”, and this simplification then introduces the proper, more detailed definition, reproducing a deductive process that sees the medical term before its description. The linguistic and functional features are respected and rendered in the equivalent Italian script, which has a similar syntactic construction to the narrators’ utterance, where the simplification of “laringospasmo” – “questo riflesso”, ‘this reflex’ – is followed by the juxtaposition of its definition.

A final example of popularization by means of linguistic reformulation is found in extract (8) below, from CAUD, about the death of a college student, Jamal, who decides to compete in a spitting contest with his male friends. Before his turn, the student takes a run trying to apply the physical law of conservation of momentum (which is explained), but the party turns into tragedy, as Jamal falls from the balcony:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamal is employing principles of momentum. The amount of momentum that an object has depends on two physical quantities: the mass, and the velocity of the object. The mass – Kattan’s body. The velocity – his forward motion.</td>
<td>Jamal sta applicando la legge di conservazione della quantità di moto. La quantità di moto di un oggetto dipende da due quantità fisiche: la massa e la velocità dell’oggetto in movimento. La massa di Jamal è il suo corpo, la sua velocità viene dal movimento in avanti.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The popularization of the physical notion lies in the lexical, syntactic and visual features of the source text. The disciplinary content is in fact explained by means of periphrases that provide actual examples specifying what the young man’s body and velocity represent in terms of the physical principle. Also in extract (8), then, a visual representation of the scientific formula is added (Figure 4) to increase the viewers’ knowledge:

![Figure 4. Visual representation of principles of momentum](image)

The Italian script achieves an equivalent informative function, defining how momentum is obtained and indicating the two quantities in relation to Jamal’s story. After the explanatory segment, though, the clip ends with the comment (9), which ironically indicates the experiment’s tragic conclusion:

(9) It was a case of using the right principle... in the wrong way.

The resulting derogatory type of representation is consistent with the show’s black humour, and simplifies again the influence of the implied receivers on script production. Similar instances of humorous
discourse are shared, in fact, by 1WTD, as is evident in example (10), when the narrator concludes the story of Stu, a tyrannical, oppressive swimming instructor, by comparing his dead body to a fish:

(10) He was making a good impression of a goldfish – the kind you wind up flushing down the toilet.

The comparison between Stu and a goldfish produces a derogatory representation and eventually results in the activation of an arousal/safety reaction to the black humour in the comment on his story, whereby laughter over someone's death may be softened by their previous behaviour. These types of narrators' comments are not present in RA, which instead addresses a more general audience, and pursues the emotional involvement of viewers by underlining the "superhuman" strength of the main characters who face their conditions with courage, as is evident in extracts (11) and (12) below:

(11) But back home in Warren, Michigan, where he's been living on his own for a year, [Jason] muscles through his days with superhuman determination.
(12) As Son is wheeled in the O.R., he's scared, but stoic as always.

This section has analysed the examples of popularization by means of linguistic reformulation. The following section inquires into the multimodal actualization of another of the most common strategies of explanation of specialized knowledge – metaphors.

4.2. Metaphors

Popularization in the selected corpus of scripts is also performed through the inclusion of metaphors, which are meant to facilitate the viewer's understanding thanks to the activation of mental connections with everyday objects and notions that belong to their experience. Two examples of metaphors can be found in extracts (13) and (14) below, from the RA episode concerning blood:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(13) Blood is the river of life.</td>
<td>Il sangue è il fiume della vita.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(14) This incredible plumbing system is as efficient to our survival as our heart, lungs, or brain.</td>
<td>Questo incredibile sistema idraulico è essenziale per la nostra sopravvivenza tanto quanto il cuore, i polmoni e il cervello.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Blood and the human circulatory system are compared to rivers and a "plumbing system", drawing upon the implied receivers' background knowledge. Additionally, the second metaphor recalls the association with the "small pipes" mentioned earlier in the episode (cf. extract (1) above) and therefore suggests that authors perhaps imagine a constant attention on the part of viewers, thus inserting intratextual references to the popularization strategies already employed in the same instalment. The original associations are preserved in the Italian versions, which therefore do not present modifications, but produce functional and linguistic equivalents. Also in extracts (13) and (14) popularization has a multimodal nature because words are supported by images such as the visual representation of blood as a river, from (13):
A similar visual representation of blood is adopted as a backup to another metaphor, when Michael’s vascular malformation is described:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Like cars in a maze of congested streets, many of [red blood cells] get backed up in the nooks and crannies of [Michael’s] malformed vessels.</td>
<td>Come auto in un dedalo di strade congestionate, molti [globuli rossi] si fermano negli angoli e nelle fessure dei vasi sanguigni malformati.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this fragment, two metaphorical associations can be identified, one between the circulatory system and “congested streets”, the other correlating Michael’s red blood cells with cars, both conveyed through an interactive relationship between the narrators’ utterances and the images, such as those represented in Figure 6:
Another metaphor can be found in the following extract (16), about the need for muscles to work in pairs:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>So, every muscle plays a role like—each one's an instrument, it's got to play with the other.</td>
<td>È un po' come un'orchestra, in cui ogni muscolo svolge una funzione.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The entire muscular system is compared to an orchestra, using a notion that – according to the authors – implicates the need for cooperation to ensure a successful performance and therefore facilitates the comprehension of muscle coordination, which is necessary to perform any action. The Italian metaphor is here more explicit than the original one, and this may be due to the time restrictions afforded by voice-over, which does not allow translators to preserve the hesitations and fragmented syntax from the source utterances. Yet, if (16) is compared to (17), when Dr Kaplan describes the causes of the Bone-Fibrodysplasia Ossificans Progressiva, one may notice that also hesitations and repetitions are not always given the same importance:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENGLISH VERSION</th>
<th>ITALIAN VERSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F.O.P. is like an atom bomb, where the fuse – the fuse of the atom bomb – is the mutant gene.</td>
<td>La F.O.P. è come una bomba atomica, dove la miccia – la miccia della bomba atomica – è il gene mutato.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dr Kaplan’s turn comes after the definitions of genes and proteins on the part of the narrator, who indeed resorts to two more metaphors: genes are labelled as “the body’s blueprint”, whereas proteins are considered as “the body’s building blocks”. When the specialist takes the floor, another parallelism is created, between F.O.P. and atom bombs, so that receivers can infer the seriousness and unpredictability of the rare disease. From an audiovisual-translation perspective, it is worth observing that the doctor’s aside and the consequent fragmented structure are left in the Italian version despite the temporal constraints of voice-over, perhaps because they have been considered as strategies that increase accessibility to the specialized knowledge, and are therefore essential in terms of pragmatic equivalence.

Finally, examples of multimodal metaphors are found in extracts (18) and (19), which respectively show the features of nerve cells and the consequences of F.O.P. The multimodal transcriptions of (18) and (19) exemplify the connection between metaphors and visual representations to make the medical con-

Table 2. Multimodal representation of two extracts from RA
ditions more accessible and support the implied viewers’ adequate reception. In particular, the narrator in (18) resorts to the expression “transmission lines” to refer to the networks of nerve cells in the human body, and his metaphorical association is multimodally reproduced through a mainstream representation of connections between two nodes of a network. At the same time, also example (19) symbolizes the multimodal nature of the popularization strategies under examination, and in particular the figure reflects the semantic and pragmatic dimensions entailed by the metaphor. The suffocation caused by the insufficient mobility of the chest cavity is illustrated by the rigid ribs that imprison the lungs, hence the depiction of a group of caged organs that do not move and prevent one from breathing supports the metaphorical association with a straightjacket from the extralinguistic viewpoint.

5. Conclusions

The study of the selected corpus of English and Italian scripts has described the use of juxtaposition, periphrasis and metaphors to reformulate medical knowledge for the general audience, and has illustrated the association between the conventional lexical and syntactic features of popularization and the visual support to the narrators’ and specialists’ utterances. The resulting composition can be defined as multimodal, for the integration between different semiotic modes is essential to render the explanation of the structure and function of human organs, or of the causes and effects of rare diseases, more accessible to viewers. At the same time, the examination of the target versions has revealed that the translations are generally committed to preserving the original aim of increasing accessibility to medical notions, despite the modifications and condensations determined by the need to cope with the temporal and spatial constraints of voice-over, the mode that is conventionally preferred for the audiovisual translation of documentaries in Italy.

In order to advance the state of research, one interesting approach may be represented by a multidisciplinary examination of this pluricode, hypermodal and hybridized discourse, for example to inquire into the possible cases of misinterpretation and miscommunication caused by the differences between source and target linguacultural backgrounds. At the same time, the exploration of other examples of multimodal popularization may help to pinpoint the main features of this process, in order to identify the analogies and differences between the various subgenres, such as sitcoms or other TV shows. Finally, it may be worth investigating the empirical effects of multimodal reformulations to reveal whether the actual audience’s response confirms the authors’ expectations in terms of the acquisition of (supposedly) more accessible knowledge.

References

Berti B. 2013. Comedy as an empirical science. The case of The Big Bang Theory. In S. Kermas and T. Christiansen (eds), The Popularization of Discourse and Knowledge


Abstract

Legal drama is the media fiction genre dealing with the professions of lawyers, judges and police and with law enforcement, including solving mysterious crimes or civil litigations. As such, it is a form of FASP (Fiction à Substrat Professionnel, ‘Fiction with Professional Background’, Petit 1999) and plays an outstanding role in language learning (Isani 2006a, 2006b; Villez 2005) and in the popularization of legal-specific contents and terminology for the non-expert audience (Laudisio 2016).

Against this background, this study sets out to analyse samples from two corpora, made up of the original scripts in English and the Italian fan-made translations of three legal dramas. Drawing on Venuti’s (1995) distinction between ‘foreignizing’ and ‘domesticating’ approaches and some classifications of the translation strategies in audiovisual products (Pedersen 2007; Ranzato 2013), the focus is placed on the translation of Culture-Specific References (CSR) connected to the US legal system and their translation into Italian.

The results show a tendency to substitute CSRs with references drawn from the Target Culture (TC), which sometimes disregard the lack of equivalence between the source text in favour of a domesticated and ‘ready-made’ translation of legal terminology. These results open the way to further reflections on the reasons behind the translators’ choices, among which the intention to neutralize the knowledge and cultural gap for a non-expert, non-American audience.

1. Introduction: corpus and methodology

One of the most challenging aspects of translation concerns filling the ‘cultural gap’ generated by the transposition of a text from its original language and culture to others. When the text to be translated is permeated with references to the procedures, terminology and professional culture of a specific country and is an integral part of a multimodal product including audiovisual elements, as in the case of legal drama, then the translator is faced with even more difficult challenges. Starting from the studies conducted on the translation of cultural references in audiovisual products, this paper proposes to make a contribution to the state-of-the-art literature on screen translation, as well as on legal discourse and the genres interlaced with the legal profession and
culture, with the final aim of providing an overview of the role of cultural references in legal drama and the possibilities of translation. Reflecting the latest developments in screen translation, the corpus of texts under analysis is made up of FanSubs, downloaded from the website OpenSubtitles.org and produced by the community ItalianSubs. FanSubs started out as fan-made subtitles for Japanese animes (Díaz Cintas and Muñoz Sánchez 2006; Chiaro 2009) and are the fruit of a teamwork of semi-professional translators, generally fans of the subtitled series; they are uploaded on the Internet immediately after each episode is aired, before the official DVD translations come out. FanSubs differ from professional subtitles in that they “are more daring and flout many conventions” (Chiaro 2009: 152), so that their analysis can bring to the fore several uncommon and variegated translation strategies. Still, their nature and function are basically the same as those of ‘official’ subtitles as are the challenges for the translator. Besides cultural diversity, which is the focus of this paper, some formal constraints also come into play and influence the translation process: in fact, since subtitles appear and disappear from the screen and are supposed to be as unobtrusive and efficient as possible, they are conditioned by time and space constraints. They should take up a maximum of two lines, each containing 20-40 characters, the words of the original dialogue generally being reduced by 40-75 per cent (Antonini 2005: 213; Chiaro 2009: 148), so that the reading process is made easier and viewers can enjoy the images while following the written text with little effort. These technical requirements lead to a series of linguistic operations and devices exploited by subtitles translators, such as:

- the elimination of elements which do not modify the content;
- rendering, meant as the editing of aspects such as dialects, slang or taboo;
- condensation of the original syntax (Chiaro 2009: 148).

It can easily be inferred, then, that time constraints and the strategies used in order to deal with them efficiently have a strong impact on the translations and the translators’ choices, which is also discussed in the Data analysis section below.

For the purposes of this research, three legal dramas have been selected, namely The Good Wife (abbreviated as ‘TGW’, seasons 1-2), Suits (seasons 1-2) and Boston Legal (abbreviated as ‘BL’, season 1). Only the scenes set in the courtroom, the law firm, or in sites where lawyers interact with peers, judges, clients, investigators, police officers and similar characters and legal topics are discussed, have been selected for this study.

On the basis of previous studies (see Section 2) all references to the Source Culture (SC) have been identified, up to 1000 occurrences. A contrastive analysis of the Source Text (ST) and the Target Text (TT) in the focal points where CSRs were present has made it possible to formulate hypotheses about the translators’ mental processes and choices and to reconstruct them, while also bearing in mind their effect on the audience and the ‘faithfulness’ to the original. Word-by-word ‘back translations’ of the Italian FanSubs into English are sometimes offered to enable the readers to understand the consequences of the translations on a semantic level. Despite the high number of examples quoted here, this analysis is therefore qualitative in nature and aims to provide a

---

1 The internal regulation of the ItalianSubs community provides for periodic admission of new translators, who are required to pass a quality test to check their skills as translators (https://www.italiansubs.net).
pure description of a still unexplored genre, legal drama FanSubs, and the way their producers (FanSubbers) deal with the transfer of cultural references in a second language and culture. The study also attempts to determine whether some consistency in the strategies used for the translation of CSRs can be observed and what this potentially implies in the representation of alterity.

2. Culture-Specific References

Since the first appearance of Translation Studies, scholars have focused on the challenges of the translational process, among which the translation of the linguistic and extra-linguistic references related to the Source Culture (SC) not present in the Target Culture (TC). Vlahov and Florin (1969: 438) referred to them as *realia*, i.e. words “which constitute denominations of objects, concepts which are typical of a geographical environment, of a culture [...] which] have not precise equivalents in other languages.” *Realia* were also the subject of interest of Leppihalme’s (1994, 1997) seminal studies on *culture bumps*, which focus more generally on cultural “allusions”. The currently widespread denomination of Culture-Specific References (Franco Aixelá 1996, Chiaro 2009) originated in a wave of studies conducted in the 1990s which generally dealt with the translation ‘problem’ connected with these expressions: Nedergaard-Larsen (1993: 209-10), for instance, talks of “culture-bound problems” referring to idioms, metaphors, and the use of some grammatical categories; Mailhac (1996: 133-134) states that the opacity of cultural references causes a problem for the target reader, and finally, in Franco Aixelá (1996: 58), culture-specific references are defined as “items whose function and connotations in a source text involve a translation problem in their transference to a target text, whenever this problem is a product of the non-existence of the referred item or of its different intertextual status in the cultural system of the readers of the target text.”

Translation Studies intersected with Media Studies in the first reflections and analyses on Culture Specific References in Audiovisual texts, such as Gautier’s (1981: 111-112) classification of culture-bound elements in films. Later on, Chaume (2004) acknowledged the urgent need for a contribution of Translation Studies in the exegesis of audiovisual texts by means of a specifically aimed integrated model of analysis based on systematic approaches. He underlined the importance of distinguishing the text’s “external” factors (such as professional or historical factors) from “general” translation problems, including linguistic, contextual, pragmatic and cultural difficulties, and taking both into account when analysing Audiovisual Translation. This new awareness opened up a new wave of studies on AVT, which encompassed the analysis of the elements more strictly related to language and culture. Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007), for instance, dedicated a whole section to the translation of language- and culture-specific issues, including emotionally charged language, culture-bound terms, songs and humour. Pedersen (2005, 2007) has also provided an important contribution to the studies on the translation of culture-bound elements in audiovisual texts. In particular, he defined (2007: 30) ‘Extralinguistic Cultural References’ (ECRs) as “expressions that refer to entities outside language, such as names of people, places, institutions, food, customs etc., which a person may not know, even if s/he knows the language in question”, a definition very close to Ramière’s (2006) “Culture-Specific material”, i.e. any verbal sign which is specific to the original sociocultural context of the audiovisual
product and that therefore creates a translation problem, since it does not exist in the Target Culture.

Several contributions on the translation of culture in AVT are contained in Díaz Cintas’s (2009: 44) volume, including Pettit’s (2009) study of cultural signs, i.e. signs which “contain [...] culture-specific information, verbal or nonverbal, transmitted aurally or visually” in a corpus of films in English and their dubbed French versions, and Gottlieb’s (2009) study of “localisms” in Danish productions and their translation into English and vice versa. In actual fact, studies on the translation of CSRs in audiovisual products, whether focusing on dubbing or subtitling, have attracted the attention of studies from all over Europe, especially from Spain, France and Italy (which are “dubbing countries”, as stated in Chiaro 2009: 143) and more recently other countries such as Greece – e.g. Kostopoulou (2015) on the analysis of translation from Greek into English based on Franco Aixelá’s (1996) taxonomy. Santamaria Guinot (2001a, 2001b, 2010) and Baños Piñero (2005, 2009, 2010) have offered insights on the translation of CSRs present in the source English text into Spanish and in particular, Baños Piñero (2005) shifted the focus of research towards the translation of cultural references in TV series.

As far as Italian is concerned, the work edited by Baccolini, Bollettieri Bosinelli and Gavioli (1994) on dubbing and linguistic and cultural transposition paved the way for a whole line of research on cultural transfers in Italian dubbing and subtitling, which includes other pioneering works such as Heiss and Bollettieri Bosinelli (1996), Antonini and Chiaro (2005), Pavesi (2006) and Freddi and Pavesi (2009). Research has also gradually focused on diverse and more specific aspects of culture, thus including not only references to objects and terms of the Source Language, but also wordplays such as those based on paronomasia, irony, satirical sketches, ‘politically incorrect’ jokes, taboo (Bucaria 2009; Chiaro 2007) and even compliments (Bruti 2009) and greetings (Bonsignori and Bruti 2014). The latter give an overview of the possible translational solutions to culture-bound problems when translating TV series into Italian (for instance, changes in the syntactic structure and lexis, reduction and omissions) and analyse the different perception of compliments and greetings on the part of the target viewers. More specifically, a series of studies focusing on the (un)translatability of humour grew out of Chiaro’s (1996) and Zabalbeascoa’s (1996) works on the translation of jokes and later evolved into an interdisciplinary approach to Humour Studies as applied to Screen Translation (Chiaro 2004; Zabalbeascoa 2005; Antonini 2005).

Chiaro (2009: 155) makes a useful distinction between the types of “translational hurdles” that dubbers and subtitlers have to deal with, i.e.:

1. highly culture-specific references (e.g. place names, references to sports and festivities, famous people, monetary systems, institutions, etc.);
2. language-specific features (terms of address, taboo language, etc.);
3. areas of overlap between language and culture (songs, rhymes, jokes, etc.).

More recently, Ranzato (2014: 223) has proposed a model to classify cultural references starting from the basic assumption that they are to be distinguished between “realistic” and “intertextual”:
The former are references to non-fictional persons, objects and events: living or once living people, food, currency, institutions, celebrations and everything which composes our reality. The latter are intended as explicit or indirect allusions to other texts, which create a bond between the translated text and other literary, audiovisual or artistic texts.

This distinction allows for an all-encompassing view of culture-bound references in audiovisual translation. Moreover, to the best of my knowledge, Ranzato (2013) is also the author of the most recent and detailed analysis of Culture-Specific References in English/American TV series and their translation into Italian, which also provides a useful theoretical and methodological background (referred to in Section 3, where the most significant classifications of the strategies used to translate CSRs are presented in detail). Against this extremely variegated background, which encompasses the analyses of a wide range of different cultural aspects and audiovisual genres, this research sets out to investigate a very specific aspect: culture-specific references related to law in legal TV series and their translation into Italian in FanSubs.

3. Translation of Culture-Specific References

When approaching culture-related issues in translation, references to Venuti’s (1995: 19-21) distinction between foreignization and domestication are inevitable. In analysing the relationship between a (target culture/language) reader and a (translated) text, Venuti (ibid.: 5) identifies two opposite trends, one making the content of a text “intelligible and even familiar to the target-language reader”, and bringing the text towards the reader (domestication); and the other preserving the linguistic and cultural features of the ST and manifesting the ‘other’ culture, regardless of a defamiliarizing effect on the target reader (Ramière 2006).

On the basis of Venuti’s polarization, several scholars have proposed their classifications of the strategies used to translate cultural references, some of which derived directly from the application to audiovisual texts. Vinay and Darbelnet (1977) proposed one of the first classifications of strategies for the translation of culture-specific references which has inspired, among others, the one offered by Nedergaard-Larsen (1993: 219), containing transfers and loans, direct translation, explicitation, paraphrase and, most importantly, adaptation to the TC. Franco Aixelá (1996: 60) provided a view of these strategies along a “continuum of various degrees of intercultural manipulation”, in which it is possible to assign to each translation strategy a certain degree of foreignization or domestication. This continuum has also been illustrated by Ramière (2006) who underlines the difficulty of placing ‘neutralization’ and ‘omission’ among domesticating or foreignizing strategies as they basically erase any reference to another culture, sidestepping the problem of the cultural gap (Figure 1).

Pedersen’s (2007: 31) taxonomy distinguishes subtitling strategies according to a lesser or greater intervention by the translator, placing ‘minimum change’ strategies in contrast with ‘intervention’ strategies and, like Ramière, considers ‘omission’ a self-standing category (Figure 2).

‘Cultural substitution’ is central to Pedersen’s (2007: 32) analysis: it is the strategy which “replaces an unknown reference with a known one, either from the source culture (SC) or from the target culture (TC)”. In reality, cultural substitution can also
take place by means of a ‘transcultural ER’ which resorts to a third culture reference known to both the Source and the Target Culture. The use of a ‘transcultural’ ECR implies distancing oneself from the original reference in the ST in favour of references culturally closer to the subtitles reader, as well as greater creativity from the translator – thus breaking Levy’s (1967: 156) ‘minimax’ strategy. It often brings with itself a ‘breach of reference’ and the consequent risk of a ‘credibility gap’, e.g. when reference is made to elements of the TC which the audience knows are not part of the SC, therefore causing ‘credibility’ or ‘authenticity problems’ and causing the subtitle to be perceived as incorrect (Pedersen 2007: 33). On the other hand, the use of transcultural ECRs can also have a ‘standardizing’ effect, i.e. rendering the foreign culture elements with more familiar and accessible cultural references.

Cultural substitution by a target culture ECR, on the other hand, removes a foreign element and replaces it with a domestic one and is therefore the most domesticating strategy. As Pedersen (2007: 38-39) showed, it is the most common strategy employed to translate titles and terms in the governmental sector. It often leaves no room for the target reader to perceive the substitution of the original cultural reference and creates no credibility gap, also because it often acts by replacing ST ECR with its ‘official’ equivalent in the TC. Official equivalents are established either by an “official decision by someone who has authority over the ECR in question” or through ‘entrenchment’, i.e. “if a SC ECR is always rendered in a particular way in the TC” (ibid.: 36). As shown in
Section 5, this type of strategy is particularly fruitful in the translation of legal terminology, which often draws on official and ‘entrenched’ translations. Besides avoiding credibility gaps, TC cultural substitution also conveys connotations in a space-efficient way, which is essential in subtitles since time and space constraints require a condensation of the spoken text.

4. Legal drama and legal-specific Cultural References

As demonstrated in previous research (Laudisio 2016), legal drama is a kind of TV series set at the interface of fiction and reality, with a focus on the specialized field of law and the legal profession. It is a shining example of FASP *(Fiction à Substrat Professionnel*, Petit 1999), where the plot, characters and source of literary inspiration are defined by and dependent on a specialized professional environment: in legal drama, legal professionals are shown in “all the places they work and going about all their possible activities. [...] They plead in courts, but it is in the offices of the firm that they meet clients, listen to and advise them, negotiate with other parties, do research in case law and prepare arguments” (Villez 2005: 34-35).

Studies on legal TV FASP have shown that it can serve an educational function, especially in ESP classes, being instrumental in teaching and transmitting knowledge on three main levels:

1) the content level, since it conveys information about the professional background and the specific domain in which FASP is set and helps build a ‘capital of knowledge’ related to that domain (Isani 2006a, 2006b; Laudisio 2016: 123-124);

2) the cultural level, meaning culture as in ‘high culture’ (human activities related with art, music, classic literature etc.: see Isani 2011: 9); as ‘societal culture’, and as ‘professional culture’, i.e. the “intra-, inter- and extra-professional interlocutors who interact with a particular professional community, its relevant institutions, basic values, modes of functioning, history and traditions and the issues it is confronted with”, allowing learners to acquire a “professional cultural competence” *(ibid.*: 36);

3) the linguistic/discursive level, as the specialized terminology of a scientific/professional domain and exchanges in professional milieus, including dialogues between professionals, is impossible to separate from the professional background portrayed in the fiction (see Villez 2005: 75).

Seen from the ESP perspective, legal drama is an example of ‘genre embedding’, where a “particular generic form, it may be a poem, a story or an article [is] used as a template to give expression to another conventionally distinct generic form” (Bhatia 1997: 191): a whole range of different genres ‘borrowed’ from the legal profession are embedded within the TV series template narrating stories in episodes. The appropriation of generic textual features results in the high occurrence of Culture-Specific References connected to legal discourse, which also come to be a central and constitutive element of this genre and as such are the focus of this article. For the analysis of CSRs in the legal drama corpus both Pedersen’s (2007) above-mentioned taxonomy and Ranzato’s (2013) will be taken as methodological reference. Ranzato’s (2013) classification, as opposed to Pedersen’s (2007), is not based on the mental processes behind the translator’s choice,
but on merely linguistic criteria, which include intervention at the grammatical, lexical and syntactic level. In fact, the strategies identified by Ranzato (2013) are:

1) Loan, i.e. “a verbatim repetition of the CSR as it was found in the SC”; as in this case:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have a signed affidavit from ASA Alex Phelan stating that Peter Flottick has asked him to influence</td>
<td>Ho un affidavit firmato dal Sostituto Procuratore Alex Phelan, che dichiara che</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your Honor into granting bail (TGW 1x08).</td>
<td>Peter Flottick gli ha chiesto di influenzare il giudice per assecondare la libertà</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>provvisoria*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* ‘Affidavit’ is generally translated with a loan, although there are cases in which it is translated by means of a paraphrase:
Your Honor, this is an affidavit from the clerk at the Lake Avenue Motel saying that Mr. Rivers spent the night with Kelli Gerber Smith on nine occasions. (TGW 1x16).
Vostro Onore, qui c’è una dichiarazione giurata del concierge al Motel Lake Avenue che dice che il signor Rivers ha passato la notte li con Kelli Gerber Smith nove volte.

2) Official translation, a “recognized term, already available in the TC”, a “ready-made strategy” for the translator generally obtained through loan, calque or substitution, e.g. Supreme Court → Corte Suprema;

3) Calque, i.e. a literal translation of a non-existing term in the TC, e.g. reasonable doubt → ragionevole dubbio; this strategy includes quotations and word by word translations of lengthy excerpts;

4) Explicitation, i.e. “a form of definition of the CSR by means of an explanation, of addition of information”, including more popular or generic terms to define the same item, e.g.:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explicitation by adding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretrial release (TGW 1x08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member of the Capital Litigation Bar (TGW 2x01)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explicitation of acronyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DUI (TGW 1x09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPR (TGW 1x15)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5) Generalization by hypernym, i.e. replacing a CPR with “one or more words having a broader meaning than the given element” (e.g. attorney-client privilege → segreto professionale, see below);

6) Concretization; i.e. making a general concept more specific by using a hyponym;

7) Substitution, mainly corresponding to Pedersen’s (2007) cultural substitution, in subtitles it can be particularly useful to substitute lengthy cultural references with shorter ones, although the substitution may not have ‘functional’ reasons (see above);

8) Lexical recreation, i.e. the creation of a neologism, generally motivated by a neologism in the ST;
9) Compensation, i.e. “when a loss in one point of the translation is compensated for in another point of the same translation”;

10) Elimination, when a CSR which was in the ST is not present in the TT, e.g.: “No, they can’t. Double jeopardy. He’s been tried, cleared” \(\rightarrow\) No, non possono. È stato già processato e rilasciato (No, they can’t. He’s already been tried and released, TGW 2x02); in this case the translators chose not to use an equivalent Italian technical term (like the expression ne bis in idem) but to retain the explicative sentence. Elimination can also be partial, as in word couplets translated by a single word, e.g.: null and void \(\rightarrow\) nullo (TGW 1x17);

11) Creative addition, i.e. a subjective authorial intervention by the adapter, dictated by his/her personal taste, often contributing to explicitate the CSR, e.g. ‘Small’ \(\rightarrow\) taglia Small (Small size, see below), or to obtain humorous effects.

This classification will be used as a methodological reference together with Pedersen’s (2007) to describe legal-specific cultural references in legal drama both at the level of their linguistic structure and semantics and of the translator’s choices.

5. Data analysis

In the legal drama corpus, references to public and governmental institutions are particularly frequent, and FanSubbers mostly avail themselves of what Pedersen (2005) calls Cultural Substitution by a TC ECR, as with several other culture-specific references related e.g. to the trial phases. A classification of CSRs which specifically focuses on institutional references, especially with regard to the legal field and thus applicable to legal drama, is offered by Antonini and Chiaro (2005: 39):

1) Place names: Chicago Polytech (Politecnico di Chicago, TGW 1x08), Cook County (Contea di Cook, in TGW 1x01, or Cook County, as in TGW 1x20 and 2x07);

2) Monetary systems, also in colloquial expressions: a million bucks (un milione di dollari, TGW 1x17); 50 grand (explicitated in 50 mita, i.e. ‘50 thousand’ in TGW 1x02);

3) National sports and pastimes;

4) Food and drink, e.g. ‘deep dish by the slice’ (pizza alta al taglio, explicitating that it is a type of ‘thick’ pizza, TGW 1x03) and ‘white wine spritzer’ (spritzer di vino bianco, TGW 1x09).

5) Holidays and festivities, e.g. Shabbath (unvaried, as it belongs to a third culture, in TGW 1x07);

6) Books, films and TV programs, e.g. CSI: NewYork (TGW 1x18); The New York Times (TGW 1x19); Social Network (a film, TGW 2x14) all left unvaried because they are known by their English titles in Italy.

7) Celebrities and personalities, as in the following cases:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Wouldn’t you benefit, even if only in the form of lowered spousal support?</td>
<td>- Ma lei non ne beneficierebbe quanto meno in termini di diminuzione del mantenimento?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- I guess, but I’m not Warren Buffett. (TGW 1x02)</td>
<td>- Penso di sì, ma non sono Warren Buffett.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3
8. Institutions (including judiciary, police, military), including:

   a. Legal formulae: e.g. ‘All rise’ (In piedi); ‘Objection overruled/sustained’ (obiezione respinta/accolta); ‘Motion is granted/denied’ (mozione accolta/respinta), generally translated by means of corresponding or similar formulae in the TC legal system or by means of ad-hoc formulae used as standardized translations in audiovisual products;
   b. Courtroom forms of address: e.g. ‘Your Honour’ (Vostro Onore); ‘Ladies and Gentlemen of the jury’ (Signore e Signori della giuria);
   c. Legal topography, as in the following case:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Steven Spielberg did a pre-nup on a napkin. Didn’t hold up, which is why Amy Irving is the richest out-of-work actress in Hollywood. (Suits 2x06)</td>
<td>Steven Spielberg fece un accordo prematrimoniale su un tovagliolo. Non resse. Ed è per questo che Amy Irving è l’attrice senza lavoro più ricca di Hollywood.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I say Atticus Finch makes a good speech here, but this is a fender-bender, not a multimillion-dollar lawsuit. (TGW 1x02)</td>
<td>Dico che Atticus Finch qui ha fatto un gran discorso, ma si tratta di un incidente di lieve entità, non di una causa multimilionaria.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- High court is our last stop.</td>
<td>- La Corte Alta è la nostra ultima possibilità.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- High court?</td>
<td>- Corte Alta?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Texas doesn’t have a Supreme court. They have two High courts, one for civil, and one for criminal. (BL 1x17)</td>
<td>- In Texas non hanno la Corte Suprema. Hanno due Corti Alte, una per il civile e una per il penale.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illinois State Supreme Court (TGW 1x09)</td>
<td>Corte Suprema dell’Illinois</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Affairs (TGW 1x23)</td>
<td>Affari Interni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Affairs (TGW 1x18)</td>
<td>La Disciplinare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Jury</td>
<td>Gran giuri</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In all these cases except one, the translation into Italian is based on word-by-word translations (e.g. *Dipartimento dello Sceriffo*) or standardized adaptations into Italian (e.g. *gran giurì*). The only exception is recorded in episode 1x18 of *The Good Wife*, where Internal Affairs is translated as *la Disciplinare*. This term has been coined as an elliptic form of *Polizia Disciplinare* or *Sezione Disciplinare* and refers to specific authorities which are in charge of controlling the ethical behaviour of police organs. On the basis of the information provided by the general context in which the term is used, the translator has chosen to use a more specific term referring to a specific office of the same authority (*creative addition*) and at the same time to resort to a TC cultural substitution:

d. Agents, e.g. types of judges and attorneys:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State’s Attorney</td>
<td>Procuratore / Procuratore di Stato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Attorney</td>
<td>Procuratore distrettuale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASA</td>
<td>Assistente Procuratore di Stato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA</td>
<td>Assistente Procuratore Distrettuale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8

As in the cases shown in c), in the translation of ‘agents’, standardized equivalents are preferred (cf. Chiaro 2009: 156 on the translation of District Attorney as *Procuratore distrettuale*). Similarly, explicitation strategies are also frequent, as in the case of the explicitated translations of the acronyms ASA and ADA, adapted as *Assistente Procuratore di Stato* and *Assistente Procuratore Distrettuale* respectively.

This category could also encompass the appellatives given to the trial participants, like Plaintiff and Defendant, whose translation can change according to the domesticating purposes of the FanSubber (Table 9).

In most cases, ‘plaintiff’ is translated as *querelante*. This term, which is often offered as translation in general dictionaries, is used here to indicate a person reporting another for a criminal offence, even when it is not used in a criminal trial, but in a civil one (in *Suits* 1x07, for instance, a defamation case is discussed). In *The Good Wife* 1x02, ‘plaintiff’ is translated as *parte lesa* (the injured party), consistent with the Italian terminology potentially usable for a criminal case as the one discussed. However, in *The Good Wife* 1x19, the term *attore* (i.e. the person who initiates civil trials) is used, although references are made to a bomb and a person’s death, so that they are probably discussing a criminal case. Of course, a translation which follows the distinction between the
terms *parte lesa* (or *vittima del reato*) for criminal trials and *attore (in giudizio)* for civil claims, would be more appropriate.

As for the ‘defendant’, *imputato* is the Italian term for a person indicted in a criminal trial (*procedimento penale*) and a substitution by means of a TC CSR is properly applied for criminal cases. However, in the episodes in which the trials are civil and not criminal (e.g. in *Suits 1x07*), the FanSubbers do not choose to use the Italian equivalent terminology for civil trials, which is *convenuto*, but prefer *imputato*. This translation choice underlines the fact that substitutions by means of a TC technical term do not necessarily resort to a term which would have fitted the equivalent situation in the TC. This may be due to two main different reasons: on the one hand, the FanSubbers may not have been aware of the distinction made in the Italian legal system between *convenuto* and *imputato*, or they may have carelessly ignored it. On the other hand, if we consider the huge amount of information and original, real material and texts available on the Internet and on terminological data banks, which would have easily allowed FanSubbers to acknowledge such a terminological difference, this translational choice might also reveal the FanSubbers’ conscious attitude towards domestication, regardless of the semantic and pragmatic accuracy of the Italian terms used.

Antonini and Chiaro’s (2005) classification, however, does not include a category for the legal principles and procedures which belong to a single culture (or State). These terms are mainly related to public institutions, and include trial types or phases, as well as courtroom procedures of the US legal system only, and can thus be considered culture-specific (Table 10).

While for some of these terms translations are highly standardized (100% of cross-examinations are translated as *controinterrogatorio*, and a similar percentage of closing argument/statement and summations are translated as *arringa (finale)*), others leave room for different solutions. For example, the adjective ‘pretrial’ has given birth to the calques *pre-processo* or *pre-processuale*, although the Italian equivalent *preliminare* is generally used for this kind of hearing. Terms which are less widely known to the average foreign audience and have generally no equivalent in the TC give rise to less standardized translations. For example, the ‘voir dire’ phase, during which potential

---

2 My special thanks go to one of the anonymous referees who observed this.

3 Thanks to one of the anonymous referees who observed this.
members of a jury are questioned to see if they are suitable to judge without bias⁴, is retained in the Italian translations by means of a loan in two episodes, but in both the term is explained on its second occurrence by means of a paraphrase (esame preliminare, preliminary exam), or even replaced with a more general word, or hypernym (colloquio, interview), which compensate for the opacity of the ‘voir dire’ loan.

9. Units of measurement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
<th>Back translation into English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bench trial, jury trial (TGW 1x13)</td>
<td>Processo senza giuria, processo con giuria</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretrial hearing (TGW 1x01)</td>
<td>Udienza preliminare</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretrial motions (TGW 1x16)</td>
<td>Questioni pre-processo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretrial motion (TGW 2x01, 2x03, 2x08)</td>
<td>Mozione pre-processo, pre-processuale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency injunction</td>
<td>Ingiunzione straordinaria</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency motion (TGW 1x16)</td>
<td>Mozione straordinaria</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voir dire (TGW 2x06)</td>
<td>Voir dire, esame preliminare</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voir dire (TGW 1x04)</td>
<td>Voir dire, colloquio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening statement (Suits 1x05, 1x07)</td>
<td>Dichiarazione d’apertura</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing argument (TGW 2x01)</td>
<td>Arringa finale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing statement (Suits 1x07)</td>
<td>Arringhe finali</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summations (TGW 1x04)</td>
<td>Arringhe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross-examination (TGW 1x08, 2x11)</td>
<td>Controinterrogatorio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10

⁴ http://www.nolo.com/dictionary/voir-dire-term.html. All web sources were last accessed on 5 April 2017.
As can be deduced from the selected excerpts above, units of measurements are always domesticated: pounds are converted into kilos, feet and yards into metres, Fahrenheit degrees into Celsius degrees. Even clothes sizes are converted, and the American ‘12’ becomes an Italian ‘46’. The more international sizes Small, Medium, Large and Extra-Large, although commonly used in Italy, are explicitly referred to as *taglia* (size) in the Italian translation. This ‘creative addition’ (according to Ranzato’s (2013) taxonomy, see below) functions as an explicative device which makes the reference to clothes size undoubtedly clear to the target audience.

10. Educational references to ‘high school’ culture (e.g. sorority mate, *consorella*, in TGW 1x18) and the school system:

To translate the concept of pre-school (synonym of pre-Kindergarten and nursery school) the FanSubbers chose the Italian equivalent *scuola materna* which hosts children from three to five. ‘Grade school’ is associated with *scuola elementare*, although they do not correspond completely: the school level corresponding to *scuola elementare*...
is that of ‘primary’ or ‘elementary school’, while the ‘grade school’ denomination also includes the following phase of ‘secondary school’\(^5\). Sunday school, a typically Protestant institution providing extra education to children from six to 13 about religious themes, is associated to the courses held in Italian Catholic churches to eight- and nine-year-old children before their Holy Communion, known as *Catechismo*, by means of a highly domesticating strategy.

School ‘grades’ also seem to be a cause for confusion: in the United States’ system, each school year corresponds to a grade (in Italian simply called *anno*, year), hence the ‘grade school’ name. In Italy a *grado* is the whole level of education consisting of three to five years of courses. This explains the translation of the sentence “taught second grade” from *The Good Wife* 1x01 as *insegnava alle superiori* (‘she taught at high school’), a school that is also known as ‘secondaria di secondo grado’ (*second-grade secondary school*). Although this translation is at some distance from the ST reference, it fortunately did not affect the development of the plot and did not cause any credibility gap in the audience.

In episode 2x11 of *Suits*, where ‘sixth grade’ is mentioned, the exact equivalence within the Italian system is avoided: the sixth year in the Italian system corresponds to the first year of *media* school, but only a general reference to the kind of school is made, without specifying the year, therefore associating an omission and a generalization strategy.

‘Law school’ is often translated as *Laurea in Giurisprudenza* (*Degree in Law*), although it is a post-graduate program which enables US graduates to work as an attorney (if they pass a Bar examination) and it is a further step after attending university. Similarly, Italian lawyers have to be ‘qualified’ (*abilitati*) after an 18-month traineeship program and an obligatory national examination, so that graduating from a Law Faculty is not enough to practise Law. For this reason, translating it as ‘laurea’ (*Master degree*) causes a loss at the reference and information level, despite being satisfactory at the ‘effect’ level (Pedersen 2007: 33). Given the substantial overlapping of the American and Italian systems, a law school graduation could have been more efficiently translated as *abilitazione*, instead of the misleading and confusing *Scuola di legge*.

In the last example, the judge comments on the lawyers’ defence strategy by saying that they deserve an ‘E’ (grades in the US school ranging from A to F, and E being almost close to the ‘pass’ threshold), like the initial letter of the ‘Effort’ they made. As the Italian translation for ‘effort’ is *sforzo*, the reference to the first letter of the word is lost. As Chiaro (2009: 156) points out, “a schoolchild’s ‘F’ grade would [usually] be translated literally despite the absence of a corresponding marking system in Italy.” Therefore, the Italian audience is acquainted with the A-to-F grade system, but an equivalent in the 1-to-10 Italian system with a grade close to the Pass threshold (which is 6, so a 5 would have been close) would have probably offered a more ‘fluent’ version in the TC.

**Hearsay**

‘Hearsay’ is a “testimony given by a witness who is not telling what he or she knows personally, but what others have said”\(^6\). Such testimony is therefore inadmissible in

\(^5\) https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Primary_school.

a trial in compliance with the ‘hearsay rule’ which “prohibits the use of out-of-court statements”.

The term, composed of the two verbs ‘hear’ and ‘say’ joined to form a single noun, is one of the most frequent types of objection, as a lawyer can object to the content of a testimony if it was only heard and then reported in court by the witness and can be functional to a coup de scène in which evidence, statements and declarations are held to be unreliable and therefore excluded:

| Table 13 |
| Original script | The prosecution now plans to introduce it into evidence. But they can’t, because it’s hearsay. (TGW 1x22) |
| Italian FanSubs | L’accusa ha intenzione di presentarlo come prova. Ma non possono perché è per sentito dire. |

| Table 14 |
| Original script | - I never said that. He did.  
- Oh, that’s great. This way, if I level a charge for extortion, it’s hearsay, huh? (Suits 1x10) |
| Italian FanSubs | - Io non l’ho mai detto. Lui sì.  
- Oh, fantastico. Così se sporgo denuncia per estorsione è per sentito dire, vero? |

| Table 15 |
| Original script | It was a dying declaration and therefore an exception to the hearsay rule. [...] For her to incriminate her own son would be a declaration against her interest, which would also qualify as an exception to the hearsay rule. (BL 1x11) |
| Italian FanSubs | Era una dichiarazione in punto di morte e quindi un’eccezione alla regola del ‘sentito dire’. [...] Incriminare il proprio figlio sarebbe stata una dichiarazione contro i propri interessi, che costituisce un’altra eccezione alla regola del ‘sentito dire’. |

Although an expression exists in the Italian legal system to express a similar concept (testimonianza de relato), almost the totality of the occurrences of ‘hearsay’ are translated into Italian by ‘sentito dire’, a word-by-word translation which proposes the use of the same two verbs, though separated because of the grammatical constraints imposed by Italian.

Nonetheless, alternative translations can be proposed in which the noun ‘hearsay’ is translated without resorting to grammatical recategorization, but by means of a similar noun in Italian, which has its roots in the verb ‘to say’ (dire): dicerie (Table 16).

Being a pivotal term in legal drama, hearsay has undergone a process of ‘entrenchment’, as Pedersen (2007: 36) defines it, by being systematically exported into a TC and therefore becoming internationally known (Ranzato 2013: 116).

As shown by the examples, its diffusion led to a certain degree of standardization in its translation as well. In most cases, a grammatical recategorization (or ‘transposition’, as in Vinay and Darbelnet’s (1977) taxonomy) is used, where a SL noun is rendered

---

by means of a verbal phrase in the TL. The alternative found in episode 1x01 of *The Good Wife* brings to the fore the lack of consistency within the FanSubbers’ community, which does, however, leave room for a higher degree of variability in the proposed translations. Even though both strategies result in a general lowering of the term’s degree of specialization, *sentito dire* is more neutral than *dicerie*, which commonly refers to out-of-the-courtroom gossip-like exchanges and brings a negative connotation with it. Yet, on the other side, it is functional on the space and time constraints level, since it makes it possible to translate ‘hearsay’ by means of one single word of the same length.

### Table 16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
<th>Back translation into English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Testimone: Ma, dopo l’udienza per la custodia, Michael aveva paura che Jennifer...</td>
<td>Witness: But, after the last custody hearing, Michael was afraid that Jennifer...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alicia: Obiezione, Vostro Onore!</td>
<td>Alicia: Objection, Your Honor!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giudice: Su quali basi?</td>
<td>Judge: On what grounds?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alicia: <em>Dicerie</em>?</td>
<td>Alicia: <em>Rumor</em>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giudice: Ci ha provato, signora Florrick.</td>
<td>Judge: You’ve tried, Mrs. Florrick.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the United States legal doctrine, Attorney-Client Privilege is

[a] rule that keeps communications between an attorney and client confidential and protects everything said between attorney and client from being discovered by the opposing party during pretrial investigation, or used as evidence in a trial. The same type of privilege exists between physician and patient, clergy and parishioner, and spouses.

However, different types of privilege exist and their translation into Italian may be tricky (Table 17).

Similarly to ‘hearsay’, the translation of different types of privilege tends to be standardized: in most cases, FanSubbers chose to use *segreto professionale* (professional secret/privilege), a form of hyperonymy which entails a loss of a more specific reference to the kind of ‘privilege’ discussed. In fact, both ‘patient-therapist’ and ‘attorney-client’ privilege were also dealt with under the umbrella term *segreto professionale*, leaving disambiguation to the audience’s knowledge of the professional context and to the visual elements present in the scene.

The first excerpt, from *The Good Wife* 1x19, manages to keep the reference to a form of ‘privilege’ by resorting to compensation and translating ‘the privilege’ (referring to

---

ADRIANO LAUDISIO

the obligation to confidentiality) as *privilegio*, which in Italian only keeps the meaning of a special right granted to a person.

To the hypernym *segreto professionale* a specification is added only when different types of privilege are distinguished in the ST, as in the following case:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Original script</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The laws in this country to protect against child-abuse supersede <em>doctor-patient privilege, lawyer-client privilege</em>, but not <em>priest-parishioner privilege</em>?! (BL 2x10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The law against child abuse abolishes the professional secret between doctor and patient, between lawyer and client but not the one between priest and parishioner?!!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Original script</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your Honor, I regret that I can’t answer that question, due to the <em>bond of attorney-client privilege</em>. (TGW 2x19)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Retaining a specification of the individuals enjoying privilege in the TL serves a twofold purpose:

a) to highlight the speaker’s role as attorney, therefore establishing her own position in the legal hierarchy;

b) to persuade the judge of the legitimacy of the lawyer’s action. This is also underlined by the use of *condizione* (condition) in lieu of ‘privilege’, a word bearing the
idea of being passive or coerced in the choice and in the development of the facts under discussion.\(^9\)

Leaving aside the differences in the approach of dubbers and (fan)subtitlers and the different reading/visual constraints (Chiaro 2009: 144-152), the solution adopted above demonstrates that it is possible to obtain an Italian equivalent which at the same time keeps the reference to the Italian equivalent (segreto professionale) and specifies the subjects of the privilege (cliente-avvocato), at the same time preserving the hyphenated form of the American term:

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian dubbing</th>
<th>Back translation into English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Undoubtedly you’re familiar with the concept of ‘double jeopardy’. You’ve been acquitted. You can never be tried for this crime. And, of course, anything that you say to me here is protected by attorney-client privilege. (BL 2x02)</td>
<td>Indubbiamente il concetto di ‘doppia condanna’ è familiare e dato che Lei è stata assolta non potrà mai più essere processata per questo crimine. E naturalmente qualsiasi cosa lei mi dica qui è protetta dal segreto professionale cliente-avvocato.</td>
<td>Undoubtedly the concept of ‘double conviction’ is familiar to you, and given that you’ve been acquitted, you may never be tried for this crime again. And, of course, anything you say to me here is protected by the ‘attorney-client professional secret’.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Table 20

**Felony**

The classification of United States criminal offences in ‘felonies’ and ‘misdemeanours’ according to the seriousness of the offence and the consequent punishment\(^10\) poses the problem of their equivalence into any other legal system and their translation. The opposition between the two terms finds a formal equivalence in the Italian terms delitto and contravvenzione, respectively two types of reato (or illecito penale). However, observing the corpus data, the standardized Italian translation seems to be crimine, a term which shares the same roots as the English ‘crime’ but is generally used in legal theory and in legal academic discourse, and not in criminal procedure, where reato, delitto or illecito (according to the type of offence) would have better reflected Italian courtroom terminology (Table 21).

In other cases, however, for example when the word ‘felony’ is accompanied by other words in forming legal-specific phrases, other translations can be proposed, as in the following excerpt (Table 22).

In the case in Table 22, the defendant has been arrested and charged with her third DUI (Driving under influence), which is a misdemeanour, and due to the force of the

---

\(^9\) It should also be noticed that not much attention is paid to the Italian collocation of verbs with the equivalent terms which have been chosen to translate the original CSR. For instance, in the example from TGW 2x06 in Table 17, the conversation is protetta (protected) by the segreto professionale, while according to the Italian terminology, it would be coperta (covered). Similarly, the law against child abuse can derogare (waive) or scavalcare (climb over) the privilege, and not abolire (abolish) it (Table 18) and a vincolo is esercitato (exercised), not dato (given, Table 19). I wish to thank one of the anonymous referees for this observation.

We’re talking about a *felony crime* here. We have an obligation. (TGW 1x04)

Parliamo di un *crimine* qui: abbiamo l’obbligo di dirlo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aggravated battery is a <em>felony</em>, Your Honor, carrying a prison term of two to five years. (TGW 1x09)</td>
<td>Le percosse aggravate sono un <em>crimine</em> che condanna dai 2 ai 5 anni di reclusione.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You’re under arrest for attempted murder. A <em>class X felony</em> with a minimum sentence of six years. (TGW 2x07)</td>
<td>È in arresto per tentato omicidio. Un <em>crimine di classe X</em> con una sentenza minima di 6 anni.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 21

The State’s Attorney is gonna want a *felony conviction* and 25 days at Cook County to use you as an example. (TGW 2x07)

Il Procuratore chiederebbe una *condanna di colpevolezza* e 25 giorni al Cook County per usarli come esempio.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Back translation into English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>And because the guard was killed in the commission of an alleged burglary, it’s <em>felony murder</em>. […] We didn’t get bail because Brian cut a deal with the S.A. He got immunity on <em>felony murder</em> by taking a lesser charge of burglary. […] And if someone dies during the commission, it’s <em>felony murder</em> regardless of who killed him. (TGW 1x03)</td>
<td>The Attorney is going to ask for a <em>guilty conviction</em> and 25 days at Cook County to use you as an example.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E dato che la guardia è stata uccisa durante un presunto furto, diventa un <em>omicidio</em>. […] Non abbiamo ottenuto la cauzione perché Brian ha fatto un patto con il Procuratore. Ha l’immunità sull’<em>omicidio</em> e si è preso un meno gravoso furto con scasso. […] E se qualcuno muore durante il furto è comunque <em>omicidio</em>, indipendentemente da chi l’abbia ucciso.</td>
<td>And since the guard was killed during an alleged theft, it becomes a <em>murder</em>. […] We didn’t get bail because Brian made a deal with the S.A. He has immunity on <em>murder</em> by taking a less heavy charge of burglary. […] And if someone dies during the theft, it’s <em>murder</em> anyway, regardless of who killed him.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 22

‘third strike rule’, which allows a harsher sentence for someone’s third criminal offence, she is likely to receive a harsher sentence, such as those given for felonies. The contrast between the DUI *misdemeanour* and a *felony conviction*, which is underlined in the ST (“The State’s Attorney is gonna want a *felony conviction*”) is neutralized in the TT. However, the FanSubbers partially express the gap between the defendant’s expectations and the lawyer’s prediction by underlining the *colpevolezza* (guilt) element of the conviction and enacting a compensation strategy concerning this aspect.

In the following excerpt the word ‘felony’ is not used as a category for criminal offences, but in the phrase ‘felony murder’, i.e. “a killing that occurs in the course of a dangerous felony, even an accidental death [that can] be charged against the felon as first-degree murder […] even if the felon is not the killer [my emphasis]” \(^{12}\) (Table 23).

Once again, the additional meaning of ‘felony’ seems to be neglected in favour of a translation which aims at a higher familiarity with the audience, i.e. by only using the word *omicidio* (murder), although the specific charge they are referring to is not a murder directly committed by the defendant (“If someone dies during the commission, it’s *felony murder* regardless of who killed him”) who, in actual fact, was only involved in a burglary. Despite its breach of reference (see Pedersen 2007: 33-34), the omission in the TT is effective and fulfils Levý’s (1967) ‘minimax’ rule in its first two occurrences, whereas in the last sentence the *omicidio* translation does leave room for a potential credibility and accountability gap in the Italian audience, who might be puzzled reading that someone can be accused of *omicidio/murder* although he did not kill a person. Potential translations avoiding this type of gap might have been:

1) the use of a similar/equivalent term or hypernym in Italian (cultural substitution by TC ECR), e.g. *concorso in omicidio* (involvement in homicide), or

2) a paraphrase or a creative addition, e.g. *omicidio commesso durante un altro reato* (murder while committing another crime), or *omicidio derivante da un altro reato* (murder deriving from another crime).

*’Fruit of the forbidden tree’*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
<th>Back translation into English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nice try Mr. Gardner, but there’s nothing here that rises to the level of ‘fruit of the forbidden tree’ so you’ll have to do better than that.</td>
<td>Bel tentativo, signor Gardner, ma non c’è niente qui che si innalzi al livello del “frutto proibito”, quindi dovrà fare di meglio.</td>
<td>Nice try, Mr. Gardner, but there’s nothing here that rises to the level of ‘forbidden fruit’, so you’ll have to do better.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[...]</td>
<td>[…]</td>
<td>[...]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Now Mr. Gardner, I’m finding new reason to reverse myself. I think you’ve made a very strong ‘fruit of the forbidden tree’ argument. If I can’t trust Shores, then I can’t trust the evidence that’s tied to him. (TGW 1x06)</td>
<td>Signor Gardner, ora ho un motivo per tornare sui miei passi. Penso che lei abbia trovato il suo “frutto proibito”. Se non posso fidarmi di Shores, non posso fidarmi delle prove a lui connesse.</td>
<td>Mr. Gardner, now I have a reason to go back on myself. I think you’ve found your ‘forbidden fruit’. If I can’t trust Shores, then I can’t trust the evidence connected to him.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 24

The ‘fruit of the poisonous/forbidden tree’ is a metaphor used in US legal theory to refer to evidence obtained illegally and that, as a consequence, cannot be used as exculpatory in a trial. It derives from the analogy between inadmissible/illegal evidence, seen as a ‘forbidden tree’, and the ‘fruits’ of this tree, i.e. all its possible uses.

implications and consequences, or between the illicit/unreliable source (the forbidden tree) and the evidence it provides (the poisonous fruits of the tree). In the example in Table 24 the judge rejects Will Gardner’s motion to exclude some evidence due to the fact that there is no reason to consider it ‘fruit of the forbidden tree’, since a connection to an illicit or unreliable source had not been demonstrated. When the lawyer manages to demonstrate that the source of the evidence (Mr. Shores) is unreliable, the judge upholds Will’s motion to exclude the evidence. The reference to the source of the evidence is lost in the Italian translation, where the fruit is considered as forbidden per se (frutto proibito) and not because it derives from a poisonous tree. When accepting Will’s request, the judge explains why he is now persuaded and even defines Will’s argument as ‘very strong’ because he cannot trust Shores. This helps explain why the evidence is a ‘forbidden fruit’, but does not convey the tree metaphor to the Italian audience at all.

Other occurrences of the tree metaphor, however, demonstrate that it is possible not to omit and neutralize it, without any creative effort by the translator: a literal translation is enough to convey the metaphoric expression to the target audience, especially if embedded within an explicative sentence, as in the following case:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yeah, but we got it with an illegally obtained text. It’s the fruit of the poisonous tree. We can’t use it. (TGW 1x17)</td>
<td>Sì, ma ce l’abbiamo grazie ad un messaggio ottenuto illegalmente. È il frutto dell’albero avvelenato. Non possiamo usarlo.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 25

Theft, burglary, trespass, breaking and entering

‘Theft’ is the generic term for all crimes in which a person intentionally takes the personal property of another without permission or consent and with the intent to convert it to the taker’s use. Burglary does not necessarily imply a theft: it is “the crime of entering a building with the intent to commit a crime”, which can also be, for instance, a murder and not an appropriation without consent.

Entering any building through force, without authorization, corresponds to the ‘breaking and entering’ crime. When someone enters in order to commit a crime, it is considered burglary. If there is no such intent, breaking and entering alone without permission or authority may be illegal trespass, which is a misdemeanor.

In general, in Italian translations a theft corresponds to a furto, as the following example shows:

---

13 In criminal law, legal theorists say that evidence discovered through unconstitutional means (such as a forced confession or illegal search and seizure) may not be used as evidence against a criminal defendant (http://www.nolo.com/dictionary/fruit-of-the-poisonous-tree-term.html).

14 Robbery (taking by force), burglary (taking after entering unlawfully), and embezzlement (stealing from an employer) are different forms of theft; http://www.nolo.com/dictionary/theft-term.html.


The asymmetry between the SC legal system and the TC legal system is evident in an episode in which all the terms above are mentioned while settlements between the opposing parties take place:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kid stole a chicken from Costco. Richardson agreed to a plea of simple theft, and supervised release. (TGW 1x10)</td>
<td>Ha rubato un pollo da Costco. Richardson accettò il patteggiamento a furto semplice e rilascio controllato.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 26**

The difference between ‘burglary’ and ‘theft’, similarly to the one between manslaughter and murder or between felony and misdemeanor, is likely to have no direct equivalent in other cultures. As mentioned above, a burglary does not necessarily entail a theft (an appropriation of someone else’s property), but only entering a building to commit any crime. The repetition of the word ‘burglary’ is essential in this scene because it underpins the lawyers’ logical reasoning and strategy. Therefore, it would have been advisable to translate it by using the same term twice; on the contrary, the Italian translation proposed a cultural substitution with explicitation, *furto con scasso* (theft and breaking) for the first occurrence of the term and the use of a hypernym *furto* for the second one, which also corresponds to a different crime. It is important to note that the person charged with burglary had not committed a theft, but is investigated for someone’s death after he and his friend Brian had wrongfully entered a house, therefore the Italian translation does not fully comply with the narrated events.

Towards the end of the episode, when evidence is shown that no burglary or theft had been committed and that the defendant was not responsible for the murder, the two opposing counsel are bargaining for lesser offences (Table 28).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original script</th>
<th>Italian FanSubs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>He got immunity on felony murder by taking a lesser charge of burglary and agreeing to testify against Kenny. So what we need to do is... Establish there was no burglary. (TGW 1x03)</td>
<td>Ha l’immunità sull’omicidio e si è preso un meno gravoso furto con scasso, per aver accettato di testimoniare contro Kenny. Quindi quello che dobbiamo fare è... Stabilire che non c’è stato alcun furto.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 27**

The difference between ‘burglary’ and ‘theft’, similarly to the one between manslaughter and murder or between felony and misdemeanor, is likely to have no direct equivalent in other cultures. As mentioned above, a burglary does not necessarily entail a theft (an appropriation of someone else’s property), but only entering a building to commit any crime. The repetition of the word ‘burglary’ is essential in this scene because it underpins the lawyers’ logical reasoning and strategy. Therefore, it would have been advisable to translate it by using the same term twice; on the contrary, the Italian translation proposed a cultural substitution with explicitation, *furto con scasso* (theft and breaking) for the first occurrence of the term and the use of a hypernym *furto* (theft) for the second one, which also corresponds to a different crime. It is important to note that the person charged with burglary had not committed a theft, but is investigated for someone’s death after he and his friend Brian had wrongfully entered a house, therefore the Italian translation does not fully comply with the narrated events.

Towards the end of the episode, when evidence is shown that no burglary or theft had been committed and that the defendant was not responsible for the murder, the two opposing counsel are bargaining for lesser offences (Table 28).

Once again, burglary is considered an equivalent of *furto*, though no reference is ever made in the narration and in the reconstruction of facts to any appropriation of someone else’s property. However, the action of entering someone’s house is somehow retained and expressed by the following translation of ‘breaking and entering’, where ‘*di domicilio*’ (of domicile, domestic) is added to *violazione* (violation/breaking, respecting the Italian CSR *violazione di domicilio*, similar to ‘housebreaking’) and therefore compensating the previous lack of specification. Finally, a less technical synonym of *violazione di domicilio* is employed to translate the lesser crime of ‘trespass’ (i.e. *scon-
As stated in the Introduction, this study has a mainly descriptive purpose and therefore does not aim to draw statistical results from the analysis of the corpus. However, it is among its aims to observe any trends or particular consistencies in the strategies adopted in FanSubs in the translation of legal Culture-Specific References, since FanSubs are the result of non-conventional translations carried out by heterogeneous teams of translators who, despite their differences, share the common purpose of giving accessibility to all those who want to enjoy the TV series.

This study also contributes to providing evidence of the translation strategies employed to cope with the ‘problem’ of Culture-Specific References and fill the gap between American and Italian cultures and the expertise gap between legal professionals and the non-expert audience watching them as a form of entertainment.

As regards the type of CSRs retrieved in legal dramas, it can be inferred that since they stage a wide variety of settings and communicative contexts, all of which are related to law but also to the actual enforcement of law in everyday life, they are also particularly variegated in the types of CSRs embedded. While the translation of pastimes, foods and drinks etc. is continuously dealt with in other audiovisual genres, it is not the same for CSRs connected to law, e.g. legal principles, types of courts and officers. The legal principles and procedures embedded in the Source Text should be translated efficiently, with particular attention to both keeping the accuracy and the referentiality of the original text and to keeping the audience familiar with the concepts expressed and the words used.

With the help of previous taxonomies deriving from similar studies on CSRs in AVT (Pedersen 2007; Ranzato 2013) it was possible to observe the use of the following strategies to solve the translation problems that FanSubbers are faced with:

1) loans for words with no similar equivalent in the TC, especially if they come from a non-English word (affidavit, voir dire);

2) calques, official equivalents and literal/direct translations of widely known institutions and semi-technical terms, which make sense and efficiently convey their mean-

17 I wish to thank one of the anonymous referees who suggested this.
ing in the TL if translated literally (pretrial, *pre-processo*; fruit of the forbidden tree, *frutto dell’albero proibito*; Supreme Court/High Court, *Corte Suprema*, *Corte Alta*);

3) generalizations and hypernyms (attorney-client privilege, *segreto professionale*; burglary, *furto*) or paraphrases for principles, concepts and procedures which do not have an exact equivalent, but can be easily associated to others in the TC, especially if these are widely known and familiar to the general audience;

4) explicitation, addition and compensation (burglary, *furto con scasso*) for terms which, having no equivalent in the TC, need to be explained by providing further information for the denouement of the plot;

5) elimination/omission for terms which do not have an equivalent in the TC but are considered as not being essential to understanding the plot.

The first two types of strategies reveal the translator’s intention to keep the reference to the ST as strong as possible (foreignizing approach), while the third and the fourth blatantly domesticate the specialized ST in favour of the target reader. Omissions can be considered domesticating on the one hand, since they prevent the audience from coming into contact with unfamiliar terms, but at the same time they operate ‘against’ the audience by subtracting pieces of information from the original text.

The most significant trend observed is towards substitution by means of TC references. These substitutions often hide an actual discrepancy between the original meaning and the meaning in the TC (as in *imputato* vs. *convenuto*) and even more frequently translate technical terms with non-technical ones (felony as *crimine*; closing statement as *arringa finale*), terms with different meanings (felony murder as *omicidio*; opening statement as *dichiarazione d’apertura*), or even neologisms. Most technical terms, in fact, are translated by means of *ad hoc* forms, which have become more and more standardized and enable an ‘automatized’ translation process, an aspect which allows a more time-efficient and effortless translation. ‘Standardized’ translations of legal CSRs in FanSubs represent a good compromise between domesticating and foreignizing, as they make it possible to retain their ST monoreferentiality and to convey it in the TT. At the same time, FanSubbers use terms which are familiar in the TC (although incorrect to some extent) or create terms which over time have become familiar to the target audience. The interconnection between the standardized forms observed in legal drama and FanSubs is rooted in the very nature of FanSubs and in the ‘minimax’ principle noted before: the FanSubbers’ intention to produce easily accessible and ready-to-download translations, in teams and in an incredibly short time, has led them to choose a strategy which allows them to translate as efficiently as possible with the minimum effort.

**References**


Baños Piñero R. 2005. La oralidad prefabricada en los textos audiovisuales: estudio descriptivo-


ONLINE HEALTH PROMOTION: THE CROSS-CULTURAL CONSTRUCTION OF BIOPEDAGOGICAL DISCOURSES OF CHILDHOOD OBESITY

Anna Franca Plastina
(University of Calabria, Italy)

Abstract
This paper investigates biopedagogical discourse, which instructs parents about healthy lifestyle choices, soliciting changes in their children to counter the 21st-century childhood obesity epidemic. Although biopedagogical discourse is now used in online health promotion as a more far-reaching intervention to fight the epidemic, it essentially draws on cultural schemas, or health-related knowledge which is socially shared by members of a same community. Accordingly, different cultural schemas may be invoked across health cultures for a more effective impact on parents. Cultural schemas therefore appear helpful in manipulating community-level discourses, driven by the ideology of regulating obesity in the childhood population and disciplining individual behaviours. They are thus useful analytical tools to investigate the linguistic features that instantiate biopedagogical discourses, especially where childhood obesity has become a major health issue. Based on these premises, the present study explores how biopedagogical discourse is mediated through the use of cultural schemas across US and Italian health cultures, currently affected by alarming rates of childhood obesity. The twofold aim is to investigate how cultural schemas contribute to organizing information and situating the meaning of childhood obesity cross-culturally, and to disclose possible distinctive discourse patterns. Modal verb types are analysed as indicators of potential discourse manipulation, which draws on different cultural schemas to shape these patterns, thus reflecting differences in the exertion of ‘biopower’. A comparative analysis of a collection of US and Italian web-based texts is conducted, guided by a cultural approach to CDA, and specifically by cultural schema theory. Accordingly, the cultural schemas of facts-and-concepts, context, role and emotion are used as four indicative types of cognitive constructs influencing US and Italian biopedagogical discourses to frame the cross-cultural analysis. Overall, the paper sheds light on diverse approaches to constructing biopedagogical meaning across two different health cultures, and on possible contending conceptualizations of health.

1. Introduction

The 1946 Preamble to the Constitution of the World Health Organization (WHO) defines health as “a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity”\(^1\). Traditional health discourses have, how-

\(^1\) Constitution of the World Health Organization: Principles (www.who.int/about/mission/en/).
ever, been mainly driven by the dominant biomedical approach which conceptualizes health only as the absence of disease or defect. As these discourses have been confined to the area of individual health education, promotional discourses have not thrived beyond these boundaries for quite a long time.

More recently, a new socio-environmental conceptualization of health has been advanced to offer a broader understanding of its meaning also as ‘social well-being’. This has been witnessed by the closer attention paid to ‘macrosocial determinants’ due to their strong impact on population health. These nonmedical determinants include “factors, such as culture, political systems, economics [...] that are beyond the individual [...]” (Galea and Putnam 2007: 9). As a result of this paradigm shift from a biomedical to a ‘social determinants’ approach, new global health policies and national initiatives\(^2\) have significantly contributed to reshaping the traditional roles of health promotion and education. Although health promotion has emerged out of the field of health education, current interventions are increasingly targeting the broader community level in order to promote changes which reduce population health risks. In this, health education has become “a primary instrumentality for achieving health promotion outcomes” (Huff et al. 2015: 5).

More importantly for present purposes, these changes have started to fuel new health discourses in the public arena for the sake of “enabling people to increase control over their health and its determinants, and thereby improve their health” (WHO 2006: 10). These discourses evolve primarily as constructive responses to priority health issues, while also representing effective opportunities for learning about healthy behaviours. They have thus been defined as “biopedagogical discourses” which “function to affect populations” (Harwood 2009: 22) by providing “information, advice, and instruction about bodies, psyches, health, and well-being, often moralizing or lecturing in tone” (Chandler and Rice 2013: 231). It is important to note that biopedagogical discourses do not, however, underestimate the value of epidemiological knowledge at the individual level, given that it helps “people to make individual informed choices about their health behaviours” (Laverack 2014: 82).

Within this frame, the present paper sets out to explore how biopedagogical discourses of childhood obesity are constructed cross-culturally. Currently, these discourses are “generated by escalating concerns over claims of global ‘obesity epidemic’ [and] are disseminated more widely through the web” (Wright 2009: 2). As such, these discourses also reflect the contemporary social practice of creating online health resources as a proactive response to the growing phenomenon of consumers seeking health information via the Internet (see Plastina 2012, 2015). In spite of their global reach, these discourses appear, however, to be significantly framed by the cultural contexts in which they operate (see MacLachlan 2000). This can essentially be assumed based on the fact that “there are no universal norms of health; [and thus] perceptions may vary across individuals and cultures” (Jensen and Allen 1993: 220). On these grounds, health discourses can therefore be seen to “select, foreground, and circulate specific cultural values” (Dutta 2015: 297).

Based on these premises, the current research attempts to make a contribution to

\(^2\) For example, the US initiative “Healthy People 2020” considers culture as a social determinant of health (www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/social-determinants-of-health).
the study of online health promotional discourse through a comparative analysis of US and Italian health cultures. The main aim is to investigate whether biopedagogical discourses of childhood obesity addressing parents are mediated through the use of different cultural schemas across these health cultures. To this end, a cross-cultural analysis of a collection of texts from US and Italian health websites may help disclose whether cultural schemas shape different linguistic patterns across the two cultures, given that schemas as cultural constructs, or “cognitive representations” are “socially shared” (van Dijk 1989: 165) by members of the same community. Different cultural schemas may thus be invoked by health experts to manipulate biopedagogical discourse for a more effective impact of their promotional initiatives. Hence, discourse manipulation here appears to be “[...] part of what health promotion and disease prevention is all about” (Zoller and Dutta 2008: 9). It is driven by the ideology of “biopower”, or “[...] a power that exerts a positive influence on life, that endeavours to administer, optimize, and multiply it, subjecting it to precise controls and comprehensive regulations” (Foucault 1998: 137). In other words, the manipulation of biopedagogical discourse of childhood obesity is governed by health experts’ “power-knowledge”, which is grounded in “the norm [...] that can be applied to both a body one wishes to discipline and a population one wishes to regularize” (Foucault 2003: 253). Hence, this kind of discourse manipulation is purposed to creating “both disciplinary effects and regulatory effects” (ibid.: 252) on parents, and thus contributes to building individual (disciplinary) and social (regulatory) preventive measures against the childhood obesity epidemic.

2. Materials and methodology

Online searches were performed in both English and Italian, using the key expressions “childhood obesity prevention and parents” and “prevenzione dell’obesità infantile e i genitori”. The top websites yielded were filtered for texts responding to the basic functional feature of biopedagogical discourse, namely the provision of scientific information, and of instructions and advice about childhood obesity prevention under the condition of directly addressing parents. Texts from five US and five Italian websites (Appendix 1) were found to match these distinguishing features, and were thus downloaded and used as the materials for the present study. The ten texts are made up of a total of 9,492 words and 12 pictures with the US collection amounting to 5,164 words (M=1,146 words; 4 pictures), and the Italian one counting 4,328 words (M=606 words; 8 pictures). The greater conciseness of the Italian written texts thus appears to be compensated by the larger number of images, which are twice as many as those used in the US collection. Although a multimodal analysis is beyond the purpose of the present study, it is worth mentioning that the visuals are connotated with different representational meanings across the two cultures. The Italian images commonly represent parents and their children engaging in the consumption of healthy Mediterranean foods, thus creating a more immediate educational impact; the US pictures, instead, depict lonely obese children distractedly devouring fast food during sedentary activities, thus stigmatizing common unhealthy lifestyle habits. Moreover, all sample texts are written in plain language to directly address parents. This reflects the pedagogical importance the expert authors ascribe to this style in improving laypeople’s health literacy (see Plastina 2016) and, more specifically, in facilitating parents’ understanding of obesity-related issues.
On the whole, the texts respond to the required features of biopedagogical discourse, and are thus suitably representative samples for cross-culture analysis. In addition, the two collections have a similar word length, and are therefore sufficiently balanced to ensure a systematic analysis. In an interdisciplinary perspective, the research adopted a cultural approach to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (see Gavriely-Nuri 2012), which was framed by cultural schema theory. Accordingly, Nishida’s (2005) cultural schemas of facts-and-concepts, context, role and emotion were introduced as four indicative types of cognitive constructs3, which were expected to shape US and Italian biopedagogical discourses differently. In detail, fact-and-concept schemas refer to “pieces of general information about facts”, context schemas contain information “about appropriate actions to take in order to achieve goals in the context […] and suggestions for reasonable problem-solving strategies”, role schemas refer to “sets of behaviors that are expected of people in particular social positions”, and emotion schemas “contain information about affect and evaluation” (ibid.: 405-407).

These schemas were first analysed to understand how they broadly affect the organization of the information conveyed by biopedagogical discourses. Content and frequency analyses were conducted on raw textual data according to the criteria of cultural schema type and frequency of occurrence. Linguistic elements associable with one of the four cultural schemas were classified accordingly, and their occurrences were computed. Comparisons between US and Italian data were then drawn to pinpoint possible cross-cultural differences in the use of schemas. As a second step, a closer analysis was carried out to investigate how “situated meaning” (Gee 2014: 53) of childhood obesity was constructed at the discourse level. Meaningful linguistic features reflecting the use of each cultural schema type were identified, and distinctive patterns of biopedagogical discourse and possible cross-cultural variations across the two health cultures were recorded. Based on these findings, modality was then considered as a potential tool of discourse manipulation reflecting the ideology of biopower as it presupposes “the presence of an individual subjectivity [the health expert] behind the printed text, who is qualified with the knowledge to pass judgement […] or assign responsibility [to parents]” (Fowler 1991: 64). The analysis specifically focused on the choices made of epistemic, dynamic and deontic modal verbs as indicators of discourse manipulation. Epistemic modals reflecting health experts’ opinions were expected to be used to manipulate propositional content influenced by social norms regulating childhood obesity (context schemas) or by individual discipline (parent role schemas), as well as by power-knowledge (expert role schemas), and evaluative information (emotion schemas); dynamic modals were seen as manipulating “events that are not actualized, […] but are merely potential” (Palmer 2001: 70) according to individual disciplinary norms of obesity prevention (parent role schemas) in order to encourage parents to accept responsibility for their own actions; deontic modals were expected to be used to manipulate “events that have not taken place” (ibid.: 70) by drawing on the authority of health experts (expert role schemas), and on reliable scientific information (fact-and-concept schemas) in the attempt to get parents to preventively act on their children.

3 The other four types included in Nishida’s cultural schema theory were not considered properly applicable to biopedagogical discourse.
3. Cultural schemas in biopedagogical discourses

3.1. The US schemas of obesity

Results from the content analysis recorded 254 tokens of cultural schemas, and frequency analysis showed that schema types were unevenly distributed across the five US texts. In particular, a major use of context schemas (42.3%) and fact-and-concept schemas (35.4%) was found. By contrast, a much lower frequency of role schemas (13.7%) and emotion schemas (8.6%) was recorded. These preliminary findings point to the general organization of biopedagogical discourses, which seems to be mainly shaped by instructional information “about appropriate actions to take in order to achieve goals in the context [...]” (context schemas), and by “pieces of general information about facts” on childhood obesity (fact-and-concept schemas) (Nishida 2005: 405). This further seems to anticipate that these discourses were only marginally embedded with information imposing specific behaviours expected of parents coping with obese children, and even less with evaluative information about parents. Findings on the frequency of occurrence (%) of single cultural schema types used in US texts are reported in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural schemas: types</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
<th>Mean frequency distribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fact-and-concept</td>
<td>90 (35.4%)</td>
<td>18 (37.98%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>35 (13.7%)</td>
<td>7 (13.62%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>107 (42.3%)</td>
<td>21.4 (39.36%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotion</td>
<td>22 (8.6%)</td>
<td>4.4 (9.04%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1. The use of US schemas: cultural types and frequency*

Results from the analysis of “situated meanings” of childhood obesity showed that different linguistic features were used to draw on cultural schemas. In particular, the category of action verbs was found to reflect the use of context schemas in all US texts with the highest frequency of occurrence recorded for the five verbs *choose, begin, show, help, give* (73.2%). Hence, the underlying ideological purpose of these verbs was to empower parents to take appropriate actions. By drawing on fact-and-concept schemas, four types of information were conveyed: social (e.g. *this epidemic is no longer just a problem for adults – childhood obesity is steadily on the rise, too*); nutritional (e.g. *your body gets all it needs from sugar naturally occurring in food – so anything added amounts to nothing but a lot of empty calories*); economic (e.g. *companies spend more money marketing sugary drinks to youth than they spend on any other food category*), and research (e.g. *below are some of the major findings from the Yale study*). However, the higher frequency of social facts (44.5%) indicates that a ‘social determinants’ approach was adopted to construe these discourse practices. This was further confirmed by the discourse organization of nutritional information (35.5%), which was not significantly entwined with research facts (8.8%), given their low frequency of occurrence. Furthermore, the choice of placing major emphasis on social factors was also evident from the scant economic information recorded (11.2%).

As the predominant type of fact-and-concept schema, social facts were more closely analysed for their situated meanings. Three main linguistic features were found to situate specific US social determinants of childhood obesity: qualifiers (e.g. *average, typical, quick,*
busy, safe), intensifiers (e.g. high, largest, more, on the rise), and temporal deixis (e.g. daily, today, less time, often, constant non-stop). The first feature pointed to US community lifestyle and environment, the second to advertising as a social determinant, while the third touched on the factor of ethnicity, as shown in the sample tokens in Table 2, where the linguistic features used to situate cultural meaning are highlighted in bold font.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social determinants</th>
<th>Linguistic tokens</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lifestyle & environment | - The average American consumes 50 gallons of soda and other sweetened beverages each year.  
- a typical 20-ounce soda ...  
- On average, kids between the ages of 6-11 drink about 15 ounces of soda a day.  
- the high consumption of sugar-sweetened drinks amongst kids is considered the largest contributor to childhood obesity.  
- these sweetened beverages have become the daily beverage choice.  
- if you add the hard candy sweet from a quick stop at the store...  
- Today, 1 out of 3 children and teens in the U.S. are overweight or obese.  
- Busy families are cooking less...  
- Kids spend less time actively playing outside, and more time watching TV, playing video games, and sitting at the computer.  
- The local YMCA, YWCA, or Boys’ and Girls’ Club are safe places for children to exercise and play. |
| Advertising | - Youth are often the main target of sugary drink ads  
- the constant non-stop advertisement geared towards them to drink these beverages  
- Teens hear 46% more radio ads for sugary beverages than adults do |
| Ethnicity | - African-American and Latino youth saw 80 to 90 percent more TV ads for sugary drinks compared to white youth.  
- Marketing for these beverages on Spanish-language TV has also been on the rise since 2008. |

Table 2. Situating the meaning of US social determinants of childhood obesity

On the other hand, all the instances related to role schemas addressed parents through the person pronoun You to directly solicit them to become role models. Positive qualifiers were therefore attributed to this behavioural outcome (e.g. you can have a great influence on your kid’s preferences; you need to be a good role model; you can set a great example). Finally, emotion schemas were mostly rendered through nominal phrases (6.7%), which were meant to arouse feelings of fear, reinforced by a disease-oriented approach to emotion (e.g. looming health hazards, alarming rate, cause of preventable death in America, the risk of future heart disease, at the highest risk). Very few instances of verbal phrases (1.9%) were found to convey concerns of social exclusion.
(e.g. other kids may tease and exclude them). Overall, these findings unfold the general pattern of US biopedagogical discourses summarized in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural schemas</th>
<th>Situated meanings</th>
<th>Main linguistic features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>empowering parents</td>
<td>action verbs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fact-and-concept</td>
<td>‘social determinants’ approach</td>
<td>qualifiers intensifiers temporal deixis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>parents as role models</td>
<td>personal pronoun You positive qualifiers of role modelling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotion</td>
<td>disease-oriented approach to fear</td>
<td>disease qualifiers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3. The pattern of US biopedagogical discourses

3.2. The Italian schemas of obesity

The 239 tokens identified in the Italian texts also covered all four types of cultural schemas with varying frequencies as shown in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural schemas: types</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
<th>Mean frequency distribution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fact-and-concept</td>
<td>103 (43.2%)</td>
<td>20.6 (41.62%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role</td>
<td>57 (23.8%)</td>
<td>11.4 (24.06%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>57 (23.8%)</td>
<td>11.4 (25.88%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotion</td>
<td>22 (9.2%)</td>
<td>4.4 (20.85%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. The use of Italian schemas: cultural types and frequency

These results first show that fact-and-concept schemas outweighed all other types (43.2%), and that role schemas were as relevant as context ones (23.8%), while emotion schemas lagged behind (9.2%). Significant differences were found in the four different types of information conveyed through fact-and-concept schemas: social (51.4%), research (24.3%), nutritional (24.3%) and economic (0%). Hence, while Italian discourses were slightly more structured by social facts compared to their US counterparts (respectively 51.4% and 44.5%), a noticeable difference was found in the use of research facts (Italian 24.3%; US 8.8%). This means that Italian discourses were imbued with more medical notions of obesity, and were thus also oriented by the biomedical approach. In this sense, nutritional facts were mostly embedded with medical references: e.g. in uno studio pubblicato sul Lancet, una rivista specializzata in Diabete e Endocrinologia, si ricorda che [...] una lattina di Coca-Cola contiene 139 calorie [A study published in Lancet, a specialized journal in Diabetes and Endocrinology, recalls that a can of coke contains 139 calories]. As for economic facts, no significant data were recorded.

At the discourse level, meanings of social facts were mostly rendered through the use of nouns and adjectives to situate geographical differences, technology and cultural diets as specific Italian social determinants of childhood obesity, as shown in Table 5.
The first two instances point to the social determinant of geographical differences in the spread of the phenomenon of childhood obesity. In the first example, the nouns ‘centre’ (centro) and ‘south’ (sud) generically point to higher percentages (percentuali... più alte) of obesity in these Italian areas; in the second, ‘north’ (nord) and ‘south’ (sud) discriminate between the social reasons behind the fact that children do not walk to school. Thus, they function as cultural pointers to “the lack of time” (la mancanza di tempo) in the hard-working northern regions, and to “the fear of the dangers” (la paura dei pericoli), also stereotypically alluding to potential violence in the southern regions. Examples (3) and (4), instead, introduce technological referents like ‘computers’ (pc), ‘mobile phone’ (cellulare), ‘sms’, and ‘internet’ (rete) as determinants of eating disorders. On the other hand, examples (5) and (6) use cultural nominal expressions, such as ‘American fast food’ (“fast-food”all’americana), ‘Mediterranean diet’ (dieta mediterranea), and junk food to denote dietary changes which shift towards US habits. The deictics ‘more often’ (sempre più spesso), ‘have now moved away from’ (si sono ormai allontanati dal) are further used as emphatic temporal markers of these unhealthy cultural changes.

As for context schemas, these relied on the use of implicit evaluative statements: e.g. i genitori lasciano bere e mangiare sostanze zuccherine e grasse liberamente ai propri figli [parents allow their children to freely drink and eat sugary and fatty stuff], as well as on explicit evaluative ones: e.g. la responsabilità è delle mamme che preparano sempre gli stessi soliti piatti [the mothers are to blame for always preparing the same usual dishes] for the common purpose of denigrating parents. Role schemas were also used to

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social determinants</th>
<th>Linguistic tokens</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Geographical differences | 1. *Le percentuali sono più alte nelle regioni del centro e del sud.*  
[Percentages are higher in the central and southern regions]  
2. *il motivo per cui i bambini non vanno a scuola a piedi al Nord è prevalentemente la mancanza di tempo, al Sud è soprattutto per la paura dei pericoli.*  
[the reason why children do not walk to school in the North is predominantly due to the lack of time, in the South it is mostly for fear of the dangers] |
| Technology | 3. *I ragazzi consumano i pasti stando davanti al pc e parlando al cellulare o mandando sms.*  
[Kids eat meals in front of their computers and while speaking on their mobile or text messaging]  
4. *la maggior parte resta sveglia fino a tardi a caccia di curiosità nella rete.*  
[Most stay up late surfing the Net for curious stuff] |
| Cultural diets | 5. *sempre più spesso si preparano piatti stile “fast-food” all’Americana*  
[American-style fast food meals are being prepared more and more often]  
6. *i bambini italiani si sono ormai allontanati dal modello della “dieta mediterranea” per consumare sempre più “junk food”*  
[Italian children have now moved away from the “Mediterranean diet” model to eat more and more “junk food”] |
address parents as responsible for their children’s obesity: e.g. *ma nella maggior parte dei casi il problema è legato all’alimentazione e dunque ai genitori* [but in most cases the problem is tied to eating and therefore to parents]; *un’altra causa determinante l’obesità infantile risiederebbe nel fatto che i genitori non considerano mai grassi i propri figli* [another determinant of childhood obesity lies in the fact that parents never consider their own children to be fat]. In a similar vein, emotion schemas were mostly referenced to overtly criticize parents’ wrong emotions (7.7%): e.g. *le ansie sbagliate dei genitori* [parents’ misplaced anxieties]; *la paura dei genitori che i loro figli non siano abbastanza nutriti* [parents’ fear that their children are not sufficiently well nourished]. Emotional reactions were also culturally related to more traditional Italian beliefs: e.g. *derivanti da un antico retaggio culturale secondo cui il bambino grasso è anche sano* [deriving from the old cultural idea according to which a fat child is also healthy]. Thus, they summoned warnings like *Sos mamme* [Sos mothers]; *gravi conseguenze* [serious consequences]; *considerevole rischio* [considerable risk].

On the whole, these findings point to the general pattern of Italian biopedagogical discourses summarized in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural schemas</th>
<th>Situated meanings</th>
<th>Main linguistic features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Context</strong></td>
<td>denigrating parents</td>
<td>explicit evaluative statements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fact-and-concept</strong></td>
<td>social determinants</td>
<td>geographical markers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>biomedical approach</td>
<td>technological referents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role</strong></td>
<td>parents as responsible for</td>
<td>blame language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emotion</strong></td>
<td>parent’s wrong emotions</td>
<td>negative emotional nouns</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 6. The pattern of Italian biopedagogical discourses*

The comparative analysis of US and Italian data confirms the present research hypothesis that cultural schemas framed biopedagogical discourses across the two health cultures with different functional purposes and varying frequencies of occurrence, as reported in Table 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural schemas</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>Italian</th>
<th>Frequency variation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Context</strong></td>
<td>empowering parents (42.3%)</td>
<td>denigrating parents (23.8%)</td>
<td>- 19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Facts-and-concepts</strong></td>
<td>&quot;social determinants&quot; approach (35.4%)</td>
<td>social determinants + biomedical approach (43.2%)</td>
<td>+ 7.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role</strong></td>
<td>parents as role models (13.7%)</td>
<td>parents as responsible for (23.8%)</td>
<td>+10.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emotion</strong></td>
<td>disease-oriented approach to fear (8.6%)</td>
<td>warning approach to parents’ wrong emotions (9.2%)</td>
<td>+0.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 7. Variations in the use of cultural schemas across Italian and US discourses*
These findings show that Italian discourses were less driven by instructional purposes than their US counterparts (context schemas: -19%), slightly more permeated also by biomedical facts (fact-and-concepts schemas: + 7.8%), and more overtly targeting parents (role: + 10.1%). Based on these variations, modal verbs were analysed to see whether their use differed cross-culturally as an indicator of discourse manipulation.

3.3. The cross-cultural use of modality for discourse manipulation

Results from the analysis revealed a much higher occurrence of modal verbs in US texts (N=162) than in Italian ones (N=64), which were also featured by explicit evaluative statements about parents (N=54 occurrences). This appears to be consistent with the variations reported in the cross-cultural use of schemas (see Table 7). More importantly, differences were found in the natural distribution of the most frequent verbs recorded in the US texts (CAN, MAY, WILL, SHOULD) and in the Italian ones (MUST, SHOULD, COULD), as shown in Table 8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modality</th>
<th>US texts</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence (N=162)</th>
<th>Italian texts</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence (N=64)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Epistemic</td>
<td>==</td>
<td>==</td>
<td>MUST</td>
<td><strong>43 (67.2%)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SHOULD</td>
<td>14 (21.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>COULD</td>
<td>7 (10.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deontic</td>
<td>CAN</td>
<td><strong>62 (38.3%)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAY</td>
<td>23 (14.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SHOULD</td>
<td>14 (8.6%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamic</td>
<td>CAN</td>
<td>18 (11.1%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WILL</td>
<td>23 (14.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8. Cross-cultural differences in the use of modality types

Divergences in the use of these modal verbs already point to cross-cultural differences in discourse manipulation, suggesting ideological inconsistencies. In detail, the predominant use of deontic modality (61.1%) in US texts suggests that health experts mainly manipulate discourse to direct parents to take preventive actions on their children, as shown in Examples (1) - (3):

(1) You can encourage them to lift weights.
(2) You may opt for products labeled “reduced sugar” or “no added sugar”.
(3) You should set rules that limit the amount of time your children spend on the computer.

Examples (1) and (2) show directives expressing deontic possibility, whereby the events are merely potential, and “the conditioning factors are external to the relevant individual” (Palmer 2001: 9), namely the parents, who also depend on their children’s willingness to change their behaviours; in example (3), instead, the directive expresses deontic necessity as a recommendation, but “the speaker admits the possibility that the...
event may not take place” (ibid.: 73). In all cases, the tentative physical and dietary directives draw upon context schemas of regulatory norms, whereby the actions (encourage, opt, set rules) are socially acceptable, as well as on role schemas acknowledging the authority of the health experts, and on fact-and-concept schemas of scientific knowledge to directly address the subject You (parents). Moreover, US texts were also featured by the dynamic modals CAN and WILL (25.3%) to indicate parents’ “ability and willingness” as “internal” factors (ibid.: 9), and thus create meanings of individual (disciplinary) prevention as shown in Examples (4) - (5):

(4) Parents can set a great example for the whole family by creating a healthy environment at home.
(5) If you stick with it, physical activity will become a part of your family’s routine.

The examples draw on role schemas to express “subject-internal” ability or volition in order to strategically stimulate parents to realize the proposed directives.

By contrast, epistemic modals were the only type used in Italian texts, thus denoting a completely different manipulative strategy. This was characterized by three different degrees of certainty of propositional content, namely a strong degree marked by the prevailing use of the present indicative form DEVONO (MUST) (67.2%) combined with direct evidential markers to strengthen the truth-value of content; a medium degree marked by a less frequent use of the present conditional DOVREBBERO (SHOULD) (21.9%), and a weak degree of certainty marked by a much less frequent use of the present conditional POTREBBERO (COULD) (10.9%), as shown in Examples (6) - (8):

(6) Soltanto 1 genitore su 3 sa che frutta e verdura devono essere consumate più volte al giorno [Only 1 out of 3 parents knows that fruit and vegetables must be consumed several times a day].
(7) I genitori dovrebbero educare i propri figli a un’alimentazione consapevole [Parents should train their children to be aware of what they’re eating].
(8) Le mamme potrebbero evitare loro stesse abitudini alimentari scorrette così da non crescere bambini in sovrappeso [mothers could themselves avoid wrong dietary habits so as not to raise overweight children].

Example (6) shows how the verb DEVONO (MUST) conveys epistemic necessity by drawing on health norms (context schema), as well as on the expert’s power-knowledge (role schemas) to make the strong negative judgement of parents’ poor health literacy (emotion schemas). The certainty of the claim is further strengthened by the co-occurrence of the evidential marker soltanto 1 genitore su 3 (only 1 out of 3 parents). While example (7) also appears to convey epistemic necessity, there is a weaker degree of certainty of propositional content expressed through DOVREBBERO (SHOULD), further marked by inferential evidentiality, i.e. we need to infer that Italian parents do not train their children properly, and to interpret the implicit negative judgement (emotion schemas) based on cultural facts (context schemas). Example (8), instead, indicates epistemic possibility based on general cultural knowledge (context schemas), whereby the expert shows lack of confidence in the proposition as it is not justified by observational evidentiality as in (6), or by inferential evidentiality as in (7). Hence, the truth-value of the propositional content manipulated through the modal
POTREBBERO (COULD) appears to be purely subjective, and designed to express the negative judgement of mothers (parent role schemas), thus using power-knowledge to exert social control (expert role schemas).

Moreover, Italian discourses were further characterized by explicit evaluative statements, as shown in examples (9) and (10):

(9) Altro errore comunissimo è non abituarli a una buona e sana prima colazione, che consente loro di fare il pieno di energia per la giornata [another common mistake is not getting them used to having a good and healthy breakfast, which allows them a full intake of energy for the day].

(10) le abitudini alimentari di noi occidentali proprio non vanno, e a farne le spese, spesso, sono proprio i più piccoli [our Western food habits are very wrong, and often those who pay for it are the little ones].

In both instances health experts act as knowledgeable authorities in the field as shown in the propositions “a full intake of energy for the day” and “our Western food habits”, respectively grounded in biomedical and sociocultural facts. These then allow the writers to position their epistemic stance, which acts as both a subjective and intersubjective manipulative device. In example (9), subjective linguistic manipulation is accomplished through the negative evaluative expressions “another common mistake” and “not getting them used to having”. This person-oriented manipulative device is deliberately deployed to construct a negative intersubjective image of parents, allowing the writer to fully claim his knowledgeable authority. In example (10), instead, the expression “our Western food habits are very wrong” is loaded with subjective negative evaluation, which favours the use of a society-oriented manipulative technique in order to construct a negative image of the Western community as a whole. In turn, this allows the writer to position her evaluative stance of community blame, which is justified by the repercussions on children as passive agents of obesity.

On the whole, US biopedagogical discourses were found to rely on syntactic manipulation through deontic modality to promote regulatory healthy actions, and through dynamic modality to encourage disciplinary ones at home, thus exerting modern biopower for instructional purposes. Italian discourses, instead, used syntactic manipulation through epistemic modality together with lexico-semantic manipulation rendered by evaluative statements to claim power-knowledge, and thus exert traditional biopower in the form of social control (see Foucault 2003). These features denote how health was promoted from different cultural angles. In US discourses, parents were considered as active participants in fighting childhood obesity, and were thus empowered to take action through the proposed role-model approach; in Italian discourses, instead, parents were considered as passive participants who were stigmatized through a victim-blaming approach to health education, whereby they were held responsible for their children’s dietary behaviours. In other words, Italian biopedagogical discourses were oriented by the “behavioural change model”, which promotes a more biomedical view of health, and is further connoted with victim blaming and with underlying assumptions of “healthism” (see Crawford 1980) focusing on individual responsibility; on the other hand, US discourses were influenced by the “collective action model”, which requires people (parents) to acquire the knowledge and skills necessary for health changes, and to achieve healthy outcomes both individually and collectively.
4. Concluding remarks

The present study has explored online biopedagogical discourses of childhood obesity through a comparative analysis across US and Italian health cultures. It has investigated how the four main cultural schemas of fact-and-concepts, context, role and emotion play a key role in shaping these discourses also for manipulative purposes. These cognitive constructs have been taken as potential indicators of different cultural choices expressed through a range of discourse instantiations, which were analysed in terms of variation and frequency of occurrence. Qualitative and quantitative findings highlighted a recurring use of action verbs, qualifiers, intensifiers, temporal deixis, the You pronoun and nominal phrases to express US cultural schemas, whereas Italian ones were rendered through the frequent use of explicit evaluative statements, geographical markers, technological referents, temporal deixis, research/medical references, negative emotional nouns and blame language. The analysis has further moved beyond these discursive features as situated meanings of cultural schemas to consider the health promotional discourses in which they occurred. At this broader level, the investigation has shown that both Italian and US discourses were framed by manipulative strategies which consistently reflected the underlying cultural schemas selected. A combination of syntactic manipulation in the form of epistemic modality and lexico-semantic manipulation marked by evaluative statements was predominantly used in Italian discourses to stigmatize parents, and thus promote behavioural changes; syntactic manipulation by means of deontic and dynamic modalities was, instead, employed in US discourses to empower parents and promote collective action. These cross-cultural variations thus reveal contending conceptualizations of health as individual responsibility versus collective action. The different use of discourse manipulation is oriented by the opposing “behavioural change” and “collective action” models, and thus by different approaches to promoting health. Ultimately, this means that discourses of health empowerment will probably resonate more positively with parents. Conversely, those stigmatizing and blaming parents are more likely to have a negative promotional impact leading to their alienation which, in turn, may aggravate their children’s medical conditions.

References


Appendix 1 - Health-related websites on childhood obesity

US Websites
1. Parents take charge
https://www.parentcoachplan.com/obese.php
2. Helping Your Child Reach and Maintain a Healthy Weight
3. Sipping on Sugar
http://www.nourishinteractive.com/healthy-living/free-nutrition-articles/235-rethink-your-drink
4. Targeting children with sugary drinks
http://kohlshealthyfamilyfun.org/
5. Let’s move
http://www.letsmove.gov/parents

Italian Websites
1. Bambini e genitori a tavola
http://www.bambiniincucina.it/blog/106-bambini-e-genitori-a-tavola
2. Sos mamme: come combattere l’obesità infantile, un fenomeno in crescita
3. Obesità infantile: i consigli per i genitori
http://www.pianetamamma.it/il-bambino/malattie/obesita-infantile-i-consigli-per-i-genitori.html
4. Mangiare Sano dai 2 ai 18 anni
5. Io e il mio bambino
1. Aims of the paper

The word-formation process of compounding with neo-classical combining forms (CFs) is normally treated in English as a separate phenomenon with its own peculiar features, differing from standard composition and affixation in many ways. Neo-classical CFs, such as multi- in multitasking and micro- in microblog, are an interesting area of vocabulary, especially when it is considered from an interlinguistic perspective, as they constitute a common lexical stock which has contributed to the creation of technical and scientific vocabularies of most European languages for several centuries (Pulci-
ni et al. 2012). Since the 20th century, because of the leadership of Anglophone countries in scientific and technological progress and dissemination, specialized terminologies have also assimilated many terms from the English language. This borrowing process has been facilitated by the presence of neo-classical components in their morphological structure, which is shared with Latin-based languages.

In this paper we investigate initial CFs belonging to English loanwords integrated into Italian and recorded in the latest edition of the Italian general dictionary Zingarelli 2017 (2016), henceforth ZING. The aim is to identify the CFs that feature in Anglicisms, either as English/Italian homographs (e.g. video- as in videotape), Anglicized forms resisting formal adaptation to Italian (e.g. photo- as in photofinish) or otherwise adapted (foto-) and analyse their characteristics. The compounds containing neo-classical CFs are further investigated in terms of Italian equivalents, if any, usage fields, and semantic profile. Given that formal similarity of the neo-classical elements does not necessarily give rise to semantic transparency of Anglicisms, we will consider the coexistence of competing calques in Italian (e.g. videocassette from videotape). The morphological structure of these compounds is examined, with their characteristic modifier+head pattern, which is in conflict with the typical, but not exclusive, head+modifier sequence of compounds in Italian, but in line with composition with neo-classical elements. The increase of right-headed (and coordinate) compounds in the Italian language is supposed to have been boosted by the influence of foreign languages, especially French and English (Iacobini 2015). On the other hand, we will also try to show that, in spite of the strong input of Anglicisms in Italian and the productivity of neo-classical combining forms in the Italian language, the number of Anglicisms made up of ‘neo-classical CF+English word’ in Italian is relatively small. This may be explained by the fact that for this type of compound, familiarity with the classical element is more conducive to composition with domestic elements rather than to borrowing.

In Section 2 a definition of neo-classical CFs is provided, followed by a discussion of the specific features of these lexical items. In Section 3 some historical information about neo-classical CFs in Italian and in English is presented. In Sections 4 and 5 our lexicographic data will be illustrated and discussed. Some concluding remarks will sum up the main points of this study and confirm the preliminary hypothesis here formulated.

2. Neo-classical CFs and types of compounds

Neo-classical CFs are lexical items of Latin and Greek etymology, used to create compound terms in technical and scientific domains. Linguists regard this phenomenon as a form of interlinguistic convergence which, over the centuries, has produced a stock of terms with a very similar form and identical meaning across historically related and unrelated languages, such as biology in English, biologie in French, biologia in Spanish, biologia in Italian, Biologie in German, биология (biologiya) in Russian, and so on (from Greek βίος ‘life’ and -λογία ‘the name of science’), and microphone in English.

The reason why this medium-size general dictionary of Italian has been chosen is that a new edition is issued every year. This makes it particularly useful for the study of present-day vocabulary and neologisms.
microphone in French, micrófono in Spanish, microfono in Italian, Mikrofon in German, микрофон (mikrofon) in Russian, and so on, which are made up of the Greek elements μικρός ‘small’ and φωνή ‘voice, sound’. For this reason, these terms are also referred to as ‘internationalisms’ (Petralli 1992; Iacobini 2004). In the formation of modern vocabulary, especially since the 20th century, neo-classical compounds have greatly contributed to the designation and categorization of concepts and objects in science and technology, but have also spread beyond specialized vocabulary to denote familiar objects in the general language (e.g. telephone, photograph).

With reference to the English morphological system, Bauer (1988: 248) argues that neo-classical compounds represent a rather unusual type, because they are “words formed in the modern European languages from elements of the classical languages, in such a way that there is no native root involved”. Yet, because English is the lingua franca of science and technology worldwide and a large number of neo-classical compounds have been formed in modern times (hence, neo-classical), this language is generally held responsible for the input of neo-classical compounds as well as other forms of compound coinages which involve the combination of a CF with a common word. Indeed, this is another type of compounding, which is widespread in many European languages too.

Focusing now on the latter type of compounds, which involves the union of an initial CF with an English root or word, we can add that they usually form ‘endocentric’ compounds, where the left-hand element functions as modifier of the right-hand element, which is the head. In other words, endocentric compounds as a whole are hyponyms of the main or head element (Bauer 1988). Thus, the word ecosystem designates a system of living organisms and their environment (from Greek οἶκος ‘house, dwelling place, habitation’) 3. By the same token, a megastore is ‘a very large store or shop’. ‘Exocentric’ compounds are also possible, when the meaning of the compound is not directly associated to the meaning of each single element. For instance, a photoflood is neither a photo nor a flood, but ‘a highly incandescent tungsten lamp used as an artificial light source for indoor photography, television, etc.’ (www.collinsdictionary.com).

Compounds containing neo-classical CFs prototypically designate something in a specialized domain, e.g. multitasking means ‘1. (computing) the execution of various diverse tasks simultaneously’, but can be extended to non-specialized contexts, as in ‘2. the carrying out of two or more tasks at the same time by one person’ (www.collinsdictionary.com). Thus, nowadays not only do the hard sciences develop specialized terminology taking advantage of neo-classical elements, but a large amount of vocabulary referring to soft sciences and everyday vocabulary is built in the same way, e.g. sport (hydrospinning), entertainment (videogame), cinema (biopic), music (videoclip), politics (bipartisan).

Although this category is not homogeneous, CFs display characteristics that make them closer to free morphemes rather than to bound morphemes. Some of them originate from the abbreviation of longer words to create new ones, like tele- originating

2 In ancient Greek -φωνος (-phonos) was already used as a final combining form as in βαρβαρόφωνος (barbaróphonos), i.e. speaking roughly or speaking a foreign language.

3 In ancient Greek οἶκος (oikos-) was already used as a combining form, as in οἰκόσιτος (oikósitos), i.e. eating at home.
from the abbreviation of television and then generating new items like teleprompter, teletext, teleplay, telegenic and teleshopping, and, at the same time, from the abbreviation of telephone, prompting new items like telemarketing, teletex, and telesales. This shortening process does in fact generate homonymic pairs of primary elements or etonyms, in this case the Greek tele- ‘afar, far off’. For this reason, they are considered ‘second generation’ CFs (Iacobini 2004) and regarded as an open category of lexis, contrary to that of prefixes.

In his analysis of the differences between prefixes and initial CFs for lexicographic purposes, Prćić (2005) explains that both prefixes and initial CFs are separable elements having an identifiable form, content and function. However, while prefixes can only be attached to free-standing bases, initial CFs can combine with both free-standing bases and with other final CFs. For example, the prefix re- can be attached to the free base play to form the word replay, the initial CF geo- can be attached to the free base chemistry to form the word geochemistry and the initial CF steno- to the final CF -graphy to form the word stenography, a true neo-classical compound. Although the boundary between prefix and CFs is sometimes not so clear-cut, CFs are more word-like, as noted above, that is, in particular contexts they may be used as independent words, e.g. mini, maxi, or become fully-fledged invariable common nouns (e.g. video, photo, porno, turbo). The formal distinction between affixes and CFs is crucial for differentiating between derivation and composition (or compounding), which are separate word-formation processes. Bauer (1983) states that CFs can be considered affixes because they can be attached to lexemes just like any other affix, but, as already pointed out, they can be attached to other CFs, making up a word with no root or base (e.g. bio+logy). This is not possible for prefixes, even to elements which, because of their lexical value, look like initial CFs such as anti- super- or extra-. Initial CFs usually end in a vowel, <o> in particular for Greek-derived forms and <i> for Latin-derived ones, but not exclusively.

Fixing boundaries for the category of CFs is not a simple matter, especially for Italian, a language entirely rooted in classical vocabulary (Tekavčić 1980). According to Iacobini (2015: 1661), in Italian “Latin plays a dual role, constituting both the source of the native lexicon and the main source of loanwords and calques, which were absorbed into Italian in the modern age from Latin texts as well as through the mediation of other languages (mainly French and English).” Furthermore, CFs possess a domestic appearance to Italian native speakers so that words like multiplayer could be classified as a hybrid loanword, containing the Italian element multi- and the English root player, if all the other cultural and social components involved in the borrowing process did not lead us to consider the word multiplayer as an English import word or Anglicism.

In his treatment of neo-classical CFs in Italian, Iacobini (2004) examines the features which differentiate CFs from affixes and CFs from lexemes. Although he does

---

4 On the productivity of tele- in Italian, see Dardano (2009: 210-211) and Iacobini (2004: 74).
6 Iacobini (2015) explains that non-adapted compounds containing a lexeme that English borrowed from Latin are to be classified as Anglolatinisms. Their adoption is favoured by the phenomenon of interlingual identification, leading to greater acceptance of these loanwords.
7 In Italian CFs are referred to in many ways by different authors: ‘elementi formativi’ (formative
not consider the semantic component as a decisive one, he points out that CFs express denotational meaning (e.g. \textit{bio-} = ‘life’) which adds to the overall lexical meaning of the compound. This possibility is very limited in prefixes, whose role is generally to express categories and relations. As confirmation of this distinction, we may reflect on the role of the prefix \textit{super-} (‘surpassing others’) and the CF \textit{porno-} in \textit{superstar} and \textit{pornostar}⁸: a \textit{superstar} is ‘a star or celebrity that is more famous than the others’ (relational reference), a \textit{pornostar} is ‘a star or celebrity that is famous for performing in pornographic films’ (denotational reference). In sum, unlike affixes (prefixes and suffixes), CFs seem to possess ‘full’ lexical meaning because in the classical languages they were independent words (D’Achille 2003: 148). As stated above, this distinction remains controversial, especially if we shift our attention from the etymological sphere to the much more variable area of language use and lexical competence.⁹ The case of \textit{super-} is, in this respect, emblematic, in that it derives from Latin \textit{super} ‘above’ (invariable part of speech, adverb or preposition)¹⁰, and today is included in the category of CFs (Prandi and De Santis 2011: 489), but generally labelled as a prefix by most Italian dictionaries (DELI, GDU, ZING)¹¹. Thus, also in the lexicographic domain, we find the peculiar opposition between \textit{supermarket}, derived from \textit{market} and the prefix \textit{super-}, and \textit{minimarket}, a compound of \textit{market} and the CF \textit{mini}.¹²

3. Initial combining forms in Italian and in English: ‘divided by the same etymons’

Observing the vocabularies of European languages, the Latin and Greek elements deriving from a common classical historical background are quite evident. Most European languages expanded their vocabulary through word-building from classical elements already during the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, but more intensely from the 18th century. As Minkova and Stockwell (2009: 48) point out: “The great intellectual movement of reinvention and interpretation of the classical models began in Italy during the early Middle Ages, spread in Europe, and reached England during the fifteenth century”. In English the enrichment of its vocabulary intensified in the Early Modern period (1476-1776), expanding at the astonishing rate of 4,500 new words for elements), ‘\textit{prefissoidesi/suffissoidesi}’ (prefixoid/suffixoid), ‘\textit{confissi}’ (Iacobini 2004: 70-71), ‘\textit{quasi-prefissi}’ (quasi-prefixes) (Tesi 2005: 235) and ‘\textit{semiparole}’ (semi-words) (D’Achille 2003: 148; Tesi 2005: 235).

⁸ \textit{Pornostar} is actually an Italian creation from the English \textit{porn star} or \textit{porn/pornographic actress or actor}.

⁹ According to Dardano (2009: 152), the sociolinguistic criterion of ‘continuum’ must necessarily be taken into account; in fact, prefixes like \textit{hyper-}, \textit{macro-}, \textit{mega-}, \textit{multi-}, etc. should be considered as prefixes because they are commonly familiar to speakers, whereas elements only known by limited groups of users, like \textit{allo-}, \textit{endo-}, \textit{paleo-}, \textit{pseudo-}, etc. may or may not be classified as prefixes. Also Serianni (1988: 534) adds a word of caution, stating that elements like \textit{neo-}, \textit{pan-} and \textit{pseudo-} may be treated as prefixes or CFs by different authors.

¹⁰ Extensively examined by Migliorini (1941 and 1963: 61-98) and also discussed by Klajn (1972: 167) with reference to the relationship between English and Italian.

¹¹ DELI, see Cortelazzo and Zolli (1999); GDU, see De Mauro (2007 [1999]).

¹² In turn, the origin of \textit{mini-} is an issue of debate. According to GDU, “dall’ingl. \textit{mini-}, tratto dal lat. \textit{minimum}, superl. di \textit{parvus} ‘piccolo’, con influsso di \textit{miniature} ‘miniatura’” (tr. from Engl. \textit{mini-}, from Latin \textit{minimum}, superlative form of \textit{parvus} ‘small’, influenced by ‘miniature’). Also the Italian etymological dictionary DELI favours the hypothesis of an English origin of \textit{mini-}.
each decade between 1500 and 1700, two thirds of which were derivatives and one third straight borrowings, mostly from Latin, the dominant source of borrowed lexis, and French (Carstairs-McCarthy 2002; Plag 2003; Hogg and Denison 2006; Minkova and Stockwell 2009). The explosion of English vocabulary gave rise to strong competition between native and non-native word formation patterns; in morphology the gradual decline of Old English prefixes and the almost complete loss of verbal ones cleared the way for massive borrowing from Latin and French.

The great intellectual re-birth of the Renaissance (where re- stands for ‘again’ and the Latin root nasc- means ‘be born’), along with the rediscovery and appreciation of classical works in many areas of knowledge, triggered such a word-building process affecting a wide range of fields, from the humanities to science. In this period, education was mainly based on proficiency in Latin and Greek, and most scholarly activity and academic writing was conducted through the medium of the Latin language. The 16th-century ‘inkhorn debate’ marks a historical period in which much criticism was addressed against the exaggerated influx of Latinate vocabulary, or ‘hard words’, that people without a classical education would not be able to use or understand. Yet, the internationalization of English through borrowing from classical and Romance sources was unstoppable, so that “[a]s a result, the Modern English vocabulary is less Germanic than foreign, at least as far as the lexical types go” (Hogg and Denison 2006: 270). The 18th-century industrial revolution and its technical and scientific outcomes provided a further stimulus for the creation of specialist terminology. Scientists of the 18th and 19th centuries like Carl Linnaeus and Antoine Lavoisier, who introduced taxonomies and classificatory systems in botany, physics, and chemistry, introduced many terms to denote existing or possible entities exploiting word-formation mechanisms typical of classical languages, especially Greek, consolidating the modifier+head pattern (e.g. gastroenterology= ‘the science dealing with the pathology of stomach and intestines’).

Compounds with CFs are therefore mostly modern coinages, sometimes even arbitrary ones with respect to the original classical elements. In Italian they represent loanwords from French, English and German, the so-called ‘Euro-Greek’ or ‘Euro-Latin’ words’ (Dardano 2009: 206). In the past, starting from Migliorini (1963: 19-60), followed later by Tekavčić (1980: III 15), scholars tended to distinguish this category from derivation and composition with domestic elements.

From a historical and linguistic perspective, studied by Tekavčić (1980: III 13-165), Rohlfs (1966-1969: §§ 991-1000) and Tesi (2005: 235-238), the quantitative data provided by GDU on the distribution

---

13 Serianni (1988: 561) mentions the example of macroscopico (macroscopic), which presupposes the meaning ‘big’ in the Greek word makrós ‘long’.

14 Also D’Achille (2003: 150) states that composition with neo-classical elements began first of all in the language of science, with the scope of creating new referents. Thus, Latin and Greek vocabulary has provided a rich and inexhaustible lexical reservoir from which to draw. The new words made up of neo-classical elements, often created in languages other than Italian, have soon become ‘European’, typical of international educated use. Prandi and De Santis (2011: 491) explain that some compounds containing CFs have come to us directly from Greek, such as geography, economy, philosophy, philology, archeology, philanthropy, etc. Most of them are words coined in recent times by means of Greek roots to designate concepts that were totally unknown to the Greek, like the telephone or geriatrics. These words belong to the international lexis of science and technology.

15 Mentioning the numerous compounds created from Latin and Greek roots in § 995.
across the centuries of compounds indicate an exponential growth between the 19th and 20th centuries (about 34,000 out of a total of 35,368). The contribution of CFs, either combined together (e.g. photography, cardiology, homophobia) or joined to a common word (e.g. electroshock) is substantial. The former, based on the model of 18th century scientific terminology, which was increasing at the major European universities in Holland, Germany, France and Great Britain, is largely confined to specialized discourse, with a limited impact on common language use (Tesi 2005: 235); the latter, which is constantly growing, has proved to be able to impact significantly beyond the specialized domain (Dardano et al. 2008).

This productivity has also given rise to one of the most important phenomena of readjustment in Italian lexical morphology, that is, the increase in invariable nouns (D’Achille 2005; Pulcini and Scarpino 2017). Beside the 16th-century input of a few feminine Greek items ending in -i such as metamorfosi, parafrasi, ipotesi, crisi (metamorphosis, paraphrase, hypothesis, crisis), a substantial increase took place between the 19th and the 20th centuries by virtue of the constant and massive import of foreign words, to which the short forms of several neologisms were added (fotografia → foto, radiotrasmittente → radio, automobile → auto, [impianto] stereofonico → stereo, [biglietto] europeo → euro, etc.) (Tesi 2005: 237). Such short forms, as mentioned above, are homonymous with their primary constituent elements.

The close connection between neo-classical compounds and neologisms also appears in the order of the constituents, which shows a marked preference for the modifier+head pattern, instead of the reverse Romance sequence. This is in line with the classical model but also reflects the order of similar types of compounding in modern Germanic languages with left-hand modification (Tesi 2005: 235). In other words, in Italian endocentric compounds generally follow the head+modifier pattern, otherwise referred to as “Romance order”. Thus, in the compound fine settimana (weekend) the hyperonymic relation between the two elements assigns the head function to the left-hand element fine (end) and the modifier function to the right-hand one settimana (week). However, Latin-derived formations display a reversed order: chemioterapia (chemotherapy), for example, has the same modifier+head pattern that was noted above for the word geochemistry. In conclusion, Italian accepts both patterns. As noted by several scholars (e.g. Bisetto 2004; Iacobini 2015) the influence of English on the word-formation processes of the Italian language has given rise to an increase of modifier+head formations not only for regular compounds but also for formations containing initial CFs, such as ciberspazio (from cyberspace). According to Bisetto (2004: 62), this structural change is

As an anticipation of this, the accomplished scholar Anton Maria Salvini (1653-1729), commenting on the fact that the Greek word telescopio (telescope) is preferred to other Italian equivalents (cannone, occhiale, cannocchiale), stated: “questo è uno dei singolari pregi della lingua greca di somministrare le voci a qualunque invenzione, o nuova cosa, che sarà mai per trovarsi nella lunghezza dei secoli avvenire” [English tr.: “this is one of the peculiar merits of the Greek language, to provide terms for any invention or new thing that will continue to emerge in the centuries to come] (quoted in Tesi 2005: 77-78).

Serianni (1988: 562) highlights two characteristics of classical compounds in medical terminology: a) they can combine several components by means of a process that is extremely rare in other domains (epatolienografia, in Engl. hepatoliengraphy ‘radiographic visualization of the liver and spleen’, from ancient Greek ἱππατο- liver, Latin lien spleen, Greek -γραφία graphic representation); b) they display the modifier+head sequence not only in compound containing Greek or Latin elements [...] but also in English-induced compounds.
not new and has been deemed possible owing to the fact that Italian has words of classical origin which display the same pattern.

4. Analysis of Anglicisms with combining forms

In order to conduct this study, entry words labelled as ‘vc. ingl.’ (English word) have been searched for in ZING, obtaining 2,761 headwords. Of these, 76 are made up of a CF+English element (2.7%) and have been considered for this analysis. The CFs are the following 19 items, in frequency order: multi-, video-, hydro-, micro-, auto-, tele-, bio-, mega-, photo-, bi-, mini-, porno-, cyber-, eco-, euro-, geo-, mono-, ortho-, techno-.\(^\text{18}\) The loanwords containing these CFs are listed in the Appendix\(^\text{18}\).

Considering the age of borrowing, most items were borrowed between the 1980s and 2011, in particular 38.1% in the 1980s and 32.9% in the 1990s; 18.4% are dated before 1980 and the oldest is Monotype\(^\text{®}\) (1904)\(^\text{20}\); 10.6% were borrowed between 2000 and 2011, and the newest is hydrofracking (2011)\(^\text{21}\).

4.1. Productivity

Our data shows only 19 different types of CFs listed above and presented in Table 1. Note that also the Italian forms have been considered, when available (idro-/hydro-, foto-/photo-, ciber-/cyber-, orto-/ortho-), to check productivity in both forms. Overall, the number of CFs featuring in Anglicisms and recorded by ZING appears to be quite small (below 1%) with respect to the total number of CFs (initial and final) both in English and in Italian, which amounts to approximately 2,272 in English (OED) and 2,635 in Italian (GDU). The two most productive ones are multi- and video-, forming respectively 12 and 11 compounds made up of CF+English word and assimilated in Italian.

The figures shown in Table 1 are to be read as follows: the shaded columns indicate the most meaningful raw data. The first shaded column on the left shows the number of compounds containing the listed CF in ZING. For example, multi- has 89 entries. The second shaded column from the left indicates the number of compounds containing an English-derived element, 15 out of 89 in the case of multi-. The figures in the next unshaded column indicates the proportion between the two (16.85%), that is, the incidence of English borrowings out of the total number of entries containing the same CF. The central shaded column gives the number of non-adapted English-derived compounds (the ones that are listed in the Appendix), which for multi- is 12 (13.48% of all recorded compounds, 80.00% of English-derived compounds). Finally, the right-hand

\(^{18}\) The native English prefixes present in ZING are considerably fewer (3 types): over-, (12), overbook, overboost, overcoat, overdesign, overdose, overdrive, overfishing, overflow, overlay, overnight, overruling, oversize; up- (5) update, upgrade, upload, up-to-date, upwelling; under- (4) underground, underscore, understate, underwear.

\(^{19}\) Frenguelli (2005: 160) adds that 19 CFs listed in De Mauro’s dictionary (2007 [1999]) are of English origin, although only eight of them are exclusively from English and unrelated to Latin or Greek. These are: -cettivo, -cettore, cyber-, -gate, malo-, -mid-, -orama, stat-.

\(^{20}\) Monotype\(^\text{®}\): trademark ‘any of various typesetting systems; type produced by such a system’. (www.collinsdictionary.com).

\(^{21}\) Hydrofracking: ‘a method of mining in which cracks are created in a type of rock called shale in order to obtain gas, oil, or other substances that are inside it’. (www.macmillandictionary.com).
shaded columns shows the number of English-derived adapted compounds (3 items: *multimodale*, *multipletto* and *multivisione*, from English *multimodal*, *multiplet* and *multivision*), followed, in the last two columns on the right, by the proportion with respect to the total number of recorded compounds in ZING (3.37%) and of the English-derived compounds (20%). According to the OED, the etymon of **multi**- is “Latin *multus*, with the sense ‘more than one, several, many’”. Most of the items found in this

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>multi</strong>-</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16.85</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>video</strong>-</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>17.65</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>hydro</strong>-</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>idro</strong>-</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>micro</strong>-</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.08</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>bio</strong>-</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11.67</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>porno</strong>-</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>auto</strong>-</td>
<td>292</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>mega</strong>-</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>mini</strong>-</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>photo</strong>-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>fotot</strong>-</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>tele</strong>-</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9.77</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>bi</strong>-</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>cyber</strong>-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ciber</strong>-</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>eco</strong>-</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.56</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Euro</strong>-</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11.90</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>geo</strong>-</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.25</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>mono</strong>-</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ortho</strong>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>orto</strong>-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>techno</strong>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>tecnoc</strong>-</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1,810</strong></td>
<td>123</td>
<td>6.80</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>4.19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1.** Productivity of CFs in Italian compounds and Anglicisms with CFs recorded by ZING
group are adjectives (*multiflash, multigrade, multijet, multimedia, multiplayer, etc.*) or can have an adjectival function (*multiservice, multiutility*). Semantically, most of these compounds are exocentric, as their meaning lies outside the separate meanings of their constituent elements. For example, *multitouch* refers to ‘[a] technology allowing a touchscreen, trackpad, etc., to register multiple points of contact made on the surface simultaneously’, and *multijet* means ‘having or involving more than one jet or jet engine’ (en.oxforddictionaries.com).

The second most productive CF is *video-*, whose origin is Latin combined with -o-connective. According to the OED, its use may have been triggered by analogy with *audio-* (from Latin audīre + -o-connective). It forms ‘words relating to the production, transmission, or recording of video images’, mostly endocentric. Thus, *videoclip* denotes ‘a short video, esp. one produced to promote a record’, and a *videowall* is ‘a set of video screens that are connected together, so that each screen shows a part of the whole picture’ (www.collinsdictionary.com).

Scrolling down the column that indicates the proportion between all CFs and English borrowings, it appears that the only items that have 100% English provenance are the ones that have an Anglicized form coexisting with an Italian one, namely *hydro-/idro-, photo-/foto-, techno-/tecn-* and *ortho-/orto-*. For Anglicized CFs *techno-* and *ortho-*, only one example for each is recorded by ZING, namely *techno-thriller* and *orticon* or *orticon*. By contrast, the Italian *orto-* appears to be quite productive in Italian, having 47 compounds made up from this ancient Greek CF (*ὀρθο-*), meaning ‘straight’, in scientific words like (med.) *ortodonzia* (orthodontics), *ortopedia* (orthopaedics), (mat.) *ortogonale* (orthogonal), and so on. A lower degree of productivity is recorded for Italian *tecn-*, with 10 compounds, including (econ.) *tecnostruttura* (technostructure) and (chim. tecnol.) *tecnofibra* (techno fibre). If we consider the pairs *hydro-/idro-* and *photo-/foto-* the difference in productivity is far more marked. Both Italian *idro-* and *foto-* are highly productive (respectively 115 and 117 compounds), while the Anglicized counterparts have been imported in a limited number of cases: a handful of technical items with *hydro-* (*hydrobob, hydrofining, hydroforming, hydrofracking, hydrospeed, hydrospinning*) and a few with *photo-* including two trademarks (*photofinish, photoflood, Photofit*, Photoshop®). These examples clearly indicate that these Anglicized neo-classical CFs are not readily borrowed from English and are confined to a small number of technical terms and brand names.

The CF *cyber-* represents an interesting case of incipient, potential productivity. The etymon is ancient Greek *κυβερνήτης* (steersman), forming the English word *cybernetics* in 1834 (carrying the sense of ‘art of governing’), *cibernetica* in Italian (1950 from English *cybernetics*, according to the GDU), defined as ‘The field of study concerned with communication and control systems in living organisms and machines’ (OED). *Cyber-* has been quite productive in English since the 1960s to form compounds (often

---


*23 Engl. definition: ‘a television camera tube in which an optical image produces a corresponding electrical charge pattern on a mosaic surface that is scanned from behind by an electron beam. The resulting discharge of the mosaic provides the output signal current’. It. definition: ‘(elettr.) tubo elettronico da presa, che utilizza, per l’analisi dell’immagine, elettroni a bassa velocità’.*
casuals or nonce-words, as highlighted by the OED), denoting ‘words relating to (the culture of) computers, information technology, and virtual reality, or denoting futuristic concepts. Later also: spec. forming terms relating to the Internet’ (OED). Only two entries are recorded by ZING, i.e. cybercafé (1992, also Internet café) and cyberpunk (1989). ZING has a few entries with cyber- alternating orthographically with ciber- (cyberbullismo, cybernauta, cyberspazio), (cyberbullying, cybernaut, cyberspace), also in the pronunciation between the English [ˈsaɪbə(r)] and the Italian [ˈtʃiber]. It looks as though this CF has not yet settled on either forms. A trend towards a preference for the English form may be observed in web-based corpus data, which shows that cyber- is in fact more frequent than ciber- in Italian, and is also quite productive in forming a wide variety of compounds: apart from the most frequent cyberspazio and cyberpunk, other candidate terms include cybercrime, cybersquatting, cyber-shot, cybersex, cyber-stalking, cybersecurity.

Another case of shortening is porno- from pornography, originally from Greek πορνογράφος (adjective), meaning ‘writing about prostitutes’; it refers to ‘[t]he explicit description or exhibition of sexual subjects or activity in literature, painting, films, etc., in a manner intended to stimulate erotic rather than aesthetic feelings’ (OED). Only three non-adapted Anglicisms, made up of porno- and an English element, are recorded by ZING, i.e. pornoshop, pornoshow, and pornostar. While the first two terms do not have Italian equivalents, the gender-neutral word pornostar has pornoattore and pornodivo, recorded in the dictionary in their ‘generic’ masculine forms as headwords, as is customary in gender-aware languages like Italian, with the indication of the possible feminine inflection (f. -trice). As independent English words, porn is attested as a noun (shortening of pornography) and porno as an adjective (shortening of pornographic). However, as pointed out in Section 2, pornostar seems to be an Italian creation, standing for English porn star or porn actor/actress, probably induced by the old Anglicism star, borrowed in 1929 and other already existing compounds all-star, guest star and star system.

Proceeding with the illustration of the CFs according to their incidence on the number of compounds containing the same CF in Italian words and recorded in the Italian dictionary ZING, we find mini- (16.00%) in the entries minicomputer, minimarket, and minicar. Of Latin etymology (from Latin minimus), the history of mini- has taken several different paths. While in Italian its provenance is attributed to English (see note 7), the OED states that the etymon of mini- is Italian ‘miniatura’, probably reinforced by Latin minimum adj. ‘smallest quantity or amount’. The meaning of mini- is quite straightforward, i.e. ‘of small size’, but also ‘short’ (una mini vacanza → a short holiday); ‘lower than expected’ (un mini assegno → a mini cheque), and the word can also be used as an independent adjective or noun, for example in the field of fashion for ‘garments that are short compared to the standard length’ (OED), e.g. miniskirt.

---

24 Def. ‘café equipped with computer terminals which customers can use to access the internet’ (www.collinsdictionary.com)
25 Def. 1 ‘a type of science fiction typically describing a violent, urban future in which computers and drugs predominate’ 2 ‘a writer of cyberpunk’ 3 ‘a hacker’ (US). (www.collinsdictionary.com)
26 Italian Web 2016 (itTenTen16) containing 4.9 billion words, queried through the Sketch Engine system (www.sketchengine.co.uk) gives the following: cyber- 6.80 per million; ciber- 1.70 per million.
27 See also Frenguelli (2005) for a discussion of cyber- and its productivity in Italian from the 1990s.
Euro- has become quite a productive CF since the formation of the European Community (now the European Union). Etymologically it derives from classical Latin Eu- rōpaeus and ancient Greek Εὐρωπαῖος, with the meaning of ‘belonging to Europe’, but modern usage denotes in particular political and economic referents pertaining to the EU (e.g. euromercato, europarlamento, in Engl. Euromarket, Euro Parliament). As a free-standing lexeme, it is the name of the European currency. Only two non-adapted Anglicisms are recorded in ZING, i.e. eurobond and eurocent: one is adapted, i.e. euro-americano, whereas two items are proper names (Eurocity, Euronight) \(^{28}\), not recorded in the English dictionaries used in this study.

Most of the words containing the CF bio- refer to the original meaning of Latin bio- and ancient Greek βίο- of βίος ‘life’. According to the OED, bio- is used to form words referring to ‘life and living organisms (real and fictional), and (in later use) to biotechnology or environmental sustainability.’ Another use of bio- is with the sense of ‘biographical’. This CF is highly productive in Italian (120 entries), and only 11.67% are from English, 10 of which are adapted (e.g. bioreattore from Engl. bioreactor) and only four are non-adapted, i.e. biochip, biomarker, biopic, and biotech. Biopic (biographical picture) is the only case in which the second meaning is taken on, as ‘[a] biopic is a film that tells the story of someone’s life’, whereas biochip is an IT term denoting ‘a small glass or silicon plate containing an array of biochemical molecules or structures, used as a biosensor or in gene sequencing’, a biomarker (also biological marker) is a medical term meaning ‘a substance, physiological characteristic, gene, etc. that indicates, or may indicate, the presence of disease, a physiological abnormality or a psychological condition’, and biotech (biotechnology) is ‘the use of living parts such as cells or bacteria in industry and technology’ (www.collinsdictionary.com).

As anticipated in Section 2, the primary etymon tele- (from Greek τῆλε-, meaning ‘afar, far off’) has given way to ‘second generation’ homonyms derived from the abbreviation of television and telephone. In our corpus we have the word telex, whose meaning is related to the original etymon, ‘[a] system of communication in which text-based messages are transmitted and received using teleprinters connected to a global network’ (OED). Only one example is connected with telephone communication, i.e. teletex, ‘[a] system in which electronic text and documents are transmitted and received by computers over telephone lines, designed to be a faster and more versatile alternative to telex’ (OED). Also telemarketing, ‘[t]he marketing of goods, services, etc., by means of (chiefly unsolicited) telephone calls’ is related to the use of the telephone, while two terms are linked to television communication, i.e. (OED), teleprompter ‘[a]n electronic device that displays a prepared text to a speaker or performer in such a way that it can be read while appearing to look directly at the audience or into a television camera’, and teletext ‘[a] system used for transmitting pages of text and simple computer generated images to televisions, typically allowing the viewer to select from a variety of different pages for viewing using the keys on a remote control’ (OED). In Italian teletext is also called televideo, which is made up of the abbreviation of teletext combined with video-.

The CF mega-, from Greek μεγα-, denotes very large dimensions, as in megastore,

\(^{28}\) It is curious to note that the term Eurostar, which is attested in English dictionaries and also recorded in ZING, could not be retrieved by selecting the label ‘vc. ingl.’ because ZING fails to indicate the English origin of the element ‘star’ [comp. di Euro- e star: ‘stella europea’ ☉ 1995].
and also figuratively ‘of major impact’, as in the word *megatrend*, ‘an important shift in the progress of a society or of any other particular field or activity; any major movement’ (OED). Other compounds with *mega-* are units of measurement, such as *megaton*, ‘[a] unit of explosive power, equal to that of one million tons of TNT and used chiefly with reference to nuclear weapons.’ (OED) and *megabyte*, ‘[o]ne million (formally: 1,048,576, or $2^{20}$) bytes, as a unit of data size or memory capacity’ (OED), the latter nowadays taken over by larger units like gigabytes and terabytes.

**Eco-** derives from the abbreviation of the term ecology, which both Italian and English attribute to German *Oecologie*, ‘[t]he branch of biology that deals with the relationships between living organisms and their environment’ (OED), from the Greek word οἶκος, ‘house, dwelling’. By extension, *ecology* has come to refer to ‘[t]he study of or concern for the effect of human activity on the environment’ and compounds with *eco-* carry overtones of environmentalism. In fact, the neologism *ecodesign*, not attested in the English dictionaries considered here, is a blend of ecology and design, and denotes the ideation and production of goods made with materials with low environmental impact. Yet, the term *ecodesign* is easily found on the web; for example on the European Commission website[^29], *ecodesign* is extensively used with reference to the EU’s 2020 energy efficiency objective to reduce energy consumption in compliance with the Ecodesign Directive (2009) and the Energy Labelling Directive (2010), to which also the term *ecolabel* is related.

The CF **geo-** derives from classical Latin *geo-* and ancient Greek γεω- ‘earth’. The OED states that *geo-* has been productive in French and German since at least the 19th century, and that it can easily combine with second elements of Greek and Latin origin. This may explain the reason why *geo-* is quite productive in Italian but less so in English, at least in combination with English elements. Only five entries in ZING are borrowings from English, but only one has an English form, i.e. *geotag* (2005), ‘[a]n electronic tag that assigns a geographical location to a photograph or video, a posting on a social media website, etc.’ (https://en.oxforddictionaries.com).

Another CF indicating size is **micro-**, a borrowing from ancient Greek μικρό- ‘small’, reflecting the tendency to reduce the size of technical components to save space and increase manageability. In our corpus we have the words *microcar* and *microcomputer* (possibly a further reduction in size of minicar and minicomputer), and the specialist terms *microarray* (in molecular biology ‘an array of spots each containing a sample of DNA for use in genetic testing’, OED), *microblog* (‘a blog in which there is a limit on the length of individual postings’, www.collinsdictionary.com), *microchip* (‘a small piece of semiconductor material carrying many integrated circuits’, www.collinsdictionary.com), and *micromarketing* (‘the marketing of products or services designed to meet the needs of a very small section of the market’, www.collinsdictionary.com).

The last three CFs in our corpus are the most productive in Italian and display the lowest incidence of English borrowings out of the total number of compounds with the same CF. The most productive of all is **auto-**, from Greek αὐτό- ‘self, one’s own, by oneself, independently’, through post-classical Latin *auto-*. According to Carlucci (2017: 387), the CF *auto-* is “an instance of revitalization and downward migration of a dormant element previously confined to the ’cultured’ strata of the Italian lexicon”.

The productivity of *auto*- has greatly increased since the beginning of the 20th century (Iacobini 2003), partly because of the formation of internationalisms such as *autobiografia* (from English *autobiography*) and *automobile*, but especially because of the impulse provided by English words with the prefix *self-*; generating synonymic calques in Italian like *autocontrollo* (from *self-control*). By contrast, the number of borrowings containing the CF *auto*- is fairly limited. The original reflexive meaning of *auto-* can be attached to mechanical devices with the sense of ‘functioning automatically’ (OED), is found in our corpus in *autofocus* (an English borrowing although made up of non-English elements) and in the obsolescent *autoreverse* (‘a facility on an audio tape player allowing the reverse side of a tape to play automatically once the first side has finished’, OED; in English also *auto-rewind*). The other examples refer to *auto-* as the abbreviation of automobile, i.e. *autocross* and *automotive*, whereas *autofiction* (coexisting with It. *autofinzione*) comes from *auto(biography)* and *fiction*, a neologism denoting a narrative genre which combines autobiographical events and fictional elements.

Another CF which is particularly productive in Italian is Latin *bi*- (‘having or furnished with two’), featuring in only three non-adapted, namely *balance* (from *bi-* twice + *lanx* flat plate, scale; see note 32), *bifuel* ‘a dual-fuel vehicle is designed to run on two different types of fuel, usually petrol and a type of fuel that does not cause pollution’ (www.macmillandictionary.com), *bipartisan* ‘[o]f, representing, or composed of members of, two (political or other) parties’ (OED).

Finally, the CF *mono-* (from ancient Greek *μονο-* with the senses ‘one, alone, single’, ‘having, involving, etc., one’) is found only in the brand name *Monotype®* (1904; see note 16).

### 4.2. Adaptation and calques

Out of 19 types of initial CFs, the majority are English/Italian homographs, that is, they have the same orthographic form. We also noticed that the Anglicized form exists for four of them, namely *idro*-/ *hydro*-, *foto*-/ *photo*-, *ciber*-/ *cyber*-, *orto*-/ *ortho*-. Since Italian is a language with phonetic spelling, pronunciation will diverge, especially for vowels. Thus, *multi-* is pronounced [ˈmulti], *microchip* [ˈmɪkrəʊtʃɪp], *cyber-* [ˈtʃiber] instead of [ˈsaɪbə(r)]. Phonetic adaptation takes place unless speakers are fully proficient in English or wish to adhere to the English pronunciation for correctness or stylistic reasons.

Concerning the existence or absence of an Italian equivalent both as an adaptation or a calque of the English loanword, our data reveals that the majority of the non-adapted Anglicisms (47=61.8%) do not have equivalent terms, while a smaller number (29=38%) cohabit with an Italian word which is semantically identical. In traditional loanword studies (Haugen 1950; Görlach 2002) a distinction is made between necessary and luxury loans, which express the rather misleading assumption that new concepts and referents can only be named using a loanword, and, conversely, that having two terms for the same referent – for example Engl. *preview* and It. *anteprima* – may be more than is needed in a language, therefore useless. Elsewhere this distinction is associated to pragmatic and stylistic choices (Winter-Froemel and Onysko 2012), whereby Anglicisms with no domestic equivalents represent an unmarked choice for the speaker,
while using an English borrowing instead of an available native term should be considered a ‘marked’ choice from a pragmatic point of view.

From a linguistic perspective, our corpus seems to reveal that genetic similarity may more easily lead to adaptation or translation, as in the cases of *biomarker*/*biomarcatore*, *multiservice*/*multiservizio*, *autofiction*/*autofinzione*. Yet, some Anglicisms coexist with Italian formally different equivalents, like *videotape*/*videocassetta*, *videogame*/*videogio*co and *Eurobond*/*eurobbligazione*. Which of the two options is preferred in actual use could be discovered through the observation of corpus data, but this is beyond the aims of the present study. Other linguistic factors undoubtedly influence the preference or prevalence of Anglicisms over Italian terms or otherwise, like the compactness of English compounds, with monosyllabic English elements (videoclip), which cannot always be rendered in Italian in the same way (*megatrend* vs *megatendenza*, *multitasking* vs *multiprogrammazione*), and with the same semantic flexibility (e.g. *pornoshop* vs *porno negozio* or *porno negozio*). Extralinguistic factors in favour of English are the well-known prestigious overtones of modernity (veejay, microblog, cyberpunk), technological appeal (multitouch, multijet, biochip), and expressions of professionalism (ecodesign, megatrend, multitasking) associated with the use of English.

4.3. From specialized discourse to everyday language

The areas of vocabulary that are more receptive to lexical innovation are the technical and scientific ones. Neoclassical CFs contributed to the building of specialized vocabularies in many European languages from the 18th century, but nowadays compounds with CFs are most of all modern formations from the 20th century, known to the general public and used in media communication. From the analysis of the 76 compounds composed of CFs joined to English elements, the percentage of lemmas recorded by ZING and marked by field label is 42.1%, while the number of words with no field label is 57.9%. This confirms that, although many Anglicisms with neoclassical CFs belong to specialist vocabulary, the majority of this type of English loanword belongs to the general vocabulary.

The specialized domains represented by our collection of Anglicisms with neoclassical CFs are, in decreasing order, the following: information technology (biochip, megabyte, microcomputer, minicomputer, multitasking, geotag, multitouch, Photoshop®), electronics (microchip, multiplexer, multiplexing), automotive (microcar, minicar, multijet), the economy (Eurobond, multiutility, multiservice), sport (photofinish, hydrospeed, hydrobob), the Internet (microblog, videoblogger), chemistry (hydrofining, hydroforming), biology (microarray), geology (hydrofracking), medicine (biomarker), music (videoclip), physics (megaton), politics (bipartisan), literature (autofiction), and typography (Monotype®). As these examples show, most of them belong to the hard sciences, but the highest number denote terms related to information technology and the Internet. This is also confirmed by a study carried out on the Anglicisms recorded by the GDU and ZING across the centuries, covering the new millennium up to 2016 (Pulcini 2017).

4.4. Semantic profile

As anticipated in Section 2, with respect to the semantic relation between their constituents, compounds may be endocentric (a semantic feature which is typical of
affixes) and exocentric (only exceptionally found in derivatives with affixes). Out of the 76 compounds containing CFs with English roots or words analysed in our corpus, the presence of a higher number of endocentric compounds (47 = 61.84%) is to be attributed primarily to the greater incidence of CFs that express ‘size’, such as mega- (4 out of 4: megabyte, megastore, megaton, megatrend), micro- (5 out of 6: microblog, microcar, microchip, microcomputer, micromarketing) 30, and mini- (3 out of 3: minicar, minicomputer, minimarket). A further addition to endocentric types comes from CFs that express a restrictive semantic specification (>semantic hyponym) of the head element, such as bio- (3 out of 4: biotech, biochip, biomarker), 31 cyber- (2 out of 2: cybercafé, cyberpunk), eco- (2 out of 2: ecodesign, ecolabel), euro- (2 out of 2: eurobond, eurocent), porno- (3 out of 3: pornoshop, pornoshow, pornostar), techno- (1 out of 1: techno-thriller) and, most of all, video- which, beside the brandname Videotex® 32, includes 10 endocentric items out of 11 (video art, video jockey 33, videoblog, videoblogger 34, videoclip, videogame, videomaker, videomusic, videowall).

The other most productive CF attached to English elements, multi-, has instead instances equally distributed between endocentric compounds (6: multilevel marketing, multimedia, multiplayer, multiservice, multitasking, multiutility) 35 and exocentric (6: multiframe, multigrade, multijet, multiplexer, multiplexing 36, multitouch); a higher incidence of exocentric types is recorded for bi-, 2 (balance 37, bipartisan) against 1 (bifuel): in both cases, the type of quantitative specification (respectively ‘many’ and ‘double’), which may trigger the composition of endocentric forms, appears to be less binding compared to the relation of ‘size’ mentioned above (mega-, micro-, mini-).

Moving on to other types of semantic relationships between constituents, all five instances with auto- are exocentric, both with the primary meaning of ‘by oneself, independently’ (autofiction, autofocus, autoreverse), and in the secondary one of ‘automobile’ (autocross, automotive), while there are more endocentric compounds with tele- than endocentric ones, but a distinction must be made between the three cases of

---

30 The only exocentric instance is microarray ‘[a] microscopic or small-scale array; (now, Molecular Biol.) an array of spots each containing a sample of DNA for use in genetic testing’ (OED).

31 The only exocentric instance is biopic, which however presents a more complex compositional process, from the abbreviation of bio(graphical) and picture blended together.

32 Composed of the CF video- and the abbreviation of two constituents, i.e. t(elephone) and exchange), meaning ‘A system in which electronic text and documents are transmitted and received by computers over telephone lines, designed to be a faster and more versatile alternative to telex’ (OED).

33 The acronym is VJ, on the model of disc jockey > DJ.

34 These two last compounds exist in their abbreviated form vlog (2003) and vlogger (2005), recorded by ZING, but not by GDU.

35 Multiservice and multiutility are synonyms.

36 As recorded by OED, multiplexer and multiplexing derive etymologically from ‘classical Latin multiplex (adjective) divided into many parts, having many forms, many times as many or as much (also as noun) < multi- multi- comb. form + -plex -plex suffix. Compare Middle French multiplex (adjective) in sense A. 1a (c1390). Compare Italian molteplice (a1332), Spanish multiplice (1567).’

37 OED: spec. ‘of the arrangement and adjustment of sources of sound; the sound thus produced.’ Its etymology is < French balance (= Spanish balanza, Provençal balansa, Italian bilancia) < late Latin *bilancia a pair of scales, < classical Latin bilanx, bilanc-em, adjective (in libra bilanx) ‘two-scaled,’ < bi- twice + lanx flat plate, scale.
NEO-CLASSICAL COMBINING FORMS IN ENGLISH LOANWORDS: EVIDENCE FROM ITALIAN

191

semantic affinity (teletex, teletext, telex)\textsuperscript{38}, against the two endocentric ones, totally autonomous (telemarketing, teleprompter)\textsuperscript{39}. The category of endocentric compounds is strengthened by brandnames (Monotype®, Photofit®, Photoshop® \textsuperscript{40}, beside the already quoted Videotex®), and some isolated cases (orthicon, geotag).

Finally, among the compounds with hydro-, together with the endocentric hydro-spinning and the exocentric hydrofracking, there are the two synonymic terms hydro-bob and hydrospeed, the former endocentric (literally ‘water bob’), the second exocentric (‘the float used in leisure activity that involves jumping into fast-flowing white water esp. rapids on a river and being carried along at high speed’, OED), and the two lemmas hydrofining \textsuperscript{41} and hydroforming \textsuperscript{42}, which may be classified as coordinate forms discussed, among others, by Iacobini (2004: 85), where each element contributes to the overall meaning of the term without expressing any semantic restriction on the other.

5. Discussion

The validity of the data presented and analysed in this paper should be weighed against some objective limitations. Firstly, although the category of compounds containing neo-classical CFs is considered autonomous with respect to traditional processes of composition and derivation, to some extent its margins are blurred. This is due to the fact that some compositional forms are alternatively labelled as prefixes or CFs in different dictionaries, as in the case of super-. Secondly, the use of lexicographic sources can provide clear numerical evidence, but may fail to consider the more dynamic and productive aspects of language use, especially with respect to register variation (spoken or written mode), which may be better represented by means of other analytical tools, such as corpora, as shown by the case of cyber-. Lastly, more information may be retrieved by extending the analysis to other dictionaries, both Italian and English, while for the time being we have limited our study to the comparison between the OED and ZING.

Nevertheless, from the study conducted here, some meaningful evidence has emerged, also from a quantitative point of view. A preliminary evaluation cannot disregard the other donor languages in Italian, namely French and German, whose input can be shown in Table 2:

\textsuperscript{38} As discussed above, telex refers to the original meaning of ‘afar, far off’, teletex to the word telephone and teletext to the term television.

\textsuperscript{39} Both telemarketing and teleprompter originate from the secondary references of tele-, the former to telephone, and the latter to television.

\textsuperscript{40} For photo- we can add the endocentric photo finish (also recorded in its solid form photofinish and as a solid and adapted form fotofinish) and the exocentric photoflood, both from the secondary meaning of ‘photograph’ of this CF.

\textsuperscript{41} OED: From hydro(genation) + fining. ‘A catalytic process in which a petroleum product is stabilized and its sulphur content reduced by treatment with gaseous hydrogen under relatively mild conditions, so that unsaturated hydro-carbons and sulphur compounds undergo selective hydrogenation.’

\textsuperscript{42} OED: compound of hydro(genation)+forming, ‘In the petroleum industry, a catalytic reforming process that converts the paraffins and alicyclic compounds in low-octane petroleum naphtha to aromatic compounds by dehydrogenation at a high temperature and moderate pressure in the presence of gaseous hydrogen.’
Data proves that the influence of German in this area of vocabulary is negligible, while that of French is slightly more significant, and in three cases even stronger than the influence of English (bi-, mono- and especially foto-). Overall, we have 179 compounds containing a foreign element out of 1,810 entries (9.89%).

6. Concluding remarks

In this paper, the analysis was addressed to an area of word-formation in which the influence of English on the Italian language is supposed to be considerable, i.e. compound terms in the technical and scientific domains containing neo-classical CFs. The leadership of Anglophone countries in these fields led to the hypothesis that a much higher incidence of English terms would be found, also considering the well-known attraction for English words in Italian. This resistance to the importation of English terminology is to be ascribed to the Latin and Greek component, still etymologically recognizable and formally integrated into the Italian language, which has favoured and continues to trigger the composition of domestic lexical items, which greatly out-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N.°</td>
<td>% on comp.</td>
<td>N.°</td>
<td>% on comp.</td>
<td>N.°</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>multi-</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>16.85</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>video-</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>17.65</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hydro-</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>idro-</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>micro-</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>6.08</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bio-</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>11.67</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>porno-</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>auto-</td>
<td>292</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mega-</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mini-</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>photo-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>foto-</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tele-</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>9.77</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bi-</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cyber-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ciber-</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eco-</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>6.56</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>euro-</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>11.90</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>geo-</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>7.25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mono-</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ortho-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>orto-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>techno-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tecno-</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1,810</td>
<td>6.80</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2.93</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Compounds with the selected CFs in Italian and distribution across English, French and German origin recorded in ZING.
number those of foreign origin. A further validation of this conclusion is given by CFs having double formal realizations, the Italian ones (idro-, foto-, tecn-, orto-) and the English ones (hydro-, photo-, techno-, ortho-). While the former give rise to practically all domestic compounds (285 out of 289, representing 98.61%), the latter produce exclusively English compounds, although their number is much smaller (only 13)\(^\text{43}\). Put more simply, if the CF is felt to be integrated into the morphological system of Italian, compounds will be generated within the same system; by contrast, when the CF is perceived as exogenous to the system, the compounds are taken on from external sources. The CF geo- is another emblematic example of this trend. In fact, out of five compounds of English origin, four of them are made up of geo- combined with a classical element (geocodifica, geodimetro, geomatica, geotechnologie, from English geocoding, geodimeter, geomatics, geotechnology), while geotag is composed of geo- and the English word tag (of obscure origin, possibly Germanic), and is the only one borrowed in its English form without any adaptation or translation equivalent available in Italian.

From a closer examination of Anglicisms containing CFs, it is worth noting that non-adapted forms (76 = 4.30% of all compounds and 61.78% of English-induced compounds) are more numerous than the adapted ones (47 = 2.66% of all compounds and 38.21% of English-induced compounds). This may be partly ascribed to their semantic specialization which is mainly accessible to specialist and educated users, who are supposed to be capable of handling or are professionally motivated to use direct loanwords. In other words, in spite of possible deviation in their phonetic realization, Anglicisms will be taken on in their original morphological form.

To conclude, in the study of language contact and, in particular, of the morphological influence of English on Italian, we have identified an area of lexis – that of compounds with CFs – which is not easily permeable to the input of non-adapted borrowings from English. Even less noticeable is the influence of French and German on Italian. By contrast, the word class of neo-classical CFs has been quite productive in the Italian language, starting from the creation of scientific and technical terms, and then moving on to the enrichment of general vocabulary. In particular, some ‘second generation’ CFs like auto-, video-, tele- have developed new semantic associations with modern inventions and have become productive with these new meanings. In any case, neo-classical CFs represent a stock of shared morphological resources of English and Italian, so that from a typological point of view we may claim that an English loanword like microblog can be classified as both a non-adapted and a hybrid Anglicism. Paradoxically, even words like autofocus and multimedia, which do not contain a single English element, are in fact recorded as English-induced borrowings into Italian, not by virtue of their formal identity but because of their historical genesis in the Anglo-American cultural context.

References


\(^{43}\) The case of cyber/-ciber- discussed above is more complex.


Italian Web 2016 (itTenTen16). At www.sketchengine.co.uk.


Sketch Engine. At www.sketchengine.co.uk.


## Appendix

Neo-classical Combining Forms in direct Anglicisms in Italian (Zingarelli 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>euro-</td>
<td>eurobond (1979) eurocent (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>geo-</td>
<td>geotag (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mono-</td>
<td>Monotype® (1904)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ortho-</td>
<td>orthicon (1983)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>techno-</td>
<td>techno-thriller (1993)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PACKAGING ANTI-TERRORIST ATTITUDES THROUGH THE POWERFUL LANGUAGE OF COLOURING BOOKS

Margaret Rasulo

(University of Campania ‘Luigi Vanvitelli’, Italy)

Abstract

The overall aim of this paper is to explore how the genre of colouring books has been exploited (Bhatia 2004) by the American publishing house Really Big Coloring Books, Inc. 1 in the attempt to shape reality according to a specific cultural perspective. The present study focuses on how these books, published and distributed mainly in the United States, activate processes of power that pervade social life and institutions (Fitzpatrick and McPherson 2010) through the use of visual and verbal features which are used to engage young adults (Newman and Newman 2014) in the discourse of freedom and democracy now that these principles, according to Wayne Bell, the CEO of Really Big Coloring Books 2, are being systematically undermined by terrorist attacks. The view that is put forth in this study is that the conventions of colouring books have been reinvented in order to provide an anti-terrorist response to the provocation of terrorist organizations, al-Qaeda first and the Islamic State after, whose online magazines are being used for the recruitment and self-radicalization of young Muslims living in different parts of the world. By conducting a comparative analysis of these two different genre types, namely the colouring books and the terrorist magazines, and by drawing attention to the stark contrast between their divergent purposes, the author intends to reveal a stimulus/response pattern underlying their communicative action whose purpose is to establish their own version of the truth. The study’s methodological framework is based on Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996, 2001, 2006) social semiotic approach to multimodal analysis (van Leeuwen 2005). Through the interdisciplinary tools of multimodality, the meaning-making resources of visual and verbal conventions (O’Halloran and Smith 2011) employed to communicate contrasting views of terrorist representation are revealed.

1. Context of the study

In 2011, Really Big Coloring Books, Inc. came out with a series of controversial products with the intention of teaching children and young adults about the threat of terrorism. In 2010, for the purpose of recruiting and radicalizing young Muslim men mainly

living in Western countries, but also in other parts of the world (Helfstein 2012), the militant Islamist organization al-Qaeda in the Arabian Peninsula (AQAP) published the first issue of the digital magazine *Inspire*, released by the *al-Malāhīm* Foundation.

Through the *al-Hayat* Media Centre, the self-proclaimed Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS) in 2014 published the digital magazine *Dabiq* in correspondence with the announcement of the Caliphate. The comparative analysis of these two different genre types is based on the assumption that the colouring books constitute the response of the US-based publisher to the terrorist provocation enacted by al-Qaeda and the Islamic State through their respective recruitment and radicalization magazines.

Drawing on Kress and van Leeuwen’s (2006: 3) view that “visual language is not transparent and universally understood, but culturally specific”, this study’s main challenge and overarching research question is to investigate how Western visual communication conventions are exploited to design editorial products originating from two different cultural systems whose purposes are completely antithetical. This also entails assessing the extent to which the content of these products is packaged and manipulated by these terrorist organizations in order to control their audiences and turn them into their major stakeholders, by which we mean those who share common beliefs, value systems and mission and are willing to become fully involved with an organization and therefore take on responsibilities towards it and contribute to its success.

In American culture, colouring books have been published for over one hundred years, the earliest ones starting out with paints and continuing with crayons (Greenaway 1915), but they have also been the focus of research studies related to child and adolescent issues such as abuse, stress and serious illness (Fitzpatrick and McPherson 2010). Adult colouring books, which have recently enjoyed a surge of popularity, have also been the focus of several studies, especially in the 1960s with the first modern colouring book about conformity in the workplace, namely *The Executive Coloring Book* (Altman et al. 1961), published in 1961. Throughout the decade, many other adult colouring books were regularly published, such as *Drucker’s JFK Coloring Book* (Drucker and Roman 1962), *The Nation’s New Frontier Coloring Book* (Nation 1962), and *Khrushchev’s Top Secret Coloring Book: Your First Red Reader* (Shalit and Davis 1962). The aim of these historic satirical books was to read their message and take a stand. Adults were therefore not expected to actually colour the pages, but just browse through them and have a laugh.

---

3 The name AQAP came into existence in 2009 when Al-Qaeda’s Saudi branch merged with its Yemeni branch. However, Al-Qaeda’s presence in Yemen dates to the early 1990s when fighters returned home from Afghanistan accompanied by those from outside the country, including bin Laden, after successfully fighting off Soviet occupation. Retrieved from: http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2015/1/14/who-is-aqap-.html.


5 The *al Hayat Media Center* is one of the main media outlets of the Islamic State. From here, messages in different Western languages (English, French, German) are spread through images, video and audio. Retrieved from: http://formiche.net/2015/01/15/al-hayat-media-center-isis/.

6 http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/stakeholder.html.

Indeed, colouring books have also attracted criticism from educationalists mainly related to the act of inducing people to colour within the lines, an activity which is thought to stifle creative thinking and encourage stereotypes. Nevertheless, regardless of the pros and cons of this medium, the effectiveness of colouring books as educational and therapeutic tools and as a means for self-expression and relaxation continues to be addressed by mainstream research studies (Fitzpatrick 2010; Drake et al. 2014).

Very few studies, however, have been conducted on recently published colouring books, supposedly aimed at children and young adults, which have been designed to explore the controversial issues of terrorism and religion. These colouring books cannot be defined as representative of their genre, although they use typical features such as a large format and figures traced in black and white lines ready to be filled in with coloured crayons. Upon closer scrutiny, it becomes clear that some of them, and especially those included in this study’s corpus, are not intended for children at all; the complexity of the figures does not facilitate colouring, and the chilling content of the verbal expressions accompanying the images can only be approached by an older age group.

Creating a more flexible version of a colouring book by interconnecting conventional visual features with those that usually characterize comic books and graphic novels, such as speech balloons, thought bubbles, panels, captions, headings, and stylized typography, would appear to be an attempt on the part of the publishing company to contrive a counter-provocation strategy to withstand the provocation of terrorist recruitment and radicalization magazines. In light of the above, this study aims to reveal the strategies employed by the Really Big Coloring Books publishing house to co-opt and adapt (Schnatz 2015) the features of what has always been widely understood as a favourite childhood pastime in order to exploit them as an editorial response to the terrorist threat.

It is the author’s view that the publishers of both editorial products have strategically selected a tool of communication that would best disseminate their message according to effective packaging devices. The initial impression that one gets by visiting the Really Big Coloring Books, Inc. website is that of uniqueness as their products are customized to meet the communication needs of wide audiences that include individuals, institutions and businesses. Reaching large audiences and popularity are probably the two main objectives that have also led the terrorist organizations investigated in this study to use online magazines for radicalization purposes. Magazines are, indeed, powerful tools that can shape attitudes and encourage identification with the images or narratives that are told (Breazeale 1994). A common feature of Inspire and Dabiq is the combination of ideological and religious texts with lighter items such as rap songs, poems, religious dictates, warrior success stories, and messages from imprisoned and regretful Western journalists awaiting their fate.

The contrastive analysis of the different data sets described above will attempt to identify how entities from different cultural backgrounds package their equally provocative message through similar multimodal artefacts (van Leeuwen 2005) in order to legitimize their specific mission. The anti-terrorist message of the colouring books, analysed

---


in this study by setting it against the content of the terrorist magazines, is meant to be discussed, according to Really Big Coloring Books, with open dialogue within the American community as a whole. For the terrorist organizations, their digital magazines serve the purpose of spreading the jihadi message within homeland territory and beyond.

1.1. Terminological disambiguation

When dealing with sociological issues that intersect the multimodal analysis of culture-sensitive data, a point to be made from the very beginning is the clarity of terminological references. Hence, the meanings of the words ‘terrorism’, ‘terrorist’, ‘terrorist organization’ and jihad/jihadi provided below are used within the context of this study as strictly related to the terrorist militant groups.

Despite the familiarity with the terms ‘terrorism’ and ‘terrorist’, they are still nebulous concepts and it is hard to agree on internationally accepted definitions. Regarding the definition of ‘terrorism’, this study adheres to the one formulated by the United Nations (1992) which states that terrorism is “[a]n anxiety-inspiring method of repeated violent action, employed by (semi-) clandestine individual, group or state actors, for idiosyncratic, criminal or political reasons, whereby – in contrast to assassination – the direct targets of violence are not the main target”

This definition is then supplemented by quoting the one given by the British Government (1974) which is less complicated, but quite compatible with this context: “[Terrorism] is […] the use of violence for political ends, and includes any use of violence for the purpose of putting the public, or any section of the public, in fear”.

The term ‘terrorist’ best fits the organizations for which terrorism is the principal activity even if political motives are also part of their agenda. According to the EU a ‘terrorist’ “commits such acts as attempted murder, kidnapping, etc, where the aim is of seriously intimidating a population […] or seriously destabilising or destroying the fundamental political, constitutional, economic or social structures of a country or an international organization”. In this study, the term ‘terrorist’ is used to indicate an individual who commits acts of violence by specifically and voluntarily targeting civilians.

The term ‘terrorist organizations’ is generically used to refer to militant groups involved in acts of terrorism. Specifically, however, the single term ‘organizations’ within the context of terrorism refers to militant groups that operate according to different ideologies, infrastructures and operational modalities. With reference to the context of this study, al-Qaeda is best defined as a terrorist organization as it counts hundreds of members, does not hold territory, and cannot directly confront military forces. The Islamic State, on the other hand, has about 30,000 fighters, funds itself, holds territory in both Iraq and Syria, although they are now in retreat and increasingly being forced

---

14 US Lieutenant General Sean MacFarland claims that although ISIS had over 45,000 fighters at the height of its powers in 2014, it has lost over 15,000 of them and is currently losing more as casualties in
out of these same areas, engages in sophisticated military operations, controls lines of communication, and is therefore more than an organization, but rather a new type of terrorist group that can be designated as a complex network of individuals which also calls itself a State. These defining features should be kept in mind as the discussion unfolds, but as the distinction between the two does not alter the data that are being analysed and compared, both militant groups will be referred to as ‘terrorist organizations’.

The Arabic word *jihad* is often translated as ‘holy war’, but its definition is closer to the act of struggling or striving. In a religious sense, *jihad* refers to the internal and external efforts of every Muslim to be a good believer and to inform people about the faith of Islam. The term also takes on military significance in terms of the legitimate use of force which can only occur if and when protecting the faith against others through peaceful solutions is not possible. Also, military *jihad* follows strict rules as it is proclaimed by a religious authority who advises those involved that there is an imminent external threat and violence is needed as a form of defence.

Unfortunately, the implementation of military *jihad* has been exploited by many political and religious groups to justify various forms of violence even if scholars of Islam affirm that this misuse of *jihad* contradicts their faith. The activity of the two militant groups investigated in this study exemplifies their constant alignment of the military aspect of *jihad* with religious conceptualizations; all of which is clearly reflected in their terrorist magazines.

Another major terminological concern regards the variety of names given to the Sunni group known as the Islamic State. Part of the trouble is that since the group has evolved over time, the changing of its own name has led to other variants such as the Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS), the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS), the Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS), and the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) and Daesh. The militants themselves prefer to be identified as the Islamic State in recognition of their self-declared Caliphate, but this study will also use ISIS as it is the most commonly encountered acronym in major worldwide media outlets.

1.2. A brief history of the self-proclaimed Islamic State


19 Endonym of the region bordering the eastern Mediterranean Sea, usually known as the Levant or the region of Syria. Retrieved from: http://www.express.co.uk/news/world/644304/IS-Islamic-State-Destroy-West-Terrorist-Syria-Iraq.

20 Daesh or Da’ish, the Arabic name for the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant, is a less common acronym for ISIS, but it is one that the militants do not favour. Retrieved from: http://www.mirror.co.uk/news/world-news/what-daesh-mean-IS-threatens-6841468.
ly illustrating some differences and similarities that are relevant to the understanding of the data presented in this study.

As separate organizations, al-Qaeda and the Islamic State began their terrorist activities at different times, evolving from different tactics and under different leadership conditions. Despite these differences, there are also some similarities. Firstly, they both adhere to a variation of *Salafi Jihadism*. According to a study published by the RAND cooperation (2014)\(^{21}\), a group is defined to be *Salafi Jihadist* based on two criteria: the first is the return to a pure Islam, that of the *Salaf*, the pious ancestors; the second is based on the belief that violent *jihad* is a personal religious duty.

Secondly, with reference to their enemies, both terrorist organizations tend to share their hatred for those they consider deviants, crusaders and infidels, and both also wish to fulfil certain Islamic prophecies dealing with the end of the world by engaging Western forces in Syria, and specifically in Dabiq. However, al-Qaeda’s primary enemy is the US, which is seen as the root cause of the problems of the Middle East. Its ultimate goal, therefore, has been to invalidate US domination and authority and overthrow America’s allied Muslim state regimes. The Islamic State does not target the US exclusively, but demonstrates a more global reach, as testified by the terrorist attacks committed in over twenty countries. At the same time, it is also intent on conquering territory at a regional level by targeting ‘apostate’ regimes in the Arab world, namely the Assad regime in Syria and the Abadi regime in Iraq\(^ {22}\). As for the major political concerns of the two militant groups, al-Qaeda has not traditionally been interested in establishing a caliphate, while the Islamic State has always sought to re-establish this governing body in order to “bring their brand of justice and *Shari’a* law to the entire world”\(^ {23}\). Historically, the Islamic State traces its origins to Abu Musab al-Zarqawi, who formed the group al-Qaeda in Iraq (AQI) in 2004 following the US invasion. After al-Zarqawi’s death in 2006, the group rebranded itself as the Islamic State in Iraq (ISI), and Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi became its leader in 2010. In April 2013, Baghdadi announced the merger of his forces in Iraq and Syria and the creation of the “Islamic State in Iraq and the Levant” (ISIL, ISIS). The leaders of al-Nusra and al-Qaeda rejected the move and disavowed ISIS, but fighters loyal to Baghdadi abandoned al-Nusra and helped ISIS remain in Syria. In June 2014, ISIS overran the northern city of Mosul, and moved southwards towards Baghdad. After consolidating its hold over dozens of cities and towns, ISIS changed its name to the ‘Islamic State’, of which The Caliphate is the political entity that governs according to the fundamental approach to *Shari’a* law (Vallee 2015).

It is important to point out that although the Islamic State has supplanted al-Qaeda as the jihadist threat of greatest concern, it does not stand as its outgrowth, especially

\(^{21}\) The RAND Corporation is a nonprofit institution that helps improve policy and decision making through research and analysis. Retrieved from: https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/testimonies/CT400/CT405/RAND_CT405.pdf.


considering that al-Qaeda continues to be a dangerous threat in Afghanistan, Yemen, Africa and South Asia.\(^{24}\)

2. Corpus

The corpus of this study is divided into two subcorpora. The first is the *Colouring Book* subcorpus comprising 25 images selected from three colouring books, namely *We Shall Never Forget 9/11* (2011), *We Shall Never Forget 9/11 - Vol. II - The True Faces of Evil – Terror* (2012), and *ISIS – A Culture of Evil* (2015), currently available in the US to disseminate information about terrorist organizations and their activities. The books can be ordered directly from the publishing company, but many of the pages can also be retrieved online.

Of the three colouring books, *ISIS – A Culture of Evil* is certainly one of the most violent and controversial as it has drawn heavy criticism from American Muslim groups for its representation of Muslims. The two volumes of *We Shall Never Forget*, despite the fact that their content is closely related to the aftermath of the 9/11 terrorist attacks\(^{25}\), and there are very few images of brutal violence against individuals such as those contained in *ISIS – A Culture of Evil*, have also received negative reviews from the same Muslim community, mainly due to its references to “Radical Islamic Muslim Extremists” (Vol. II)\(^{26}\).

The *Inspire-Dabiq* subcorpus comprises 30 images selected from those analysed in the 16 issues of *Inspire*, published between June 2010 and November 2016, and in the 15 issues of *Dabiq*, published between July 2014 and July 2016. These magazines can be downloaded from various websites in PDF format only, and are free of charge, a method that most certainly increases their accessibility from anywhere in the world.

As previously mentioned, *Inspire*, written in English, was created by members of al-Qaeda and designed to radicalize young Muslim men mainly living in Western countries. *Dabiq*, the Islamic State’s propaganda magazine, by harshly criticizing leading political and religious figures from the Western world as well as those from countries in the Middle East who have betrayed the jihad, hopes to radicalize any young person, but mainly men, who is willing to be a member or at least a supporter against all enemies and apostates of the Caliphate. To this purpose, the magazine is published in a number of languages besides English such as French, German, Russian and Arabic.

The above account of magazine affiliation clarifies, at least in part, the selection rationale of this corpus. As aforementioned, al-Qaeda and the Islamic State are separate organizations, but they are both willing to do whatever is necessary to bring about a global Islamic society (Jones 2014), and this is reflected in their online magazines albeit in different ways. Articles in *Inspire*, for example, include tutorials about making bombs and conducting one-man attacks, but *Dabiq*’s articles encourage a wider but more visually brutal and violent discussion on Islamic theology in support of the universal


Caliphate. This study argues that their message, notwithstanding the diversity of perspective, has been packaged as a deliberate action or provocation requiring a reaction or response from media outlets located all over the world. This implies that although the colouring books *We Shall Never Forget* (volumes I and II) are more comparable to *Inspire*’s provocation tactics supported by al-Qaeda, and despite the fact that the Islamic State’s *Dabiq* came out four years later and is therefore more comparable to *ISIS – A Culture of Evil*, the analysis undertaken in this study looks at broader categories that go beyond magazine affiliation and publication time. The focus is on the common exploitation of Western editorial conventions, styles and youth-oriented propaganda as well as on their similar justification tactics in murdering fellow Muslims.

3. Theoretical framework

This study, as mentioned above, employs Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996, 2001, 2006) social semiotic approach to multimodal analysis (Machin and van Leeuwen 2005), which draws on Halliday’s (1985) Systemic Functional Linguistics and the three Idea-tional, Interpersonal and Textual metafunctions, as well as on the principles of genre theory (Chandler 1997; Martin and Rose 2007; O’Halloran 2008).

Based on Halliday’s theory, Kress and Van Leeuwen use a slightly different terminology in discussing the meaning of image in visual communication: representational instead of ideational; interactional instead of interpersonal; and compositional instead of textual. In operating a shift from the semantic to the visual level, Kress and van Leeuwen’s multimodal theory, as Balirano (2014: 11) points out, is constructed on the view that the visual mode embodies the same semantic system as language, and “that everything which can work with the semiotic code of language can work with the same semiotic code of images”. Therefore, the act of reading images entails decoding the deployment of the elements that are the constituent parts of the three metafunctions which establish semiotic relations between the participants and the structural elements of the image itself (Kress and van Leeuwen1996: 45-46).

The representational metafunction identifies two kinds of structures in terms of how to distinguish what is actually happening in the images: the narrative and the conceptual structures.

In order for an image to be classified as a narrative representation which makes a proposition of some kind, a vector is needed. A vector is a line, often an eyeline, or implied line, that suggests direction. Elements of a visual composition are called ‘participants’. The participant from which a vector departs is known as the ‘actor’ and the arrival point is known as the ‘goal’. Kress and Leeuwen distinguish different narrative processes by the types of vectors and the number and kinds of participants involved. These are action processes whereby the participant must either have a vector coming out of it or actually form the vector, and reactional processes, whereby an eyeline, such as a glance, by one or more of the participants, forms a vector that connects those participants. The meaning generated if the vector is pointed at a participant is known as a transaction. If the vector is not pointed at any other participant, it is a non-transaction.

Conceptual structures work on stable and timeless essence, in terms of class, structure or meaning. They include the following processes:
- classificational: the participant is positioned in taxonomic representations of superordinate and subordinate functions;
- analytical: the participant is related according to part-whole structures whereby possessive attributes contribute to creating the whole;
- symbolic: the participant is represented in terms of meaning in the image, revealed by attributive processes where identity is assigned to the Carrier by another participant, and by suggestive processes whereby the participant is only the Carrier, and meaning and identity are derived from other qualities within the Carrier or from other resources such as verbal aspects.

Kress and Van Leeuwen have suggested three ways to examine the interactional meaning of images from three aspects: contact (demand or offer achieved through gaze), social distance (intimate, social, or impersonal size of frame), and attitude (involvement, detachment, viewer power, equality and representation of power perspectives). This dimension illustrates the relationships established between the image, the viewer and the producer, and thus mirrors the verbal mode where producers address their interlocutor through speech acts.

Gaze is perhaps one of the most revealing signs whereby relationships with the viewer are revealed. Kress and van Leeuwen (1996: 117) developed the notion of gaze as either ‘demand’, in which the gaze directly demands something of the viewer, or ‘offer’, in which the absence of gaze represents participants as objects of contemplation.

Social distance is also discussed in this study with a specific reference to the analysis of the different picture shots. The use of more personal close-ups is quite common in the magazines’ representation of stakeholders such as the superheroes and the lone wolf warriors. Longer shots are especially used in the colouring books, partly owing to the convention of this genre to portray full figures and objects, but also partly due to the impression these full images leave on the viewer.

The compositional meaning of image deals with the layout of the aspects on a page in order to discern whether these create or represent a coherent whole. It is realized through three interrelated systems: information value (given or new, ideal or real), salience (achieved through size, colour, tone, focus, perspective, overlap, and repetition) and framing.

Left and right information positioning denotes the given and the new. According to western conventions, the eye tends to start reading from the left of an image and moves to the right. In a triptych, the central panel is often the mediator between left and right and between given and new. Top and bottom information positioning denotes what is ideal and real, or what is promised and what is delivered, or even what is more emotive and more practical.

Salience is considered in terms of features of size, focus, tonal values, sharpness and foregrounding. The diversity of visual weight attributed by the use of these features gives the image a more or less dynamic composition.

Framing may be explicit according to the lines that break the image or they may also be implied in the alignments of participants. Lack of framing suggests group identity and collectivity, while the presence of frames usually identifies more individualistic aspects.

Modality is another concept applied to multimodal discourse analysis and refers to the truth value or credibility of statements about the world (Kress and van Leeuwen
In social semiotics, which adapts Halliday’s analysis of other sign systems, the point of departure is van Leeuwen’s premise (2005: 160) that the question of truth is a social question, and what “is regarded as true in one social context is not necessarily regarded as true in others”. Therefore, modality is the reliability, veracity and authority of an image which is assessed according to its primary element, namely its ‘naturalistic representation’: what can be seen by one’s naked eye (Kress and Van Leeuwen 1996). In the West, high modality is signified by the broad category of realism when it is equated with truth, or in other cultures it might be equated with the sacred or spiritual. Markers of realism may be such things as colour saturation and differentiation, detail (especially background detail), depth, quality of material, illumination and brightness (Kress and van Leeuwen 2006).

Since the publication of Kress and van Leeuwen’s seminal books Reading Images (1990) and Reading Images. The Grammar of Visual Design (1996, 2006), multimodal studies have flourished (Machin 2007; Kress 2010; O’Halloran and Smith 2011), and the interest in this research approach has progressively included other multidisciplinary approaches such as Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (van Leeuwen 2008; Fairclough 2010; van Dijk 2001; Machin and Mayr 2012), making it possible to move beyond the describable aspects of multimodal discourse in order to raise awareness of the relationship between verbal and visual texts (van Leeuwen 2008, 2013). Applying some of the linguistic principles pertaining to the above disciplines has led to the approach of Multimodal Critical Discourse Analysis (MCDA) which identifies how images, photographs, diagrams and graphics work to create meaning through specific choices made by the author of the visual or verbal text (Machin and Mayr 2012). As these choices and their inherent meanings are often more implicit or indirect in visual language, MCDA adopts a critical approach to reveal not only how these semiotic resources are put together, but also what they mean (ibid.:10).

It is important to point out, however, that this study’s multimodal critical approach focuses primarily on instantiations of the stimulus-response struggle contained in the visual representations of the terrorist magazines. This implies that the critique is not extended to the discussion of specific political, religious or ideological interpretations that may be inferred from the findings; these issues deserve an extensive discussion in the complex areas of terrorism and counter-terrorism conducted with a more insider view of the historical, cultural and political meanings.

As mentioned previously, this study is also indebted to the contribution of genre theory and to the seminal work conducted in various disciplinary fields by a number of key authors such as Halliday (1978, 1994), Martin (1984), Biber et al. (1998), Chandler (1997), Hyland (2003), Swales (2004), Coffin (2006), and Martin and Rose (2007, 2008).

However, the investigation especially draws on Halliday’s (1978; 1994) SFL theory of language that represents genre as a mode or conduit of communication and communicative action, with a focus on the contextual interaction between social purposes and text meanings. This functional model asserts that meanings are realized through sets of choices that a given culture uses to express itself (Halliday 1994: 15).

Working on genre within Halliday’s SFL theory, Martin and Rose (2008) build on their own previous work (Martin and Rose 2007) to extend the notion by defining genres as configurations of meaning, with the final goal of mapping cultures as systems of genre. My view is that the colouring books and the terrorist magazines and the sets of
meanings that can be inferred from them are material products of a cultural context (Prown 1982) and, as such, provide their own representation of reality according to their identity within that context.

Also closely related to the conceptualization of genre in this study is that more than one modality of communication is needed to realize a specific genre (Martin and Rose 2008). This consideration includes all that is non-verbal which can be analysed through multimodal analysis as in the case of this study’s methodological approach.

Hybridity is another element that characterizes the genre types in this study. It is argued that the colouring books and the digital magazines are easily exploitable as they belong to what Chandler (1997) refers to as looser and more open-ended genres in terms of permeability of features and boundaries, and are therefore more easily transformed into hybrid products. In particular, the colouring book is similar to a picture book, and is therefore “a complex macro-genre whose bimodality (visual and linguistic semiotic modes) ranges from the wordless or near-wordless picture book to “illustrated stories” (Martin and Rose 2008: 4). Really Big Coloring Books added the verbal features of speech balloons, thought bubbles and typography to transform the traditional colouring book into a mixed-genre type. With reference to these verbal features, it is important to point out that this study’s text analysis regards the visual aspects of speech and attempts to illustrate how these contribute to the general composition of content and their role in supporting the images. This implies that the intervention of hybridity on these colouring books foregrounds visual resources, while verbal features are consequently positioned in relation to these in order to amplify the more prosodic and para-linguistic aspects of speech.

The above perspective, by positing that genres are not constant concepts but ever-changing ways of meaning-making, facilitates the description and analysis of the genre-dissimilar products that form the two subcorpora. The kind of visual and verbal communicative action identified by the author is based on a pattern of stimulus / response that connects the two different genres. This pattern can also be construed as provocation / counter-provocation or recruitment rhetoric / anti-terrorist admonition.

4. Methodological tools

Table 1 below provides a comprehensive view of the visual and verbal features analysed in both the colouring books and the digital terrorist magazines. Considering that the analysis and interpretation of visual forms requires going beyond the study of a single aspect alone (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996), the representational, interactional and compositional metafunctions are taken into account as they are part of the same network system of visual communication (Kress and van Leeuwen 1990, 1996), although each can be foregrounded according to the aim of the investigation. Table 2 illustrates the resources under each metafunction that have been selected for this study’s visual and verbal analysis.

5. Findings

This section presents the analysis of the images by applying the framework in Table 1 according to the stimulus/response pattern discussed previously, also interpreted as
provocation / counter-provocation, recruitment rhetoric / anti-terrorist admonition. The aspects pertaining to the colouring books and the digital magazines in Table 1 will be analysed according to the structures and processes of the three metafunctions listed in Table 2. Furthermore, each element of analysis that constitutes the stimulus, thus originating from the recruitment and self-radicalization magazines, will precede the response of the colouring books.

5.1. Packaging

The discussion begins with the analysis of the front and back cover pages of *Inspire* (Figure 1) and with the feature of salience. According to Kress and van Leeuwen (1996), salience is the visual weight allocated to elements according to size, focus, colour and distance. Both *Inspire* and *Dabiq* magazines feature high-definition, finely-grained colour photographs on glossy paper. The colour scheme of the *Inspire* cover page is dominated by the full colour brown of the hooded jacket and the black gun. These colours are contextualized against a poorly articulated background with faded pictures of individuals probably cut out from magazine covers or newspapers. The colour scheme of the back cover is dominated by the recognizable but faded green of the shrubbery in the background, reinforced by the full green of the individual’s vest. Through this image, the degree of naturalness, and therefore the perception of ‘realness’ of context, is increased compared to the front cover, along with a higher level of credibility of action (*ibid.*). As regards the ‘information value’ of the cover photos, weight is given to the two guns by placing them on the left-hand side of the foreground which is the area attributed to the given or universally known information. The participants’ gaze is not
directed towards the viewer, and their guns, which are used as vectors (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996, 2006), are presumably pointed at the intended victims. By looking at the front cover, the viewer is given a glimpse of what the hooded individual is about to do, and the back cover increases the likeliness of that happening by showing the perpetrator of a possible act of violence. The fact that these individuals are alone most likely suggests and supports the lone wolf attack theory (Pantucci 2011), as claimed in the Editor’s letter at the start of the magazine: “We at Inspire, and in the cause of the events of 9/11 encourage the Muslims in the West to join the Lone Jihad caravan, the caravan that has and always will continue to trouble and bring nightmares to the west” (Yahya Ibrahim, Inspire, Issue 14, 2015, p. 4). In terms of layout, framing panels allow the reader to establish a relation with the actors and events (Kress and van Leeuwen 1996, 2006), and the creation of a reading path from top to bottom is facilitated by the masthead on the front cover with the name of the magazine Inspire, which delineates the top frame and sweeps across the page on a white linen cloth, understood as the symbol of innocence and purity. On the back cover, a call to arms is clearly given by the inclusive pronoun ‘we’, as it is a community term used to prompt collective action. The reading path here begins with the gun, whose function is clearly stated by the front cover line “Assassination Operations”, and subsequently leads to the warning line “O Aqsa 27 We are coming” in the bottom frame of the back cover.

The packaging features of the front and back covers of the colouring book ISIS – A Culture of Evil (Figure 2) include the use of glossy paper similar to that of the magazines. The participants are attributed a high level of salience through the use of full

27 According to a report by the Middle East Media Research Institute (MEMRI) the phrase “O Aqsa, We are coming,” has become almost an official sign-off for Al-Qaeda in the Arabian Peninsula (AQAP) in any productions by its official media arm, al-Malahem. This warning refers to the liberation of the Al-Aqsa Mosque, located in the Old City of Jerusalem, which will come after the war of the End of Days in Dabiq (Israel http://www.jns.org/).
colours based on the modulation of dark red, yellow, brown and the white of the speech bubbles. The back cover uses a wider range of lighter colours that give it a greater degree of brightness. The larger size of the actors compared to the other objects on both covers is established by placing them in the foreground and by drawing their silhouette with clearly defined lines. In this polarized composition of front and back, the reading path seems to accompany the reader from darkness to light, from the present (given) to the future (new), which might be considered a message of hope. In reference to gaze, while the participants on the front cover establish eye contact with the viewers, the participants on the back cover look at each other, thus emphasizing the idea of community and belongingness. As for the framing strategy, the masthead on the front cover with the name of the colouring book “ISIS – A Culture of Evil” and the sub-heading “a true to life graphic comic book”, forms the top panel. The centre panel is completely occupied by the actors carrying out a number of highly symbolic actions. The first speech bubbles appear in the centre frame with a white background and rhetorical question written in red letters: what will you do when they come for you? As these colouring books aim to mimic the same rhetoric contained in the terrorist digital magazines which are full of intertextual quotations from a variety of sources including religious texts, poems, songs, films and adverts, this reference brings to mind the 1987 Inner Circle song Bad Boys whose provocative refrain is “Bad boys, bad boys, whatchagonna do when they come for you” 28. The bottom panel is occupied by symbols of ancient Greek or Roman civilization that have been destroyed. The back cover is also divided into three panels. The top panel features a blue sky with the rhetorical question placed in the ideal position “will the human race ever embrace real peace and real love for their neighbours?”, thus emphasizing, as mentioned previously, the idea of Utopia. The cen-

28 Retrieved from: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=f4MRmEPNUxY.
The panel highlights a symbolic embrace between individuals from apparently different religions against a more naturalistic background. The bottom frame of the back cover, placed underneath the three children, the name of the company and the statement “100% USA MADE” seem to establish identity and superiority, very similarly to the warning line closing off the back cover of the terrorist magazine described above.

5.2. Stakeholder representation

Stakeholder representation (Table 2) would seem to be an affiliation strategy used by the terrorist organizations for self-radicalization purposes conducted through magazine propaganda and by the publisher of the colouring books to disseminate their anti-terrorist warnings. Stakeholders are represented differently in the two subcorpora images even if the narratives that are used are the same. The superhero narrative along with perfect brotherhood belongingness and lone wolf representation in these magazines are employed to highlight the superiority of the Islamic State warrior. These same narratives are used in the colouring books to represent ordinary heroes as superheroes that protect the American community as a whole, whether as entire institutions or individuals, from the threat of terrorism. Enemies in both publications are also considered stakeholders as they especially represent the counter-narrative of the opposing culture and, as such, they are the evil force that must be destroyed.

Repeated and reinforced through various stylistic and content elements, the superhero in the magazines is first of all representative of the Islamic State’s ideal of masculine superiority manifested through the stark contrast with the simplistic construction and dehumanization of the enemy.

The men in Figure 3 are attributed superhero status as their behaviour clearly displays strong commitment to the jihad cause. Picture 1 is only one of the many close-up shots contained in both magazines. The eyeline vector that emanates from this participant is directed towards an unidentified something and there is no action, but rather a reaction. Indeed, the cover line O, America, Our response is what you see, not what you hear seems to be a thought formed in the mind of the participant himself. The man in this picture is ready to act as his gaze and naturalistic pose stand for confidence and credibility. Brotherhood and belongingness, another indicator of superhero status, is established in picture 2 by the presence of props: the keffiyeh, the headwear often worn.
with camouflage-style clothing, the guns that are part of their apparel, the ISIS flag barely visible in the background, and their beards. In many countries and throughout time, this last item has often been considered as the symbol of manliness (Bengry 2014), but within the ISIS militant group it is more than that: it is also a symbol of obedience. In fact, ISIS recently issued an order stating that all of their warriors were to grow full beards on the grounds that shaving is *haram* (forbidden) under *Sharia* law \(^{29}\). By displaying a naturalistic pose, these two men, interconnected by their gaze while engaging in conversation, are placed in what looks like a garden or tree-lined context emphasizing the credibility of the situation. The superhero warrior in *Dabiq* appeals to a multiethnic audience from which they find their recruits who are exhorted to abandon the land of *Shirk*: a land of idolatry or polytheism, where there is the worship of another God besides Allah \(^{30}\). The two young radicalized Western-looking men in picture 3 have probably followed this call as they hold the Koran and use the one-finger salute as a vector towards Allah. This salute is common in ISIS propaganda, both on the battlefield and in the final minutes before martyrdom. It refers to the first half of the *shahada*, the affirmation of Muslim faith that is recited before every prayer. The reference passage defines the Muslim faith in saying that: “*There is no god but Allah, and Muhammad is his Prophet.*” This gesture was actually used by Muslims long before the Islamic State and signified the *tawhid*, the belief in the oneness of God \(^{31}\). According to the article headline in picture 4, *Affliction and Faith* are two qualities that allow the injured ISIS superhero to overcome the fear of death and look with courage towards suffering and the possibility of martyrdom.

---

\(^{29}\) [http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/isis-beard-police-enforce-shaving-ban-mosul-1503787.](http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/isis-beard-police-enforce-shaving-ban-mosul-1503787.)


In Figure 4 above, pictures 1 and 2 are only two examples of the many others found in these terrorist magazines, and especially in *Inspire*, as they portray the lone wolf warrior, another representation through which the superhero narrative is reinforced. Avoiding the disclosure of the superhero’s identity by depicting convincingly intriguing, strong, mysterious versions of undercover *jihad* soldiers, capable of intermingling with the rest of society without being noticed, encourages self-radicalization and attracts potential terrorist recruits.

The dehumanization of individuals, as shown in the next set of pictures in Figure 5, is a strategy consisting in the representation of the Western citizens as awkward and helpless individuals (Weimann 2008). By treating the enemy as ‘less than human’, the superiority of the ISIS warrior is strengthened. The participants in picture 1 are not
well defined owing to the context which is faded and distorted. Pictures 2 and 3 use intertextual references to *DEAD* or *ALIVE* posters for the purpose of turning their targeted victims into ransom money.

Stakeholder representation is also employed by the colouring book publisher to convey an anti-terrorist admonition message.

The superhero strategy, as illustrated in the terrorist publications, is also part of the colouring books’ rhetoric. The two images above are from the colouring book *We Shall Never Forget - Vol. II - The True Faces of Evil - Terror*.

The individuals in picture 1 (Figure 6) represent superheroes that are, in fact, ordinary heroes who, according to *Big Coloring Books*, are always in the frontline against terrorist attacks, and are in stark contrast with the Islamic State’s idea of hero and heroic actions. In picture 2, the US President and other top politicians and institutional figures are also pictured among these heroes, as they are the guardians of the US constitution.

Conceptual processes of narration are used by both publishers to represent the symbolic attributes of the enemy. The objects and the accompanying text in pictures 1 and 2 (Figure 7) from *Inspire* are metonymic expressions of the attacks committed in New York and Paris. Similarly, in picture 3 from *ISIS - A Culture of Evil*, the terrorist threat is directed towards the destruction of entire continents, also represented by their recognizable symbols.

Through the use of the broken pencil as a simple but potent vector, all of the actions undertaken in pictures 1, 2 and 3 of Figure 7 are placed on a timeline showing the past, present and future of terrorism, emphasized by the colour red that gives salience to the rising and blood-shedding action on the flow chart (Figure 8, picture 1).

The community of stakeholders in the colouring book *ISIS - a Culture of Evil*, represented by journalists, politicians, members of the armed forces, Christian and Muslim men, women and children, immigrant communities, and Western institutions, mirror the ‘brotherhood’ metaphor used in the terrorist magazines. Collectively, they are heroes intent on defending their freedom and potential victims of terrorism.

The top panel of picture 1 (Figure 9) is occupied by headline news announcing ter-
Figure 8. Timeline. Picture 1 (Inspire Issue 14, 2015:48)

Figure 9. Institutions as stakeholders. Picture 1 (ISIS - A Culture of Evil 2015:4); picture 2 (ISIS – A Culture of Evil 2015:27)
The element of intertextuality, similarly to the terrorist magazine, is evident in the use of TV news references such as ‘Live’ and ‘Breaking News’, placed in the top panel. The centre panel emphasizes this element with the pictures of famous anchor women and men from major US TV channels who are framed in poster-like fashion. There is no transaction among the actors, but the connection is established directly with the reader especially through the use of gaze and personal close-up shots.

Targeting members of the media either as victims or enemies is a common strategy in both publications. In the colouring book these men and women are victims, but also holders of the truth as they are the ones, according to the Big Coloring Books publishing house, who tell-it-like-it-is. The bottom panel is occupied by a message written in TV style credits. The institution that is being targeted as the victim of terrorism in picture 2 (Figure 9) is the United Nations and its representatives. Shown in the close-up shots of the foregrounded bottom panel are two other individuals who might be interpreters or other service officers who are looking quite distressed.

Picture 1 in Figure 10 shows a multipanel representation of African-American young men killed by US police soldiers on the streets of their own hometown. Inspire frames this narrative as “the US against their own people”, a subtle message that reinforces the view that American Muslims are not safe in the US. As a response to the terrorist message, pictures 2, 3 and 4 (Figure 10) from the colouring book ISIS – A Culture of Evil, convey a similar message about ISIS and the Muslim people. Divided into three diagonal panels, picture 2 shows rows of young Muslim men who converted to Christianity and are about to be executed in their own country. The articulation of detail draws attention to the degree of probability that these actions correspond to the truth.

Pictures 3 and 4, in which women and children are threatened, as specified in the text written in headline position, are also detailed accounts of how ISIS targets their own people. The absence of panels in these two pictures and the crowded features weaken the idea of the individual being treated as a human being and reinforce the concept of collective dehumanization.

The dehumanization of the enemy described above is substituted by compassionate and caretaking attitudes manifested in the pictures in Figure 11. These pictures are the
representations of stakeholders that are universally known as a country’s future: youth. In picture 1, there are 4 panels delineated by alternating shades of grey and yellow. If read from left to right, the focus is both on the message headline *Be Merciful*, and on the young child’s bandaged finger. In pictures 1 and 2, the reiteration of the image of the adult warrior as a superhero apparently aims to present an alternative, peaceful narrative which is sophisticated and appealing (Becker 2014). However, by exploiting images of youth and children in their propaganda, *Inspire* hopes to recruit Western and North African youth (Ali 2015), but also others who live in areas such as Eastern Europe, the Caucasus, central Asian parts of the former Soviet Union and Asia. This double stand-
ard attitude is unmasked in the colouring books in picture 3 of *ISIS – A Culture of Evil* which shows an ISIS soldier inviting the “kids” to “join the Caliphate”. This, however, is written in a speech balloon with a jagged tail, which usually indicates anger or shouting and, in fact, in the upper left-hand side of the top panel, the word “hate” written in bold letters seems to reveal the real truth behind the warrior’s intention.

Lone wolf representations are also exploited in the colouring books. In pictures 1 and 2 of Figure 12, readers are warned of possible attacks by terrorists who can look like ordinary people. Picture 1 is divided into two panels which have an articulated background with sufficient details that provide contextual reference of location confirmed by the war apparel. Panels 1 and 2 of this picture are connected not only by the same figure, but also by the vectors that are pointing upwards, the gun on the left and the freedom tower with the long antenna pointing skyward. In this picture, the headline “coming soon to a city near you” is clearly an intertextual reference related to film or theatre trailers.

Picture 2 is characterized by articulation of depth. The figure in the background is given more salience compared to those of the victims that are in the foreground as it is
totally black. This figure, placed above the rest in the ideal frame, cannot be coloured in, and it is therefore untouchable. Although these too are simplistic representations of terrorists, similar to those shown in the recruitment magazines of Western citizens, the purpose here is to convince the readers, through the use of colouring book conventions, that the threat of terrorism within our own countries is real.

In both publications, the enemy is the counterpart’s victim and is therefore a stakeholder. In the terrorist publications, the enemy is a well-known politician or businessman, and close-up shots with name and affiliation (Figure 13, pictures 1 and 2) or a cover line, as in the Obama picture, are effective representational conventions through which weaknesses and faults are revealed. Those in the colouring books can take the form of cut-out trading cards (Figure 14, picture 1) with names and descriptions of state leaders (picture 2), or the entire ISIS organization (picture 3).

The use of modern media as a message conduit is common to both publications. The terrorist magazines contain pictures showing members of ISIS using laptops (Figure 15, picture 1) or references to open source materials (Figure 15, picture 2). Internet media are also the primary link to jihadi ideology due to the digital nature of the magazine.

The colouring books also contain references to the media-literate and knowledgeable terrorists (Figure 15, picture 3), pictured as informed and savvy individuals.

Inspire magazine and the colouring book ISIS - A Culture of Evil also normalize what is really not normal as illustrated by Inspire’s business-of-the-day page (Figure 16, picture 1) and a who-to-call page in the colouring book (Figure 16, picture 2).

5.3. Verbal analysis: speech balloons and headlines

A speech balloon, or the carrier, is one of the most representative devices associated with the visual language of comics (Cohn 2013). These devices are conventionalized signs of speech, thought and sound effects that extend towards the speaker, or the root (ibid.), with a line known as the tail. They play a variety of functional roles in representation, but one of the most important is the integration of text and image into a meaningful whole (Horn 1998; McCloud 1993; Cohn 2003, 2013), which Mitchell (1986) has referred to as “imagetexts”. Another element that describes this combination is
adjoined texts which are a ‘voice over’ of an entity’s narration (Mitchell 1986). Adjoined texts can take on a reading track separate from that of the visual sequence, which is not specifically connected to any carrier in order to give the narration a universal message (Cohn 2003, 2013).

The headlines and sub-headlines of a magazine or newspaper are often the reader’s point of entry (Dor 2003). Along with photos, they are the first element of a composition that is noticed, often followed by additional information in sub-headlines. They follow rules of simplicity and directness in order to make an immediate impact. Both publications use headlines in similar ways, but to achieve different purposes. In picture 1 of
Figure 17, *Inspire* places the headline text containing the loaded words *hate* and *fight* in the lower panel accompanied by the exclamation mark as the vector that originates from the top panel. The colouring book page (Figure 17, picture 2) also uses the vector of the *Jihadi John* knife to connect the headline question positioned in a text box in the top panel which stands for the unknown information, and the pictures of destruction in the other three overlapping panels. The pronoun *you* in both images acts as the intended recipient of the message, but this direct address also clearly establishes a polarization of the participants.

As mentioned above, these devices are more frequently used in comic books than in picture or colouring books. As can be noticed in picture 1 of Figure 18, the message in the top panel is not actually encapsulated in a balloon or a bubble, but is nevertheless delineated by an uneven line resembling the tail of a balloon. The lower panel also features a speech balloon, but the text resembles a ‘to-do’ list of items and the tail is a jagged line, usually signifying loudness.

In picture 2 (Figure 18), the top panel headline uses narrative markers such as *meanwhile*. The rest of the spoken text is not contained within speech balloons, but it is out in the gutter, understood as the space between the panels. The unorganized position of the spoken text is emphasized by the overlapping images that occupy two or more panel spaces. As substitutes for speech balloons, the *Inspire* picture (Figure 18, picture 3) uses a quote as the carrier of the message (Cohn 2003, 2013). The pronoun *we* establishes a dialogue and provides a window into thoughts and ideas of the speaker but, as in the previous example, it is also an ‘us’ and ‘them’ polarization device (van Dijk 2005). There are overlapping panels, but the world time zone clocks are vectors that connect the whole image carrying the message of a ‘24/7’ terrorism. All three pictures are an example of how text and image are directly interfaced with each other.

5.4. Thought balloons

While the content of speech balloons and sound effects are meant to be heard by all characters in the narrative, the content of thought balloons is known only by the char-
actor in the panel. A thought balloon can also contain a visual image such as in picture 1 of Figure 19.

Salience is given to the characters in the foreground of the bottom panel in pictures 1 and 2 of Figure 19. In picture 1, the victim’s thoughts are connected to him through the use of indexical tails which also connect the present situation to the past events. In picture 2, the thought bubble contains the terrorist’s thought, but the word ‘Ideology’ seems to be disconnected from the rest of the image and is similar to an external voice.

Figure 19. Thought bubbles. Picture 1 (ISIS - A Culture of Evil 2015:8); picture 2 (ISIS - A Culture of Evil 2015:13)

Figure 20. Using speech and thought bubbles in magazines. Picture 1 (Inspire Issue 14, 2015:32); picture 2 Inspire Issue 14, 2015:33)
Although thought bubbles are not a typical convention of magazines, *Inspire* uses the technique of bringing the past into the present and gives access to a character’s thoughts through personal storytelling techniques (Figure 20, picture 1). The typography used in the title of this article contained in the top panel, whose space is shared by the character, is a revelation of inner thoughts and motivations. Picture 2 (Figure 20) uses a tail-like bracket to indicate that the text placed underneath it is also a personal account of a character’s experience.

5.5. *Adjacent text*

Adjacent text is connected to the image through captions or proximity (Cohn 2013), as in Figure 21, picture 1. This form is typical of captions positioned in the top or bottom panels of the picture which usually have a narrative or storytelling function (Cohn 2013). In picture 1, the caption is in a text box on the side, while in pictures 2 and 3 the adjacent text is in caption style overlapping the pictures.
The colouring books contain many captions, a feature co-opted from the comic book or graphic novel (Figure 22, pictures 1 and 2), but they also contain text which is adjacent to the images, either in the panel gutter or in text boxes, so as to highlight that the message has a multiple root and not a single individual. Elements of typography are expertly woven into the images (picture 2).

6. Discussion

An NBC news I-Team press release dated November 11, 2015 states that the counter-terrorist colouring book, produced by the St. Louis company, is in contrast to “flashy recruiting magazines put out by some foreign terrorist groups” published in the Arabian Peninsula and distributed within the US. I only partially agree with the content of this press release as the comment does not take into account genre-dissimilar aspects and the process of hybridity discussed in the previous sections. The study has attempted to demonstrate that the colouring books’ mission, clearly in contrast with the ideology of the terrorist magazines, was to re-write the genre by exploiting conventions similar to those used by *Inspire* and *Dabiq* in order to provide a counter-terrorist response to terror provocation. More specifically, Western and non-Western writers, illustrators and publishers have relied on the following common features to design their editorial products:

1. flexible genre conventions to convey a specific vision of the world;
2. same-age group audiences for radicalization or admonition purposes;
3. exploitation strategies to convey the essence of their message through visual and verbal resources.

As also mentioned above, colouring books are a unique medium that reaches out to people of all ages and *Really Big Coloring Books* have built an entire business dedicated to this production. In my opinion, however, this company’s biggest intuition was to contaminate the medium by turning it into a hybrid genre in order to disseminate their perspectives on issues such as education, religion, politics and terrorism among young audiences. Indeed, the genre has been transformed into a channel for the popularization of terrorism discourse. Drawing on knowledge dissemination theories, identified specifically with popularization processes, the re-packaging and communication of content for clearly defined purposes (Ciapuscio 2003; Calsamiglia and van Dijk 2004) and for specifically targeted audiences is the design rationale underlying the Chicago publisher’s products.

In similar ways, dissemination of self-radicalization ideology through digital magazines has been expertly exploited by the terrorist organizations, as discussed throughout the paper. The medium has served the purpose of appealing to Muslim youth living in many areas of the world, preferably, but not exclusively, in the English language, and through cultural and religious symbols.

It is hard to determine the extent to which the target audiences of both cultural products have been influenced by the content, but the workings of the narratives proposed and realized by the visual and verbal meaning-making resources in both genre

---

types cannot leave the viewer unaffected; their messages are not neutral, but act as potent weapons that require both an action and a reaction from the onlooker.

The analysis of the visual structures has been foregrounded because of the nature of the publications that are heavily based on visual stimuli and mainly dependent on narrative patterns. Visual structures, such as the ones presented in this study, according to Kress and van Leeuwen (2006: 47), do not simply reproduce the structures of reality, but “they produce images of reality which are bound up with the interests of the social institutions within which the images are produced, circulated and read. They are ideological. Visual structures are never merely formal: they have a deeply important semantic dimension.”

More specifically, the representational meaning of the terrorist recruiting magazines is sustained by the narrative of heroism and individual commitment to the cause. But the hero does not act alone. He is supported by an entire community that reaches out wherever Muslim youth might be located. This is where the interactional metafunction is realized. Throughout the narrative, the element of community is tangible and is characterized by aspects of equality, involvement, and intimacy as well as by processes of the exclusion of ‘the others’. Through this recruiting rhetoric, conventional structures, resources and symbols of Western communication strategies are exploited, and compositional elements of terrorist speech, thoughts and plans within a business-of-the-day framework are portrayed.

With reference to the colouring books, my impression is that the American publishing house wanted to create a counter-narrative based on a stimulus-response pattern. The colouring books’ representation of terrorism is that of an imminent and perpetual threat coming from the inside; a threat which includes targeting Muslims and non-Muslims. There is no mercy for the stakeholders of peace, according to CEO Wayne Bell. Really Big Coloring Books, in answer to the provocation enacted by the recruitment magazines, exploits the same visual and verbal features to establish a universally-understood language in order to launch a wake-up call addressed to all those who are striving to defeat terrorism.

Conclusion

The discussion outlined above provides an overall response to the study’s overarching research question which focused on the impact that media packaging might have on popular opinion, beliefs and affiliation. One of the paper’s aims was to discuss how these media products formulated a stimulus-response pattern of communication in order to increase the cultural resonance of their storytelling techniques. In so doing, the study has arguably provided evidence that these colouring books and magazines, open to manipulation and exploitation, inevitably encourage visual media messages that stereotype groups or individuals that reinforce rather than challenge social misconceptions (Lowenfeld in King 1991). Borrowing from cultivation theory, which mainly refers to the long-term effects of television, it can be argued that the same effects of repeated exposure to TV also apply to the repeated exposure to a certain view of the world depicted in other media materials, by which mental content is generated that is by and large homogeneous and with a partial view of reality (Griffin et al. 2014; West and Turner 2014). As discussed in this paper, the superhero and lone wolf narratives are created by
both western and non–western cultures through their products in order to become part of a common consciousness and shape certain perceptions of the world.

As a final remark, I would like to briefly discuss this study’s limitations. The first is related to the sensitive nature of the collected data and to the scope of the study which deserved a fuller exploration of the meaning potential underlying the data and, consequently, of the results. Another limitation, as briefly mentioned above, regards ascertaining the impact that these magazines and colouring books or other similar media might realistically have on both Muslim and non-Muslim youth. Research in this area would increase the awareness that media formats have alternative agendas that do not always correspond to fair and balanced representations of reality, and would hopefully encourage a more peaceful and unbiased discussion of issues concerning terrorist opposition.

References

**Primary sources**


Really Big Coloring Books Inc. 2015. *ISIS - A Culture of Evil*. St. Louis, Missouri, USA: Wayne Bell Publisher.


**Secondary sources**


Web references
http://jihadology.net/category/dabiq-magazine/
http://jihadology.net/category/inspire-magazine/
http://www.nbcnewyork.com/investigations/
Abstract
Since its launch in 2005, YouTube has become the hosting platform of many virtual communities, including makeup lovers. A few of them have achieved such popularity that they are referred to as ‘makeup gurus’. Thanks to their notoriety and influence, these YouTubers have been able to make a profession out of makeup video posting and are often recruited as digital influencers by cosmetic brands. In order to appear as makeup experts (thus generating revenue from their videos), these so-called ‘gurus’ typically adapt the specific language of makeup and cosmetics to the new Internet video medium, leading to the creation of a new Web genre, the YouTube makeup tutorial.

Inspired by the success of English-speaking ‘makeup gurus’, Italian YouTubers have emulated them, thus bringing this relatively new genre into the Italian ‘makeupsphere’. In spite of the potential borderlessness of the Web, this process entailed a degree of linguistic and cultural adaptation which this study investigates by focusing on the generic, rhetorical and linguistic practices of English- and Italian-speaking ‘makeup gurus’ and highlighting how these languages and their associated discursive strategies are used in different cultural contexts, albeit within the same virtual platform and utilizing the same generic resources. Starting from the assumption that it represents an instance of language for specific purposes (LSP) largely unexplored so far, the verbal component of makeup video tutorials is examined and a comparison is drawn between the rhetorical, discursive and lexical preferences in the language in which this genre originated (English) and within a new linguo-cultural environment (Italian). Analysis suggests an ongoing tension between the global and the local dimension of YouTube makeup culture, as highlighted by the frequent phenomena of language contact and interference described in the chapter.

1. YouTube makeup tutorials: background information

Social media discourses currently play a major role in the general perception of the social and cultural transformations of the body (Katz 2015). More specifically, social media makeup discourse significantly contributes to the long ongoing debate over the body as a social object, which can undergo a process of re-creation, enhancement of ‘fixing’ through the use (and consumption) of cosmetic products (see, among others, Phak-
On account of its heavy reliance on the visual component, YouTube has come to be one of the preferred social media hosting platforms for cosmetic communication and has favoured the creation of a very active and widespread video community of makeup lovers. Users from all countries typically use their YouTube channels to share information and tips, do product reviews, announce new collections, and post tutorials and how-to’s (Kedveš 2013). The makeup tutorial, the main object of this study, is a hybrid genre which combines the instruction genre with a vlogging component, i.e. a diary or blog relying on the video medium. Most of these videos are produced in English as the YouTube makeup tutorial phenomenon first originated in the USA, but more and more content is being uploaded on the global video platform in other languages.

The reasons underlying such a vast growth of footage about makeup are multiple: first and foremost, YouTube has a free sharing policy which allows anyone with a camera and an Internet connection to post videos. This means that many users enjoy uploading content and they do it as a hobby. For a limited number of makeup lovers producing videos has instead become a profession. They are so popular on the platform and are regarded as so authoritative by the online community that cosmetic brands have started to recruit them as so-called ‘digital influencers’. These YouTubers, commonly referred to as ‘makeup gurus’, are often paid through sponsorship or endorsement deals to incorporate and promote products in their videos (Wu 2016). This business practice seems successful and is therefore very widespread.

Since the launch of YouTube in 2005, many cosmetic companies have opened accounts on the platform to use them as channels featuring advertorial content. However, consumers show a tendency to prefer amateur videos produced by makeup YouTubers as they look more genuine and trustworthy. Inspired by the success of English-speaking ‘gurus’, Italian YouTubers have emulated them, thus adapting makeup videos to a different linguo-cultural context.

This study explores English and Italian makeup video tutorials in a cross-linguistic and cross-cultural perspective. It rests on the assumption that genres, such as the makeup tutorial which represents the main object of this analysis, are “clusters of typified responses to recurrent communicative needs and situations [and] are firmly embedded in the cultural contexts where they are used and are thus highly sensitive to cultural variations” (Garzone 2004: 312; cf. Miller 1984) and aims to provide an explanation of what ‘culture’ may mean within the YouTube makeup domain. The earliest definitions of ‘culture’ within Cultural Studies gave much prominence to national and ethnic identities from a historical standpoint (cf. Williams 1981), whereas later research problematized the role and importance of the concept of nation and ethnicity. Studies on globalization and its transformative effects on identity put the emphasis on the emergence of a tension between ‘global’ and ‘local’ cultures. Drawing on Giddens (1990: 17-21) who identifies it as one of the constitutive elements of the globalized so-

---

1 In 2014, beauty was the fourth-leading industry with the largest reach of influencers in online marketing in the United States (cf. Statista 2016).
ciety, Hall et al. (1996: 619) describe time-space compression as the aspect that mostly affects cultural identities and contend that the global does not replace the local, but a new ‘articulation’ emerges between them. Robertson (1995) also addresses the issue of how homogenization and heterogenization are only seemingly opposing trends, and he utilizes the notion of “glocalization” to refer to communication practices that are both aimed at increasingly global audiences as well as adapted to differentiated local and particular realities. In this regard, Chouliaraki and Fairclough (1999) notice that the presence of fuzzier margins between the global and the local dimension and the subsequent increase in interaction across linguistic and cultural boundaries often lead to the appearance of hybrid discourses.

This arguably applies to Web-mediated communication, which, thanks to the affordances of the electronic medium it relies on, offers the opportunity for both a “global reach” (Askehave and Ellerup Nielsen 2005) and the tailoring of messages. YouTube videos are a case in point: they are posted on a global platform and can therefore be watched by anyone, but they are produced within and possibly address specific cultural and linguistic contexts. YouTube’s affordances allow groups of people who – in spite of having different cultures and languages – share the same passion about a topic and wish to deepen their knowledge and expertise to interact on an ongoing basis (Wenger et al. 2002: 4). This type of interaction gives rise to digital communities of practice, i.e. communities defined by common interests, conventions, tool usage, values, and standards (Wenger 1998). After the advent of online global platforms such as YouTube, communities of practice with cross-national and cross-linguistic backgrounds have become increasingly more widespread. The identity of their members is extremely intricate as it is shaped by both their national and linguistic (local) culture as well as by the (global) culture of their digital community of practice.

The virtual community of makeup artists and lovers represents an interesting example in this regard. Their remarkable abilities in exploiting the potentials of video social media – and of YouTube specifically – has enabled them to increase their networks and sharpen their communication skills, adjusting traditional off-line genres to the new medium and even creating new ones. The genre of the makeup tutorial first originated in English-speaking countries and then spread to other regions of the world, thus undergoing a process of adaptation. As a consequence, it is possible to hypothesize that the tension between the online global discourse of makeup lovers’ community of practice and the diversified local linguo-cultural environments in which the latter is articulated may result in hybrid, glocalized communication.

2. Method and study design

Starting from these premises, this study sets out to compare the generic, rhetorical and linguistic conventions of English- and Italian-speaking ‘makeup gurus’, illustrating how these languages and their associated discursive strategies are used in different cultural contexts, albeit within the same virtual platform as well as within the same type of video, i.e. the makeup tutorial.

2 Robertson stresses that glocalization is a widespread phenomenon in the marketing domain.
Drawing on the assumption that it represents an instance of language for specific purposes (LSP) that has, as yet, attracted scant academic interest, the discussion of the language of YouTube makeup tutorials is informed by the various linguistic contributions to the study of LSP (see, among others, Swales 1990; Bhatia 1993; Gotti 2003; Candlin and Gotti 2004; Garzone 2006; Garzone et al. 2016). Specifically, the verbal component of English and Italian makeup videos is explored in order to bring out differences and similarities across cultures and languages: particular attention is devoted to the rhetorical organization of YouTubers’ monologues (Section §3) (see Swales 1990; Bhatia 1993), the text type(s) they tend to prefer (Section §4) (see Werlich 1976; Hatim and Mason 1990), and the specialized terminology they utilize in their tutorials (Section §5) (Calsamiglia and van Dijk 2004; Garzone 2006).

In order to explore these issues, a corpus consisting of thirty makeup tutorials uploaded on YouTube over the course of seven months (October 2014 - April 2015) has been collected. Videos were selected on the basis of their representativeness: content uploaded by some of the most popular English- and Italian-speaking ‘beauty gurus’ was chosen and analysed. More precisely, the 15 tutorials in English were posted on three of the most subscribed YouTube How to & Style channels (also ranking within the top 300 most subscribed channels of the whole YouTube platform), i.e. Michelle Phan’s (USA), Tanya Burr’s (England), and Lauren Curtis’ (Australia). Michelle Phan is probably the most famous makeup YouTuber: she is a 30-year old American and her videos have been watched more than a billion times. Tanya Burr is an English makeup artist with almost 3.7 million subscribers: she is famous for her ‘celebrity looks’. Lauren Curtis is a 24-year old Australian who has 3.6 million followers.

As regards the 15 videos included in the Italian subcorpus, they were also produced by the best-known ‘gurus’, that is to say Clio Zammatteo (ClioMakeup), Nicole Husel (Kissandmakeup01) and Giuliana Arcarese (Makeupdelight2009). Clio Zammatteo was born in Italy and moved to New York City (where she currently lives) in 2007. With 980,000 subscribers, she is the most famous Italian makeup YouTuber. Nicole Husel was born in Trieste, Italy, to a Slovenian father and an Italian mother. She recently moved back to Italy after spending some years in Amsterdam. Giuliana Arcarese is 42. When she was 22 she moved to the United States and she now lives in San Diego (CA).

The above selection suggests that, in spite of its American origins, the makeup tutorial genre has spread extensively in the English-speaking world (namely to the UK and to Australia). Moreover, it is important to note that the most popular Italian users seem to have a hybrid cultural identity: in actual fact, two out of the three makeup artists selected for this research currently reside in the USA (Zammatteo and Arcaneese) and the third one has a double nationality, comes from Trieste (a city famous for its mixed

3 Although videos mainly rely on images and are semiotically very complex, the main focus of this study is the verbal component of makeup tutorials because they have hardly been tackled from a linguistic perspective until now.
4 See Appendix for more details.
5 Data collected in May 2015 (YouTube).
6 With the exception of Lauren Curtis, all the makeup YouTubers selected for this study have published non-fiction beauty guides and autobiographies. Moreover, thanks to their YouTube success, most of them have also been able to launch their own makeup line (data collected in February 2017; see YouTube).
ethnic background) and has spent part of her life in the Netherlands (Husel). This multifaceted identity of ‘beauty gurus’ seems to be in keeping with the international and cross-cultural character of global platforms such as YouTube and with the transnational and translinguistic nature of digital communities of practice.

3. The rhetorical organization of makeup tutorials in English and Italian

Makeup tutorials are one of the most popular typologies of videos posted by ‘beauty gurus’. Although frequency of publication mainly depends on the single YouTuber, those who achieve a certain degree of notoriety typically upload content quite often (i.e. more than once a week), so that they can maintain their level of exposure as well as keep their audience’s attention high. A strategy that allows makeup celebrities to produce topical as well as timely content is to match the makeup looks they propose to the calendar and to yearly festivities, seasons, holidays and events. This stratagem can be observed in both English and Italian makeup channels: for example, all the YouTubers (with the exception of Tanya Burr) posted a Valentine’s Day makeup tutorial. Famous televised happenings featuring VIPs also provide a good source of inspiration: another common kind of makeup tutorial is the recreation of a specific makeup look worn by a public figure on one of these occasions. Albeit with differences regarding the events and the people mentioned in the videos, both English- and Italian-speaking makeup artists instruct their audience on how to reproduce celebrities’ looks (e.g. in her “TUTORIAL TRUCCO Charlize Theron SANREMO 2015”, Clio Zammatteo explains how to recreate Charlize Theron’s makeup look which the actress wore as a guest at the Sanremo Festival).

Whereas the time contexts in which the genre of the tutorial is realized are analogous in both subcorpora, a certain tension between generic integrity and innovation can be observed (Bhatia 1999), especially in the Italian subcorpus, as regards their rhetorical organization. If Swales’s (1990) and Bhatia’s (1993) models are applied to gurus’ monologues, it is possible to identify a common set of communicative intentions as well as a similar internal structure. Swales (1990) and Bhatia (1993) adopt a functional approach to genre which highlights the centrality of the notion of “communicative purpose” and explores the relation between the aims and the rhetorical organization of texts. Both their models suggest that genres rely on a series of “moves” (further subdivided in “steps”) in order to perform the “typified rhetorical action” (Miller 1984) underlying their use. Analysis shows that, for a beauty video to feature as a tutorial, it only needs to realize one main communicative purpose, that is, to instruct the audience. Consequently, it may be stated that providing an expert explanation of the makeup application process represents the typified rhetorical action carried out in tutorials: the

---

7 See Riboni (2017a) for a more detailed analysis of the communicative purposes and the rhetorical structure of YouTube makeup tutorials.

8 A makeup tutorial typically realizes more than just one communicative purpose: for example, self-promotion always plays a crucial role in social media and it arguably accomplishes one of users’ aims in making videos. Moreover, as suggested before, makeup brands often employ famous YouTubers as digital influencers to advertise their products. However, providing some guidance as to how to create a makeup look is what makes a beauty video a tutorial, therefore it may be stated that giving instructions is the main communicative purpose of the genre.
makeup application part of the video is therefore the main and obligatory move of the genre. As a matter of fact, this move usually takes up most of the video and can be found in all the tutorials collected.

However, the Italian makeup tutorials collected for this study sometimes deviate from their English counterparts. Giuliana Arcarese’s videos are a case in point when she occasionally blends the how-to component of her footage with the review of the product(s) she is about to utilize for the look she intends to create. Consequently, it may be stated that this kind of video accomplishes two rhetorical actions, i.e. providing an opinion on makeup items and showing how they can be used.

Italian YouTubers appear to be more innovative not only as regards the communicative purposes of the makeup tutorial genre, but also as regards their constitutive moves and steps. Typically, this kind of video starts with a Greeting/Welcoming section followed by a short Introduction leading to the makeup application part, which, as already stated, represents the central and core move of the genre. Tutorials normally end with a Leave-Taking move, which may include a Call to Action (i.e. an appeal for the viewer to do something). Codas are non-obligatory final moves: in actual fact, users realize them very rarely (see Riboni 2017a).

As already anticipated, significant differences emerge in the subcorpora as far as makeup tutorial moves are concerned. This can be observed, for examples, in the two initial sections of the videos, i.e. Greetings/Welcomings and Introductions. Greetings carry out a double function: first of all, they mark the beginning of the video which, although featuring a monologue performed in front of the camera, is rhetorically constructed as a conversation with a virtual friend. Additionally, Greetings normally consist of formulaic expressions repeated in all their videos and which acquire the status of a linguistic catch phrase, a feature that helps ‘gurus’ distinguish themselves from the many other similar YouTubers. For example, Michelle Phan usually starts her videos by saying “Hey gorgeous!” whereas Clio Zammatteo is famous for her “Ciao ragazze!” [Hello girls!]

Introductions consist of a summary or ‘abstract’ of the makeup look described in the tutorial (Riboni 2017a; see also Chou et al. 2011); this rhetorical move is crucial and occurs at the beginning, because it is used to reassure viewers that they are watching precisely the video they want to watch (i.e. the one showcasing the makeup look they wish to recreate)\(^9\).

Whereas English-speaking gurus always realize both moves and always realize them verbally (although introductions also rely on visual resources), their Italian counterparts seem less adherent to the genre’s requirements. Nicole Husel and Giuliana Arcarese often skip the Greeting/Welcoming move and occasionally opt for a visual demonstration of the makeup look which may consist in a series of pictures (such as in Husel’s case) or in a very short footage of the person sporting the final look\(^10\). Through these strategies they ensure that the videos do not start too abruptly (in spite of the

---

\(^9\) Video titles can be non-specific or deceptive (sometimes even intentionally so), therefore it is important for YouTubers to provide a summarized description of the makeup look right at the beginning of the tutorial.

\(^10\) Arcarese often films tutorials in which she applies makeup on her friends and not on herself. The introduction of this kind of video normally includes the footage of these girls’ reaction to the final makeup look.
absence of proper greetings) and provide the audience with an initial display of the look, even though this second move is not realized in a verbal form.

As regards the ending moves of the tutorial, a similar variety can be observed. Just like Greetings, leave-taking formulaic expressions are also utilized as distinguishing linguistic trademarks. By and large, the Leave-Taking move is realized by all users, whereas the Call to Action and the Coda can either be carried out or not. The Call to Action step consists in a request for the viewers to interact with the tutorial or the YouTuber by subscribing to the channel, liking or commenting on the video. Even though the ultimate goal of all channels is to widen their follower base, not all of the content creators selected for this study explicitly ask their audience to perform an action, possibly in order to appear disinterested, as if they simply wanted “to share their passion with others by turning on their webcam and performing their favorite routines” (Spyer 2013). Consequently, some makeup artists do not make a verbal Call to Action but display the words “subscribe”/“like”/“share” in one of the last video frames before showing links to their contact information, logo, social media addresses and so forth on the screen, whereas others do not perform this move at all. This variability does not seem to depend on the linguo-cultural environment of the user, but on her personal preference. The same applies to the last optional move, i.e. the Coda. Only one instance of Coda was identified in the corpus (at the end of Michelle Phan’s video “Butterfly Kisses”). Codas represent completely separated texts which do not have anything to do with the makeup look presented but have a different communicative purpose (codas may include “bloopers”, or provide non-makeup lifestyle advice, etc.)

To conclude this analysis of the rhetorical organization of makeup tutorials, it may be stated that a tension between generic integrity and generic innovation can be noticed in this kind of video (as to be expected with all genres, especially recent ones such as those involving YouTube). However, a more distinct tendency towards innovation is perceivable in the Italian subcorpus, which may indicate that the genre of the makeup tutorial is much more consolidated in the English-speaking domain, where it originated, than in the other countries. As a result, Italian makeup artists tend to follow the English model, but they do not adopt it wholesale. This seems to suggest that, as regards the way tutorials are rhetorically organized in the two languages, similarities far outnumber differences, even though it cannot be denied that, when appropriating the genre, Italian YouTubers appear more likely to innovate it, whereas their English-speaking counterparts are more inclined to conform to the established generic format.

After describing and comparing the rhetorical structure of tutorials, in the next section I narrow my analysis to their obligatory move, i.e. the makeup application phase, to study its most relevant textual features.

4. The makeup application move: preferred text types and modes

The examination of the rhetorical organization of tutorials has highlighted the fact that this genre is typically constructed as a virtual conversation with a friend rather than as some kind of lesson. This hypothesis is arguably even further confirmed by the investigation of its main move, which is also the most instructional in nature, that is to say, makeup application.
Whereas it would be legitimate to expect this part of the video to consist in a series of instructions, the analysis shows that users tend to construct it as a narration of the application process instead, as if they were creating a makeup look on themselves and explaining what they were doing to a friend. Consequently, it is the expository text type (Werlich 1976: 71) and not the instructional text type (ibid.: 40) that prevails in tutorials. More specifically, the investigation of discourse markers and predominant verb modes seems to suggest that this makeup application phase represents an instance of (expository) narrative text, as it focuses on its subsequent stages and their relation in time (Hatim and Mason 1990). In fact, the main functional category of discourse markers to be found both in the English and in the Italian videos is time discourse markers which – together with comparable expressions – abound in order to provide a temporal sequencing to the description of the application process:

1. *Now it’s time for* concealer and you guys are gonna think I’m crazy because when I was getting my products ready to use in this video I picked out five different concealers. (TB)
2. *Ora passo al* primer occhi. (NH)
3. *Then* for under my eyes I’m using [brand name and product]. (TB)
4. *Poi* passo il fondotinta – questo è di [brand name] – e lo stendo. (NH)
5. *Last but not least* I’m going to apply this [brand name] lipstick all over my lips just to bring everything in together. (LC)
6. *Ed infine* le vado a rendere un po’ più realistiche con il gel per sopracciglia della [brand name] che aggiunge un po’ di spessore. (CZ) [emphasis added]

Examples 1-6 arguably show that not only are time discourse markers extremely common in both languages, but that equivalents of the same discourse marker are also often utilized. A similar correspondence seems to appear in the use of verb modes and tenses, too. In both English and Italian tutorials the first person pronoun and the indicative mode prevail, as YouTubers illustrate the different steps they are taking and the products they are applying. With the exception of Michelle Phan, users mainly opt for the indicative rather than for the imperative (the mode which one would legitimately expect to recur in a genre such as the tutorial) to describe makeup application from their perspective, as they are experiencing it:

7. To conceal and highlight underneath my eyes I’m gonna use the [brand name and product]. (LC)

---

11 Some exceptional videos feature the YouTubers’ friends (cf., for example, Arcarese’s “Trucco ‘DAY/ NIGHT’ con MICHELA! Makeup Tutorial”) or even their mothers (cf. Curtis’s “Makeup ‘Makeover’ on my MUM!”).

12 The transition from step to step is also realized through the use of verbs indicating sequencing, such as “to start” or its Italian equivalent “iniziare”.

13 I now move on to the eye primer. (NH) 4. *Then* I apply the foundation – this is by [brand name] – and I spread it. (NH) 6. And finally I’m going to make them look more realistic by applying [brand name] brow gel which makes them thicker.

14 Unlike the other YouTubers, Michelle Phan tends to use the imperative rather than the indicative. This may have to do with the fact that, whereas the other girls typically recreate a virtual chat with a friend in their tutorials, she confers a more professional-looking quality to her videos. As already noted, for the time being she is the most successful and popular YouTube ‘makeup guru’ and her notoriety well extends beyond the platform.
8. Then *I'm just going to use* what's left on the brush to go underneath my eyes and do my lower lashes (...). (TB)
9. And *I'm just adding* it a bit more shape with the pencil (...). (TB)
10. *Inizio applicando il primer* su tutto l’occhio. (CZ)
11. *Continuo con il verde acqua.* (GA)
12. *Vado a correggere* il tutto con il fondotinta. (NH) [emphasis added]

The *going to* form (and its contracted variant *gonna*; cf. example 7) is the preferred option in the videos of the English-speaking YouTubers (even though other similar structures such as the present continuous – cf. example 9 – can be identified in the corpus). Italian makeup artists typically describe their actions using the present indicative (with a continuous meaning) but also extensively rely on the expression *andare a [to be going to]*, as example 12 as well as the following ones suggest:

13. *Adesso andiamo a fissare* tutto con la cipria. (CZ)
14. *Ed inizio con l’ombretto “Veiled” che è un color vaniglia satinato e lo vado ad applicare* sull’angolo interno. (GA)
15. *Vado a disegnare* le sopracciglia, sapete già come le faccio. (CZ) [emphasis added]

*Andare a* represents the exact equivalent of the *going to* form; what may be interesting to note is that, whereas English speakers utilize the latter rather regularly, the same cannot be said for its Italian counterpart. *Andare a* may not be defined as a *calqued* expression, but it arguably represents a marked form. This possibly indicates that the English model, in which the first as well as the most popular instances of the genre of the tutorial were and are still performed, exerts such a heavy influence on the language utilized by makeup artists of other countries that it generates phenomena of linguistic interference (just as in the case at hand). This hypothesis is further explored in the following section, where the specialized lexicon of makeup in English and in Italian videos is investigated and compared.

5. Specialized lexicon in makeup tutorials and linguistic interference

From the lexical standpoint, one of the most distinguishing characteristics of tutorials (in both English and Italian) is the significant use of specific terminology. The adoption of specialized lexicon represents a strategy to emphasize users’ membership of the professional makeup artist community of practice (cf. Wenger 1998), a strategy

---

15. 10. *I start* by applying the primer all over my eyelid. (CZ) 11. *I carry on* with the aquamarine. (GA) 12. *I'm going to conceal* everything with foundation. (NH)
16. 13. *Now we are going to set* everything with powder. (CZ) 14. And I *start with the “Veiled” eyeshadow, which is of a satin vanilla shade that I am going to apply* on the inner corner. (GA) 15. *I'm going to draw* my eyebrows. You already know how I do that. (CZ)

17. Although two out of the three gurus selected for the study live in the USA and supposedly have a good command of the English language, the widespread presence of instances of linguistic contact in Italian makeup tutorials cannot be explained as their own, idiosyncratic use of the language. This is firstly because Nicole Husel, the third Italian guru, does not live in an Anglo-Saxon country but avails herself of numerous English words and phrases, too. Moreover, the occurrence of many English words may be a common trait which tutorials share with the advertisement of cosmetic brands.
shared by both English- and Italian-speaking YouTubers. Typically, specialized lexicon in both languages refers to three main domains (Riboni 2017b): makeup application, products/tools, and face parts.

It is interesting to note that, although they are aimed at providing guidance, tutorials do not entirely fit into the expert-layman communication category: in fact, ‘gurus’ almost never use popularizing features such as exemplification, definition, reformulation etc. (cf. Calsamiglia and van Dijk 2004; Garzone 2006), even when the specific terms may be opaque or unknown to their viewers:

16. Now I’m not a big fan of contouring these days, which is quite strange ’cause I used to absolutely love it. (LC)
17. And, if you want a fuller lash line, tightline your upper water line. (MP)
18. Niente eye-liner ma nella rima superiore [dell’occhio], prendo un po’ del colore più scuro della palette della [brand name]. (CZ)
19. Ora passo al primer occhi. Vado a stenderlo su tutta la zona, insomma sulla palpebra mobile e su quella fissa. (NH) [emphasis added]

This decision seems to depend on YouTubers’ intention to make their monologues appear as an instance of expert-to-expert communication, thus emphasizing that they feel they are on an equal footing with their audience. Utilizing very specific terminology to refer to makeup and face parts without providing an explanation for it implicitly rests on the assumption that the viewers are familiar with it, even when this may not be the case. However, this is in keeping with the YouTube tutorial genre, which characteristically aims to draw attention to the skills and expertise of the ‘guru’ while, at the same time, recreating a virtual conversation with the watchers, rhetorically constructed as peers or even as friends and not as learners.

Examples 18-19 contain a typical feature of the specialized lexicon of Italian makeup videos, i.e. a combination of specific terms belonging to the two languages under examination. By and large, the lexical examination of the Italian subcorpus seems to highlight a significant degree of linguistic interference of the genre model language, English. Language contact can result in different phenomena, mainly lexical borrowings (see, among others, Weinreich 1953; Jespersen 1964; Thomason 2001; Haspelmath and Tadmor 2009) and code-mixing20 (see, among others, Blom and Gumperz 1972; Heller 1988; Myers-Scotton 1993, 1997; Gross 2000) whose distinction may not always be straightforward.

Lexical non-integrated borrowings are mostly utilized when an Italian equivalent for the English term does not exist: this is the case of eye-liner and primer (see examples

---

18 As already noted in Riboni (2017b), explaining what products or face parts are involved in the application process may not be totally necessary given the prominent visual component of makeup tutorials. However, the choice of introducing specialized lexicon without clarifying it mainly seems to represent a strategy aimed to discursively create an audience of peers.

19 18. No eyeliner but in the upper lashline [of the eye], I take a little of the darker shade of [brand name]’s palette. (CZ) 19. Now I move on to the eye primer. I spread it all over the area, so on the movable and on the non-movable lid. (NH)

20 In this study the term ‘code-mixing’ is preferred to ‘codeswitching’ as makeup artists typically insert words in English within sentences in Italian, whereas the latter term usually applies to inter-sentential phenomena.
18 and 19). Other borrowings, instead, have been assimilated into the Italian morphological system through affixation. Very often, this process has led to the creation of hypocoristic forms, as suggested by the following examples:

20. Poi, sempre dalla stessa palettina, vado a prendere il rosa e un pizzico del viola. (NH)
21. È bello perché sono dei microglitterini che si notano soprattutto quando, appunto, come lei apriamo l’occhio o chiediamo l’occhio. (CZ) [emphasis added]

The use of these terms of endearment probably represents another strategy which Italian users adopt to confer a sensation of informality and friendliness to their videos. Hypocoristics convey the idea that these YouTubers are extremely fond of makeup – a passion that bonds them with their audience – and they also suggest a close relationship with them. It is to be noted that, besides this type of integrated borrowing (which can obviously be found in the Italian videos only), colloquial terms and expressions belonging to the makeup domain are present in both subcorpora as a strategy to enhance the impression that tutorials feature virtual conversations among friends:

22. And this is instead of using a lip liner because sometimes if I use a lip liner with this lipstick I find it looks a bit too like boom lips on my face. Obviously it is very like wow lips anyway […] (TB)
23. Mi piace perché rispetto a una volta che [brand name] faceva delle beauty blender cioè delle fake beauty blender [gestures air quotes] orribili perché erano gnucche gnucche, la nuova versione è più morbida, vedete? [sic] (CZ) [emphasis added]

Example 23 is particularly interesting as it contains both instances of colloquialisms and of intra-sentential code-mixing. Given the abundant presence of English words in the Italian videos, distinguishing between loan words and code-mixing items may not be immediately straightforward. However, it can arguably be stated that, whenever they opt for foreign terms or expressions instead of their Italian equivalents, YouTubers are mixing languages rather than borrowing from English. Examples 24-27 indicate that most code-mixing also concerns makeup specialized lexicon:

24. Credo che ormai la maggior parte degli ombretti, se non tutti, sono [sic] wet or dry. (GA)
25. Se c’è qualche fallout, qualche … appunto… un po’ di colore che è caduto sulle guance […]. (NH).
26. E poi con questo ombretto, che è un ombretto invece shimmer ma in polvere, vado ad illuminare l’arcata sopraccigliare. (NH)

---

21 As regards the makeup domain, the term palette (in turn borrowed from the French; see OED Online, Third Edition, March 2005) does not have an Italian equivalent either. Tavolozza is not normally used to indicate eyeshadow trays, the English palette is the preferred option.
22 20. Then, from the same palette, I am going to take some pink and a little bit of purple. (NH) 19. It’s nice because they are microglitters you can see, especially when we open and close the eye, just like she does. (CZ)
23 Both colloquial expressions and specialized lexicon refer to the makeup domain: this is probably because users typically construct their YouTube persona by striking a balance between their professional and their amateur identities (see Riboni 2017b).
24 23. I like it because, unlike before when [brand name] used to produce beauty blenders, that is to say “fake beauty blenders” which were horrible because they were all stodgy, this new version is lovely and soft, see? (CZ)
27. La inizio a prendere dalla parte del sedere [sic] e... *stamp stamp stamp!* (CZ) [emphasis added]25

Italian makeup artists possibly utilize both languages (even within the same sentence) because they are heavily influenced by the much more famous English-speaking ‘beauty gurus’ whose videos have contributed to shaping the genre and have inspired non-English-speaking YouTubers to make similar ones, adapting the latter to new lingua-cultural contexts.

Another possible (but not mutually exclusive) explanation may have to do with the strong interdiscursive link which makeup tutorials share with advertising26. Numerous studies about code-mixing in advertising (see, among others, Cardona 1974; Cook 1992; Kelly-Holmes 2000; Piller 2000, 2001, 2003; Santulli and Silvestri 2004; Lee 2006) contend that this type of linguistic phenomenon stems from a close connection between a language and its associated (cultural) identities. The foreign language (English in this case) is mixed with the language of the audience not simply for its communicative function, but for its symbolic value, so that it can evoke the cultural stereotype of the country with which the foreign language is associated (Kelly-Holmes 2000). In Italian cosmetic advertising English has been replacing French (traditionally tied to notions of sophistication, seduction and elegance) because of its ability to call to mind the values typical of American culture, namely modernity, youthfulness, and technological advancement (Santulli and Silvestri 2004: 239).

The same dynamics seems to apply to Italian makeup tutorials. The choice of the English language, due to its relation with the notion of Americanness, allows YouTubers to promote themselves (instead of cosmetic products): their persona is thus perceived by the Italian audience as professional and up-to-date as well as international, youthful and friendly. The utilization of specialized lexicon in English may suggest that Italian makeup artists are knowledgeable about the most advanced products and techniques which come from the US, currently considered the homeland of makeup innovation. This may also account for the fact that all Italian YouTubers have opted for usernames in the English language and belonging to the makeup domain, a choice significantly not shared by their English-speaking counterparts.

6. Concluding remarks

The interplay between the different dimensions of ‘culture’ (i.e. that connected with makeup artists’ national and linguistic context and that linked with the transnational and translinguistic community of practice they belong to) which characterizes the YouTube makeup domain cannot be fully appreciated only by recourse to the analysis of the rhetorical, textual and lexical features of video tutorials. However, this study has provided a codification of this relatively new genre and may offer interesting insights into some of the distinctive cultural and linguistic phenomena of the genre and present

---

25 I think that now most eyeshadows, if not all eyeshadows, are either wet or dry. (GA) 25. If there’s any fallout, any...yeah.. a bit of colour that has fallen onto your cheeks.... (NH) 26. And now, with this eyeshadow which instead is *shimmer*[y] but powdery, I am going to illuminate my eyebrow. (NH) 27. I start by taking it from its bottom end and .....*stamp stamp stamp!* (CZ).

26 Cf. § 1.
a comparison between videos realized in the language in which they were first produced (English) and videos adapted to a new linguo-cultural context (Italian).

On an online hosting platform such as YouTube, the tension between the global and the local dimensions of culture is not difficult to grasp; nonetheless, determining which of the two prevails is hardly viable. The impact on Italian tutorials of the globalized, cross-national and cross-linguistic community of practice of makeup artists appears rather clearly in the widespread instances of language contact. The genre originated in Anglophone countries and the English model has been implemented by the digital makeup community worldwide, thus generating phenomena of interference when adapted to other languages.

However, the global influences exerted by the transnational and translinguistic culture of YouTube makeup lovers’ community of practice are probably counterbalanced by the impact of the (local) Italian language and national culture. This may be observed in the only partial adoption of the rhetorical structure of English tutorials: whereas the main move, the makeup application part of the video, is always realized and with comparable language and discursive resources, Italian videos seem more varied as regards the Greeting, Introduction and Leave-Taking sections. A more marked tendency towards innovation may also be interpreted as a cultural difference between Italian and English native YouTubers27.

The fact that tutorials have been adjusted to another local, linguo-cultural context is also noticeable in the significant occurrence of code-mixing instances. Users insert English terms or phrases within Italian sentences as a strategy to evoke the values traditionally associated with the foreign culture(s) where the language is spoken. The use of English words is therefore a communication strategy employed by YouTubers to be perceived by their fellow nationals as possessing some of the typical qualities connected with the American cultural stereotype, i.e. modernity, friendliness, youthfulness and innovation (applied, in this case, to the makeup domain).

By and large, it may be stated that although studies on the tension between the local and the global dimension of culture have been flourishing for decades, the issue is still extremely topical. Linguistic and cultural phenomena originating from language and culture contact such as those described in this research are not new, but they have become more marked since the spread of the Internet, especially with the development of Web 2.0 platforms in conjunction with the rise of user-generated media. Since English is the language of globalization, users who are native speakers have the chance to post entries which simultaneously address both local and transnational audiences, thus belonging to their national as well as their international virtual community of practice. The advantage provided by the full command of the language and the consequent possibility of being members of both local and worldwide communities allows English native speakers to establish their leadership at the global level.

Against this backdrop, non-native English speakers have to find strategies to boost their authoritativeness although they necessarily have a more limited audience than their English counterparts. The study has arguably highlighted that the acceptance and adoption of the globalized models is not wholesale; on the contrary, a certain tradeoff

27 The validation of such a hypothesis may be the object of a future investigation as the scope of this study does not allow for further exploration of the matter.
between languages and cultures emerges. In conclusion, it may be stated that the investigation of communication practices (both long-established and new as is the case of the genre of the makeup tutorial) reveals that the latter do not simply reflect notions about identities but they also create identities (Bondi 2004: 59).

References


**Appendix - Video List**

**Michelle Phan**

1) **Butterfly Kisses**
17 April 2015 5:58
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MfvPDTbnpIQ&list=PLDm3KH9jNzQmFrVXOjaHII-572mQe7zOv

2) **Glowing Skin Look◊Ethereal Aura**
20 March 2015 6:35
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=V3CmBjdoHNc&index=3&list=PLDm3KH9jNzQmFrVXOjaHII-572mQe7zOv

3) **Lunar New Year Beauty**
19 February 2015 8:33
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bDciknUOA7w&index=5&list=PLDm3KH9jNzQmFrVXOjaHII-572mQe7zOv

4) **5 Lipstick Looks & A Valentine’s Day DIY!**
13 February 2015 3:37
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3_VIWu5Tbz0&list=PLDm3KH9jNzQmFrVXOjaHII-572mQe7zOv&index=6

5) **Glam X / (♦ x ♦) \**
13 December 2014 5:34
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sn2YzWqnlS7M&list=PLDm3KH9jNzQmFrVXOjaHII-572mQe7zOv&index=7

**Tanya Burr**

1) **Emma Stone Flawless Skin Makeup Tutorial! ad | Tanya Burr**
19 April 2015 13:58
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qPlOSoT_BEQ&list=PLt_BERL98BiftO9uquOF7wJ97d-AzsOWf
2) My Smoky Night Out Makeup Tutorial! | Tanya Burr
22 March 2015 11:58
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dRk2PrTZchE&index=2&list=PLt_BERL98BiftO9uquOF7wJ97d-AzsOWf

3) Golden Goddess Makeup Tutorial! | Tanya Burr
22 February 2015 13:39
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=p6BMkt65rkE&list=PLt_BERL98BiftO9uquOF7wJ97d-AzsOWf&index=3

4) Selena Gomez Everyday Makeup Tutorial! | Tanya Burr
25 January 2015 11:59
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vhrt3cvSVK40&list=PLt_BERL98BiftO9uquOF7wJ97d-AzsOWf&index=5

5) My Autumn Makeup Tutorial! | Tanya Burr
23 October 2014 13:29
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kcz6XUdD_bQ&list=PLt_BERL98BiftO9uquOF7wJ97d-AzsOWf&index=5

Lauren Curtis
1) Inverted Smoked-Out Eyeliner & Ombre Vampy Lips! | Lauren Curtis
19 February 2015 11:48
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AQn1CkXOLTI&list=PLa4Mpt4BD3Pb_Dh6iENxdUZQakFqX200D

2) How To Apply EYELINER + Graphic Liner! (ONE BRAND)
15 February 2015 11:25
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=T68caIDzOlo&list=PLa4Mpt4BD3Pb_Dh6iENxdUZQakFqX200D&index=2

3) Valentine’s Day Makeup Tutorial - Soft & Pretty!
9 February 2015 7:49
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cLc6nOYxDWw&index=3&list=PLa4Mpt4BD3Pb_Dh6iENxdUZQakFqX200D

4) Makeup ‘Makeover’ on my MUM!
28 January 2015 14:11
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IJ27FddwGE&list=PLa4Mpt4BD3Pb_Dh6iENxdUZQakFqX200D&index=4

5) Removing Makeup In Front of BOYS! Tips & Advice!
13 January 2015 15:04
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6IkBQsMzjJs&index=6&list=PLa4Mpt4BD3Pb_Dh6iENxdUZQakFqX200D

Clio MakeUp
1) TUTORIAL TRUCCO Charlize Theron SANREMO 2015
22 February 2015 16:10
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Cv8LQQM0i_U
2) TUTORIAL TRUCCO SAN VALENTINO 2015 MARSALA
12 February 2015 18:16
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jTggYO8Ks6g

3) TUTORIAL TRUCCO EXODUS LOOK ANTICO EGITTO
15 January 2015 11:47
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=w4ixu6E9BPU

4) TUTORIAL TRUCCO CAPODANNO VIOLA SEXY
30 December 2014 16:36
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OC_ETduE4CI

5) TUTORIAL TRUCCO CAPODANNO FACILE ECONOMICO SCINTILLANTE ESSENCE
28 December 2014 12:37
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=58wRbCD49lg

KissandMakeup01
1) Carnevale 2015 - Madre Malkin - Il settimo figlio
17 February 2015 5:35
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7v1LDtAZP9g

2) Mi Trucco con Voi - San Valentino - Santa o Peccatrice?
12 February 2015 5:44
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_yGMkH60rBU

3) Mi Trucco Con Voi - Sexy e Glam anche a Gennaio!!
14 January 2015 5:36
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=72yez9DF8oU

4) Mi preparo con voi - Speciale Natale!
29 December 2014 8:08
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=InaKoK2_9Z0

5) Mi Trucco Con Voi - Festeggiamo!!
17 December 2014 4:56
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rOFkzsT5XB0

Makeup Delight2009
1) San Valentino a Colori! Makeup Tutorial
11 February 2015 5:55
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cFcHwCr8-Kc

2) Trucco di San Valentino - Makeup Tutorial
5 February 2015 5:05
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-6-1hpmB_QI

3) Review e Tutorial SMASHBOX Double Exposure!
21 January 2015 7:49
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e_V-KsDrN8E
4) Trucco COLORE DELL’ANNO Marsala - Makeup Tutorial
16 January 2015 5:44
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=oXgQOULNWBw

5) Trucco “DAY/NIGHT” con MICHELA! Makeup Tutorial
12 January 2015 8:48
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tjUzULhxUxk